ENGLISH STUDIES IN THE 21ST CENTURY

Edited by Zekiye Antakyalıoğlu, Kyriaki Asiatidou, Ela İpek Gündüz, Enes Kavak and Gamze Almacıoğlu

English Studies in the 21st Century

English Studies in the 21st Century

Edited by

Zekiye Antakyalıoğlu,
Kyriaki Asiatidou,
Ela İpek Gündüz,
Enes Kavak
and Gamze Almacıoğlu

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing

English Studies in the 21st Century

Edited by Zekiye Antakyalıoğlu, Kyriaki Asiatidou, Ela İpek Gündüz, Enes Kavak and Gamze Almacıoğlu

This book first published 2020

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

From April 24 to 26, 2019, the Department of Western Languages and Literatures at Gaziantep University in Gaziantep, Turkey hosted IDEA 2019, a conference entitled Studies in English. It was the 13th international conference of the English Language and Literature Research Association of Turkey (IDEA) which is affiliated with the European Society for the Study of English (ESSE). One valuable outcome of this conference is *English Studies in the 21st Century*, a book of twenty-three chapters adapted from presented papers that reflects the ideals of academic polyphony and diversity by highlighting the interdisciplinary character of the field of English Literature and Language. It accomplishes this by incorporating as its subjects various authors and works from almost all literary periods, and by giving voice to academics, both old and young, from different national, political, and religious backgrounds.

This book comprises the results of the most recent academic research dealing with a wide spectrum of subjects—politics, psychology, religion, philosophy, history, culture, aesthetics, and education—in relation to literary, cultural, and language studies. The criteria for selecting these chapters were the epistemological aim of the works, the recent character of the conducted research, the satisfactory degree of the qualitative and quantitative research conducted, the controversy specific authors and works have stirred within the academic community, as well as the influence of specific authors and works on the expression of the creative imagination of contemporary and/or future generations of authors. Because IDEA conferences take place in Turkey, special attention was also given to the learning needs of Turkish students, the relationship between teacher and student, and the application of teaching methods within the Turkish educational system.

The editors warmly thank all the contributors whose concerted efforts have led to the publication of *English Studies in the 21st Century*. This reference book is ideal for academics, graduate and undergraduate students in Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences, as well as literature enthusiasts outside the academic community. It is hoped that this continuous engagement in the process of learning will lead to the enrichment of their knowledge and thus to a broader understanding of contemporary research in English Studies.

Professor Zekiye ANTAKYALIOĞLU
On Behalf of the Editorial Board

CHAPTER ONE

THE PRESENCE OF THE *ZOHAR* IN MILTON'S *PARADISE LOST*: INTERTEXTUALITY AND ORTHODOX CHRISTIAN RHETORIC

KYRIAKI ASIATIDOU

Discussions on the mystical elements of the poetry of John Milton foreground the popularity of medieval and renaissance Jewish and Christian mysticisms in the seventeenth century as signs of the rise of religious zeal and its impact on the literature of that time. Particularly, scholarly attention has been given to the impact of the Kabbalistic work *Zohar*. A characteristic example is that of Denis Saurat who claims that Milton's religious thought was influenced by Jewish mysticism by connecting particular passages from *Paradise Lost* solely to passages from the *Zohar*.[1] Among the noteworthy scholars who have argued against Saurat's Jewish Kabbalistic approach to several passages of *Paradise Lost* stand Walter Clyde Curry, who interprets some of the alleged passages within the context of Hellenistic Neoplatonic philosophy,[2] and R. J. Zwi Werblowsky, who refutes Saurat's claim by interpreting some of the alleged passages within the context of Renaissance Christian mysticism/Christian Kabbalism.[3]

---

[1] Denis Saurat, "Milton and the 'Zohar'," *Studies in Philology* 19, no. 2 (1922): 136-151, http://www.jstor.org/stable/4171822.

[2] Walter Clyde Curry, "Milton's Chaos and Old Night," *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 46, no. 1 (1947): 38-52, https://www.jstor.org/stable/27712836. A commentary on Curry's Neoplatonic interpretation of several parts of *Paradise Lost* is not available in the present work. However, like Saurat, Curry fails to relate his interpretation to Milton's purpose of composing *Paradise Lost*.

[3] R. J. Zwi Werblowsky, "Milton and the Conjectura Cabbalistica," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 18, no. 1/2 (1955): 90-113,

Still, if interpretations solely emphasize the Jewish, pagan, or Christian mystical influences upon Milton the artist as distinct entities from the orthodox Christian tradition, they create the false impression that Milton has chosen a different spiritual path from mainstream Christianity; thus, Milton is transformed into a heretical man approaching the Christian faith idiosyncratically. Readings based on the various influences upon Milton the poet and the man may be many; however, they cannot be characterized by arbitrariness. To illustrate my claim by using Saurat's interpretation of *Paradise Lost*, I may assert that although scholars cannot miss traces of Jewish mysticism in *Paradise Lost*—a poem of a strong Christian character and, thus, of an inevitable intertextual nature because of the historical, cultural, and geographical conditions under which Christianity was formed—they cannot ignore this epic poem's specific purpose clearly uttered by Milton (the narrator) in the proem: "I may assert Eternal Providence,/And justify the ways of God to men (Book I, lines 25-26)."[4] I will attempt to demonstrate that Denis Saurat's exclusive Jewish interpretation of specific passages of *Paradise Lost* disrupts the overall meaning of the poem since Saurat fails to relate the provided interpretations of the specific passages to Milton's general purpose of composing *Paradise Lost*. My assertion is that a possible orthodox Christian mystical interpretation based on the teachings of the Patristic theologian Dionysius the Areopagite may better serve Milton's end. Before my refutation of Saurat's interpretation of particular excerpts from *Paradise Lost*, I briefly elaborate on the purpose of the composition of *Paradise Lost* on which my refutation of Saurat's interpretation will be built.

   Paul Carus asserts that Christianity is a "branch of Gnosticism," acknowledging that Gnosticism—as a movement whose objective is man's salvation through the attainment of gnosis (knowledge)—existed before the founding of Christianity by Peter and Paul.[5] Carus traces the roots of Gnosticism to Oriental religions fostered in India—such as Brahmanism, Jainism, and Buddhism—with which Jews and Greeks became progressively familiar throughout the Hellenistic Period and the Roman Period.[6] He further notes that the Jewish Diaspora was responsible for the fusion of Indian and Greek beliefs and ideas into Judaism on Syrian soil,

---

http://www.jstor.org/stable/750289.

[4] John Milton, "Paradise Lost," in *Paradise Lost: An Authoritative Text, Backgrounds, and Sources Criticism*, 2nd ed., ed. Scott Elledge (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1993), 9.

[5] Paul Carus, "Gnosticism in Its Relation to Christianity," *The Monist* 8, no. 4 (1898): 502-503, http://www.jstor.org/stable/27897524.

[6] Ibid., 505-507.

and from there, various gnostic groups popularized their ideas in the multicultural societies of Alexandria and the cities of Asia Minor.[7] Gnosticism offered a "universal/supernational," "personal," and "spiritual" reading of the Jewish Scripture (the Old Testament), but Christianity succeeded in becoming more acceptable within the Hellenistic world because it transformed "abstract" gnostic views into "simple" and "concrete" ideas in the form of the Gospel.[8] Since the second century B.C., there were known Jewish gnostic communities, such as the Essenes with whom Jesus had connections, the Nazarenes/Nazarites/Ebionites, the Therapeutae, and the Zabians/Baptists among whom was St. John the Baptist. They generally embraced asceticism, poverty, intense contemplation and penance, fasting, praying, ablutions, baptism and special initiatory rituals, along with the rejection of oaths and bloody sacrifice. They also had their own set of secret doctrines of interpreting the Old Testament, and the millennium idea.[9] Particularly, the Nazarenes were the mystics/Gnostics associated with early Christians. The Jewish religious elite accused Paul of being a Nazarene and, in general, viewed all Christians as Nazarenes; similarly, early Christians did not find the epithet "Gnostic" a pejorative and early Church Fathers like Clement attached to this epithet a Christian meaning.[10] The contemporary Nazarenes/Ebionites of Origen were divided into those who acknowledged and those who did not acknowledge the "supernatural birth" and divine nature of Christ.[11] Later, many of the aforementioned Jewish gnostic practices, either comprised the core or were considered signs of the highest virtues within the orthodox Christian tradition. Furthermore, Carus notes that Apocryphal writings such as "the Book of Enoch, the Psalms of Solomon, and Leptogenesis […] are obvious symptoms of Gnosticism."[12] The Patristic theologians acknowledged Jewish mysticism—especially through their acceptance of the Apocrypha—as logos spermatikos. McGrath states that they accepted the authority of the Apocrypha/deutero-canonical writings, including them in the Septuagint, the Greek version of the Old Testament, with writings that were not originally in the Tanakh/the Hebrew Bible/Old Testament.[13]

---

[7] Ibid., 506-507.

[8] Ibid., 502-504.

[9] Ibid., 510-513, 526.

[10] Ibid., 502-503, 511.

[11] Ibid., 512.

[12] Ibid., 512.

[13] Alister E. McGrath, *Christian Theology: An Introduction*, 5th ed. (West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), 120-123.

Carus provides two noteworthy examples of the intellectual trading between early Jewish mysticism and Christianity which may be found in the Book of Enoch where the Messiah is mostly addressed as "the son of the woman," "the son of man," and once as "the son of God," who eternally existed before all creation.[14] Similarly, in the Christian tradition, "Son of Man" and "Son of God" address the dual nature of Christ, fully man and fully God respectively, as well as God's second hypostasis (the Son) that is consubstantial and coequal with the Father, the first hypostasis. Carus also justifies the appearance of a spiritual Messiah in the Book of Enoch by pointing out that the Book of Enoch was partially written after 79 AD, but he acknowledges Essenic influences rather than Christian ones.[15] Still, there are other Christian influences on Jewish mysticism. Examples like the bodily resurrection of the dead in the Book of Daniel and 2 Esdras and the association of the Messiah with God's son Jesus in 2 Esdras[16] remind us that, as they developed, Jewish mysticism and Christian mysticism have exchanged beliefs. The second example is related to the Babylonian idea of emanations that was embraced by various Gnostic groups.[17] In the Wisdom of Solomon viii. 3-4, Wisdom/Sophia— the emanation and bride of God—is "conversant with God."[18] In other words, the love relationship between God and Sophia is defined by the action of speech. Within the Christian tradition, wisdom, love, and speech are meanings of Logos, an epithet attached to Christ and the Holy Spirit, the second and the third hypostases of God. Therefore, while acknowledging the contribution of Jewish mysticism to the shaping of the orthodox Christian faith, Milton's mysticism may be interpreted within the boundaries of mainstream Christian mysticism rather than Jewish mysticism.

Milton's clear assertion of his poem's end—his fellowmen's realization of God's will for humanity, which is humanity's theosis (deification)—is directly related to the teachings of the first-century theologian Dionysius the Areopagite, the Bishop of Athens. Parker claims that Dionysius the Areopagite was a disciple of Paul and a major influence upon Pantaenus and Ammonius Saccus, the founders of the Alexandrian school, and he refutes the dominant view that attributes to Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite, a Syrian monk of the late fifth and early sixth century, the Neoplatonic, panentheistic *On Divine Names*, *Mystic Theology*, *On the Heavenly Hierarchy*, and *On Ecclesiastical Hierarchy*. Rather, Parker

---

[14] Carus, "Gnosticism in Its Relation to Christianity," 516.
[15] Ibid., 517.
[16] Ibid., 518-519.
[17] Ibid., 509.
[18] Ibid., 514.

advocates that these works belong to the first century Dionysius the Areopagite, thus making panentheism the philosophical backbone of early Christianity before the shaping of the third-century Neoplatonic pagan philosopher Plotinus's panentheism. According to Parker, Plotinus came into contact with the Alexandrian school and, for eleven years, was a student of Ammonius-Saccus.[19] The theologians of the Alexandrian school, along with the theologians of the Antiochene school, were the major contributors to the formulation of the Trinity doctrine and the hypostatic union doctrine, the official position of the Church acknowledged by the council of Nicaea in 325 and the council of Chalcedon in 451.

Armed with the conviction of being illuminated by the Divine ray of grace, Milton fulfils his duty, reminding his fellowmen of the Divine will of a deified humanity. Milton echoes Dionysius the Areopagite who reveals:

> For each of those who have been called into the Hierarchy, find their perfection in being carried to the Divine imitation in their own proper degree; and what is more Divine than all, in becoming a fellow-worker with God, as the Oracles say, and in shewing the Divine energy in himself manifested as far as possible. For it is an Hierarchical regulation that some are purified and that others purify; that some are enlightened and others enlighten; that some are perfected and others perfect; the Divine imitation will fit each one in this fashion.[20]

The striking similarity between Milton's purpose and Dionysius's explanation of orthodox Christian panentheism—which, in the relationship of God and man, brings to the fore the active response of man to the calling of divine grace through the practice of human will—provides readers with clues of the eschatological purpose of an amillennial character in *Paradise Lost*. *Paradise Lost* is an allegory which stresses that reality is mental and the degree of its perception by humanity depends on the latter's present mental state. As John of Ruysbroeck (1293-1381) eloquently states, "The second coming of Christ our Bridegroom takes place every day within good men; often and many times, with new graces and gifts, in all those who make themselves ready for it, each according to

---

[19] John Parker, "Dionysius the Areopagite and the Alexandrine School," in *Dionysius the Areopagite, Works (1897)*, trans. and comp. John Parker (London; Oxford: James Parker and Co, 1897), 132-135, https://www.ccel.org/ccel/dionysius/works.

[20] Dionysius the Areopagite, "On the Heavenly Hierarchy," in *Dionysius the Areopagite, Works (1897)*, trans. and comp. John Parker (London; Oxford: James Parker and Co, 1897), 149, https://www.ccel.org/ccel/dionysius/works.

his power."[21] Milton's reader must take immediate action to rise from the lower mental states of Ulro and Generation he/she experiences at present to the higher mental state of Beulah, in which one's soul gets prepared for its union with God in the Edenic state, which is the infinite and eternal highest mental state humanity may experience within the boundaries of physical reality at present. *Paradise Lost* refers to the different mental states which humanity as a whole, as well as the individual as a distinct soul, may experience. The narration's beginning, strongly connected as it is with the Christian hope—and Milton's hope—of the completion of the Divine Will of a restored and perfected humanity, alludes to the first and second coming of Christ and man's experiencing the highest mental state, the Edenic state.[22] The narration proceeds from the descriptions of the lowest mental state of Ulro that is personified by Satan in Hell, the low mental state of Generation that is personified by both Satan abandoning Hell and temporarily visiting Heaven and Adam being separated from Eve (the personification of his soul) to the high mental state of Beulah which is mirrored in the loving union of Adam and Eve both inside and outside the garden of Eden. This should be the context within which the identification and function of the various sources of Milton's artistic inspiration in *Paradise Lost* may be discussed, including the Kabbalistic work *Zohar*.[23]

Denis Saurat points out that Kabbalistic ideas have been known to Europe since the fifteenth century and have not been forgotten thanks to scholars such as Pico della Mirandola, Reuchlin, Agrippa, Cordovero, and

---

[21] John of Ruysbroeck, "The Adornment of the Spiritual Marriage," in *John of Ruysbroeck: The Adornment of the Spiritual Marriage, The Sparkling Stone, The Book of Supreme Truth*, trans. C. A. Wynschenk Dom and ed. Evelyn Underhill, 33, https://www.ccel.org/ccel/ruysbroeck/adornment.

[22] Milton refers to Christ's redeeming for humanity first coming as God's plan: "[…] Till one greater Man/Restore us, and regain the blissful seat" (Book I, lines 4-5). Humanity's status is elevated after the first coming of Christ, whose dual nature makes possible not only humanity's salvation but also humanity's perfection (Christlike/Godlike)—a continuous process that is taking place at present and will be completed in the future, during His second coming.

[23] Milton's purpose of spreading the news of man's capacity for deification is also evident in the felix culpa defining the end of *Paradise Lost*. Adam and Eve exit the garden of Eden in loving union, an allegory of man's being in union with his soul even after his fall. His union with his soul is the prerequisite toward the fulfilment of the Divine Promise (Logos) of Humanity's deification. The Divine Promise/Logos is manifested in Christ/Logos Who, through His incarnation, makes possible fallen man's redemption and theosis through the practice of man's free will. *Paradise Regained*, the sequel of *Paradise Lost*, illustrates, through Christ, man's partaking in the Divine (the Edenic state).

Loria and that European enthusiasm for Kabbalism was preserved during Milton's lifetime through the works of Joseph Voysin, Father Kircher, Robert Fludd, and the Cambridge Platonist Henry More.[24] He also comments that although Milton might not have believed in the sacredness of the *Zohar*, *Paradise Lost* includes three original ideas that are retrieved exclusively from the *Zohar*.[25] Saurat notices that in *Paradise Lost*, Book IX, lines 816-833, Eve expresses egoistic feelings of fear and jealousy after eating the forbidden fruit; she is uneasy with the thought of Adam having next to him another woman created by God. She decides to share the fruit with him because in comparison a lonely life or death due to exclusive access to knowledge is not worth living. Saurat notices that Milton's lines perfectly correspond to the following passage from the *Zohar*:

> The woman touched the tree. Then she saw the Angel of Death coming towards her, and thought: Perhaps I shall die and the Holy One, Blessed be He, will make another woman and give her to Adam. That must not happen. Let us live together or let us die together. And then she gave the fruit to her husband that he should eat it also. [26]

Indeed, the resemblance of the two passages—Book IX, lines 816-833 of *Paradise Lost* and the above excerpt from the *Zohar*—is striking, but Werblowsky differentiates between thirteenth-century Jewish Kabbalism, represented by the *Zohar*, and seventeenth-century Christian Kabbalism which attaches a Christian symbolic meaning to borrowed Jewish kabbalah elements. Most Christians of that time did not have direct contact with Jewish mysticism but copied material from their predecessors, such as Pico della Mirandola, Reuchlin, Riccius, and Knorr von Rosenroth.[27] Werblowsky brings the example of Henry More's statement, "'Christ is nothing but Moses unveiled'."[28] Unfortunately, Werblowsky's argument of the popularity of Christian—rather than Jewish—Kabbalism in Milton's time does not encourage readers to relate Christian Kabbalism to orthodox Christianity.

Still, having some knowledge of Christian mysticism in general and Patristic theology in particular, a reader may discern in this passage of the *Zohar* how significant it is for man to be in union with his soul to taste

---

[24] Saurat, "Milton and the 'Zohar'," 136.
[25] Ibid., 137.
[26] Ibid., 138.
[27] Werblowsky, "Milton and the Conjectura Cabbalistica," 91-92.
[28] Ibid., 92-93.

true life. The use of the word "husband" connotes marriage. In the fourth century, the Antiochene school used marriage imagery to speak about the hypostatic union of Christ (the dual nature of Christ). The same imagery was also used by the Antiochene school to talk about the union of Christ (the husband) with the Ecclesia/the Church (the wife).[29] The imagery of the union of a husband and wife is also preserved by Western Christian mystics to talk about the perfect state of the man who is in touch with his soul (his feminine part). Both the teachings of the Patristic tradition formed by the Alexandrian and Antiochene schools and those of Western Christian mysticism echo the teachings of Dionysius the Areopagite who advises, "We must then contemplate things Divine, after this Union, not after ourselves, but by our whole selves, standing out of our whole selves, and becoming wholly of God."[30] In the marriage (erotic relationship) of God and the believer, the latter unites with the divine through his soul/feminine side where Christ/Logos—man's essence—resides. The human soul's depiction as a female in the Eastern Patristic Christian discourse may be related to the "psyche," the Greek word for the soul that is a feminine noun. In *Metamorphoses*, the second-century Platonist Lucius Apuleius depicts Psyche as the wife of Eros and claims her

---

[29] Eastern Patristic theological discourse is analogical; God is sexless and genderless since He is beyond being and cannot be perceived by the human mind. Dionysius the Areopagite acknowledges the limitations of Symbolic theology, pointing out that God is the "Nameless" because "It previously embraced in Itself all things existing, absolutely and without limit" [Dionysius the Areopagite, "On Divine Names," in *Dionysius the Areopagite, Works (1897)*, trans. and comp. John Parker (London; Oxford: James Parker, 1897), 16, https://www.ccel.org/ccel/dionysius/works]. However, Dionysius also highlights the need of creation to celebrate the Creator in a respectful way through the use of "numerous beneficent Names of the uncalled and unnamed Deity" (Ibid., 17). Maybe the best evidence that Eastern Patristic theology uses analogical language is the use of God's name Logos. Although logos is primarily a masculine noun, its multiple meanings are expressed by both masculine and feminine nouns, including aitia/cause (feminine noun) connoting nous/mind (masculine noun) and sophia/wisdom (feminine noun), logos/speech (masculine noun), and diathiki/covenant (feminine noun) connoting charis/grace (feminine noun), agape/love (feminine noun), and Eros/love (masculine noun). Eastern Patristic theology, as well as Western Christian mysticism, celebrates both the masculine and feminine attributes of Christ. Christ as Logos (masculine noun) is the true life/zoe (feminine noun); He is the essence/ousia (feminine noun) and the divine will/energia (feminine noun). The Fathers portray the human soul as the female partner of Christ because to really exist, the human soul must submit to the will of God, that is, the essence of all creations.

[30] Dionysius the Areopagite, "On Divine Names," 55.

attaining immortality by Zeus; Apuleius's allegorical narration delivers the human soul's yearning for divine love.[31] The union of Psyche and Eros may be a source of inspiration for the Eastern Patristic theologians, who, speaking the Greek language and addressing a mainly Greek-speaking audience, deliver the Christian message of humanity's theosis in Christ through familiar imageries. Similarities may be drawn between Zeus and God the Father, Who makes the human soul immortal through His grace Logos/Christ; only through her union with Christ, the human soul may become immortal. Christ/Logos is the divine will to which the believer must submit, that is, God's will and the believer's will must be one. According to the Patristic Christian teachings, the relationship of the human soul and Christ is not a power relationship but a love relationship. Explaining the Eastern Patristic dogma of man's theosis, the seventh-century theologian and mystic Maximus the Confessor states that "each nature has its own real manifestation, possesses its own existence proper to itself, its own 'will,' even though the two are united in the person of the Word and the human will is subject in all things to the divine will."[32] In the Eastern Patristic discourse, will—free from any meaning attached to it by modern individualistic philosophy—means "energy," "the manifestation of *real existence*."[33]

Therefore, one's detachment from his soul results in his emotional and intellectual fragmentation because he distances himself from God/Christ. The fragmentation of the ideal Self results from the domination of ego/natural selfhood that leads man to spiritual death/nonexistence. In both passages—Book IX, lines 816-833 from *Paradise Lost* and its counterpart in the *Zohar*—a controlling Eve who contemplates on whether she should eat the fruit by herself or together with Adam is the female will, the personification of man's domination by his selfhood and therefore, a man alienated from the divine, the true life. In his ideal state, the man is harmoniously united with his soul (man's feminine part). The fragmentation of man—that is, his detachment from his soul—and his alienation from God and his divine state (ideal Self) caused by the domination of selfhood is, as has already been shown, the primary concern of Christian mysticism, as well as Milton's major concern.

Milton foreshadows the need for this union through the expression of Adam's preference for a shared life. Adam complains to God/Christ about

---

[31] Michael Grant and John Hazel, eds., *Who's Who in Classical Mythology* (NY: Routledge, 2006), 287-289.
[32] John Meyendorff, *St Gregory Palamas and Orthodox Spirituality*, trans. Adele Fiske (NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1974), 41.
[33] Ibid., 41.

his loneliness although God has endowed him with all knowledge and has appointed him the master of all the subjects of "the garden of bliss" and all the earth:[34]

> I found not what methought I wanted still;
> […]
> And all this good to man, for whose well-being
> So amply, and with hands so liberal
> Thou hast provided all things: but with me
> I see not who partakes. In solitude
> What happiness, who can enjoy alone,
> Or all enjoying, what contentment find?
> […]
> […] of fellowship I speak
> Such as I seek, fit to participate
> All rational delight, wherein the brute
> Cannot be human consort; (Book VIII, lines 355, 361-366, 389-392)[35]

Adam yearns for a union, feeling that earthly possession and knowledge are not enough to satisfy him. Adam confesses that reason is enjoyed when he is in communion with his female consort. Milton uses the term "rational delight" in a playful, erotic way, encouraging his readers to associate it with "reason"—which, in Greek, is logos—to think of logos's multiple meanings, including speech, cause/creativity/productivity, and love, and finally to identify logos with the divine reason residing in man's soul, Christ, whose activation—according to the Patristic theologians and medieval Christian mystics—is the mental faculty man should employ to connect with God. Therefore, the union of Adam (man) and Eve (his psyche) corresponds to the marriage of God and man; Adam's yearning for a consort/his soul (psyche)/feminine side personifies his yearning to become Godlike/Christlike. The positive response of God to Adam's yearning for union validates the truth of his desire; a man who is in union with his soul is on the path to perfection.

The second exclusive element of the *Zohar* in Milton's *Paradise Lost* that Saurat points out is the marital relationship of Satan with his daughter Sin. This relationship is inspired by the well-established father-daughter form of incest present in Kabbalistic tales, including the *Zohar* in which "God himself has sexual intercourse with the Matrona, or Shekhina, his daughter."[36] Within a Christian context, the portrayal of man's soul as a

---

[34] See *Paradise Lost*, Book VIII, lines 299, 319, 338-348.
[35] Milton, "Paradise Lost," 189-190.
[36] Saurat, "Milton and the 'Zohar'," 139.

"daughter" symbolizes his becoming his ideal Self and the portrayal of man's soul as a "bride" symbolizes man's membership to the Divine body.[37] That the outcome of Satan and Sin's union is monstrous symbolizes the falsehood experienced by a man when he is dominated by his ego/natural reason since he has distanced himself from both his true Self and God.

Saurat traces a third common feature between Milton's *Paradise Lost* and the *Zohar* that is related to the role of chaos, quoting from Book II, line 911: "[Chaos is] The womb of Nature and perhaps her grave."[38] According to Saurat, the *Zohar* speaks of many worlds that were created and destroyed by God. Saurat thinks that through the mentioning of Chaos and its destroyed worlds, Milton warns about the possibility of our world's destruction if we do not serve our purpose. Saurat also claims that Milton wants to stress God's free will to act creatively the way He wants.[39] However, within a Christian context, because the omnipotence of Divine Will is unquestionable, theological discourse focuses on man's free will. The notion of God's will to destroy creations may indeed shock Milton's Christian audience whose God, far from being a vindictive God, is seen essentially as a loving Creator. Divine creativity closely related to God's love for his creations is the divine attribute emphasized above all in the relationship of God and man upon which Patristic theologians dwell. The fourth-century Athanasius of Alexandria, who made a major contribution to the shaping of the Christological and Soteriological doctrines officially accepted by the early Christian Church, explains the response of God to fallen humanity:

> […] What then was God, being Good, to do? Was He to let corruption and death have their way with them? In that case, what was the use of having made them in the beginning? Surely it would have been better never to have been created at all than, having been created, to be neglected and perish; and, besides that, such indifference to the ruin of His own work before His very eyes would argue not goodness in God but limitation, and that far more than if He had never created man at all. It was impossible, therefore, that God should leave man to be carried off by corruption, because it would be unfitting and unworthy of Himself (2:6).[40]

---

[37] Like Milton, William Blake does something similar in *Jerusalem*, where at the beginning, Jerusalem/man's emanation/soul appears as his alienated wife and, later in the poem, she becomes his daughter given to Christ as His bride.

[38] Saurat, "Milton and the 'Zohar'," 140.

[39] Ibid., 141.

[40] Athanasius of Alexandria, *On the Incarnation of the Word* (https://www.ccel.org/ccel/athanasius/incarnation/html).

The meaning of Saurat's chosen line from Book II must not contradict any other passage in *Paradise Lost*, including the following lines from Book VII, in which the angelic choir praises God by uttering: "[…] but to create/ Is greater than created to destroy./ Who can impair thee, mighty king, or bound/ Thy empire? […]/ […] his evil/ Thou usest, and from thence creat'st more good" (Lines 606-609, 615-616).[41] If a reader places these two passages of *Paradise Lost* side by side, he/she receives a complete orthodox Christian message. Saurat's choice of the specific line from Book II of *Paradise Lost* echoes Milton's eschatological concerns, but these are of a Christian nature. An orthodox Christian understanding of Saurat's chosen line from Book II may be traced to Dionysius the Areopagite's words, "All things are from Him, and to Him."[42] John of Ruysbroeck echoes the Patristic theologian when he states:

> The time which is fitting for this coming is the hour of death, and the Last Judgment of all men. When God created the soul out of nothing and united it with the body, He set a fixed day and a fixed hour known only to Him, when it should have to give up temporal things and to appear in His presence.[43]

In Patristic theology, the obscurity and darkness of "Chaos" have the negative connotations of confusion and perplexion only when addressing man's fallen mental state (Ulro/Generation), viz., when man willingly detaches himself from God, being permeated by ego/self-love. In contrast, when "Chaos" refers to God, it becomes part of the diction used in apophatic theology (negative theology) and relates to His unrevealed, unknown, and ineffable side and our agnosia[44] of Him. Dionysius the Areopagite advocates, "the most Divine Knowledge of Almighty God, which is known, through not knowing (agnosia) during the union above the mind."[45] He further claims that negative diction is more proper when we address the divine because "It [God] is above every essence and life,"[46] and he notes, "Not even one of the things existing is altogether deprived of participation in the beautiful, since, […] all things are very beautiful."[47] In other words, everything that the super-essential God has created is good,

---

[41] Milton, "Paradise Lost," 179.
[42] Dionysius the Areopagite, "On the Heavenly Hierarchy," 141.
[43] John of Ruysbroeck, "The Adornment of the Spiritual Marriage," 35.
[44] To unite with God, we must surrender our knowledge of Him.
[45] Dionysius the Areopagite, "On Divine Names," 57.
[46] Dionysius the Areopagite, "On the Heavenly Hierarchy," 145.
[47] Ibid., 145.

including evil. Milton embraces Dionysius the Areopagite's view when, in Book VII, the angels differentiate between the essence of God (the Creator) and Satan (the created) and confirm the goodness of the destructive Satan, thus indirectly also acknowledging that all creatures of God are of divine essence—that is, whether good or evil, all turn to be good. Dionysius the Areopagite explains that all creations of God are known by Him before their existence because they are of His essence, the cause of the existence of all:

> 'He, knowing all things, before their birth.' For, not as learning existing things from existing things, does the Divine Mind know, but from Itself, and in Itself, as Cause, it pre-holds and pre-comprehends the notion and knowledge, and essence of all things.[48]

The popularity of mysticism in Milton's times is not inimical to orthodox Christianity. In contrast, it fosters the harmonious union of orthodox Christianity's advocacy of the potential theosis of humanity beyond the latter's salvation and the seventeenth-century intellectual spirit's nurturing of the upcoming age of reason by foregrounding the potential of the use of human intellect for the satisfactory apprehension of the truth. Mysticism is an integral and inseparable part of the orthodox Christian tradition, ensuring the survival of orthodox Christian tradition throughout the centuries, even after the physical fragmentation of the initially unified Christian Church. William Philip Downes observes that "as the state cannot live without the idealist, so the church would die without the mystic. It is the mystic that always saves the church."[49] Although some readers may not wish to read *Paradise Lost* as an example of a zealous Christian using his worldly calling for the spiritual revitalization of his Christian fellowmen, they cannot ignore Milton's identity as an enthusiastic mystic, and a mystic is primarily a humanist, one who aspires to humanity's ideal state. Downes remarks, "'All mystics speak the same language and come from the same country'."[50] Interpretations of *Paradise Lost* that acknowledge the intertextual nature of orthodox Christian mysticism not only endow the poem with vivacity and color and make the poem's reading an exciting adventure but also, and above all, contribute to the strengthening of a unified humanity's yearning for the fulfillment of man's potential deification.

---

[48] Dionysius the Areopagite, "On Divine Names," 56.
[49] William Philip Downes, "Mysticism," *The Biblical World* 54, no. 6 (1920): 619, http://www.jstor.org/stable/3136208.
[50] Ibid., 620.

References

Athanasius, Alexandria of. *On the Incarnation of the Word*.
    https://www.ccel.org/ccel/athanasius/incarnation/html.

Carus, Paul. "Gnosticism in Its Relation to Christianity." *The Monist* 8, no.
    4 (1898): 502-546. http://www.jstor.org/stable/27897524.

Curry, Walter Clyde. "Milton's Chaos and Old Night." *The Journal of
    English and Germanic Philology* 46, no.1 (1947): 38-52.
    https://www.jstor.org/stable/27712836.

Dionysius, Areopagite the. "On the Heavenly Hierarchy." In *Dionysius the
    Areopagite, Works (1897)*, translated and compiled by John Parker,
    140-178. London; Oxford: James Parker and Co, 1897.
    https://www.ccel.org/ccel/dionysius/works.

Dionysius, Areopagite the. "On Divine Names." In *Dionysius the
    Areopagite, Works (1897)*, translated and compiled by John Parker, 12-
    77. London; Oxford: James Parker and Co, 1897.
    https://www.ccel.org/ccel/dionysius/works.

Downes, William Philip. "Mysticism." *The Biblical World* 54, no. 6
    (1920): 619-624. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3136208.

Grant, Michael and John Hazel, eds. *Who's Who in Classical Mythology*.
    NY: Routledge, 2006.

John, of Ruysbroeck. "The Adornment of the Spiritual Marriage." In *John
    of Ruysbroeck: The Adornment of the Spiritual Marriage, The
    Sparkling Stone, The Book of Supreme Truth*, translated by C. A.
    Wynschenk Dom and edited by Evelyn Underhill, 21-164.
    https://www.ccel.org/ccel/ruysbroeck/adornment.

McGrath, Alister E. *Christian Theology: An Introduction*. 5th ed. West
    Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.

Meyendorff, John. *St Gregory Palamas and Orthodox Spirituality*,
    translated by Adele Fiske. New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press,
    1974.

Milton, John. "Paradise Lost." In *Paradise Lost: An Authoritative Text,
    Backgrounds, and Sources Criticism*. 2nd ed. Edited by Scott Elledge,
    6-301. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1993.

Parker, John. "Dionysius the Areopagite and the Alexandrine School." In
    Dionysius the Areopagite, Works (1897), translated and compiled by
    John Parker, 132-139. London; Oxford: James Parker and Co, 1897.
    https://www.ccel.org/ccel/dionysius/works.

Saurat, Denis. "Milton and the 'Zohar'." *Studies in Philology* 19, no. 2
    (1922): 136-151. http://www.jstor.org/stable/4171822.

Werblowsky, Zwi R. J. "Milton and the Conjectura Cabbalistica." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 18, no. 1/2 (1955): 90-113. http://www.jstor.org/stable/750289.

CHAPTER TWO

A STUDY ON LORD BYRON'S *CAIN: A MYSTERY* AND FEDERICO GARCIA LORCA'S *BLOOD WEDDING*

ONUR EKLER

Sublime moments occur when one is overwhelmed by the sudden, immediate realization of the fact that one's essence is of the chaosmic energy, released out of the perpetual fight between one's opposing forces in one's mind and body. This formless, raw energy, which constitutes the paradoxical basis of a human being, is the driving force behind one's creative and destructive acts. In this study, Byron's *Cain: A Mystery* and Lorca's *Blood Wedding* are mainly discussed as two noteworthy examples that corroborate the argument about how chaosmic energy is trapped and repressed in the social settings that see the boundless energy of the Self as a potential threat to the system. This study also focuses on the struggle of Cain and Leonardo each of whom is a "terrible beauty" that strives to let the trapped energy flow freely into the fissured chamber of the existing society. Though not necessarily a comparative one, this study aims to trace the dis-organization of the body in social and religious levels by drawing parallelism in the playwrights' perception of chaosmic energy of the Self.

There have been different interpretations made by various scholars on chaosmic energy. Some perceive it as the true nature of the Self; others regard it as a potential danger that has to be eradicated for the goodness of community. Artaud compares the chaosmic energy to "a body without organs,"[1] a term borrowed later by Deleuze and Guattari. For Artaud, it is the body outside the castrating law that has life and energy. He justifies this point with these lines:

---

[1] Antonin Artaud, *Selected Writings*, trans. Susan Sontag (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976), 571.

There is nothing more useless than an organ.
When you will have made him a body without organs,
then you will have delivered him from all his automatic reactions
and restored him to his true freedom.[2]

Deleuze and Guattari borrow the term "BWO" and define it as free-flowing, unrestrained energy, which is always in the process of becoming. It functions in a way to de-stratify, de-personalize, and to dis-organize the body by setting it free from any form of an organism.

This sort of energy may be liberating, but—as Bertalanffy observes in his *General System Theory*—the modern world is inclined to see it as a potential threat for its functioning system.[3] The system attempts to control every sphere of life lest any kind of individual acts should be threatening. Bertalanffy argues that the Self with such unpredictable energy may harm the system. Therefore, it must be canalized, engineered through the functioning understanding of the capitalist system. To his system theory, the Self is self-regulating machinery like computers. It has to be "mechanized, conformist, controlled and standardized."[4] Similarly, Sorokin, another social theorist, compares the Self to a cogwheel in the system that can easily be controlled by the dominating forces in the society.[5] Kennedy defines the fact of having to act in such predetermined roles, controlled by the society as "the protean Self"[6] The romantic Self, whose essence is formless, chaosmic energy, is considered an inappropriate entity for this functioning system. Thus, social systems have designed their structures in such a way to rehabilitate the rebellious individual. Such systems also consider that the flexible notions of the Self that celebrate multiplicity pose a huge threat to the big machine. Therefore, it is the system that tries to familiarize the individual with the possibilities of a protean mode of the Self and existence. Because of this notion, the individuals are canalized into predetermined spaces and roles by the totalizing institutions of the society.

To Artaud, yielding to such a controlling mechanism is one's suicide: "If I commit suicide, it will not be to destroy myself but to put myself

---

[2] Ibid., 571.
[3] Ludwig von Bertalanffy, *General System Theory* (New York: George Braziller Inc., 1973), 13.
[4] Ibid., 13.
[5] P. A Sorokin, *Sociological Theories of Today* (New York/London: Harper& Row, 1966), 558.
[6] Alan Kennedy, *The Protean Self: Dramatic Action in Contemporary Fiction* (London: Macmillan International Higher Education, 1974), 4-6.

back together again […] I free myself from the conditioned reflexes of my organs."[7] Likewise, Deleuze and Guattari see this functioning system as an enemy to BWO.[8] They argue that one can't apprehend the multiplicities within BWO unless the recoiling organization over the body is dissolved:

> "The BWO howls: They have made me an organism! They have wrongfully folded me! They have stolen my body! The judgement of God […] makes it an organism, a signification, a subject."[9]

The individual reciprocally sees the protean mode of the Self that is controlled by the system as a threat to his uniqueness. With its ideological apparatuses, the functioning systems canalize the people into the predetermined spheres and turn them to the willing prisoners in the blocks of civilization that is built upon some hegemonic and hierarchal orders. Ironically, over time, the people unconsciously become the volunteer army of the rehabilitation institutes of these functioning systems. Also, their willingness to act in the predetermined roles in the society unconsciously interrupts the dynamic relation between the de-structuring and re-structuring functions of the mind, which in turn suffices to subdue the unbridled energy of the individual in the social world. Thus, the free-flowing desire of the individual becomes one of the discontents that have to be repressed for the sake of the seemingly symmetrical order of the systems.

However, one weakness characterizing such rigid systems with the ossified principles is their fragility. The self-liberating energy leaks into any possible cracks of these rigid systems, gradually worn-off in time. However, the ones who have such higher consciousness are usually stigmatized by the existing societies as distorted and deformed figures. Their transgressions cause them to be ostracized, castrated, and emasculated by the guardians of the system. They become monsters, the grotesque in their contemporary societies as well as the sublime figures to future generations. The Greek term to characterize their ambiguous situation is "deinos,"[10] which means both repellent and admirable. They are, to use

---

[7] Antonin Artaud, *Artaud Anthology* (City Lights Books, 1965), 56.
[8] Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* (Bloomsbury Publishing, 1988), 176.
[9] Ibid., 176.
[10] Bernard M. W. Knox, *The Heroic Temper: Studies in Sophoclean Tragedy* (London: University of California Press, 1964), 23.

Yeats's words, a "terrible beauty"[11] that might disorganize the body. In this context, both Byron's Cain and Lorca's Leonardo are a "terrible beauty" aware of the unrestrained energy, repressed by the existing hegemonic order. Their rebellious acts enable them to find out the formless energy beyond the received forms and norms of the existing society.

The irony in the struggle between the individual and the functioning system lies in the realization that mankind creates the functioning system, which would eventually imprison oneself. As Popper argues in *The Open Society and Its Enemies*, men who call themselves the social engineers have designed the system in a way so as not to give any space for individualistic acts. Popper calls Plato one of the earliest social engineers. He labels him as an enemy to open society because of Plato's attack on the uncontrollable acts of the individuals in the following lines:

> The greatest principle of all is that nobody, whether male, or female should be without a leader. Nor should the mind of anybody be habituated to letting him do anything at all on his own initiative; neither out of zeal, nor even playfully […] In a word, he should teach his soul, by long habit, never to dream of acting independently, and to become utterly incapable of it.[12]

The perpetual war between the defenders and the enemies of the open society is not a new phenomenon. It dates back to the earliest times in the history of mankind since this ongoing fight arises as to the reflection of the internal warring forces within man's mind. For these warring forces, Nietzsche coins two terms in *The Birth of Tragedy*, the etymological origins of which are two Greek deities, Apollo and Dionysus. Nietzsche defines them as two opposing forces in perpetual antagonism in art, man, and life. The Apollonian is the symbolical reflection of illusion, individuation, form, and restraint. On the contrary, the Dionysian is the primordial formless state. Nietzsche claims that both forces are in ceaseless conflict with each other.[13] This paradoxical relation as Popper argues is the source of life. However, the problem in the functioning systems is that the Apollonian force prevails over the Dionysian force since the Self-ordained Dionysian force is not desired in the machine-like structures. One can observe this mechanic network in the eighteenth century, also called the

---

[11] William Butler Yeats, *Easter, 1916 and Other Poems* (Mineola: Dover Publications, Inc, 1997).

[12] Karl R. Popper, *The Open Society and its Enemies* Vol.1 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1966), 16.

[13] Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Birth of Tragedy*, trans. Douglas Smith (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 10-16.

Enlightenment period. The mechanic aesthetic of the rationalists hated the boundless energy of the Renaissance man, so they were on the quest for a complete, precise, and symmetrical vision of things.[14] The annihilation of the individual acts in the functional systems that have dominated Europe since the Enlightenment has led to the fierce philosophical and artistic rebellions in the following centuries.

The primary artistic mode of reaction is romantic irony. Schlegel introduces the Self-evolving system in his famous fragments. To Schlegel, the romantic irony is a way of thinking about the world that embraces change and process.[15] Schlegel ontologically sees the world as chaotic.[16] However, this chaos has an eternal flux of forms, always flowing into new ones and new creations. Schlegel sees the impotency in the rational image that is symmetrically reflected in the flat mirror. He replaces the flat mirror with a convex mirror since he realizes the abundant fertile land of the chaotic universe. The romantic ironist attempts to see the beauty in the teeming chaosmic energy and not the light of reason. The clear image becomes diffused and distorted. The crack in the "camera obscura"—the mind of the artist—causes distorted images of situations and characters and chaotic scenery. The Romantics' introduction of distorted figures and chaotic situations were harsh reactions against the controlling mechanisms. Their focus is on the romantic ironic Self that celebrates the chaosmic energy spreading out of the tension between the opposing forces. With this notion, the drastic change in taste and beauty made the grotesque figures both repellent and admirable at the same time even though the guardians of the system called them demonic. As Schock notes, the romantic hero displays several distinguishing attributes of this so-called demonic tradition and, in many ways, can be considered a rebel. This figure is an unconventional hero, dangerous, and destructive but attractive because he is greater than life.[17]

Byron himself—like his mouthpiece Cain—is a sort of deinos that is a sum of paradoxes. In Bloom's description, Byron is the embodiment of opposing forces. Byron "incarnated countless contradictions of thought

---

[14] M. H. Abrams, *The Mirror and The Lamp* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1953), 17-20.
[15] Friedrich von Schlegel, *Dialogue on Poetry and Literary Aphorisms* (Pennsylvania State University Press, 1968), 54.
[16] Anne K. Mellor, *English Romantic Irony* (Harvard University Press, 1980), 7.
[17] Peter A. Schock, *Romantic Satanism: Myth and the Historical Moment in Blake, Shelley and Byron* (Springer, 2003), 143-160.

and feeling. He bewildered and fascinated his contemporaries."[18] Though he was a nobleman who was supposedly in the Tories' side in the parliament, most critics labelled him as "a poet on the Left."[19] The inspirational source of his poetry is his revolutionary side, that is, his enthusiasm to redeem the individual from any sort of oppression, restraint, and authority. Dowden similarly notes that Byron glorifies all revolters against the social order. He also adds that "His mockery was a dissolvent of accepted conventions and traditional manners and morals."[20] In his works, Byron portrays his protagonists with some common attributes, which would label him as the originator of the Byronic hero. This romantic hero/heroine fights against the tyrannical order and has a distaste for the socially imposed roles. S/he is an outsider, a wanderer, and an exile. S/he is inclined to act transgressively. S/he suffers from gigantic passions and tends to be self-destructive. Overall, the Byronic hero gives the utmost value to the autonomous individual above others. In his influential study on Byron and Goethe, Mazzini defines the Byronic hero as the unbridled Self that manifests himself "in all its pride of power, freedom and desire […] the world around him neither rules nor tempers him. The Byronic Self aspires to rule it."[21] Manfred, arguably one of the best Byronic heroes, depicts the autonomous individual in these fascinating lines:

> The mind, which is immortal, makes itself
> Requital for its good and evil thoughts—
> Is its own origin of ill, and end—
> And its own place and time, its innate sense
> […]
> Born from the knowledge of its own desert.[22]

As the lines above imply, Manfred fully bears the responsibility of his actions free from all external/spiritual powers that would supposedly reign over his will. His Self-referential dramatic speech over the individual consciousness is the reverberating theme that echoes through Byron's oeuvre.

---

[18] Harold Bloom, ed., *George Gordon, Lord Byron* (New York: Infobase Publishing, 2009), X.
[19] Ibid., Xiii.
[20] İbid., 113.
[21] Guisseppe Mazzini, "On Byron and Liberty" in *Lord Byron: The Critical Heritage*, ed. Andrew Rutherford (Routledge, 2013), 331.
[22] George Gordon Byron Lord, *Manfred, A Dramatic Poem* (London: John Murray, 1817), 74.

The eponymous protagonist, Cain, like Manfred, features the Byronic hero as the measure of one's existence in Byron's closet play *Cain: A Mystery*, published in 1822. It attracted some controversial reviews upon its publication. Thomas Moore comments on the play in one of his letters to Byron: "Cain is wonderful—terrible—never to be forgotten."[23] Eckermann delivers Goethe's praise of the play with these words: "How the inadequate dogmas of the church work upon a free mind like Byron's, and how by such a piece he struggles to get rid of a doctrine which has been forced upon him."[24] Still, some reviewers fiercely attacked Byron's play. An anonymous reviewer sees the play as "an heinous offence against the society."[25] William Blake calls Byron's play blasphemous since he regards it as an attack against the justice of God.[26] To Franklin, these fierce attacks made the play censored and labeled Byron a representative of the so-called Satanic school.[27]

Byron's de-familiarization of the biblical story is his deliberate intention to voice out the annihilating forces of the arborescent system that suppresses one's free-flowing energy. Self-redemption from the imposed roles is inevitable despite the challenging path. Byron's understanding of freedom here is quite similar to Schelling's account of freedom in his *Ages of the World*. To Schelling, the path to freedom passes through one's awareness of the terror and evil hidden in one's dark chamber.[28] That is, the consciousness of the disease[29] in one's mind through one's rupture from one's unconscious roles in society leads one to one's highest potentiality to achieve freedom.

The dis-eased Cain's awareness of the disease in his community lines Byron with Schelling in terms of the concept of freedom. One can easily notice that all the characters surrounding Cain act in the predetermined roles. The camera is so fixed and limited that all the characters but for Cain are canalized through the fixed paths.

---

[23] Thomas Moore, *The Letters of Thomas Moore*, ed. Wilfred Sellers Dowden (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964), **quoted in** Andrew Rutherford, *Lord Byron: The Critical Heritage* (London: Routledge, 2013), 214.

[24] Johann Peter Eckermann, *Conversations with Goethe* (North Carolina: Lulu Press, Inc, 2016), **quoted in** Harold Bloom, ed., *George Gordon, Lord Byron* (New York: Infobase Publishing, 2009), 275.

[25] Ibid., 265.

[26] Ibid., 266.

[27] Caroline Franklin, *Byron* (London, Routledge, 2006), 23.

[28] Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph Schelling, *The Ages of the World* (Columbia University Press, 1942), 175.

[29] Schellling equates evil and terror with disease in his book.

> ***Cain.***
> My father is
> Tamed down; my mother has forgot the mind
> Which made her thirst for knowledge at the risk
> Of an eternal curse; my brother is
> A watching shepherd boy, who offers up
> […] and my Adah my
> Own and beloved she, too, understands not
> The mind which overwhelms me:[30]

The roles that his family holds unconsciously intensify Cain's torturing spirit. Cain's deeper questioning of the unreasonable punishment and the suffering he goes through, as well as his obligation to surrender to the external forces, enables him to have an immediate realization of the source of his existential suffering. Other characters who are trapped in the "camera obscura" refuse to accept those ontological questions.

> ***Adam.***
> Oh! my son, Blaspheme not: these are Serpent's words.
> ***Cain.***
> Why not? The snake spoke *truth*; it *was* the Tree of Knowledge;
> It *was* the Tree of Life: knowledge is good, And Life is good; and
> how can both be evil?[31]

Adam calls his words demonic. Adam, like other family members, ironically acts as the guardian and the prisoner of the system. His exhortation to Cain is a sort of warning for not trespassing the boundaries of the system. However, Cain's camera is already cracked and blurred. This exposes him to what Bataille calls the limit experience. It is where transgression lies when Cain radically puts the assigned roles into question. It is where Lucifer appears to push him to act transgressively. Lucifer acts as the embodiment of the higher consciousness that would set Cain's energy free from any constraints. Lucifer, wandering beyond and outside of "camera obscura," represents the crack on the wall of Cain's consciousness. He helps Cain fulfil his desires by reinforcing him to catch a glimpse of the possibilities which stand beyond the camera.

In Act II of the play, the two characters travel "o'er the gulf of the space" and go over the limits of their garden. The universe becomes smaller and smaller and appears as a congested little room lost in darkness

---

[30] George Gordon Byron Lord, *Cain, A Mystery* (London: High Holborn, 1824), 11.
[31] Ibid., 4.

now. With Lucifer, Cain travels across the innumerable stars and experiences the terrors and chaos and ascends to a level where familiar objects within the symmetrical chamber become unfamiliar. The moment of epiphany occurs when Cain is exposed to the sublimity and vastness of the universe and Death in this chaosmic travel. It is at this moment when he moves from being to becoming. By transgressing the boundaries of God, he uncovers the boundless energy in the universe, long unknown to him and his family till that moment. His knowledge of nothingness becomes his candle in his Self-becoming.

> ***Cain.***
> I had beheld the immemorial works
> Of endless beings; skirred extinguished worlds;
> And, gazing on eternity,
> [...]
> but now I feel
> My littleness again. Well said the Spirit,
> That I was nothing![32]

Once he crosses the limits of the heavenly order, Cain is overwhelmed by the sublimity of the universe. The sublime experience makes him aware of his "littleness" and "nothingness." His realization of the free-flowing energy intensifies his indignation and as Schelling argues brings him closer to evil and terror. Through the spilt blood of his brother Abel and the Self-exile in the aftermath of the event, Cain disorganizes the external constraints over his body. Rajan argues that Cain achieves Self-autonomy through the knowledge of death.[33]

Though almost a century lies between Lorca and Byron, some similarities may be traced in their perception of the paradoxical nature of man. Lorca like Byron defines himself as rebellious, innovative and anti-bourgeois: "The fight I must wage is enormous, for on the one hand I have before me the old school, and on the other I have the new school. And here I am, from the newest school, chopping and changing old rhythms and hackneyed ideas."[34] The implication is that Lorca was an unaccustomed figure in the conservative setting of Spain. Sorell notes that Lorca's

---

[32] Ibid., 55.
[33] Tilottama Rajan, "Something Not Yet Made Good: Byron's Cain, Godwin, and Mary Shelley's Falkner," in *Byron and the Politics of Freedom and Terror*, ed. Matthew J. A. Green and Piya Pal-lapinski (Palgrave Macmillan, London, 2011), 98.
[34] Leslie Stainton, *Lorca, A Dream of Life* (New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 1999), 78.

interest in the public matters of the time, his untiring efforts to infuse universality into his Andalusian culture that was poisoned with strict codes, and his alignment with the left-wing values in the years before the start of the Civil war in Spain all reflect his fervent, rebellious, and unbridled Self.[35] As Smith has rightly argued, Lorca is simultaneously "universal and particular."[36] Bunuel's description of Lorca further shows how extraordinary a person he was: "He [Lorca] was his own masterpiece […]. He himself, as an individual, far surpassed his work."[37]

Lorca's popularity partly results from his execution at the hands of the dictatorial regime of General Franco.[38] Their justification for his execution was his supposed homosexual affairs. In the aftermath of his death, he became the symbol of the Spanish Civil War. Though Lorca's popularity due to his scandalous execution is partly true, Lorca's genius as a poet/playwright is an undeniable fact. His travels around the world—particularly his visit to America and the rewarding years he spent at the Residencia de Estudiantes in Madrid in the 1920s—greatly contributed to his experimental art. It was an intellectual and cultural hub where he formed close ties with Luis Bunuel and Salvador Dali. He also became familiar with the new modernist movements, such as symbolism and surrealism. About his travel to America, an early critic says, "Lorca never left Spain […] He took the country with him in his suitcase."[39] As in Eliot's definition of the poet as a catalyst, Lorca functions as a catalyst that causes a fusion of the universal with the particular.

In his works, the awakened individual consciousness contradicts the socially imposed roles created by a social authority. The description of the Civil guard as a tyrannical figure who tortures gypsies in his *Gypsy Ballads* (1928) makes Lorca the incarnation of Delgado's "the transgressive other," a potential threat to the social order of the time. *Blood Wedding* (1933), one of Lorca's most famous rural tragedies, is an indirect attack upon the Spanish social order which is based on dogmatic

[35] Federico García Lorca, Martin Sorrell, and D. Gareth Walters, *Selected Poems: With Parallel Spanish Text*, (Oxford University Press, UK, 2007), 2.

[36] Paul Julian Smith, *The Body Hispanic: Gender and Sexuality in Spanish and Spanish American Literature* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989), **quoted in** Maria M. Delgado, *Federico García Lorca* (London and New York: Routledge, 2008), 3.

[37] Ibid., 11.

[38] Manuel Duran and Calvin Cannon, *Lorca: A Collection of Critical Essays* (Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1963), 5.

[39] Roberto G. Sanchez, *García Lorca: estudio sobre su teatro* (Madrid: Jura, 1950), **quoted in** Maria M. Delgado, *Federico García Lorca* (London and New York: Routledge, 2008), 17.

traditionalism and the Spanish code of honor.[40] Lorca's characterizations in the play are a deliberate creation that makes an implicit reference to the roles people are conditioned to have following the poisoned codes of the Spanish culture. Like Byron does in *Cain: a Mystery*, Lorca aims to redeem people from the automatic reflexes they unconsciously give in the cycle of some annihilating codes imposed upon them.

In *Blood Wedding*, only the protagonist, Leonardo, has a name. The other characters are presented through their roles in society. The characters' words and actions seem to be tamed and controlled; their dialogues move around family issues, marriage, fertility, and agricultural issues: "Mother**:** [...] That's what I love. Man, man, harvest, harvest."[41] Mother is imbued with allegorical significance since she acts like a guardian of the codes in the society. At the meeting with the Bride and her Father, the Mother questions the Bride about her duties in these lines:

> Mother... Do you know what-it is to be married. Child?
> Bride. I do.
> Mother. A man, some children and a wall two yards thick for everything else.[42]

This scene seems to be Lorca's deliberate creation to imply how people are identified with their assigned roles in society though involuntarily. The marriage institution is a rite of passage through which a woman must pass to be admitted as a member of the community. The Mother's examination of the Bride and her definition of marriage draw the ideal portrait of the woman in society. However, the Bride's short responses hint at the reluctant approval of this definition. Unlike the Mother, the Bride is highly skeptical of these familial roles attached to women. However, she does not dare to question the social status quo. The other characters seem to embrace their predetermined fate. Likewise, they are not able to voice them. Towards the end of Act I, Scene Two, the Wife and the Mother-in-law purge their anger and complaints metaphorically in the lullaby they sang to send the baby to sleep. They—consciously or unconsciously—take on roles that make them experience life like a prison.

However, Leonardo, whose name stands for "lion," carries the implications of a sublime potential to redeem himself from these predetermined roles. The energy of this lion is forced to flow in the

---

[40] David Earl Nordlund, *Authority, Power, and Dramatic Genre in the Theater of Federico Garcia Lorca* (USA: UMI Company, 1998), 16-17.
[41] Federico García Lorca, *Blood Wedding* (Dramatists Play Service Inc, 2002), 7.
[42] Ibid., 25.

predestined course. It is repressed within the chest of the beast for a long time. Leonardo, who was once in love with the Bride and forced to marry another woman, gets on the verge of transgression when he has heard that the Bride is about to marry. Leonardo's forbidden love for the Bride opens a crack in his seemingly symmetrical camera through which he trespasses the boundaries of his society. Leonardo's forbidden love for the Bride drives him to act transgressively:

> Leonardo: when I saw you afar
> I threw sand in my eyes.
> But then I climbed on my horse
> and the horse came to your door.
> my blood turned to darkness,
> it is the perfume that rises
> from your breasts and your hair.[43]

Like Cain, he has the limit-experience. Through the perfume, the higher consciousness that flows into the crevice in his chamber, he steps out of his socially assigned roles as a husband and a father. His awareness of his diseased mind suddenly changes the course of the events from the predetermined afflux. Like Cain's questioning, Leonardo's actions are seen as demonic. His acts are described through the Mother's similes. The Mother's comparison of Leonardo with a demon can be regarded as an implication of the mother's fear of Leonardo's transgressive energy as a potential threat to the perfectly regulated society: "Mother: No. Leonardo arrived, a few minutes ago, with his wife. He drove like a demon. His wife nearly died of fright. He travelled the road as though he was galloping it on horseback."[44] Moreover, the Bride's metaphorical contrast of the Bridegroom with Leonardo also implies the demonic attributes of Leonardo: "Bride: I was a woman on fire, wounded inside and out, and your son was a stream of water that could give me sons, land, health; but the other was a dark river that […] sent frost into the wounds of a poor withered woman, a girl scorched by the flames."[45] The Bride's attribution of Leonardo with the fiery and dark forces of nature helps unleash her suppressed desire to tear out the illusory roles imposed on her by the social status quo.

Consequently, Leonardo's diseased mind, which is described as demonic, leads him to act transgressively, and he eventually abducts the Bride, disregarding the norms of the society that are reflected in his wife's

---

[43] Ibid., 65.
[44] Ibid., 44.
[45] Ibid., 74.

reaction: "Wife: They've fled! They've fled, she and Leonardo. On his horse. She was holding him tight: they went past like the wind."[46] Their galloping on horseback into the forest is an implication of their wish to go back to chaos, free from any constraints. The Mother, as the guardian of the system, is furious about this violation of the code of honor and sends her only son to chase them for the sake of the code of honor of their family. She is so unconsciously attached to her role in her community that she dares to risk the life of her beloved son as she did for the other family members. The Mother figure is ironically a Self-alienated figure like the Wife, the Mother-in-law, and Neighbor who are unconsciously attached to their roles. Her worship of social duties renders her life meaningful. Her unyielding dependency on her duties in society is her illusory foundation on which she can sustain her existence. However, as I will briefly discuss in subsequent lines, she also begins to question the poisonous codes of her community though it is late.

In the last act, interestingly enough, three woodcutters and the Moon appear on the stage. The appearance of the surrealistic characters corroborates the argument that Lorca aims to fuse the Surrealistic techniques and the traditional elements on the Spanish stage. They function as a chorus and have a symbolical significance in that their echoing statements over the release of the blood from the body and their frequent references to death rather than living in a poisonous culture give an exhortation to the Spanish audience:

> Second Woodcutter: They followed their inclination: they were right to flee
> First Woodcutter: They tried to deceive themselves, but in the end blood proved stronger.
> Third Woodcutter: Blood!
> First Woodcutter: They followed the urge of their blood.
> Second Woodcuter: But blood that sees the light the earth soon drinks.
> First Woodcutter: So? Better to die of loss of blood than live with poison in your veins.[47]

The reference to the release of blood implies the necessity of the release of unrestrained energy to dis-organize the body from the Self-alienating roles prefigured by the functioning authorities. Like Cain, Leonardo here represents the transgressive other in society. The chaosmic energy which manifests itself as the forbidden Love in *Blood Wedding* transforms all things clear into grotesque and blurred visions that signal people's

---

[46] Ibid., 54.
[47] Ibid., 56.

questioning of the deified roles and codes in the society as the Mother does towards the end of the play when the fiancée appears before the mother asking to be sacrificed in atonement for her guilt. The mother questions the social values by saying: "What does your purity matter to me? What does your death matter? What does nullity after nullity matter to me."[48] In brief, in Lorca's *Blood Wedding*, the spilt blood of the characters over the earth brings forth a new fountain of life that questions the sanctified codes of the community.

Cain and Leonardo's case resembles that of Victor, the protagonist in Shelley's *Frankenstein*, who, in his youth, beholds the destructive but awful power of lightning as it strikes and shatters an oak tree close to his house:

> […] As I stood at the door, on a sudden I beheld a stream of fire issue from an old and beautiful oak which stood about twenty yards from our house; and so soon as the dazzling light vanished the oak had disappeared, and nothing remained but a blasted stump. […] I never beheld anything so utterly destroyed.[49]

The chaosmic energy of lightning cracks Victor's "camera obscura," leading him to transgress the limits of his boundaries and to explore his supreme autonomy as a creator and eventually to create his terrible beauty. Similarly, the epiphanic moments of the protagonists in the aforementioned plays happen at a time when the nibbling thoughts that have been repressed for a long time are set free by the crack of "camera obscura" as a result of the destructive energy of higher consciousness that has flashed upon their minds. In Lorca's *Blood Wedding*, the reflection of this higher consciousness is the concept of love; in Byron's *Cain: A Mystery* it is Lucifer, the exiled one. For Shelling, this is a path to sheer freedom; likewise, to Artaud, Deleuze, and Guattari, it is the process of the de-personification of the body from any form of structure. Although both Cain and Leonardo become the unwanted figures in the functioning systems, their rebellious natures against the controlling mechanism are admirable. Each of them is a "terrible beauty" that corroborates the notion that the essence of man is the chaosmic energy released from the ceaseless conflict of the grotesque and the sublime.

---

[48] Ibid., 75.
[49] Mary Wollstonecraft Shelley, *Frankenstein* (Stilwel, KS: Digireads, 2005), p. 20.

References

Abrams, M.H. *The Mirror and The Lamp*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1953.

Artaud, Antonin. *Selected Writings*, translated by Susan Sontag. Berkeley: University of California Press,1976.

Artaud, Antonin. *Artaud Anthology*. San Francisco: City Lights Books, 1965.

Bertalanffy, Ludwig von. *General System Theory*. New York: George Braziller Inc., 1973.

Bloom, Harold, ed. *George Gordon, Lord Byron*. New York: Infobase Publishing, 2009.

Byron, George Gordon Lord. *Cain, A Mystery*. London: High Holborn, 1824.

Mazzini, Guisseppe. "On Byron and Liberty." In *Lord Byron: The Critical Heritage*, edited by Andrew Rutherford, 330-341. Routledge, 2013.

Mellor, Anne K. *English Romantic Irony*. New York: Harvard University Press, 1980.

Moore, Thomas. *The Letters of Thomas Moore*, edited by Wilfred Sellers Dowden. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964.

Nietzsche, Friedrich. *The Birth of Tragedy*, translated by Douglas Smith. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Nordlund, David Earl. *Authority, Power, and Dramatic Genre in the Theater of Federico Garcia Lorca*. USA: UMI, 1998.

Popper, Karl R. *The Open Society and its Enemies* (Two Volumes). 5th ed. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1966.

Rajan, Tilottama. "'Something Not Yet Made Good': Byron's Cain, Godwin, and Mary Shelley's Falkner." In *Byron and the Politics of Freedom and Terror*, edited by Matthew J. A. Green and Piya Pal-Lapinski, 84-101. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.

Rutherford, Andrew. *Lord Byron: The Critical Heritage*. Routledge, 2013.

Sánchez, Roberto G. *García Lorca: estudio sobre su teatro*. Madrid: Jura, 1950.

Schock, Peter A. *Romantic Satanism: Myth and the Historical Moment in Blake, Shelley and Byron*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan 2003.

Schelling, Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph. *The Ages of the World*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1942.

Schlegel, Friedrich von. *Dialogue on Poetry and Literary Aphorisms*. Pennsylvania State University Press, 1968.

Shelley, Mary Wollstonecraft. *Frankenstein*. Stilwell, KS: Digireads, 2005.

Smith, Paul Julian. *The Body Hispanic: Gender and Sexuality in Spanish and Spanish American Literature*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989

Sorokin, P. A. *Sociological Theories of Today*. New York/London: Harper & Row, 1966.

Stainton, Leslie. *Lorca, A Dream of Life*. New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 1999.

Yeats, William Butler. *Easter, 1916 and Other Poems*. Mineola: Dover Publications, Inc. 1997.

CHAPTER THREE

A CULTURE OF MASOCHISMS
IN THE FIN-DE-SIÈCLE BRITISH FICTION

ENES KAVAK

Fin de Siècle, a French term referring to cultural and moral decline, or "degeneration", was a controversial period that destabilized and challenged the concerns and sensibilities of the culture and literature in England at the end of the nineteenth century. The era was characterised, on the one hand, with a recovery from a depressive century, brutal progress and socio-cultural uncertainties, and on the other hand, with a rise in the circulation of literature and the production of art that reveal the depths of human psyche by drawing borderline characters and displaying the obscenity, nonconformity, and eccentricity of the time. As the reviewer of *The Art Critic* magazine puts it, the representatives of *Fin de Siècle* were "a set of strange young men, dreamers and visionaries – often morbid, broken hearted, and poor, always nervous and impossible in society, whose first and last endeavour is to do something original, however odd and erroneous it may be."[1] Their literature, the critic maintains, was "a confusion of suppressed ideas, impulses, sardonized smiles, narcotic dreams, chronic mental catarrhs, ascetic efforts, godlike ideas, and the most absurd eccentricities and mannerisms."[2] Namely, this period's literature was saturated with non-normative psyches, distortions, and perversions. The authors eagerly embraced the concept of fantasy by depicting various forms of suffering, trauma and elusiveness as well as drawing portrayals of divergent and pervert sexualities. Thus, experiences, fears, and indulgences were absorbed by literary representations of transforming and turbulent society at the dawn of a new social and cultural epoch.

---

[1] "What is Fin De Siècle?" *The Art Critic 1*, no. 1 (1893): 9. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20494209.
[2] Ibid., 9.

Authors of the *Fin de Siècle* produced, either overtly or covertly, a plethora of representations and presentations of sexuality. Cultural and political anxieties over sexual degeneration and a new flood of literature were embodied and exacerbated by the circulation of dark or grotesque fictional characters such as Stevenson's Dr. Jekyll, Wilde's Dorian Gray, Sacher-Masoch's Severin, Doyle's Sherlock Holmes, Stoker's Dracula and others.[3] Among all these writers, Bram Stoker made an enduring impact on the popular culture of the twenty-first century with the adaptations and revivals of his astonishing character Count Dracula. Stoker's celebrated work championed the hegemonic position of imagination over objective realism of the Victorian literature and delved into the spirit of the *Fin de Siècle* culture, in which scientific innovations of the age clash unremittingly with human fantasies. This intriguing quality of Stoker's fiction led critics to explore the possible meanings and links of psychosexuality in the work as it proliferates with the Gothicism and deviant femininities as well as diverse forms of perversions such as sado-masochism, fetishism or necrophilism.

The fascination with the fictional delineations and examinations of sexuality at the *Fin de Siècle* was apparent in the period's literature, and this interest was further stimulated by Sigmund Freud's writings in the following decades. Considering Freud's claim that sexuality is the central component of the psychoanalytic theory, this was not unanticipated. Freudian psychoanalytic theory is dissident, not due to its introduction of new concepts but its reinterpretation of the boundaries of the normal and the acceptable, thus offering an intriguing spectacle into human psychology. A key section of his texts is the one attempting to elucidate the nature of perversions. For Freud, perversions like other aberrations from normal sexual formation are not unknown to human nature. He states that perversions are innate, but they vary in their strength and can be intensified by external conditions.[4] In fact, human beings undergo a sexual transformation from a primary pervert state, which is dominated by animalistic instincts pursuing satisfaction, to a "civilised" state, in which the congenital needs and desires are to be disciplined and repressed in the unconscious. In other words, human sexuality acts in the service of

---

[3] *Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* by Robert Louis Stevenson was published in 1886; *The Picture of Dorian Gray* by Oscar Wilde in 1891; *Dracula* by Bram Stoker in 1897; and the series of Sherlock Holmes by Arthur Conan Doyle first in 1887.
[4] Sigmund Freud, "Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality," in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: Volume VII*, trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001), 171.

civilisation, aiming for reproduction with a heterosexual object-choice.[5] He thus suggests that perversions are common in human beings, so they play a primary role in our constitution. But they are subjugated by the outer world for the sake of order, socio-cultural norms and expectations.

Though the literature on masochism has made it an extensively-discussed topic, the status of masochism in literature is ambivalent and problematic due to the complex and evasive nature of the theory. Richard von Krafft-Ebing outlined the term initially as "the wish to suffer pain and be subjected to force."[6] He said that the masochist "in sexual feeling and thought is controlled by the idea of being completely and unconditionally subjected to the will of a person of the opposite sex; of being treated by this person as by a master, humiliated and abused."[7] A later definition of the term came with Freud's comprehensive effort to conceptualise the nature of perversions in *Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality* in 1905. The essays set forth that "[perversions] probably emerge at the cost of the infantile sexual impulses themselves" and continued that "they consequently evoke opposing mental forces (reacting impulses) which, in order to suppress this unpleasure effectively, build up the mental dams […] [as] disgust, shame and morality."[8] Freud constructed his theory out of the conjecture that perversity is innate and constitutes a primary chapter of the biological and psychical maturation. Namely, perversions, which irrefutably exist in human disposition, are bound to be suppressed by the external factors. It may be inferred that whilst perversions seek to survive, civilised culture seeks to suppress, condemn or discard them. Perversions, themselves, via restraints and alterations create the standard sexual life. The reason why Freud strived to offer a plausible account of masochism throughout his career seems clearer seeing that he labelled masochism as the most important and prevalent form of perversions. In a way, appreciating the nature of masochism would mean appreciating the gist of perversions, thus of sexuality on the whole. As the continuation of the discussion, Philips asserted that "[m]asochism may be moral or physical and may offer differing possibilities across the gender divide. It may respond to a finite need - the rite of passage, for example- but there is

---

[5] Freud, "Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality," 191.

[6] Richard Freiherr von Krafft-Ebing was a nineteenth-century psychiatrist and the author of the influential work entitled *Psychopathia Sexualis*. Margot Weiss, "BDSM (bondage, discipline, domination, submission, sadomasochism)," in *The International Encyclopedia of Human Sexuality* (2015): 114.

[7] Roy F. Baumeister, *Masochism and The Self*. (East Sussex: Psychology Press, 2014), 3.

[8] Freud, "Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality," 178.

certainly a universal masochism, one that is essential to subjectivity, identity, the capacity to fantasise."[9] He described masochism both as a physical and mental concept.

Theories on masochism often associated it with human decadence and degeneration in the form of a natural aberration or perversion. Krafft-Ebing's concept of male masochism is a type of degeneration and stemmed from decadent fantasies as an unnatural aberration. In Freud's theory, on the other hand, this decadence is connected with fantasies of castration, fetishism, and phallic father/mother. The characteristics of the decadent literature, in this sense, include hysteria, homosexuality, masochism, androgyny, sadism, and criminality. Among all these, masochism refers to a type of character who suffers in pleasure or endorses masochistic reaction or pain, which directly inflicted on the physical body and indirectly on the depth of the subconscious. The physical and mental exaltation is ensured by the acts of physical and psychological punishment, injuries or torture. In the light of Kraft-Ebbing and Freud's aforementioned theoretical perspectives and readings, this chapter will attempt to investigate Bram Stoker's dealing with the concept of masochism in *Dracula*, which proliferates in the representations of masculinity/femininity and the constructions of (non-)normative sexualities.

Bram Stoker's *Dracula* is an exclusive work of creative fantasy and fiction, in which the late-Victorian sexual identities are presented in diverse forms. The story is initially set in Transylvania and later at a castle in a secluded part of the country. The whole story is told through the journal entries of different characters. Jonathan Harker, who is an agent of an English law company, sets out for Transylvania in order to provide Dracula with legal advice on the acquisition of an English estate. Briefly after Harker's admission to the Count's castle, a series of uncanny and supernatural incidents haunt him. It does not take long for him to realize that he is being held captive by the Count and the accompanying female vampires. Dracula secretly plans to settle down in England in order to spread his blood over the island and eventually conquer it. After several futile attempts, Harker succeeds in breaking away from the custody and flees back to England. In the meantime, an ensemble of people including Dr. John Seward and Professor Van Helsing pursue Dracula's activities and victims across the country. The former finds out that Lucy, a young acquaintance and lover, has been molested and bitten by Dracula. With the help of Van Helsing, they carry out a blood transfusion from his fiancé

---

[9] Anita Phillips, "Masochism and Literature, with Reference to Selected Literary Texts from Sacher-Masoch to Duras." PhD dissertation, 1995: 12.

Holmwood to Lucy, which, unfortunately, proves to be ineffective and does not halt her conversion into a lascivious but bloodthirsty creature. As a last resort, the group stabs her in the heart with a wooden stake, which is one of the few ways of killing remorseless and immortal vampires. The crew resolves to hunt Dracula down using their experiences and scientific knowledge. Mina's fall under his spell gives them the chance to interpret her visions under hypnosis and to track Dracula down. This empowers them to catch up with him in his final attempt to retreat to the castle in Transylvania. The novel ends with the group's definitive fight with Dracula at the castle, in which they slay him, and thus, defend themselves and their homeland from the malice and mayhem of the Count.

To begin with, a dichotomy of normative and degenerated femininity is portrayed by two female characters: Mina and Lucy as a part of the construction of masochism in the novel. Stoker differentiates two characters by idealising submission and faithfulness but reproaching non-conformity and mischievousness in women. He constructs Mina as an archetypal Victorian wife, who is reliable, faithful and self-sacrificing. Dr. Van Helsing describes her as "one of God's women, fashioned by His own hand to show us men and other women that there is a heaven where we can enter, and that its light can be here on earth."[10] Her character makes her a natural aide to menfolk more than an entirely self-governing individual. Dracula's molestation of Mina provides an insight into Dracula's pervert psychology and sadomasochistic relationship with his sufferers. His indifference to his victims' involuntariness and objections is juxtaposed with his cruel approach to the human body, which is a fictional representation of the controversy over degeneration and decadence of human physiology and psychology at the *Fin de Siècle*. Dracula describes Mina as the "best beloved one" to Harker as well as himself by calling her "flesh of my flesh; blood of my blood; kin of my kin; my bountiful wine-press for a while; and shall be later on my companion and my helper."[11] Mina, however, shows fidelity to Harker even after having been seduced by Dracula. Therefore, she is portrayed as the rightful survivor of Dracula's malicious mind and sadistic intentions. Dracula confirms that his target is not only to convert Mina but sadistically to leave the rest of the group tormented and agonised as a result of their loss. The idea of sexual and mental punishment, thus, entitles Mina and other female victims, a passive role, forcing her to a masochistic submission and recognition of agony and torture to save others.

---

[10] Bram Stoker, *Dracula* (New York: Cosimo, 2009), 161.
[11] Ibid., 246.

In *The Economic Problem of Masochism*, Freud describes this state of masochism as "feminine" in its nature. He states that the aim of any organism is to search for pleasure according to the pleasure principle. Pleasure actually acts as "the watchman over [human] life."[12] Contrary to that, masochism is a distorted form of primary sadism. Freud proposes four basic kinds: an "erotogenic," "feminine", and "moral,"[13] and a fourth one – "mental masochism" – which is used to describe those who "find their pleasure, not in having physical pain inflicted on them, but in humiliation and mental torture."[14] Masochism is also a consequence of the tension between the death instinct and the libido. The instinct of death- or destruction- is aimed at being destroyed by the libido, but it can only be diverted outwards, to the external world. This instinct is then "the destructive instinct" or "the instinct for the mastery" or "the will to power."[15] This partially turns into sadistic functioning of sexuality, but a part of it generates erotogenic masochism through sexual exaltation."[16] The feminine type cannot be restricted to women, but men can also have it. Why it is called "feminine" is chiefly due to its attachment to an overwhelming sense of guilt stemming from the sexual fantasies. And this sadomasochistic tendency is overtly performed by the characters in Dracula. In the Count's eyes, women are merely the prey of his desires and the victims of his biological and socio-political schemes. Mina's relation to Dracula is not more than total submission despite all the physical and psychological pain she knows she would have to endure. She declares she "was bewildered, and strangely enough, [she] did not want to hinder him."[17] However, as she is confronted with the idea of getting contaminated, she is horror-struck and disgusted with fear of confessing this self-indulgence and adultery to the others. Mina's sexuality is silenced to a level that her ideas on sexuality are often imperceptible or evasive.

In juxtaposition with Mina's idealised feminine qualities, Lucy is portrayed as a sexually-liberated and self-centered young girl, which can be followed in her responses to the advances of men. She corresponds to

---

[12] Sigmund Freud, "The Economic Problem of Masochism," in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: Volume XIX,* trans. by James Strachey (London: Hogarth, 1961), 159.

[13] Freud, "The Economic Problem of Masochism," 161.

[14] Quoted in the footnotes of Sigmund Freud, "Interpretations of Dreams." In The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud:, trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001), 165.

[15] Ibid., 163.

[16] Ibid., 163.

[17] Stoker, *Dracula*, 246.

Mina asking "why can't they let a girl marry three men, or as many as want her, and save all this trouble?" but self-consciously admits that "this is heresy, and [she] must not say it."[18] Her words reveal that she rejects the idea of self-effacing dedication to men, nor does she show the Victorian notions of ideal femininity, which includes the commitment to marriage and domesticity. Men like John Seward, Arthur Holmwood, Quincey Morris are all enchanted by her appeal and amiable persona, but the disappointment of rejection shapes these men's critical judgements of her. When she is cursed by Dracula, she left to be killed by her own fiancée as a punishment for her obscenity and self-indulgence in the eyes of her admirers. Therefore, this symbolic restoration of the order confirms that female sexuality is still a taboo and should be treated or restored by Victorian scientific and moral discourse.

Anxieties over women's active role in sexuality, even in the fictional portrayals, were pervasive and entrenched in the *Fin-de-Siècle* literature. Scientific and religious discourse led to art and literature producing varied images of evil in the form of female characters. Stoker's Dracula seems to have borrowed its portraits from the sources that were already in circulation for more than a century.[19] The Victorian female vampire takes another form, a "femme fatale" in the character of Lucy. Stoker deepens Lucy's sexual desires into a form of animalistic craving for human blood and soul, and, in turn, she loses her innocence and angelic beauty. As an evil vampire, she is the source of Freudian "abject" in the men's mind as both one of them and a nemesis to their masculinity and corporeal existence. The men are left with the lone reasonable solution: dismantling

---

[18] Ibid., 47.

[19] Charles Baudelaire, for instance, was one of the most influential artists in the second half of the nineteenth century and greatly influenced the *Fin-de-Siècle* art and literature through his poetry on aesthetic appreciation of beauty, evil and female sexuality. In the poem "The Metamorphoses of the Vampire," he depicts the reminiscences of a sadistic and seductive vampire lingering in the memories of her male victim. Baudelaire's poetic vampire is animalistic in her tempting physicality and hedonistic sensuality. The descriptions leave an overwhelming effect on reader as to how a man submits to the power of worldly indulgences in a sadomasochistic relationship with a devilish woman who declares "All conscience, in [her] bed, becomes compliance." This submission is also juxtaposed by the physical end of the union in the form of death. In the course of the poem, beauty, or corporeality, leaves the stage to the mortality and ephemerality of human life, which is the source of masochistic desire for the man's delight in the moment of exaltation and terror. The poem emphasizes the intensity of worldly pleasures and power of carnality over moral and spiritual struggle against physical excess and decadence.

her body to stop the looming corruption before it spreads throughout society. Her death creates another discourse of masochism due to the fact that it comes at the hands of her own husband, who simultaneously detests and desires to kill Lucy's evil body and her symbolical libertine status as one of the popular themes of *Fin-de-Siècle* fiction. This elimination of her corporeality restores the religious and moral order and contains any traces of emancipation that new women, both fictional and in reality, set out to achieve at the turn of the century.

A final analysis of sadomasochistic portrayals in Dracula entails a glance at the eponymous character and his "daughters," three female vampires. Historically, Dracula, as a legendary Romanian leader and commander, produced several myths about an obscure, immortal, sexually attractive man, whose name, "Son of the Devil," denotes his devilish intentions.[20] As a proud aristocrat and cold-blooded murderer, Dracula is the embodiment of satanic temptations and post-human faculties. His nature thus evoked the abject fears of late-Victorian readers and, turning the character into one of the most memorable embodiments of sexuality and horror in popular culture.

Dracula engages in sadistic performances by feeding on, dictating and sexually assailing human beings. At the beginning of the novel, he impulsively moves to lick Harker's neck because of a shaving cut. This homosexual inclination makes his choice of victims more ambivalent and problematic to decipher. Stevenson states that "the horror we feel contemplating Dracula is that his are fundamentally incestuous"[21] and he maintains that "the novel does concern how one old man ("centuries-old," he tells us) struggles with four young men(and another old, but good, man, Dr. Van Helsing) for the bodies and souls of two young women."[22] In a psychoanalytic reading, Harker, Lucy, and Mina all demonstrate a passive (masochistic) tendency towards the figure of authority – the symbolic father. Freud explains that masochism primarily arises from "the Oedipal Complex." He also states that both active and passive tendencies exist concurrently in the same person, and whilst sadism is identified with activity, masochism is related to the passivity.[23] Therefore, Dracula's authority on and indifference to the physical or psychological pain that he inflicts can best be read as an incestuous father figure punishing his own

---

[20] McNally, Raymond T., and Radu Florescu, *In Search of Dracula: The History of Dracula and Vampires* (Houghton: Mifflin Harcourt, 1994), 3.
[21] John Allen Stevenson, "A Vampire in the Mirror: The Sexuality of Dracula." *PMLA* 103, no. 2 (1988): 139. doi:10.2307/462430.
[22] Ibid.
[23] Freud, "Beyond Pleasure Principle," 7-67.

children. The patriarchal domination of his subordinates entitles him to be the sole biological and spiritual father of new generations, which can be traced in his plan to sexually attract Mina and Lucy as his punishment of men around them.

To better theorize this sadomasochistic tendency, Freud asserts that while the ego is masochistic, the superego is sadistic and the wish, to be punished by a parental figure in fantasies, is very close to the wish, to have a sexual relationship with him in the oedipal context. Thus the masochist is supposed to do anything to get the chance of punishment even if his existence is put in danger. Freud accentuates how two fundamental instincts' counteraction and resolution shape the psyche, triggering the flames of sadism and masochism. Furthermore, categorisation of masochism indicates that masochism may also be a moral phenomenon as well as a sexual one in view of the fact that in one type the figure of authority is the father, and moral masochism may be initiated by other father figures as well as cultural and social forces.

Harker's description of the castle as an "awful den of hellish infamy" also reveals the fact that the castle is a safe haven for sexual fantasies and centuries-old atrocities. The count has his women accompanying him at the castle, but he is also driven with a sadistic intent of kidnaping more women and tormenting his own sex as a consequence. The daughters of Dracula also realise their carnal fantasies of devouring children and enticing men into their death bed. Harker's passive role in his dealings with Dracula and subsequent encounters with female vampires show a sadomasochistic interracial and intersexual relationship between vampire and human races. Harker describes his first meeting with the female vampires in the following way:

> I felt in my head a wicked, burning desire that they would kiss me with those red lips. [...] There was a deliberate voluptuousness which was both thrilling and repulsive. […] I closed my eyes in a languorous ecstasy and waited—waited with beating heart.[24]

He clearly finds himself in a realm of unrestrained fantasy and exploration outside the human reach within the physical and psychological borders of the castle. The atmosphere permits the active and cruel disposition of men as their cruelty turns to others as much as themselves. Harker's fantasy with the three female vampires is crushed by Dracula with his reprimand of the female vampires who disobey his absolute authority. He sadistically punishes them by not permitting them to feed on Harker. Harker's

---

[24] Stoker, *Dracula*, 32-33.

acceptance of his fate, in the form of surrender to the greater powers, indicates he is controlled by a death drive in the midst of exaltation. This also echoes Freud's explanation that "the ego seeks punishment, whether from the superego or from the parental powers outside; to illustrate, teachers and authorities, self-chosen models, heroes and destiny.[25] This outer force is more powerful and domineering than his physical and psychic make-up. Therefore, he is forced to surrender to the flirtatious performances of the vampires in hallucination and his fantasy of feminine control over his body becomes almost a reality. However, Harker, in contrast to Lucy or, Renfield, a mad character captured and slain by Dracula, achieves to control himself by not surrendering completely to the fantasy and showing moral and physical resistance to the masochistic impulses. His redemption, in turn, comes through his resistance to further temptations, thus fighting for the re-establishment of moral and sexual energies in the defence of other women, particularly his wife Mina. That is, Dracula's overt sadism is countered by Harker's and other characters' taming of their masochist impulses. Freud states that the dependence of the subject and the object in sexual act epitomizes itself in the dual relationship of sadism and masochism: the existence of masochism would not be probable without the existence of sadism.[26] The control of Harker and others over their masochisms, in turn, terminates the primal and sadistic intentions of Dracula by leaving him deserted and vulnerable in this new and disruptive order.

In conclusion, the nineteenth-century theories of masochism and its sadistic element underwent constant conversions in Kraft-Ebbing's and Freud's writings. For Freud, masochism, as well as sadism, are innate components of the organic and psychic progress of human sexuality. In the earlier stage of his construction of a theory on sexuality, he determines that masochism is not a primary phenomenon but a conversion of primary sadistic instincts. Afterwards, he offers a new theory based on two sets of conflicting instincts- ego and sexual ones- the presence of which ensures the continuation of organic life. Leo Bersani suggests that "masochism which founds sexuality is at once threat to life, and an evolutionary conquest which protects life".[27] The dual nature of human sexuality again repeats itself in the text as to instincts and their overall functions. A revision of his previous theory of masochism comes with the paper *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, but it is not until the emergence of *The*

---

[25] Freud, "The Economic Problem of Masochism," 168.

[26] Ibid., 159.

[27] Leo Bersani, *The Freudian Body: Psychoanalysis and Art*. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1986), 92.

Economic Problem of Masochism that Freud puts the theory on a more stable basis, extending the basis of masochism to both sexual and social sphere. Given all, Freud's endeavour to create a credible theory on masochism, sexuality in principal, is seemingly a process of generating, evaluating and regenerating. But he manages to indicate perversions are attached to the human sexual disposition which is perverse and destructive in nature. In a sense, he "himself relentlessly pursues the project of domesticating and rationalizing the sexual in a historical narrative and a psychic structure."[28]

Popular fiction of *Fin de Siècle* dealt with sexuality and its representations in various forms. Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, in this respect, offers a rich source for examination of creative fantasy and pervert sexuality in a setting for the clash of primal instincts and civilised identities. Stoker's portrayal of female/male sexuality takes the form of a conflict between sadism and masochism. Female sexuality, in this division, bears innate feminine masochism in contrast to the sadomasochistic dualism in the constitution of men. Women's role appears to be more conventional and normative in the eyes of Stoker as Lucy never achieves a sense of mental freedom and physical autonomy out of the boundaries of patriarchal moral norms. Mina's ultimate recovery from Dracula's spell also underlines her passive consent to the masculine heroism. As Harker, Van Helsing and Seward go through an enduring struggle against their symbolic father, Dracula and his female agents, they overcome their masochistic impulses in order to thwart the sadistic tactics of the Count. The novel thus ends with a note of social and biological stability and the regulation of extreme primal instincts. Their conversion into the acceptable practises is safeguarded by the civilisation. Thus Stoker dismisses the old order and prophesies the coming of the new century at a time when the English readers are barraged with fantastical and often degenerated portrayals of the human psyche.

References

Baumeister, Roy F. *Masochism and The Self*. East Sussex: Psychology Press, 2014.

Bersani, Leo. *The Freudian Body: Psychoanalysis and Art.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1986.

Freud, Sigmund, "A Child is Being Beaten: A Contribution to the Study of the Origin of Sexual Perversions." In *The Standard Edition of the*

---

[28] Ibid., 102.

Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: Volume XVII, translated by James Strachey London: Vintage, 2001, 175-205.

Freud, Sigmund, "Beyond the Pleasure Principle." In *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: Volume XVIII*, translated by James Strachey London: Vintage, 2001, 7-67.

Freud, Sigmund, "Interpretations of Dreams." In The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, translated by James Strachey London: Vintage, 2001.

Freud. Sigmund, "The Economic Problem of Masochism." In *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*: *Volume XIX,* translated by James Strachey London: Hogarth, 1961, 159-70.

Freud, Sigmund, "Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality." In *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: Volume VII,* translated by James Strachey London: Vintage, 2001, 123-249.

Houston, Gail Turley. "Bankerization Panic and the Corporate Personality in Dracula," in *From Dickens to Dracula: Gothic, Economics, and Victorian Fiction*, 112-131. Cambridge University Press, 2005. https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511484841.006.

Laplanche, J, and J. B. Pontalis. *The Language of Psychoanalysis*. London: Karnak Books, 1988.

McNally, Raymond T., and Radu Florescu. *In Search of Dracula: The History of Dracula and Vampires.* Houghton: Mifflin Harcourt, 1994.

Phillips, Anita. "Masochism and Literature, with Reference to Selected Literary Texts from Sacher-Masoch to Duras." Ph.D. dissertation, 1995.

Silverman, Kaja. "Masochism and Male Subjectivity." In *Male Subjectivity at the Margins* (2017), 185-213. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203699676-7.

Stevenson, John Allen. "A Vampire in the Mirror: The Sexuality of Dracula." *PMLA* 103, no. 2 (1988): 139-49. DOI:10.2307/462430.

Stoker, Bram. *Dracula*. New York: Cosimo, 2009.

Weiss, Margot. "BDSM (bondage, discipline, domination, submission, sadomasochism)," in *The International Encyclopaedia of Human Sexuality* (2015): 113-196.

"What is Fin De Siècle?" *The Art Critic 1*, no. 1 (1893): 9. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20494209.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE ILLS OF TIME IN SHERWOOD ANDERSON'S *WINESBURG, OHIO*

ŞENOL BEZCI

On July 25, 1926, Virginia Woolf happens to spend some private time with Thomas Hardy and Mrs. Hardy just two years before Hardy's death. Naturally, they speak about literature and fiction. Hardy does not seem to be very happy about the new developments in fiction; he says "they have changed everything now… we used to think there was a beginning and a middle and an end. We believed in the Aristotelian theory. Now one of those stories comes to an end with a woman going out of the room" and he giggles.[1] One cannot help hearing the voice of a sad and frustrated old Hardy mourning over the changing times, shifting fashions and the development of a new style of writing. As an old wise man, he can still giggle and still see something funny about the shape of the novel and perhaps about his situation at that time. If Hardy adopts a lamenting voice, Herbert Reads' voice is angry and bitterly frustrated when in 1933 he wrote:

> […] There have of course been revolutions in the history of art before today. There is a revolution with every new generation […]. But I do think we can already discern a difference of kind in the contemporary revolution: it is not so much a revolution which implies a turning-over, even a turning back, but rather a break-up, devolution, some would say a dissolution. Its character is catastrophic. The aim of five centuries of European effort is openly abandoned.[2]

---

[1] Virginia Woolf, *A Writer's Diary: Being Extracts from the Diary of Virginia Woolf*, ed. Leonard Woolf (London: Triad Grafton Books, 1987), 97.

[2] Herbert Read, *Art Now: An Introduction to the Theory of Modern Painting and Sculpture* (London: Faber and Faber, 1933), **quoted in** Randall Stevenson, *Modernist Fiction: An Introduction* (Worcester: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1992), 5.

Read was not reported to have giggled while writing these lines.

What Hardy and Read refer to are modernist tendencies that can be placed in the period between 1890 and 1960s. Hardy and Read are objecting to a new generation of people who reject certain traditions of representation in art and literature and who have introduced new styles that they think are better suited for the concerns of the modern times. What Hardy personally refers to is probably stream of consciousness, free indirect speech, interior monologue, autotelic forms of expression and other modernist narrative devices. He must be also referring to Marx, Darwin, Nietzche, Bergson, and Freud—as well as to the Bolshevik Revolution, World War I and the Great Depression—because social constructs such as ethics, politics, and literature cannot be exempt from other social and historical forces that they are in counteraction with. Therefore, the new form of writing Hardy encapsulates through a lack of a beginning and an ending is just one of the signs of a greater change in life. As Walter Kalaidjian writes,

> […] modernism […] refers not just to an art movement, a literary period term, or a particular cultural nationalism but, more broadly, signals the expansive paradigm shift emerging at the *fin de siècle*. It encompasses global contexts of social change roughly between 1890 and 1939 in industry, commerce, technology, politics and aesthetics […]. [3]

Hardy and Read form a sharp contrast to the Italian Futurists who welcomed the new age as can be inferred from and read in their manifestos embellished with a bombastic diction and fascistic ideas. The change in the *Weltanschauung* was felt drastically all around Europe and America. According to Malcolm Bradbury,

> …[The] process was international, and shook all the major convictions and explanations crucial to nineteenth-century thought. But it was to function with an especial force in the United States, the nation most committed to the future, to modernization […]. [4]

At the turn of the century, America transformed from an agrarian to an urban society which required an industry take-over. Every business became big business to survive as Corporate America was then being built

---

[3] Walter Kalaidjian, "Introduction," in *The Cambridge Companion to American Modernism*, ed. Walter Kalaidjian (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008), 4.
[4] Malcolm Bradbury, "'Years of the Modern': The Rise of Realism and Naturalism" in *The Penguin History of Literature:American Literature to 1900*, ed. Marcus Gunliffle (London: Penhuin Books, 1993), 318.

brick by brick. Demography changed due to the new wave of European immigrants; life acquired a greater speed and mobility thanks to the automobile and highways. The period also marks the beginning of the consumer culture fueled primarily by the media industry which was then limited mostly to newspapers and magazines. More and more people started to live and work in skyscrapers, one of the symbols of the new America. At the same time, a deep sense of alienation and disconnectedness was felt as a result of all these rapid developments and the aftermath of World War I. People readily enjoying the comfort and hedonism provided by the new century grew suspicious about the great American myths of Puritanism, self-reliance, and the frontier experience. As a result, the modernist experience posed itself as:

> A change in something as fundamental as the relation of mind and world— a kind of epistemological shift, from relative confidence towards a sense of increased unreliability and uncertainty in the means by which reality is apprehended in thought.[5]

As it happens in all cases of rapid social change, some celebrate the change, some object to it, and some even regress into the past either to make sense of the new age or find consolation in the past; what is progress to one is decay and degeneration to another. Embracing or glorifying all the values of the present or the past is already unthinkable for a critical mind. Sherwood Anderson presents such a case with his much-noted short story cycle *Winesburg, Ohio*. A correct understanding of Anderson's motivation for and conviction in writing is more than hinted at in his dedication of the book to his mother. In the dedication, he writes: "To the memory of my mother [...] [w]hose keen observations on the life about her first awoke in me the hunger to see beneath the surface of lives [...]."[6] Technically, Anderson is a modernist who refuses to abide by the dictates of the popular taste in the fiction of his time and takes a special interest in the truth about the individuals hidden underneath the surface. He writes about the ills of time at the beginning of the century. Alongside many themes such as alienation, lack of communication, frustration, and sexual repression, he takes the bold step of looking into the consciousness of the modern persona and questions the viability of religion in modern life. He

---

[5] Stevenson, *Modernist Fiction*, 11.
[6] Sherwood Anderson, *Winesburg, Ohio* (New York: Dover Beach Publications, 1995), iv.

illustrates that modern life "attended by all the roar and rattle of affairs"[7] has shaken man's belief in God.

Sherwood Anderson can be viewed to belong to the third major generation of serious American short story writers. Washington Irving, as the founder of American short story, paved the way for Poe and Hawthorne who as a group invested in the gothic and the supernatural in varying degrees and fashions. Gothic and romance were followed by the vein of realism and naturalism represented by Henry James, Theodore Dreiser, Mark Twain, and Stephen Crane. Though and perhaps because Anderson is historically closer to the second generation, strict adherence to mirroring life as an artistic duty does not thrill him. In "A Note on Realism," from his book *Sherwood Anderson's Notebook*, he simply writes: "My own belief is that the writer with a notebook in his hand is always a bad workman, a man who distrusts his imagination. Such a man describes actual scenes accurately, he puts down actual conversation."[8] Anderson's passion as a writer lies somewhere beyond the "accurate" depiction of "actual scenes"; he refuses to abide by the mimetic function of art. In reply to a probably imaginary young writer who praises a book saying "it is the very life. So closely observed,"[9] he says "[…] art is art. It is not life."[10] Anderson values imagination over the accurate rendering of reality and distinguishes between two kinds of life represented in a text: the life of reality and the life of the fancy. He believes authors create a life out of their imagination which is grounded in reality but harnessed through the art of the author.[11] Without the creative touch of the author, the copied slice of life is pointless:

> [...] people do not converse in the book world as they do in life. Scenes of the imaginative world are not real scenes. The life of reality is confused, disorderly, almost without apparent purpose, whereas in the artist's imaginative life there is purpose. There is determination to give the tale, the song, the painting Form—to make it true and real to the theme, not to life.[12]

---

[7] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 34.
[8] Sherwood Anderson, *Sherwood Anderson's Notebook* (New York: Boni and Liverlight, 1926), 75.
[9] Anderson, Notebook, 71.
[10] Anderson, Notebook, 72.
[11] Anderson, Notebook, 71-72.
[12] Anderson, Notebook, 75-76.

One substantial part of Anderson's poetics of short story is, then, rejection of mimesis. Another is a rejection of the commercial form of short fiction.

The second half of the nineteenth century and the early twentieth century witnessed an immense increase in magazines which were good venues and sources of income for short story writers. In return for the benefits of the magazines, authors had to succumb to the demands of the editors and the publication policies of the magazines committed to serving the taste and preferences of the audience. Anderson is not trying to satisfy the editors, or the audience or the critics. In a letter he wrote to George Freitag, Anderson defines the compromising short stories as "nice little packages, wrapped and labeled in the O. Henry manner."[13] As can be gathered from the letter, such stories are mostly about the well-off part of the American society; they are highly commercial, sterile, and driven by plot. He, in brief, refers to the term "the genteel tradition" that George Santayana coined in 1911.[14] Because Anderson does not go with the flow and rejects writing "little packages of life," he was condemned and accused of writing obscene stories in *Winesburg, Ohio*.[15] Ironically, a critic also told him that his short stories do not have a definite form; unknowingly echoing Thomas Hardy, the critic said "there must be a beginning and an end" in a story.[16]

Winesburg, Ohio consists of twenty-two short stories, the first one of which was written in the fall of 1915.[17] The stories were published as a whole collection in 1919. Most of the short stories are tied to each other loosely through George Willard, the young reporter of the only newspaper of the imaginary town of Winesburg. While the book can be read as a Bildungsroman illustrating the development of George Willard, we are presented with a large cast of people from the town and their daily dealings in a changing society in the 1890s at "the threshold of a century that brought the changes of modern industrial alienation (which had long been effected in Pittsburg, Cleveland and Chicago) to even the rural

---

[13] Sherwood Anderson, "Four Letters (1916-1939)," in *Sherwood Anderson: A Study of the Short Fiction*, ed. Robert Allen Papinchak (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1992), 68.
[14] Douglas Mao, "Modern American Criticism," in *The Cambridge Companion to American Modernism*, ed. Walter Kalaidjian (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008), 289.
[15] Anderson, "Four Letters," 70.
[16] Anderson, "Four Letters," 69.
[17] Judy Small, *A Reader's Guide to the Short Stories of Sherwood Anderson* (New York: G. K. Hall & Co., 1994), 7.

hamlets of the Midwest."[18] Consequently, we are not presented with a small pastoral town defined by its people's solidarity and harmonious coexistence. On the contrary, most stories deal with the theme of alienation and people's difficulty in relating to each other. In this respect, the short story cycle form which enables the use of independent short stories linked to each other through the common locality and common character(s) is the best form for emphasizing the theme of alienation. At one level, all the stories are individual and distinct from each other. At another level, all these stories are related to each other as all outcasts are akin to each other. The people of Winesburg, either alienated or not, all belong to the same community though they are individuals who cannot communicate with each other. Meindl states:

> […] These grotesque figures 'inhabit' self-contained short stories that, nevertheless, in their totality form an artistic whole. This artistic whole, in turn, represents the community that fails to function […]. In this manner, the text's configuration makes modern alienation and lack of communication palpable.[19]

The piece titled "Godliness," the longest piece of the collection, reveals the cause of alienation and suffering and is heavily embellished with descriptions of time before modernity and after modernity. The short story is about three generations of the Bentley family dating back to antebellum America and extending into modern times. Before the civil war, Tom Bentley owns a farm and works on it with his four sons trying hard to clear the land for farming. The narrator states:

> They lived as practically all of the farming people of time lived […]. The four young men of the family worked hard all the day in the fields, they ate heavily of coarse, greasy food, and at night slept like tired beasts on beds of straw […]. On Saturday afternoons they hitched a team of horses to a three-seated wagon and went off to town. In town they stood about the stoves in the stores talking to other farmers or to the store keepers […]. Their hands as they stretched them out to the heat of the stove were cracked and red […]. When they had bought meat, flour, sugar and salt, they went into one of the Winesburg saloons and drank beer. Under the influence of drink the naturally strong lusts of their natures, kept suppressed by the heroic labor of breaking up new ground, were released.

---

[18] Thomas Yingling, "*Winesburg, Ohio* and the End of Collective Experience," in *New Essays on Winesburg, Ohio,* ed. John W. Crowley (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1990), 108.

[19] Dieter Meindil, *American Fiction and the Metaphysics of the Grotesque* (Missouri: University of Missouri Press, 1996), 140.

> A kind of crude and animal-like poetic fervor took possession of them
> […].[20]

The Bentleys' life is not unique; it depicts the traditional Puritan life decorated with hard work and suppression of desires. This life does not belong only to the Bentleys; they live like others in the town.

Yet, life soon changes. As the narrator later explains, life changes with industrialization, popularization of media, an increase in means of transportation, and other social influences:

> In the last fifty years a vast change has taken place in the lives of our people […]. The coming of industrialism, attended by all the roar and rattle of affairs, the shrill cries of millions of new voices that have come among us from over seas, the going and coming of trains, the growth of cities, the building of the interurban car lines that weave in and out of towns and past farmhouses, and now in these later days the coming of automobiles has worked a tremendous change in the lives and in the habits of thought of our people of Mid-America. Books badly imagined and written though they may be in the hurry of our times, are in every household, magazines circulate by the millions of copies, newspapers are everywhere. In our day a farmer standing by the stove in the store in his village has his mind filled to overflowing words of other men. The newspapers and magazines have pumped him full. Much of the old brutal ignorance that had in it also a kind of beautiful childlike innocence is gone forever. The farmer by the stove is brother to the men of cities, and if you listen you will find him talking as glibly and senselessly as the best city man of us all.[21]

The narrator of the short story views the influences of technology and urbanization, the rise of media, and the widespread popular culture to negatively affect the shaping of the new age. Reading permeated by the spirit of popular culture is singled out as the most important factor of change for two possible different reasons. Anderson's first objection to reading is poetical. By defining these books as "badly imagined" and "written […] in the hurry of […] times,"[22] he distinguishes between valuable and popular writing. Working in the industry of media as a writer, an editor, and an owner of a newspaper, Anderson knows how the business of publication functions. As a writer who disregards the example of O. Henry, he believes that "[…] wrapping life up into neat little packages […] [is] betraying life."[23] More importantly, Anderson takes no interest in

---

[20] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 30.
[21] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 34.
[22] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 34.
[23] Anderson, "Four Letters," 69.

reassuring "the comfortable" and comforting "the self-deceiving"[24] American. What he objects to as a new component of modern life is not reading itself but popular fiction written "badly." Anderson's second objection to reading is ideological. The popularization of reading and the accumulation of ideas that were previously foreign to ordinary human beings have an ideological effect on the average reader and they are tokens of a much bigger change. These new ideas, whatever they might be, have an impact on the mind of the average American. New ideas coming from reading are presented as a negative influence on the traditional belief system because in the previous era,

> men labored too hard and were too tired to read. In them was no desire for words printed upon paper. As they worked in the fields, vague, half-formed thought took possession of them. They believed in God and in God's power to control their lives. In the little Protestant churches they gathered on Sunday to hear of God and his works. The churches were the centre of the social and intellectual life of the times. The figure of God was big in the hearts of them.[25]

Consequently, one effect of reading popular books, newspapers, and magazines—just one facet of the modern life—is the blow dealt to faith in God: with the rise of modernism faith in traditional Christianity wanes.

The believer's doubt is ironically illustrated through Jesse Bentley—one of Tom Bentley's sons—who is a very religious man. He is such a fanatic believer that he wants to live in the age of men for whom God himself "had come down out of the skies and talked to these men and he wanted God to notice and to talk to him also."[26] Yet, he is aware that

> the atmosphere of old times and places that he had always cultivated in his own mind was strange and foreign to the thing that was growing up in the minds of others. The beginning of the most materialistic age in the history of the world, when wars would be fought without patriotism, when men would forget God and only pay attention to moral standards, when the will to power would replace the will to serve and beauty would be well-nigh forgotten in the terrible headlong rush of mankind toward the acquiring of possessions, was telling its story to Jesse the man of God as it was to men about him.[27]

---

[24] Ray Lewis White, *Winesburg, Ohio: An Exploration* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1990), 9.
[25] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 34.
[26] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 33.
[27] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 40-41.

Jesse is well aware that the times have changed and the traditional values of faith hold no more in society. He is critical of society and time but he does not recognize that like many people of his society, he is also caught in the frenzy of money-making. At the beginning of the short story, his ambition is to be the "chosen servant"[28] of God and to create a land of God. During a night walk,

> Jesse thought that as the true servant of God the entire stretch of country through which he walked should have come into his possession […]. Into Jesse's mind came the conviction that all of the Ohio farmers who owned the land in the valley of Wine Creek were Philistines and enemies of God.[29]

That is how he decides to enlarge his property and accuses his father and his brothers of not having done so earlier. Yet, his hunger for being the chosen servant is accompanied by his hunger for wealth:

> Jesse […] then also hungered for something else. He had grown into maturity in America in the years after the Civil War and he, like all men of his time, had been touched by the deep influences that were at work in the country during those years when modern industrialism was being born.[30]

He starts buying machinery that enables him to employ fewer workers and starts reading newspapers and magazines that tell him how easily shrewd tradesmen make money. "The greedy thing in him wanted to make money faster than it could be made by tilling the land."[31] He develops the habit of traveling to Winesburg to talk to his banker son-in-law about ways of making money. After such a visit, he returns to his farm at night to observe that his ambition to be the servant of God is not unmitigated:

> Later when he drove back home and when night came on and the stars came out it was harder to get back to the old feeling of a close and personal God who lived in the sky overhead… Jesse's mind was fixed upon the things read in newspapers and magazines, on fortunes to be made almost without effort by shrewd men who bought and sold.[32]

---

[28] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 33.
[29] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 35.
[30] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 40.
[31] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 41.
[32] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 41.

Anderson, therefore, resorts to irony and uses Jesse Bentley to illustrate the loss of faith. Whatever he is determined to do for God eventually fails. He even loses his faith at times: "Sometimes he was altogether doubtful and thought God had deserted the world. He regretted the fate that had not let him live in a simpler and sweeter time […]."[33] Even his attempt to sacrifice a lamb for God is aborted by his grandson who— he thinks—will follow him in his enterprise and maintain his legacy.

Jesse falls prey to industrialism—the most dominant feature of modernity—which is a great threat to individuality; in a letter to his son Robert, Anderson asserts "Who has cried out more sharply than myself against the coming of industrialism, the death of individualism, the modern world?"[34] He further notes that industrialism is related to both the standardized and material goals of the American Dream and newspapers and magazines. Thus he writes to George Freitag: "Publishers of books, of magazines, of newspapers are, first of all businessman."[35] Consequently, *Winesburg, Ohio* criticises industrialism by illustrating its negative influence on the lives of the Winesburg citizens. Like all other stories, "Godliness" is a character story that illustrates the experience of a character rather than a certain ensuing plot. Yet, continuous references to life before and after the change in the society move the story from the confines of a character study to social commentary. In that respect, we can read the short story as the death of "pioneer innocence and rise of materialism."[36]

"The Strength of God"—the second short story related directly with religion in *Winesburg, Ohio*—provides a moderate representation of religion, but it is in no way close to the glorification of faith. "The Strength of God" is the story of Reverend Curtis Hartman, who experiences a serious crisis of faith at the age of forty, after working at the Presbyterian Church of Winesburg for ten years. Like Jesse Bentley, he sees himself in the service of God, and he always repeats a line in his private prayers: "Give me strength and courage for Thy work, O Lord!"[37] The elders of the church trust him and the townspeople like him, but his incessant prayer asking for help from God indicates a sense of insecurity and guilt. He is as ambitious as Bentley and equally vulnerable in his devotion. Anderson goes below the surface of the respected façade and confronts him with a

---

[33] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 40.
[34] Anderson, "Four Letters," 66.
[35] Anderson, "Four Letters," 71.
[36] Adli Odeh, "Symbolism in Sherwood Anderson's *Winesburg, Ohio*," *International Journal on Studies in English Language and Literature* 2, no. 12 (December 2014): 56.
[37] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 86.

testing situation that appears in the form of a modern woman. His study
room in the bell tower of the church happens to face the window of a room
on the second floor of a house where the school teacher Kate Swift lives.
One Sunday morning, while Hartman prepares his sermon, he catches the
glimpse of the bare shoulders and white throat of the teacher smoking and
reading a book in her room instead of attending the service in the church.

What he sees is not particularly erotic or stimulating, but he is shocked
because, as a priest, he is supposed to suppress his sexual desires and
forbidden thoughts. Moreover, his experience with women has been, as the
narrator states, "somewhat limited."[38] His marriage was initiated and
realized almost entirely by his wife. Before he starts watching Kate Swift,
he would consider himself "fortunate" in marriage and "had never
permitted himself to think of other women. He did not want to think of
other women. What he wanted was to do the work of God quietly and
earnestly."[39] In his later thoughts, he would blame his wife for being
"ashamed of passion"[40] and robbing him of erotic satisfaction. On the
other hand, the woman he peeps at is a modern woman. She has a
profession, she is known to have had an adventurous life before coming to
Winesburg, and she is free-spirited as her night walks indicate. She might
even be a flapper because she smokes in her room. Hartman's idea of
propriety is so strong that he is shocked to see a woman smoking even
though she is in her private room, and he immediately remembers that she
spent some time in Europe and lived in New York City for two years.
Europe, New York City, and smoking signify sin to him, and this probably
renders her more tempting. He suppresses the excitement he gets out of
watching her and starts to hope that "on future Sunday mornings he might
be able to say words that would touch and awaken the woman apparently
far gone in secret sin."[41]

As the story progresses, Hartman becomes more and more obsessed
with her. He starts watching her secretly at night as well. Kate Swift is
unaware of him and probably is untouched by his sermons, but the
reverend is invaded by his temptation day by day. His desire to simply see
the bare shoulders turns into kissing them when he accepts his carnality.
He tries to transfer his lust to his wife, then blames her of being ashamed
of the passion, and feels cheated of his manhood. He pleads power from
God again but ends up blaming him for implanting such a temptation in
him. He even thinks of giving up his profession and going "to some city

---

[38] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 88.
[39] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 88.
[40] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 90.
[41] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 87.

and get into business."[42] Ironically, his salvation comes through the unsuspecting teacher. In his last attempt to peep at her, he first sees her bed:

> Then upon the bed before his eyes a naked woman threw herself. Lying face downward she wept and beat with her fists upon the pillow. With a final outburst of weeping she half arose, and in the presence of the man who had waited to look and think thoughts of the woman of sin began to pray.[43]

He runs out of the church in frenzy and gets into George Willard's office to talk to the only person he can find at that late moment of the night. He gets into a fit of talking and before he leaves Willard's office in a sense of victory, he says:

> 'The ways of God are beyond human understanding,' […]. 'I have found the light,' […]. 'After ten years in this town, God has manifested himself to me in the body of a woman.' […] 'What I took to be a trial of my soul was only a preparation for a new and more beautiful fervor of the spirit. God has appeared to me in the person of Kate Swift, the school teacher, kneeling naked on a bed. […] Although she may not be aware of it, she is an instrument of God, bearing the message of truth.[44]

How Hartman gets to this conclusion is for the reader to interpret. Probably seeing her praying at a moment of crisis makes Hartman realize that she is more than a sex object, an object of lust. He perhaps recognizes that beyond that sinner who once lived in New York City and went to Europe—the cigarette-smoking temptress— there is the tormented soul of a woman that should be saved. This recognition probably provides the strength of God he has been asking for since the beginning of the short story. However, because Anderson does not write short stories in the fashion of O. Henry—that is, with a moral lesson explained for the reader at the end—it must be noted that "The Strength of God" is an open-ended short story.

Hartman's religious rhetoric, as well as the pathos and the logos of the writer, most probably made the contemporaneous conservative readers sympathize with and feel happy for the reverend at the end of the short story. Yet, we should keep in mind that Hartman's struggle to stop watching the teacher secretly is a long process of trying and failing. When

---

[42] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 90.

[43] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 91.

[44] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 91-92.

he first sees her through the window, he simply closes the window and takes himself to work, hoping that "he might be able to say words [in his sermons] that would touch and awaken the woman apparently far gone in sin."[45] However, his desire to touch the ears of the teacher turns into the desire to touch her bare shoulders. In a sermon, he advises people not to despair: "In your hour of sin raise your eyes to the skies and you will be," he says, "again and again saved."[46] He, himself, is tempted again and again. On a Sunday morning, after a sleepless night because of his thoughts about the teacher, he goes out for a walk and, picking up a piece of stone, he goes to his study and breaks out the corner of the window so that he can easily watch the teacher all the time. When he is taken over by the thought of the teacher, he once raises his eyes to the skies and says: "Intercede for me Master [...] keep me in the narrow path intent on Thy work."[47] Then, he asks for divine help to have the power to repair the hole in the window. Not getting the help or the power, he blames God: "What have I done that this burden should be laid on me?"[48] Hartman crosses over the narrow path many times, and almost nine months pass before he sees Kate Swift praying naked. Only then does he break the window completely. Now he has to get the window fixed and his vision will be blocked completely, which implies that he has not mustered the power to overcome his temptation but relies on an external factor to stop him. In short, Hartman's continuous struggles to stop spying on Kate Swift and his making sense of why God tests his faith constitute the heart of the short story. He fails in both struggles several times, which implies this might be another unsuccessful stage in his effort. Who can guarantee that he will not break the window again? Who can ensure that he will not defy God again? Therefore, "The Strength of God" is without a definite end, and referring back to Thomas Hardy, we may conclude that this is another story that ends with a man leaving a room.

The title of *Winesburg, Ohio* rightly denotes locality rather than temporality. All the stories take place in an imaginary town in Ohio, but the town is not time-proof. Time is a huge factor that leaves an ineradicable mark on the individuals and institutions of the town. Because Anderson writes about the town during a transition phase of the American society from pre-modern to modern society, almost all the characters are depicted in a state of crisis. There are almost no characters who lead a comfortable and peaceful life for they are witnesses and victims of one age

---

[45] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 87.
[46] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 89.
[47] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 89.
[48] Anderson, *Winesburg,* 89.

abruptly invading another age. Therefore, the main characters of "Godliness" and "The Strength of God" are victims of the instruments of the new age. Both men want to devote their lives to God, but the new facets of modern life catch them unawares. Bentley's faith is challenged and ruined by industrialism that started sweeping America right after the Civil War, and whether Hartman can restore and maintain his faith is not obvious, but it seems he will be tested again and again by the new definitions of the gender roles in the stated period of modern America.

References

Anderson, Sherwood. *Winesburg, Ohio*. New York: Dover Beach Publications, Inc., 1995.

Anderson, Sherwood. *Sherwood Anderson's Notebook*. New York: Boni and Liveright, 1926.

Anderson, Sherwood. "Four Letters (1916-1939)." In *Sherwood Anderson: A Study of the Short Fiction*, edited by Robert Allen Papinchak, 64-73. New York: Twayne Publishers. 1992.

Bradbury, Malcolm. "'Years of the Modern': The Rise of Realism and Naturalism." In *The Penguin History of Literature: American Literature to 1900,* edited by Marcus Cunliffe, 317-352. London: Penguin Books, 1993.

Kalaidjian, Walter. "Introduction." In *The Cambridge Companion to American Modernism*, edited by Walter Kalaidjian, 1-11. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008.

Mao, Douglas. "Modern American Criticism." In *The Cambridge Companion to American Modernism,* edited by Walter Kalaidjian, 284-307. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008.

Meindl, Dieter. *American Fiction and the Metaphysics of the Grotesque*. Missouri: University of Missouri Press, 1996.

Odeh, Adli. "Symbolism in Sherwood Anderson's Winesburg, Ohio." *International Journal on Studies in English Language and Literature*. 2, Issue 12 (December 2014): 54-61.

Papinchak, Robert Allen. *Sherwood Anderson: A Study of the Short Fiction*. New York: Twayne Publishers, 1992.

Small, Judy Jo. *A Reader's Guide to the Short Stories of Sherwood Anderson*. New York: G. K. Hall & Co., 1994.

Stevenson, Randall. *Modernist Fiction: An Introduction*. Worcester: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1992.

Woolf, Virginia. *A Writer's Diary: Being Extracts from the Diary of Virginia Woolf,* edited by Leonard Woolf. London: Triad Grafton Books, 1987.

White, Ray Lewis. *Winesburg, Ohio: An Exploration.* Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1990.

Yingling, Thomas. "*Winesburg, Ohio* and the End of Collective Experience." In *New Essays on Winesburg, Ohio*,
edited by John W. Crowley, 99-128. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1990.

CHAPTER FIVE

THE GREAT WAR IN VIRGINIA WOOLF'S FICTION

GÖNÜL BAKAY

Widely regarded as one of the greatest writers of British modernist fiction, Virginia Woolf was greatly affected by the concept and reality of war both in her private life and writing career. Despite all the criticisms, psychiatry as a leading medical expert has changed the lives of millions of people as a result of the pharmacological revolution and psychotherapeutic methods that took place in the mid-20th century. However, it is important to remember that despite the understanding J. C. Reil initiated against the stigmatization of sick people 200 years ago, it is too optimistic to say that this effort has achieved its full purpose today. We are not yet close to fully understanding the causes and mechanisms of mental illness. Nevertheless, important ongoing research in the fields of biology, genetics, and psychology is showing hope that progress has been made on the path Reil pointed out, being aware of the huge and devastating impact of mental illness on individual lives. However, as Karen Levenback points out: "Woolf's life and work have not been seen to have been directly affected by her experience of the Great War, even by those who have a biographical interest in Woolf."[1] Levenback further suggests that in several novels, including *Mrs. Dalloway* and *To the Lighthouse*,

> Woolf demonstrates a progressive awareness of the ways in which the situations of soldiers and civilians are linked by the very realities of war that are ignored both by history and theory. […] An important connection among the novels is seen as their narratives focus on the ways characters,

---

[1] Karen L. Levenback, *Virginia Woolf and the Great War* (New York: Syracuse University Press, 1999), 4.

or narrators themselves, respond when the language of war is so deprived
of its emotional underpinnings that war itself cannot be described. [2]

So Woolf adopts a wider angle through which she scrutinizes the
phenomena of war while focusing also on the fact that- ultimately-
representing the full scale of the horrors of war is impossible since one
does not have the vocabulary to write about the unspeakable. Within this
context, this paper aims to examine the treatment of war and its impact on
human lives in Virginia Woolf's three famous novels: *Mrs. Dalloway, The
Waves* and *To The Lighthouse.*

Virginia Woolf's celebrated masterpiece *Mrs. Dalloway* deals with the
traumas of war both on the societal and the individual levels. As Mahinur
Akşehir Uygur, Atalay Gündüz and Eda Burcu Çetinkaya point out:
"Although Septimus is the outstanding figure representing war neurosis in
the text, Clarissa Dalloway appears as the ignored victim of the same
trauma. Septimus was haunted by his experiences, Clarissa by fear, a sense
of loss and helplessness."[3] By constructing her novel along the axis of two
parallel narratives, those of Septimus and Clarissa, Woolf seems to
suggest that war has affected the lives of not only soldiers but also
civilians. As Philip D. Beidler also maintains: "In Mrs. Dalloway, the
chief representatives of war trauma include the mad, shell-shocked veteran
Septimus Smith, but also the upper-class party-giver and hostess Clarissa
Dalloway, who has notably lost her health and her earlier vision of life
through a near fatal infection with Spanish influenza."[4]

Septimus Warren Smith comes back to England as a deeply traumatized
young man, like so many others, following his first-hand experience of the
realities of warfare as a soldier in the First World War. In particular, he
remains haunted by the death of his best friend Evans on the battlefield.
Unable to adapt to life as a civilian, he is also deeply tormented because
society is - by and large- indifferent to his pains. The two doctors who treat
him, Dr. Holmes and Dr. Sir William Bradshaw, fail to understand him and
seem to be indifferent to his suffering. All they care about is getting their
money and spending it on their private hobbies. "Woolf's creation of Dr.
Holmes and Sir William Bradshaw represents the mistrust towards and the

---

[2] Levenback, *Virginia Woolf*, 7.
[3] Mahinur Uygur Aksehir et al., "The First World War and Women as the Victims
of War Trauma in Virginia Woolf's Novels," *IAFOR Journal of Arts and
Humanities* 4, Special Issue (Winter 2017): 3.
[4] Philip D. Beidler, "The Great Party-Crasher: Mrs. Dalloway, The Great Gatsby,
and the Cultures of World War Remembrance," *War, Literature and the Arts*,
(January 2013): 1-22.

ensuing rejection of human nature through institutionalisation."[5] In the novel, both doctors who see Septimus prescribe rest and a strict diet, thinking he will benefit from this treatment. They don't try to understand him, nor do they even try to communicate with him. As a result, Septimus is very much affected by the insensitivity of the people around him.

Soon after the war, Septimus marries Rezia from Milan thinking that he could have a normal life. However, the marriage turns out to be very dysfunctional since his traumatising experiences in the war have made him apathetic to the sufferings of others. He loves his wife, is aware of her unhappiness, yet he can not do anything to change the situation. He simply says: "I can't feel." Lucrezia wants to have a baby and doesn't want to be left alone in a foreign country all by herself. She feels very lonely and quite desperate mainly because her husband is ill and she has no one to confide in. In a way, then, Lucrezia too can be considered a victim of war and her sadness has several symptoms including weight loss: "Look! Her wedding ring slipped-she had grown so thin It was she who suffered – but she had nobody to tell."[6]

Rezia eventually confronts Septimus after five years of married life and tells him that she wants a baby. She cries for the first time in front of him. "At tea Rezia told him that Mrs. Filmer's daughter was expecting a baby. She could not grow old and have no children! She was very lonely, she was very unhappy! She cried for the first time since they were married. Far away he heard her sobbing; he heard it accurately, he noticed it distinctly; he compared it to a piston thumping. But he felt nothing."[7] This quote accurately reflects how far removed Septimus is from the realities of life, including the suffering of the person who is supposed to be closest to him. He has certainly become a shadow of himself, damaged beyond repair due to his wartime experiences. He continues to process everything in his life through the filters of his wartime memories.

Another character who is deeply influenced by war is Miss Killman who is dismissed from her teaching job because her surname sounded German. She makes a visit to the tomb of the "Unknown Warrior" because her brother was killed in the war. Killman represents the modern women of the era who were very well educated and yet because of the shortage of jobs for women after the war, they could not find jobs easily. Unfortunately, Miss Killman herself is not in a good position financially and like many British suffragettes, she was against the war. It is reported that 63 percent

---

[5] Mahinur Akşehir Uygur , et al., "Mrs. Dalloway Revised: The Sense of Change and Disillusionment,"" *SEFAD* 38, (2017): 134.

[6] Virginia Woolf, *Mrs. Dalloway* (London: Hogarth Press, 1921), 34.

[7] Woolf, *Mrs. Dalloway*, 136.

of young girls who were over twenty, only 38 percent were married because of the great number of deaths of young men in 1920.[8]

The events described in *Mrs. Dalloway* take place in one day in 1923. Although it has been nearly five years since World War I ended, the after effects of war can still be felt in every family and the residual horror of war still permeates the atmosphere of London. Even an advertising plane reminds all people watching it of German planes. *Mrs. Dalloway* portrays Clarissa's return to society after her illness. Yet, neither Clarissa nor the society she lives in has totally recovered:

> For it was the middle of June. The war was over, except for someone like Mrs. Foxcroft at the embassy last night eating her heart out because that nice boy was killed and now the old Manor House must go to a cousin; or Lady Bexborough who opened a bazaar, they said, with the telegram in her hand, John, her favorite killed; but it was over; thank Heaven over.[9]

As this quote illustrates, the war on the ground might be over but its effects are still visible and strongly felt, especially by people who have lost loved ones.

The imagery of war permeates the novel, thus enhancing the atmosphere of gloom. One of these images is "falling leaves." Since leaves normally fall in autumn and not in the month is June, the falling of leaves successfully gives an autumnal air and vibe to a bright summer day. The boy soldiers lay a wreath at the Cenotaph and Peter Walsh muses about them:

> A patter like the patter of leaves in a wood came from behind, and with a rustling, regular thudding sound, which as it overtook him drummed his thoughts, strict in step, up Whitehall… Boys in uniform, carrying guns, marched with their eyes ahead of them.[10]

Like many of these young men, Septimus had no clear idea of what he was getting into when he enlisted for the army. We are told that:

> He went to France to save an England which consisted entirely of Shakespeare's plays and Miss Isabella Pool in a green dress walking in a

---

[8] Mark Hussey, ed., *Virgina Woolf and The War* (New York: Syracuse University Press,1991), 162

[9] Woolf, *Mrs. Dalloway*, 5.

[10] Ibid., 4.

square. There in the trenches, the change which Mr. Brewer desired when
he advised football was produced instantly, he developed manliness.[11]

At first, Septimus is pleased with himself when he can coolly withstand all
the horrors of war and yet very soon afterward he finds out that he has lost
his capacity to feel and to really care about people and events.

It is important to note that Woolf's *Mrs. Dalloway* shows the responses
of people from different segments of society to war. In this sense, both
Clarissa and her husband Richard reflect the feelings of the British
aristocracy to war. Clarissa feels a distance from all that is happening due
to war since her experience of war is mainly mediated through second-
hand news from her friends and acquaintances. Although Peter Walsh
severely criticizes Clarissa for only caring about her "parties," she can't
bring herself to be interested in political events. She cares more about her
roses than the Armenians. She can not even distinguish between Albanians
and Armenians. Clarissa's friend Peter Walsh, on the other hand, muses
about the sufferings of people caused by war and England's endorsement
of imperialism and convention. After leaving Mrs. Dalloway's house,
Peter encounters a group of soldiers marching with their guns on their
shoulders. He observes:

> Boys in uniform, carrying guns, marched with their eyes ahead of them,
> marched, their arms stiff, and on their faces an expression like the letters of
> legend written at the base of a statue praising duty, gratitude, fidelity, love
> of England.[12]

Like Septimus, many of these young men are conditioned by romantic
notions of nationalism and heroism before they encounter the harsh
realities of war. And many, again like Septimus, cannot survive the
devastating realities of war mentally even if they survive it physically. The
tragic death of Septimus towards the end of the novel reminds readers that
some people choose suicide rather than living death when their traumas
remain unresolved. What makes Septimus' suicide even more poignant is
that he loves life and feels almost "compelled" to take his own life since
he cannot bear living like a zombie: "But he would wait till the last
moment. He did not want to die. Life was good. The sun hot."[13] The two
parallel narratives finally converge with this suicide to which Clarissa
responds with the following:

---

[11] Ibid., 94.
[12] Ibid., 55.
[13] Ibid., 221-222.

> Always her body went through it first, when she was told, suddenly, of an accident; her dress flamed, her body burnt. He had thrown himself from a window. [...]Death was defiance. Death was an attempt to communicate; people feeling the impossibility of reaching the centre, which, mystically, evaded them; closeness drew apart; rapture faded, one was alone. There was an embrace in death. [...] She felt somehow very much like him – the young man who had killed himself. She felt glad that he had done it; thrown it away. The clock was striking. The leaden circles dissolved in the air. He made her feel the beauty; made her feel the fun. But she must go back. She must assemble. She must find Sally and Peter.[14]

This felt affinity with Septimus does not last long as Clarissa belongs to the world of the living. Yet as long as it lasts, the empathy Clarissa feels for Septimus shows how people - so different from one another in every way - can be connected with an invisible chord by means of shared feelings and sentiments.

Virginia Woolf visits the theme of the Great War once again in another masterpiece: *To the Lighthouse*. According to Goldman: "Like much of its contemporary poetic elegy, too, *To the Lighthouse* speaks more generally of the dead of the Great War, and of the passing of one way of life to a radically different one, practically and philosophically, a transition made possible by the social and political changes that accompanied the war."[15] So the spectre of war continues to haunt post-war Britain which has been fundamentally transformed into a strikingly different society. The dynamics underlying this transformation, both on societal and individual levels, is the subject of the novel. "Even the landscape reflects the scars of war, though nature herself feels nothing and looks with equanimity upon man's meanness and misery."[16] The continuing suffering of humanity in the face of a seemingly indifferent universe exacerbates the sense of loneliness and isolation within the wider scheme of things.

Woolf uses the "The Window" section in *To The Lighthouse* as a vista through which she suggestively elaborates on the subject of war. In this part, Woolf quotes examples of war poetry, showing that war poetry does not have the same meaning it had at a specific time in history as time passes. Mr. Ramsey mentions "someone had blundered" from Lord Tennyson's "The Charge of the Light Brigade" six times in this section. Mr. Ramsey's repetition of the lines six times makes the lines lose their

---

[14] Ibid., 243-244.
[15] Jane Goldman, *The Cambridge Introduction to Virginia Woolf* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 60.
[16] T.E. Apter, *Virginia Woolf: A Study of her Novels* (London: The Macmillan Press, 1979), 87.

meaning. Those lines reflect a particular moment in history but may lose their meaning in another context. Apparently, Mr. Ramsey does not comprehend the horrors of the Battle of Balaclava or he wouldn't compare the blunders of the officers with his present blunders: "He shivered, he quivered… All his vanity, all his satisfaction in his own splendour, riding fell as a thunderbolt, fierce as a hawk the head of his men through the valley of death, had been shattered, destroyed. Stormed at by shot and shell, boldly we rode and well, flashed through the valley of death, void and thundered-straight into Lily Briscoe and William Bankes."[17]

Woolf also experiments with the space-time continuum in the "Time Passes" section. The Ramsey family returns to their home, hoping to restore the former order and serenity after the war. Woolf gives the announcement of deaths in brackets as if she is mentioning unimportant events, though every household has experienced a loss in the war. The old order had collapsed, both at home and in society, whereas deaths are mentioned as if they are casual events. All in all, the war and its devastating effects continue to haunt the characters who have survived it.

In the same section, Mrs. Mc Nab (the cleaner) visits the now dusty and shabby house after the family had left it for some years. The cloths have moths, the books are wet from winter's humidity. They had to be taken out and left in the sun for some time. Mrs. Mc Nub was old now. Her legs were aching. It was too much work for one woman. She reminisced about the Ramsey family of the olden days:

> She (Mrs. Ramsey) had a pleasant way with her. The girls all liked her. But dear, many things had changed since then (she shut the drawer); many families had lost their dearest. So she was dead, and Mr. Andrew killed; and Miss Prue dead too, they said with her first baby, but everyone had lost someone these years. Prices had gone up shamefully, and didn't come down again neither.[18]

As one account after another illustrates, a deep sense of loss and gloom has enveloped those who survive the war. This thematic thread that runs through the novel gives it a powerfully expressed elegiac tone: "Woolf's text dislocates literary and elegiac conventions that historically furnished solace in the wake of painful loss; it also links her specifically modernist disintegration of novelistic unity to the legacy of the Great War."[19]

---

[17] Virginia Woolf, *To The Ligthouse* (London: Hogarth Press,1927), 30.
[18] Ibid., 130.
[19] Tammy Clewell, "Consolation Refused: Virginia Woolf, The Great War, and Modenist Mourning," *Modern Fiction Studies* 50, No.1 (Spring 2004): 210.

Woolf believes that it is ultimately impossible to truthfully express the full meaning of war, a catastrophic event that is not only objectively analyzed but also subjectively construed by all individuals who are touched by it. She tries in this novel to analyze it from various perspectives while examining what changes it brings to the lives of different people. As Megan Mondi observes, Woolf "was determined to use war as a vehicle through which she and her readers could gain fuller insight into her ever evasive question: What is the meaning of life?"[20] In this sense, the treatment of war in the novel is intricately linked with wider existential questions that have preoccupied humanity since the dawn of time, as is the case with *Mrs. Dalloway* and *The Waves*. Woolf herself remained very much interested in and preoccupied with existentialist questions throughout her life and dealt deeply with these issues in her work. Perhaps she hoped that her readers would be able to find a viable answer or an insight into this question in the shattered, chaotic life of the post-war years.

In *The Waves*, Virginia Woolf once again depicts the changes that the war and the passage of years have brought to the lives of six friends. A masterpiece of high modernism, the novel describes "the diurnal progress of the sun across a seascape and landscape, interwoven with nine multivocal sections of interrelated soliloquies by Bernard, Jinny, Louis, Neville, Rhoda, and Susan, from childhood to maturity."[21] The different chapters portray the prevalent atmosphere of doom and gloom in Europe. The six friends form a microcosm and their lives reflect the turbulences of our world.

According to Scarry, war is "unmaking the World" since "by causing pain, it reverses the process of imagining and it destroys the very origin of world-making – the body. For war's purpose is to injure-to cause bodily pain-and thereby to destroy the verbal, material, and ideological signs that constitute the culture embodied in those individuals who are fighting."[22] So the damage wreaked upon and the destruction of individual bodies is connected with the wider destruction of the national body and the socio-cultural structure embedded in it. From this perspective, it is not only the victims on the battlefield but also the whole socio-cultural as well as the economic fabric of societies that are destroyed in warfare. War and post-war trauma even affect the ways in which people filter and process information in their environment.

---

[20] Megan Mondi, "You Find Us Much Changed: The Great War in To the Lighthouse," *The Delta* 1, No.1 (2006): 12.
[21] Goldman, *Virginia Woolf*, 69.
[22] Judith Lee, "This Hideous Shaping and Moulding," in Mark Hussey, ed., *Virgina Woolf and The War* (New York: Syracuse University Press, 1991), 181.

Percival, portrayed as some kind of "God", is the member of the group who devotes himself to furthering the project of British imperialism in India and dies for it. When he arrives he brings order and thus he is the hero all his friends adore. Moreover, he is the person who unites all the friends. Bernard describes Percival during the first dinner party with the following words:

> He is conventional; he is a hero…. We who yelped like jackals biting at each other's heels now assume the sober and confident air of soldiers in the presence of their captain…Sitting together now we love each other and believe in our own endurance.[23]

So Percival has this magnetic and also commanding presence that transforms the environment he is in. As Judith Lee observes:

> Percival makes it seem that the body itself can not be wounded, and that by extension the culture (the "World" he embodies) can not be unmade. Therefore, even though he embodies a militaristic ideal, Percival's existence apparently precludes war because it seems impossible that the cultural ideals he represents could be either contested or altered.[24]

Given his centrality to their lives, Percival's death is felt by his friends as a bleeding wound, a continuous source of pain. "Their grief is not depicted primarily in terms of what they feel, but in terms of what they see- or, more precisely, their emotions are explained by the way the world appears to them."[25] It is even possible to suggest that with Percival's death the cosmic order that he represents is shattered. In his final soliloquy, Bernard can not find the right words to fill the emptiness: "About him, my feeling was, he sat there in the center. Now I go to that spot no longer. The place is empty."[26] Bernard aims to construct a world without Percival but he finds it difficult to do so because his pain destroys his image-making power. He aims to recount the events of daily life but finds it very difficult to go on: "But, it is a mistake, this extreme precision, this orderly or and *military* progress; a convenience, a lie… There is always deep below it…a rushing stream of broken dreams, nursery rhymes, street cries, half-finished

---

[23] Virginia Woolf, *The Waves* (London: Hogarth Press, 1931), 123.
[24] Elaine Scarry, *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World*, in Mark Hussey, ed., *Virginia Woolf*, 185.
[25] Apter, *Virginia Woolf*, 87.
[26] Virginia Woolf, *The Waves*, 153.

sentences and sights."[27] Still, despite all the challenges he faces, Bernard won't allow death or war to annihilate his selfhood. He observes:

> Death is the enemy. It is death against whom I ride with my spear couched and my hair flying back like a young man's, like Percival when he galloped in India. I strike spurs into my horse against you, I will fling myself unvanquished and unyielding, O Death.[28]

Percival's death brings a tremendous change to the lives of his friends who had hoped that with his heroism in war, he would bring some meaning to their lives. Although his friends make several offerings to Percival's memory, their offerings are inadequate to reflect their feelings. Rhoda buys a bunch of flowers for Percival and yet throws them on the wave, saying "into the wave that dashes on the shore, into the wave that flings its white foam to the uttermost corners of the earth I throw my violets, my offering to Percival."[29] Neville attempts to describe the feelings that Percival's death invokes, saying: "The sails of the world have swung round and caught me on the head."[30]

Bernard compares the fighting of the soldiers on the battlefield to individuals' own fight for survival in their private lives:

> I jumped up. Fight, Fight, I repeated. It's the effort and the struggle, it is the perpetual warfare, it is the shattering and piercing together, this is the daily battle, defeat or victory, the absorbing pursuit. The trees scattered put on order. …I retrieved them from formlessness with words…[31]

Elsewhere, he poetically expresses his ideas about the effects of war with these words:

> My roots go down, through veins of lead and silver through damp, marshy places that exhale odours, to a knot made of oak roots bound together in the center. Sealed and blind, with earth stopping my ears, I have yet heard rumours of wars; and the nightingale, and have felt the hurrying of many troops of men flocking hither and thither in quest of civilization like flocks of birds migrating, seeking the summer.[32]

---

[27] Ibid., 255.
[28] Ibid., 297.
[29] Ibid., 108.
[30] Ibid., 98.
[31] Ibid., 182-183.
[32] Ibid., 64.

Bernard envies Percival because he is their hero. He says he can never be like him. Yet ironically, Percival does not die like a hero, he is killed in an accident when his horse stumbles. Life can be like that, it can ridicule our dreams and most precious ideals.

All in all, war evoked feelings of horror and terror in Virginia Woolf who believed that art was the only means through which individuals could attain immortality and find some consolation in the face of the vicissitudes of life. Deeply moved by the disastrous consequences of war, she could not see any meaning in wars that brought so much pain and suffering to human beings. In her words,

> It seems entirely meaningless- a perfunctory slaughter, like taking a jar in one hand, a hammer in the other. Why must this be smashed? Nobody knows. His feeling is different from any before. And all the blood has been let out of common life… Of course all creative power is cut off.[33]

In *Virginia Woolf and the Great War*, Levenback maintains that, to Virginia Woolf, "whatever the associations or connotations, after 1914 war was not a figure of speech. She saw its experience, on the front or at home, as its history – yet increasingly its constructions had replaced individual memory and become its reality."[34] As I have already suggested, World War I undoubtedly had a huge impact on Woolf and her experience of this first war on a global scale instilled in her very strong emotions against war. Thus, it is possible to argue that Woolf's anti-war stance is significantly informed by the worldwide devastation brought about by the Great War. Moreover, "Because women had no power to create wars or fight in them, [Woolf] saw the ideology of war as masculine."[35] She also thought that patriarchal attitudes and competition for power and dominance unleashed the destructive and self-destructive urges of human nature, leading to devastation and suffering on a global scale.

Woolf further believed that it was nearly impossible to convey the sadness and emptiness that the death of a loved one brings to the lives of individuals. According to Clewell,

> Woolf redefines mourning as an ongoing experience, an endless process where the living separate from the dead without completely severing attachments. What has been less widely appreciated, however, is that Woolf's reinvention of mourning was stimulated by the cataclysmic

---

[33] Virginia Woolf, *A Writer's Diary* (Florida: Harcourt, 1953): 235.
[34] Levenback, *Virginia Woolf*, 1.
[35] Hussey, ed., *Virginia Woolf*, 26.

traumas of the First World War. In her sustained effort to confront the legacy of the war, Woolf repeatedly sought not to heal wartime wounds, but to keep them open.[36]

Moreover, "Woolf's textual practice of endless mourning compels us to refuse consolation, sustain grief, and accept responsibility for the difficult task of remembering the catastrophic losses of the twentieth century."[37]

Woolf occasionally mentions the deaths of individuals in the most casual way, in brackets, in her novels because they seemed to mean so little within the vast framework of human misery and suffering that wars brought about. This relative insignificance of human misery in the face of a seemingly indifferent or perhaps even hostile universe terrified her to the core and became an obsessive concern she repeatedly dealt with throughout her writing. In the words of Bazin and Lauter: "Her sensitivity to war is deeply rooted in her own experiences with death, her direct contact with patriarchal attitudes in the home, and her view of culture, particularly art, as the only immortality possible for human beings."[38] In this sense, Woolf turned to art for both therapy and consolation, appreciating its power to at least help people cope with the deep pain and suffering that war brought to their lives.

References

Aksehir, Uygur, Mahinur Gunduz Atalay, and Eda Burcu Çetinkaya. "The First World War and Women as the
 Victims of War Trauma in Virginia Woolf's Novels." *IAFOR Journal of Arts and Humanities* 4, Special Issue (Winter 2017): 3-11.
Aksehir, Uygur, Mahinur Gunduz Atalay, and Eda Burcu Çetinkaya. "Mrs. Dalloway Revised: The Sense of Change and Disillusionment." *SEFAD* 38 (2017): 123-138.
Apter, T.E. *Virginia Woolf: A Study of Her Novels*. London: The Macmillan Press, 1979.
Beidler, Philip D. "The Great Party-Crasher: Mrs. Dalloway, The Great Gatsby, and the Cultures of World War I Remembrance." *War, Literature and the Arts* (January 2013): 1-22.
Clewell, Tammy. "Consolation Refused: Virginia Woolf, The Great War, and Modernist Mourning." *Modern Fiction Studies* 50, no.1 (Spring 2004): 197-223.

---

[36] Clewell, "Consolation Refused," 198.
[37] Ibid., 199.
[38] Hussey, ed., *Virginia Woolf*, 14.

Goldman, Jane. *The Cambridge Introduction to Virginia Woolf*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.

Hussey, Mark, ed. *Virginia Woolf and The War*. New York: Syracuse University Press,1991.

Lee, Judith. "This hideous shaping and moulding," in Hussey, Mark, ed. *Virginia Woolf and The War*. New York: Syracuse University Press,1991: pp. 180-202.

Levenback, Karen L. *Virginia Woolf and the Great War*. New York: Syracuse University Press, 1999.

Mondi, Megan. "'You Find Us Much Changed': The Great War in To the Lighthouse." *The Delta* 1, no:1 (2006): 13-31.

Scarry, Elaine. *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.

Woolf, Virginia. *Mrs. Dalloway.* London: Hogarth Press, 1921.

Woolf, Virginia. *To The Lighthouse.* London: Hogarth Press, 1927.

Woolf, Virginia. *The Waves.* London: Hogarth Press, 1931.

Woolf, Virginia. *A Writer's Diary*. Florida: Harcourt, 1953.

CHAPTER SIX

THE FISHER KING MYTH IN T. S. ELIOT'S "WASTE LAND" AND ANNE TYLER'S "TEENAGE WASTELAND"

ZENNURE KÖSEMAN

> The sharpest recognition is surely that which is charged with sympathy as well as with shock—it is a form of human vision. And that is of course a gift. We struggle through any pain or darkness in nothing but the hope that we may receive it, and through any term of work in the prayer to keep it.
>
> Eudora Welty, *The Eye of the Story*

For Eudora Welty, the human soul's "pain or darkness" reflects the barrenness of the modern and the postmodern worlds in which human lives lack strong family interrelations. Still, as Welty further notices, the yearning of human beings for life endows them with hope for recovery from a dark psychological state; hope provides humans with the needed emotional and intellectual strength to endure pain. This study discusses how the hope of man's release from painful alienation, isolation, and estrangement is perennial through the reading of "Teenage Wasteland," the postmodern work of Anne Tyler. It discusses this in the light of the Fisher King myth permeating T. S. Eliot's "The Waste Land," one of the most popular modernist literary works. A psychoanalytical approach to the reading of Eliot's ''The Waste Land'' and Tyler's "Teenage Wasteland" allows readers to see that both works elaborate on social destruction and the dark aspects of the human psyche, i.e., the psychic reality of mental fragmentation. In "The Waste Land," Eliot depicts an individual's fragmented soul experiencing aimlessness, meaninglessness, isolation, and disillusionment as a result of the social void that surrounds him/her; similarly, complex mental structures exist in Tyler's "Teenage Wasteland." Most importantly, in both works behind the negative outlook on contemporary life lies a

longing for spiritual awakening.[1] Although much scholarly attention has been given to the implementation of the Fisher King myth[2]—an allegory of the process of fertile self recovery as cure for the illness of sterile alienation—by Eliot in "The Waste Land," not much has been expressed about the influence of the Arthurian myth of the Fisher King upon postmodernist literature, including Tyler's "Teenage Wasteland." The ancient myth of the Fisher King refers to the interrelation of the individual and his/her community toward humanity's spiritual awakening through a narrative that addresses the healing process of the Fisher King and, in turn, of his people and land. Wounded in his genitals, the Fisher King suffers from impotency that is reflected in his country's infertility. The fate of the community facing the threat of becoming a "wasteland," a land of arid life, depends on the restoration of the Fisher King's virility.[3] In this myth, physical regeneration, which corresponds to spiritual awakening, solely occurs when a Knight comes asking questions related to the wasteland. The quest for spiritual awakening is completed when the Knight finds out the exact answers to his questions.[4] Furthermore, an interpretation of Eliot's "The Waste Land" and Taylor's "Teenage Wasteland" centered on the Fisher King myth may be strengthened by an application of Edgar Allan Poe's single effect theory, through which the readers' attention is focused on one major thematic basis; thus, a comprehensive analysis defined by unity can be achieved.[5] Before elaborating on the integration of the Fisher King's tale on Tyler's "Teenage Wasteland," a brief commentary on the Fisher King' s presence in Eliot's "The Waste Land" is provided.

Eliot reshapes the "wasteland" concept of the Fisher King's tale by adapting it to the modernist world to imply one's psychological fragmentation, and he stresses the latter's discomfort, confusion, distinction, and loneliness.[6] Dividing "The Waste Land" into five parts—The Burial of the

---

[1] Francesca Bugliani Knox, "Between Fire and Fire: T. S. Eliot's The Waste Land," *The Heytrop Journal*, 56 no. 2 (2015): 235, DOI: 10.1111/heyj.12240.
[2] Jessie Weston's *From Ritual to Romance* and James Frazer's *The Golden Bough* are dedicated to the Fisher King myth and the cycles of aridity and fertility; See Knox, "Between Fire and Fire," 236.
[3] Cleanth Brooks, *Modern Poetry and the Tradition* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1939), 136.
[4] Francesca Bugliani Knox, "Between Fire and Fire," 237.
[5] William Nelles, "Microfiction: What Makes a Very Short Story Very Short?" *Narrative* 20, no. 1 (2012) in Çağdaş Özer,
Kısa Öykü Sanatı ve Politikaları (Ankara: İmge Kibabevi Yayınları, 2018), 31.
[6] David Ellis, "Modernism and T. S. Eliot," *The Cambridge Quaterly* 47, no. 1 (2018): 61, https://doi.org/10.1093/camqtly/bfx024.

Dead, A Game of Chess, The Fire Sermon, Death by Water, and What the Thunder Said—Eliot examines how fragmentary the structure of life has become and explains the methods of healing the Fisher King (the individual). For Eliot, the moral decay that plagues the postwar era is a manifestation of the individual's confusion/psychological corruption that resulted from the Great War, World War I. Eliot suggests that through the retrospective memory of past ethical values that are lost, an individual may estrange himself/herself from the social disorder of the modern world and may relatively attain his/her selfhood solely caring for himself/herself; through this way, the individual may be protected from the psychological detriments of the modern era.[7] In What the Thunder Said, the speaker states,

> I sat upon the shore
> Fishing, with the arid plain behind me
> Shall I at least set my lands in order?
> London Bridge is falling down falling down and falling down (Lines 424-427)
> [8]

In this quotation, Eliot refers pessimistically to the corrupted part of the disintegrating city. His desperate state caused by the corruption he can detect in all aspects of life leads him to complain about urban destruction and a fragmented society consisting of individuals who lack love, unity, and respect for each other and to emphasise his loneliness and estrangement, showing his rejection of living there. Eliot uncovers the futility of the twentieth century[9] and indicates that improvement in social life simultaneously creates the rise of conflicts in interactions and causes the creation of a chaotic and destructive way of living. The destruction will come to an end when the Fisher King (the individual) acquires the fertility of the self by estranging himself from the state of alienation and loneliness. In other words, there must be a demarcation between the Fisher King's (the individual's) own lands and the infertile lands (psychic/mental fragmentation) of his fellowmen.

---

[7] Zennure Köseman, "Conrad's Heart of Darkness and Eliot's 'The Waste Land' in the Context of Myth-Making in Jungian Perspective," *Interactions* 22, no. 1-2 (2013): 88, https://www.thefreelibrary.com/-a0328943981.
[8] T. S. Eliot, "The Waste Land," in *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, vol. 2, 7th ed, ed. M. H. Abrams (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2000), 2383.
[9] Gareth Reeves, *T. S. Eliot: A Virgilian Poet* (London: Macmillian Press Ltd., 1989), 37.

The opening lines of the Burial of the Dead also serve the motif of the Fisher King:

> April is the cruellest month, breeding
> Lilacs out of the dead land, mixing
> Memory and desire, stirring
> Dull roots with spring rain.
> Winter kept us warm, covering
> Earth in forgetful snow, feeding
> A little life with dried tubers. (Lines 1-7)[10]

The beginning of the awakening of people and nature occurs in "cruelty," which implies that there is uniting, engendering, or nourishing.[11] As the "dull roots" revive themselves by participating in this April transformation, then all the natural resources will heal themselves from lifelessness. They will attain life through spring rain as winter leaves the country. Eliot alludes to Chaucer's *Canterbury Tales* depicting the barrenness of the country and the desire for transformation through climatic change. Following winter, spring comes to earth and invites spring rain that initiates the awakening and augmentation of fertility in the country— "Lilacs out of the dead land" appear. Nature's rebirth connoting potency and growth is also implied in the last line—"A little life with dried tubers." Although the lethargic life of winter is addressed in the last line connoting mental passivity and the human soul in a state of sleep, the presence of "a little life" has also positive connotations endowing the line with a hopeful tone; "a little life" comes after "winter" keeping both individuals and land "warm, covering/ [...] in forgetful snow," that is, a longing for the revival of the life-cycle that signifies a rebirth. Hence, a spirit of life visits the dead land embracing all the "dried tubers."

In The Fire Sermon, Tiresias, the blind foreseer, addresses the residents of the "Unreal City" and indicates the requirement for their healing; they should meet the "expected guest" who will grant them life.

> I Tiresias, old man with wrinkled dugs
> Perceived the scene, and foretold the rest
> I too awaited the expected guest. (Lines 228-230)[12]

---

[10] T. S. Eliot, "The Waste Land," 2370.

[11] Maud Ellmann, "The Waste Land: A Sphinx without a Secret," in *T. S. Eliot*, ed. Harriet Davidson (London: Longman, 1990), 94.

[12] T. S. Eliot, "Waste Land," 2377.

The intention of the "expected guest" is to awaken the individuals who experience the barrenness of the dead land. Eliot refers to the inhabitants of the "Unreal City"[13] that devote themselves to meaningless city life by becoming the victims of their professional lives. The "expected guest" (a loving enlightened individual) will come and serve humanity through his healing; he will deliver fertility to all the country and will cause the awakening of individual souls. The "expected guest" will bring happiness to the city by rejuvenating it through the spreading of the spirit of the brotherhood of man, which can erase all traces of alienation and estrangement caused by the disinterestedness and lack of communication characterising a meaningless living.

Commenting on the darkness in Eliot's "The Waste Land," Cox states, "It is not surprising that T. S. Eliot was so much influenced by Heart of Darkness when he was writing The Waste Land."[14] Similarly, in Tyler's "Teenage Wasteland," Daisy—the mother of Donny, a teenager who emotionally and intellectually struggles to survive in a fragmented society—confronts her own heart's darkness due to being unable to find out how to save Donny from his meaningless world. Throughout "Teenage Wasteland," readers watch Daisy's desperate and futile attempts to help Donny cope with the discomfort and awkwardness which an individual may encounter in the early stages of self-exploration within an environment incapable of effective communication (in this case with family, teachers, and friends). In Tyler's narration, although Donny is clearly the estranged youth who, at the end of the story, attempts to find himself by leaving his community and severing his communication with it, readers cannot ignore Tyler's implied estrangement of Daisy; by demonstrating maternal caring and love and progressively feeling empathy for Donny, at the end of the story, Daisy discovers that she is also an estranged individual who must recover herself. In other words, Donny's estrangement becomes the means of estranged Daisy's need for recovery of self without her cutting bonds with her fellow men. Centring on the character of Daisy, readers are encouraged to relate her to the wounded Fisher King, whereas her son Donny—who, being Daisy's offspring, becomes an extension of Daisy's self and the object of her love—may be identified as the Knight (innocent love) who helps the Fisher King regain his potency. Although the open-ended "Teenage Wasteland" leaves uncertain the outcome of Donny's and Daisy's quest for self- recovery and happiness, through Donny's and Daisy's distinct cases of estrangement, Tyler expresses her hope of an

---

[13] Ibid., 207.
[14] C. B. Cox, *Joseph Conrad* (Essex: Longman, 1971), 13.

active individual finding his/her true self in his/her own unique way, both inside and outside a society defined by barren communication.

Like Daisy, a mother (a role associated with fertility) who gets to know her self through her offspring Donny, Anne Tyler examines her self through her works, the offspring of her creative imagination. Discussing Tyler's depressive teenage years, Willrich underlines that Tyler was eleven when she and her family left the commune. She had never used a telephone and could strike a match on the sole of her bare foot.[15] Tyler's experiencing distance from her social and family environment when she was a child is mirrored in her words quoted by Willrich: "I have given up hope, by now, of ever losing my sense of distance; in fact, I seem to have come to cherish it. Neither I nor any of my brothers can stand being out among a crowd of people for any length of time."[16] Willrich also implies that Tyler's literary works are the verbalization of her inner monologue functioning as the responses to her depressive past experiences.[17] Particularly, she refers to Reynolds Price's comment in an interview in 1986 that "Anne Tyler has always spoken of a voice that she hears just above her right or left ear"[18] and shares Tyler's confession:

> The voice I 'hear' is that sort of neutral, neuter voice that your mind employs when it's thinking in actual words; it seems that when I'm really inside what I'm working on, my mind's voice sometimes begins rolling ahead of its own accord. Most often this occurs with dialogue, or with a character's internal monologue. I don't think it's in any way mystical or even, strictly speaking, a matter of 'inspiration'—just momentum.[19]

Like Willrich, Robertson observes that while diving into domestic dramas in her works, Tyler fundamentally relates them to her background:

> [Her] narrative vision of family disorder seems to have been derived from her own life's problems and patterns. The existence of domestic dramas can be illustrated through having a foreign husband. The fact that she is

---

[15] Patricia Rowe Willrich, "Watching Through Windows: A Perspective on Anne Tyler," *The Virginia Quarterly Review* 68, no. 3 (1992): 500, https://www.jstor.org/stable/26437257.

[16] Ibid., 500.

[17] Tyler's confesses, "for some reasons the thought of going back to childhood— even long enough to think of brief information about it—depresses me"; see Patricia Rowe Willrich, "Watching Through Windows: A Perspective on Anne Tyler," 498.

[18] Ibid., 516.

[19] Ibid., 516.

married to an Iranian is bound to have had some influence on [her] theme of difference.[20]

The interrelationship between Tyler's personal experiences and her works is also advocated by Petry's claim that Tyler reflects herself in her inner monologues revealed in a large number of various periodical writings.[21] In this case, "Teenage Wasteland" may be read as a semi-biographical study, i.e., the outspoken side of Tyler's inner life and a convenient means through which the writer engages in the process of reflecting on her self because she is reluctant to directly confront her life.

In "Teenage Wasteland," Tyler depicts the existence of family disintegration in the American South, a traditionally family-oriented society; through this, Tyler makes her readers conscious of the degree to which pessimism and alienation plague contemporary American society and is realistic about the urgency of finding an effective resolution, which Tyler identifies as comprehension of one's self. The title of the story is inspired by The Who's 1971 song "Baba O'Riley" that describes "the teenage wasteland" and particularly concerns the lack of interaction between parents and children in the postmodern world.[22] Daisy's attendance at a conference held in Donny's private school makes evident the passive role of Matt (Donny's father)—who is extremely occupied with his work life— in his son's life. Thus, Daisy becomes the scapegoat in the postmodern world taking the responsibility for her son's behaviour when she learns that he has been "a noisy, lazy, and disruptive" student in his school and "fooling around with his friends."[23] In this arid social environment represented by the school authorities, Donny lives on the wasteland of his fragmented puberty. However, although Daisy confesses their lack of communication, she questions being thought of as a "delinquent parent."[24] She explains that as parents, she and her husband are very concerned about Donny's social life, but she admits that they cannot control their son's destructive behaviours. In her effort to justify their decision of limiting all his activities, Daisy confesses to the teacher

---

[20] Mary F. Robertson, "Anne Tyler: Medusa Points and Contact Points," in *Contemporary American Women Writers: Narrative Strategies*, ed. Catherine Rainwater and William J. Scheick (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1985), 140.

[21] Alice Hall Petry, *Understanding Anne Tyler* (Columbia: University of Southern Carolina Press, 1990), 5.

[22] Anne Tyler, "Teenage Wasteland," in *A World of Fiction: Twenty Timeless Short Stories*, ed. Sybil Marcus (California: University of California, 1995), 117.

[23] Ibid., 112.

[24] Ibid., 112.

her distrust for Donny due to his irresponsible attitude and behaviour at home:

> It isn't that we're not concerned. Both of us are. And we've done what we could, whatever we could think of. We don't let him watch TV on school nights. We don't let him talk on the phone till he's finished his homework. But he tells us he doesn't have any homework or he did it all in study hall. How are we to know what to believe?[25]

However, when they make radical decisions to hinder Donny's extravagances, Donny withdraws from all his family interactions. He becomes a really lonely and psychologically fragmented teenager similar to the speaker of "The Waste Land" and, therefore, rejects all kinds of supervision over him. Whereas Daisy's complaint implies that she believes parental authority would control Donny more effectively than before, it triggers the emergence of Donny's rebellious personality. As a postmodern teenager, he estranges himself from his parents and his surrounding wasteland. So a psychologist is invited to identify the cause(s) of Donny's problematic interactions. The psychologist's psychological analysis of Donny—based on the latter's thoughts, behavior, personality, and emotional life—determines that Donny "has no serious emotional problems. He was merely going through a difficult period in his life. He required some academic help and a better sense of self-worth."[26] The psychologist suggests Donny obtain a tutor and, therefore, Donny sees Calvin Beadle, who also has considerable psychological training. However, Donny is unwilling to accept help from a "stupid fairy tutor."[27] Donny's words echo his estrangement and isolation from, as well as his opposition to, any academic help. Daisy's initial false definition of parenthood is interrelated with Donny's false view of his tutor. For Donny, all kinds of authority signify oppression and a sterile/meaningless life; both the psychologist and the tutor—as the representatives of Donny's social environment—fail to stir Donny's self-recognition, that is, they cannot complete the recovery of the Fisher King.

    On the contrary, Donny's sterile interaction with the psychologist and the tutor becomes fertile for Daisy. When Daisy learns about the outcomes of the psychological analysis, she concerns herself with the concept of "self-worth." She views herself as an "indifferent mother to the psychological problems of her son." Blaming herself for Donny's psychological disorder,

---

[25] Ibid.,112.
[26] Ibid., 113.
[27] Ibid., 113.

she questions herself and engages in the process of self-recognition. Furthermore, the third-person narrator acknowledges Daisy's struggles to approach her son:

> Had she really done all she could have? She longed—ached—for a time machine. Given one more chance, she'd do it perfectly—hug him more, praise him more, or perhaps praise him less. Oh, who can say[…].[28]

According to Bail, "Teenage Wasteland" is a postmodern parable that warns us against the manipulative role of commercial interests that shape our daily lives and fragment our families.[29] Daisy's need for a time machine reveals that she regrets becoming the victim of a commercial world that demands parents' exclusive commitment to their professional lives to the neglect of their domestic lives. Her wishing a time machine also expresses her hope for the betterment of her relationship with Donny. Daisy believes that if she allocates more time to her son, mutual understanding and love will characterize their relationship.

In Eliot's "The Waste Land," poetic images comprise a definitive iconography that endows with meaning a meaningless and alienated world;[30] in other words, the use of poetic images contributes to the healing of the problematic social structure. In Eliot's "The Waste Land," there are two main contrasting images. The first group of images is about a "desert," a "waste" or "dead land" delivered through "dry stones," "cracked earth," "dry bones," all representing the idea of death. On the other hand, the second group of images reflects the reawakening from death. "Dull roots" bring forth "little life" and "dried tubers" wait for "spring rain" to restore life.[31] Therefore, each image serves meaninglessness, aimlessness, and estrangement, as well as life and reorientation. In this case, the imagery incorporated in "The Waste Land" is no longer a naturalistic representation but carries a spiritually healing message permeated by the spirit of the Fisher King myth;[32] it emphasises that following the long night of the soul, the new morning will bring light. Similarly, in "Teenage Wasteland," contrasting images of oppression and revolt convey death and resurrection

---

[28] Ibid., 114.

[29] Paul Bail, *Critical Companion to Popular Contemporary Writers*: *Anne Tyler A Critical Companion* (London: Greenwood Press, 1998), 31.

[30] Armin Paul Frank, "The Waste Land: A Drama of Images," in *T. S. Eliot: A Voice Descanting*, ed. Shyamal Bagchee (Hampshire: The Macmillian Press, 1990), 31.

[31] Ibid., 35.

[32] Ibid., 43.

respectively as in the Fisher King myth. The "school" and the ''parents'' represent oppressive social institutions that provoke Donny's opposition, whereas Donny's "smoking," the "musical album," and the song "Baba O'Riley" illustrate Donny's psychological revolt against his social environment. Moreover, the "psychologist" and the "tutor" contribute to Daisy's unplanned awakening, and "spring grass" signifies Daisy's struggles to heal her son.

In "Teenage Wasteland," the tutor alerts the parents to consider how lovely but emotionally wounded Donny is; therefore, the tutor causes the mother's spiritual discomfort, which paradoxically leads to her spiritual enlightenment, getting to know better herself. Through the tutor's help, Daisy progressively realizes that her initial judgment of Donny is false, and she adopts a more tolerant view of him. The main reason is that although the mother learns from the tutor about Donny's faults, the tutor also urgently warns her about the cause of Donny's psychological destruction:

> I think this kid is hurting. You know? Here's a serious, sensitive kid, telling you he'd like to take on some grown-up challenges and you're giving him the message that he can't be trusted. Don't you understand how that hurts?[33]

Both Daisy's and the tutor's responses to each other imply a serious lack of communication between the teenager and his parents. According to the tutor, the destructive cause of all Donny's problematic social behaviour is the parents' authority over him: "It undermines his self-esteem—don't you realize that?''[34] The parents "undermine his self-esteem"[35] and disregard his psychological transformations that lead to his alienation from the others. At the end of this blameful dialogue, Daisy responds with an ambiguous "Oh"[36] that reveals her discomfort resulting from the lack of a meaningful and sincere close relationship with her son. Daisy's "Oh" becomes a symbol of the emptiness and meaninglessness characterizing the relationship of estranged family members. Daisy completes her response with the humble statement: "Well, I guess you're right."[37] It is the moment of sudden revelation for Daisy, the moment of epiphany. After being

---

[33] Tyler, "Teenage Wasteland," 115.

[34] Ibid., 115.

[35] Ibid., 115.

[36] Ibid., 115.

[37] Ibid., 115.

accused of neglecting to follow her son closely, Daisy empathises with Donny:

> Whole new angle: his pathetically poor posture, that slouch so forlorn that his shoulders seemed about to meet his chin […] oh, wasn't it awful being young? She'd had a miserable adolescence herself and had always sworn no child of hers would ever be that unhappy.[38]

In this case, Donny becomes Daisy's mirror image; his alienation forces Daisy to dare to confront her own experience of isolation and alienation and to criticise her unjust authority as an adult at present. Above all, Tyler illustrates the interconnectedness defining the lives of people and the pivotal role of individuals characterized by self-knowledge towards the well-being of their society.

Donny's borrowing the album "Teenage Wasteland" symbolises the youth's attempts to free himself from his wasteland:

> Loud music would be spilling from Cal's [the tutor] windows. Once it was the Who, which Daisy recognized from the time that Donny had borrowed the album. 'Teenage Wasteland,' she said aloud, identifying the song, and Matt [the father] a short, dry laugh.[39]

Through that music, not only does Donny's inner voice find expression but also Daisy and Matt have access to their teenage years when for the first time each of them confronted his/her social wasteland. Noteworthy are the contrasting responses of the two parents to Donny's music. Daisy's enthusiastic loud response to the sound of the familiar tune mirrors her will to get in touch with her son, her husband, and, most importantly, herself. The familiar tune of "Teenage Wasteland" functions as the interlock between Daisy the adult and Daisy the teenager, contributing to her self-awareness. As in the Fisher King tale, Daisy realizes that she has been estranged from her son and has led him to a bleak state. Daisy's assessing her social ties with enthusiasm endows her with a new outlook on social interrelations and indicates her hope for the potential restoration of her spiritual fertility. In contrast, Matt's response is an indifferent "short, dry laugh" that reflects his passivity/impotency and his inability to connect with Donny and Daisy.

Borrowing Eudora Welty's wording, we may say that Donny's psychological "pain and darkness" hinders love and communication among

---

[38] Ibid., 116.
[39] Ibid., 117.

the family and becomes a plague transferred from the private sphere into the public sphere. As a result of this social destruction, Daisy seems to be unable to help Donny (the Fisher King) be healed, and Donny estranges himself from his family by escaping to an unknown place in which nobody can find him anymore. Still, the hope for Donny's self-recovery is maintained through his will to detach himself from a corrupt postmodern society. Furthermore, it is ambiguous whether Daisy, in the role of the Fisher King, eventually acquires the fertility she hopes for, but, again, the hope for her self-recovery is preserved at the end of the story; as an awakened mother, Daisy reflects on her wounded relationship with Donny:

> At night, Daisy lies awake and goes over Donny's life. She is trying to figure out what went wrong, where they made their first mistake. Often, she finds herself blaming Cal, although she knows he didn't begin it. Then, at other times she excuses him, for without him, Donny might have left earlier. Who really knows? In the end, she can only sigh and search for a cooler spot on the pillow. As she falls asleep, she occasionally glimpses something in the corner of her vision. It's something fleet and round, a ball—a basketball. It flies up, it sinks through the hoop, descends, lands in a yard littered with last year's leaves and striped with bars of sunlight as white as bones, bleached and parched and cleanly picked. [40]

We see Daisy contemplate for hours her problematic relationship with Donny, but she emotionally and intellectually vacillates when she blames Cal (the tutor) as the main cause of Donny's outcry in his wasteland.[41] Therefore, although Daisy regards herself as the potential healer (the knight) of Donny's psychological disorders, she cannot achieve his healing. To highlight the incompleteness/delay defining Daisy's self recovery as the Fisher King, as well as her becoming Donny's saviour (his Knight), Tyler uses the image of "a yard [...] striped with bars of sunlight as white as bones, bleached and parched and cleanly picked" that alludes to various lines from Eliot's "The Waste Land," such as "A heap of broken images, where the sun beats" (Line 22),[42] "[...] bones cast in a little low dry garret" (Line 194),[43] and "Dry bones" (Line 391).[44] Still, within this predominantly pessimistic verbal environment, Tyler delivers a vague

---

[40] Ibid., 120.
[41] Jonathan Yardley, "Anne Tyler's Family Circles," in *Critical Essays on Anne Tyler*, ed. Alice Hall Petry (New York: G. K. Hall & Co., 1992), 121.
[42] T. S. Eliot, "The Waste Land," 2370.
[43] Ibid., 2375.
[44] Ibid., 2382.

human hope for rejuvenation through Daisy's searching for a cooler spot—an action that connotes freshness—Daisy's sighing—an action that connotes both desire and memory—and Daisy's dream vision of Donny's basketball—an action that addresses Daisy's memory of her beloved son whom she desires to see again in her familiar territory of "a yard littered with last year's leaves." The spirit that permeates Daisy's dream vision is the same as that of the opening lines of Eliot's "The Waste Land," in which the speaker observes April's "mixing/ Memory and desire" (Lines 2-3).[45]

 T. S. Eliot's "The Waste Land" addresses individuals who experience the plight of cultural, moral, and psychological depravity in the post World War I period, and Anne Tyler's "Teenage Wasteland" explores the effects of the same plight upon individuals and the subsequent family disintegration. That is, Anne Tyler's postmodernist short story illustrates the permanency of alienation that plagues the individual in the modernist work of T. S. Eliot. Above all, however, both works reflect a reserved optimism about the resolution of the problem of a fragmented self and an alienated society since Eliot's speaker in "The Waste Land" and Tyler's Daisy and Donny in "Teenage Wasteland" resemble the Fisher King who is still longing for the time of his restored fertility.

References

Bail, Paul. *Critical Companion to Popular Contemporary Writers: Anne Tyler A Critical Companion.* London: Greenwood Press, 1998.

Brooks, Cleanth. *Modern Poetry and the Tradition*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1939.

Cox, C. B. *Joseph Conrad*. Essex: Longman, 1971.

Eliot, T. S. "The Waste Land." In *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, vol. 2. 7th ed. Edited by M. H. Abrams, 2181-2196. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2000.

Ellis, David. "Modernism and T. S. Eliot." *The Cambridge Quarterly* 47, no. 1 (2018): 53-64, https://doi.org/10.1093/camqtly/bfx024.

Ellmann, Maud. "The Waste Land: A Sphinx without a Secret." In *T. S. Eliot*, edited by Harriet Davidson, 90-108. London: Longman, 1990.

Frank, Armin Paul. "The Waste Land: A Drama of Images." In *T. S. Eliot: A Voice Descanting,* edited by Shyamal Bagchee, 28-51. Hampshire: The Macmillian Press, 1990.

---

[45] Ibid., 2370.

Knox, Francesca Bugliani. "Between Fire and Fire: T. S. Eliot's *The Waste Land*." *The Heythrop Journal* 56, no. 2 (2015): 235-248. DOI: 10.1111/heyj.12240.

Köseman, Zennure. "Conrad's Heart of Darkness and Eliot's 'The Waste Land' in the Context of Myth-Making in Jungian Perspective." *Interactions* 22, no. 1-2 (2013): 81-93.
https://www.thefreelibrary.com/-a0328943981.

Nelles, William. "Microfiction: What Makes a Very Short Story Very Short?" *Narrative* 20, no. 1 (2012): 87-104.
https://www.academia.edu/23531410.

Özer, Sevinç. *Çağdaş Kısa Öykü Sanatı ve Politikaları*. Ankara: İmge Kibabevi Yayınları, 2018.

Petry, Alice Hall. *Understanding Anne Tyler*. Columbia: University of Southern Carolina Press, 1990.

Reeves, Gareth. *T. S. Eliot: A Virgilian Poet*. London: Macmillian Press Ltd., 1989.

Robertson, Mary F. "Anne Tyler: Medusa Points and Contact Points." In *Contemporary American Women Writers: Narrative Strategies*, edited by Catherine Rainwater and William J. Scheick, 119-142. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1985.

Tyler, Anne. "Teenage Wasteland." In *A World of Fiction: Twenty Timeless Short Stories*, edited by Sybil Marcus, 111-127. California: University of California, 1995.

Yardley, Jonathan. "Anne Tyler's Family Circles." In *Critical Essays on Anne Tyler,* edited by Alice Hall Petry,119-123. New York: G. K. Hall & Co., 1992.

Willrich, Patricia Rowe. "Watching Through Windows: A Perspective on Anne Tyler." *The Virginia Quarterly Review* 68, no. 3 (1992): 497-516. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26437257.

Chapter Seven

A Bakhtinian Reading of Exupéry's *The Little Prince* in the Dialogic Context

Nilay Erdem Ayyildiz

Mikhail Mikhailovich Bakhtin (1895-1975) was a Russian philosopher, a literary theorist and a social thinker in the field of human sciences. Having experienced various hardships and even exiled because of his anti-system thoughts in his works, nothing inhibited him from dealing with social and political issues and elaborating on Formalism, Marxism, the philosophy of language and the novel genre. He contributed much to the studies of the later thinkers and literary critics with his oeuvre, including *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics* (1963), *Rabelais and His World* (1965)*, The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays* (1965)*,* and *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays* (1979). His ideas are utilised in multiple fields, such as cultural studies, literary history, and philosophy.[1]

Bakhtin's literary theory is based on dialogism, which opposes monologism defined by Bakhtin as follows,

> Monologism, at its extreme, denies the existence outside itself of another consciousness with equal rights and equal responsibilities, [...]. With a monologic approach (in its extreme pure form) another person remains wholly and merely an object of consciousness, and not another consciousness. [...] Monologue is finalized and deaf to other's response, does not expect it and does not acknowledge in it any decisive force.[2]

---

[1] Pam Morris, *The Bakhtin Reader* (London: Arnold, 2003), 1.
[2] Mikhail Bakhtin, *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics,* trans. and ed. Caryl Emerson. (London: Minnesota University Press, 1984), 292-293.

Considering the properties of monologism, Bakhtin notes that dialogism is inherent in life as to live refers to be involved in dialogues.[3] Accordingly, dialogism is created out of the multiplicity of perspectives and expressions, and people can become subjects only by producing meaning through dialogues among themselves. Therefore, Bakhtin holds dialogism against the constraining and one-sided monologism. He asserts that the relativistic nature of all meanings through dialogism necessitates the standing out of dialogues against monologic authority.[4] Bakhtin thinks that language is a medium that can penetrate easily into the privacy of the speaker and the listener,[5] so it is neither a simple nor an innocent mediator in communication for Bakhtin. In this regard, he opposes the monologic perception of language advocated by Saussurean Formalism which fails to admit the dialogic relationship between the self and the other in language and evaluates it as a complete and mechanical entity.[6] Bakhtin handles language as a living organic body within its centripetal and centrifugal forces. As Harris interprets, in the Bakhtinian approach, while the centripetal forces make language centralised, unified, monologic, and singular, centrifugal forces keep it independent, polyphonic, plural, and ambiguous.[7] Bakhtin upholds the centrifugal force in the language in a dialogic context that sets language free from all restrictive oppressions. The reason why Bakhtin favours the novel among all the literary genres is understandable as, for Bakhtin, it provides characters with a kind of freedom through speech genres, which he defines as various spheres each utterance develops in dialogic relations.[8] In Bakhtinian thought, a novel may be considered to be dialogic as long as each character's utterances are free from any authorities, including the author's.

Dialogism compiles the Bakhtinian concepts of carnivalesque, polyphony, laughter, parody, grotesque realism, heteroglossia, and unfinalisability, all

---

[3] Ibid., 293.

[4] Mikhail Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays,* trans. Michael Holquist and Caryl Emerson, ed. Michael Holquist (Austin: Texas University Press, 1981), 19.

[5] Ibid., 294.

[6] Michael Holquist, "Introduction," in *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays,* writ. Mikhail Bakhtin, trans. Michael Holquist and Caryl Emerson, ed. Michael Holquist (Austin: Texas University Press, 1981), xvii.

[7] R. Ailen Harris, "Bakhtin, Phaedrus, and the Geometry of Rhetoric," in *Landmark Essays on Bakhtin, Rhetoric and Writing,* ed. Frank Farmer (New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1998), 18.

[8] Mikhail Bakhtin, *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays,* trans. Vem W. McGee, ed. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist (Austin: Texas University Press, 1986), 60.

of which operate indispensably and interrelatedly in a novel. The study puts forward that Bakhtin's theory is a highly convenient approach to Antonio Saint Exupéry's *The Little Prince* (1943). Thus, it aims at investigating the extent to which the novella and the mentioned Bakhtinian concepts supply mutual confirmation and illumination in the dialogic context.

The Little Prince is a children's book fascinating both child readers and adults since its appearance. The story of the novella is comprised of a number of dialogical relations between the boy called "little prince" and the narrator, a pilot crashing and spending eight days in the Sahara Desert, as well as the little prince and the people he meets in his earlier visits to the other planets before he reaches the Earth. These include a king, a conceited man, a drunkard, a lamplighter, a businessman, and a geographer. In addition to all these, the little prince also has a conversation with a snake and a fox. The dialogues of the characters construct the dialogic nature of the novella, which presents a plurality of consciousnesses, each with its sphere rather than a singular perspective of the world. Bakhtin conceptualises the existence of several conflicting consciousnesses in a novel as "polyphony" emerging in the "carnivalesque literature."

Deriving the term "carnival" from the French author François Rabelais' works, particularly *Gargantua and Pantagruel*, Bakhtin asserts— in *Rabelais and His Work*—that the author benefitted from carnival spirit and masterfully applied all carnival traits to his work. Although Bakhtin defines carnival as "a well-known festivity" recognised for ages,[9] his concept of carnival surpasses festivals containing comic and popular practices in ancient times, the middle ages, and the Renaissance, and he merely utilises the medieval carnival as a metaphor for the subversive and explosive transgression against the prevailing norms and fixed values of the hierarchical order. This is because it disregards the boundaries among people and supplies a temporary potential inversion of all hierarchies. In Bakhtin's words, "Carnival brings together, unifies, weds, and combines the sacred with the profane, the lofty with the low, the great with the insignificant, the wise with the stupid."[10] As such, according to Bakhtin, the carnival offers the opportunity to have a new view of the prevailing system and come up with a new revolutionary order.[11] In this sense, carnivalesque reveals the centrifugal side of language in the dialogic context through "a utopian urge" with displacement and even inversion of

---

[9] Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World,* trans. Helene Iswolsky (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984), 218.
[10] Bakhtin, *Dialogic*, 123.
[11] Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, 34.

the social hierarchies.[12]

To illustrate, *The Little Prince* constructs a transitory utopian universe in a carnivalesque manner that enables all people from different occupations and ranks to participate on the same level eradicating the boundaries between separate social classes. The author does not name any characters in the novella supporting the notion that they exist merely with their consciousnesses. More concretely, Exupéry liberates a little boy to visit other planets and to have conversations with adults. The adults' various behaviours both amuse and perturb the little prince. He cannot understand their needs; for instance, the king needs to order people around, the conceited man needs to be admired, and the businessman needs to own everything. Thus, Exupéry draws a contrast between the limited perspective of unimaginative and superficial grown-ups and the open-mindedness of children by subverting common perceptions of adults and children. The boy's responses and questions to the people and the narrator, throughout the novella, reveal that every type of adult ignorance about children is repudiated in the book, and children's wisdom and innocence are brought to the fore. The boy is called "prince" even though he is little and most probably unaware of the meaning and the status of a prince in the world. Only in a carnivalesque environment could a little boy be a prince and people who are conceived as serious and hierarchically superior, such as a king or a businessman, be ridiculed. Regardless of their ages, classes, and professions, the author gathers all these characters in a carnivalesque atmosphere, which as confirmed by Bakhtin, "does not acknowledge any distinction between actors and spectators [...] because its very idea as a mass celebration embraces all the people."[13] Each character stands out with his consciousness and utterances which are not suppressed; thus, there is a kind of multi-voiced atmosphere as in a carnival which Bakhtin calls "polyphony."

Exemplifying Dostoyevsky's novels as polyphonic works, Bakhtin notes that the determiner of a polyphonic work is not the abundance of characters and stories in a single objectified world of the author's consciousness but "a *plurality of consciousnesses, with equal rights and each with his own world*" existing in the same event without interfering.[14] Accordingly, requiring face-to-face communication between characters, a polyphonic work provides each character with the equal right to speak

---

[12] Peter Stallybrass and Allon White, "Bourgeois Hysteria and the Carnivalesque," in *The Cultural Studies Reader*, ed. Simon During (London: Routledge, 1993), 264.

[13] Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, 7.

[14] Bakhtin, *Problems*, 6.

without any priority, including the author himself. In *The Little Prince*, although the narrator is a character in the book and opens it by telling about his meeting with the little prince, his voice is crossed with that of the title character. The reader is not exposed to a single reality presented by the narrator, but rather, he questions his reality, and the little prince questions his. Thus, their consciousnesses clash throughout a questioning and answering process. In this way, the novella, as Bakhtin favours, reveals how reality appears to each character by not letting them interfere with the consciousness of each other. Each man on the planets comes out with his consciousness, being unaware of happenings outside his planet and living by his laws. Each of them represents a certain form of life; each character refers to, in Bakhtinian terms, "[e]ach rejoinder […] [who] has a specific quality of completion that expresses a particular position of the speaker, to which one may respond or assume, with respect to it, a responsive position."[15]

Bakhtinian laughter relates to the language of carnivalesque that is characterized by the extensive use of abuse and degradation. Bakhtin derives its definition from three main sources; Hippocrates names laughter the father of medicine, Aristotle claims that laughter provides people with privilege over other living things, and Menippus descends into Hades laughing at death—which produces substantial fear to a person—and frees human life from restrictions.[16] In this respect, the only character who triumphs over any prevailing constraints or human beings is the title character in *The Little Prince* because it is solely he who laughs; the other characters, including the narrator, are engaged in "serious" matters. Although the narrator initially claims that he is irritated by the little prince's laughing at his serious tone, then he realizes that the little prince's laughter emphasises his victory over all things in the universe which appear to be serious but are essentially ridiculous. Even when the little prince talks to the snake that will take the little prince back in a short time to his planet by means of its deadly bite, the little prince laughs and tells the narrator that he leaves his laughter to the narrator as a present because, in the Bakhtinian approach, his laughter demonstrates a kind of victory both over "supernatural awe, over the sacred, [and] over death."[17] Bakhtin's concept of laughter is a philosophical and universal way of expressing key issues concerning humanity through positive and creative means.[18] It is, according to Bakhtin, "festive, communal, universal and

---

[15] Bakhtin, *Speech*, 72.
[16] Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, 70.
[17] Ibid., 92.
[18] Ibid., 66-73.

ambivalent."[19] It is a soft and unfearful resistance against the prevailing system. That is why the narrator feels relieved and inspired when he remembers the little prince's smiling face when he looks at the stars in the sky. Therefore, Bakhtinian laughter both produces pleasure and urges the reader to have a critical approach to any problematic issues.

In the Bakhtinian approach, parody is the most outstanding form of laughter in the carnivalised literature. As Cuddon defines, parody uses and abuses all the prevailing order through "[t]he imitative use of the words, style, attitude, tone and ideas […] to make them ridiculous."[20] As a common tool of subversion, parodying, for Bakhtin, "is the creation of a decrowning double" for the existing system.[21] In this regard, a carnivalesque novel offers a more positive, constructive, and comic version of the current system via parody. Accordingly, it may be claimed that parody and laughter are so indispensable in a carnivalesque work that the reversal of reality through parody brings about laughter. Thus, laughter in collaboration with parody removes the seriousness and fear established by the hierarchical order. It is safe to claim that both parody and laughter contribute to subversion in the carnivalised literature.

In *The Little Prince*, each character's different social status as the main trait of capitalist ideology is a source of parody and laughter. Bakhtin claims that capitalism is one of the fundamental factors triggering the production of such polyphonic works as it fosters the inclusion of multiple voices and ideologies in art.[22] Paradoxically, capitalism brings multiple diverse worlds and voices together and breaks monologic unity and consciousness because it hinders communication among people by enslaving them to the system. In *The Little Prince*, the fox explains to the narrator that "Men have no more time to understand anything. They buy things all ready-made at the shops. But there is no shop anywhere where one can buy friendship, and so men have no friends any more."[23] The fox implies that the materialist, capitalist world makes people blind to its workings and that people's main concern should be to perceive life with values and to understand each other. Each character with whom the little prince is involved in a dialogue is either a perpetrator or just a product of

---

[19] Ibid., 12.

[20] J. A. Cuddon, *Penguin Dictionary of Literary Terms and Literary Theory*, 4th ed. (London: Penguin Books, 2000), 640.

[21] Bakhtin, *Problems*, 127.

[22] Ibid., 26.

[23] Antonie de Saint Exupéry, *The Little Prince*, 3rd ed, trans. Katherine Woods (New York: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1995), 133.

the prevailing system. For instance, the king on Asteroid B-325 represents rulers sustaining the totalitarian ideology. The businessman on Asteroid B-328 stands out as a representative of the bourgeoisie, whereas the lamplighter on Asteroid B-329 is the representative of working-class people. Moreover, the conceited man on Asteroid B-326 represents people who are victims of the capitalist ideology that urges them to construct their social relations on materiality and fetishism. The drunkard on Asteroid B-327 also represents the victimised people of capitalism which renders them addicted to materials, including drugs and alcohol. As for the geographer on Asteroid B-330, he embodies scientists lacking in an inquisitive approach beyond materialism. Considering the dialogues between the little prince and some adults in the other planets, it is understandable why the adults' concerns are ridiculed. The king is concerned with giving orders, such as the sun to set and the little prince to yawn. The businessman counts stars which—he claims—belong to him and records them on a piece of paper that he keeps in the bank. Wearing a shiny, ridiculous hat, the conceited man yearns for admiration and respect. The drunkard wishes not to remember his shame for drinking while drinking alcohol. The lamplighter blindly obeys the order of turning on and off the lamp of his tiny planet. Finally, the sole purpose of the geographer is to collect information about the geographical features of the world in thick books while not even moving around his tiny planet.

All the mentioned characters exemplify grotesque realism, which is one of the essential Bakhtinian concepts that provide an insight into the subversive nature of comical elements in a novel. Grotesque realism is a criticism of an unfavourable social issue or idea through exaggerated images and indirect laughter. Thus, grotesque elements are comic on the surface but serious in-depth, so they both entertain and disturb. According to Bakhtin, they stand on the border of "the contrast between the feeling of pleasure and displeasure."[24] While the improbability of the grotesque characters leads to displeasure, criticism and happy solutions cause relief and joyfulness. Degrading the things thought to be "ideal" or "high," grotesque realism universalises grotesque characters to represent "all-people's characters."[25] The characters whom the little prince encounters on the other planets are just like fools and clowns in the medieval festivals, about whom Bakhtin states,

> [T]hey represented a certain form of life, which was real and ideal at the
> same time. They stood on the borderline between life and art, in a peculiar

---

[24] Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, 305.
[25] Ibid., 19.

midzone as it were, they were neither eccentrics nor dolts, neither were they comic actors.[26]

Therefore, although the characters in the carnivalesque literature seem considerably serious in their businesses and dialogues with the little prince, they evoke the reader's laughter.

The little prince experiences a unique carnivalesque experience with the men on these planets. Like a carnival, the juxtaposition of different ideologies on each planet is observed in this work as well. Each visit results in, in Bakhtin's words, "a dialogic *concordance* of unmerged twos and multiples" (original emphasis).[27] Thus, just like the medieval carnivals, the novella merges, as Bakhtin suggests regarding polyphonic works, temporary "utopian ideal and the realistic…in this carnival experience, unique of its kind."[28] Likewise, Exupéry's utopian carnivalised work removes all the boundaries for a critical approach to the present authoritative and hierarchical world order through grotesque characters as influential elements of parody leading to laughter.

Parody evokes laughter while subverting through grotesque realism in *The Little Prince*. Each character whom the little prince encounters on different planets ridicules the prevailing system and paves the way for its questioning and reconstruction. More specifically, the author criticises and ridicules monarchs through the representative king in the novella. In a carnivalesque manner, he opposes political oppression and totalitarian order through parody, laughter, and grotesque realism. The little prince observes that he boasts of his absolute power even though there is not a living being on the planet other than an old rat. The little prince says, "He did not know how the world is simplified for kings."[29] As there are not any other subjects on his planet, the king performs his authority over the sun by ordering it to set, but, ironically, only at sunset. He explains why he orders the sun to set when it is about to set as follows:

> Accepted authority rests first of all on reason. If you ordered your people
> to go and throw themselves into the sea, they would
> rise up in a revolution. I have the right to require obedience because my
> orders are reasonable.[30]

---

[26] Ibid., 8.
[27] Bakhtin, *Problems*, 289.
[28] Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, 10.
[29] Exupéry, 69.
[30] Ibid., 74.

The king also orders the little prince to yawn when he is already about to yawn.[31] He seems to meet his need for obedience to his authority regardless of his orders' reasonability. The little prince is not fooled because he knows that "[f]or what the king fundamentally insisted upon was that his authority should be respected […] [as] [h]e was an absolute monarch."[32] Furthermore, the king does not want the little prince to depart. He says to him that he will appoint him as the minister of justice. It is so ironic to be a judge on a planet where there is no one, except for an old rat. Suggesting the little prince judge himself, via the parodical king, the author gives a significant lesson: "It is much more difficult to judge oneself than to judge others. If you succeed in judging yourself rightly, then you are indeed a man of true wisdom."[33] Thus, despite the comical effect evoking laughter, the character prevents the reader from arbitrarily criticising different ways of governing and judging practised in the world.

The conceited man on another planet represents all contemptuous people. He is also a bizarre character for the little prince. He has "a [shiny] hat for salutes."[34] He considers himself to be the most handsome and the cleverest man on his little planet. In Bakhtinian thinking, the head—the upper part of the human body—is home to ideas, dreams, and abstract values,[35] but the conceited man seems to be deprived of them; thus, it is ridiculous for him to want to be admired as a clever man. The sniffy man makes use of his head just to show off his hat. It is also a pity that the conceited man still wants to be admired and respected even though the little prince reminds him that he is, indeed, alone on the planet. The little prince—perplexed by the conceited man's insistent vanity and narrow point of view—comments, "Grown-ups are certainly very very odd."[36] Similarly, the drunkard on Asteroid B-32 is also alone on the planet spending his time drinking so as to be able not to remember his shame for drinking.[37] The grotesque character seems to conflict with himself; he tries to abandon the idea of his addiction by perpetuating it. This miserable adult shocks the little prince. He does not differ from the conceited man desiring to be admired via a shiny ridiculous hat on his head. Ironically, like the conceited man, the drunkard is also concerned with his physical entity against the norms of classical conception, as in the carnivals. Thus,

---

[31] Ibid., 70.

[32] Ibid., 71.

[33] Ibid., 76.

[34] Ibid., 79.

[35] Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, 148.

[36] Exupéry, 82.

[37] Ibid., 84.

Exupéry's novella parodies people who fail to coordinate their mental and physical aspects and cannot cross their physical borders into the mental space because they are hooked on the surface through materiality.

The geographer, who suggests the little prince visit the Earth—as it has "a good reputation"[38]—represents all narrow-minded scientists who suppose that knowledge is finite and exists just in recorded concrete entities. He is an old gentleman who collects the information given by explorers that visit his planet in thick books. He lives on a vast and fascinating planet, but he does not know about its geographical features because, for him, "[i]t is not the geographer who goes out to count the towns, the rivers, the mountains, the seas, the oceans, and the deserts. The geographer is much too important to go loafing about."[39] To know things, the geographer relies on the stories of others. For the little prince, however, it requires effort to know things.[40] Passive grown-ups who lack observation skills and are unwilling to question and to explore are criticised in this novella. The geographer's case demonstrates the unreliability and relativity of knowledge; it further reveals that one should expand his vision and awareness through first-hand experience and knowledge.

In addition to "carnivalesque," the term "heteroglossia" also takes its source from Bakhtin's Marxist background. Heteroglossia enables the same person to use language in various modes of speech in distinct circumstances. In this context, according to Dentith, Bakhtin "acknowledges the class and makes it indeed the ground of his account of language through the notion of heteroglossia."[41] Through the use of heteroglossia in *The Little Prince*— that is, the inclusion of different classes with their modes of speech in a carnivalesque atmosphere—*The Little Prince* shares the same ground with Bakhtin in the anti-capitalist point of view. Besides the other characters mentioned above, the lamplighter is also a strange character through whom the novella stands against official orders. He initially appears to the little prince as the most favourable one he ever meets because the little prince finds his job useful: to light the lamp when the sun sets. However, the little prince observes that the lamplighter's planet revolves faster and faster, and the poor lamplighter feels doomed to turn on his lamp and immediately turn it off again. The lamplighter does not question the order and obeys it by saying to the little prince: "Orders

---

[38] Ibid., 108.

[39] Ibid., 104.

[40] Ibid., 106.

[41] Simon Dentith, *Bakhtinian Thought: An Introductory Reader* (London: Routledge, 1995), 14.

are orders."[42] His words are of heteroglossic feature uttered by a submissively obedient officer on his duty. Thus, he is one of the characters through whom the author criticises the prevailing capitalist system that enslaves people without letting them question it.

Another character contributing to the subversive carnival atmosphere Exupéry creates in *The Little Prince* is the businessman, who is busy with counting the stars in the sky and claims that they are his. The little prince thinks that the man is wasting his life with that assumption, and he asserts that "owning" means being useful to what you own. Thus, he parodies all capitalists, including colonialists and imperialists, of all times with the idea that they ever and never own something as long as they just use the things they "own" selfishly. In the little prince's approach, the one-way selfish utilisation does not render one an "owner." While observing the businessman, the little prince questions the businessman's idea of "owning" with his owning the rose he waters and protects, and the three volcanoes he cleans every day. This point exemplifies the Bakhtinian notion that any ideas engaged in a dialogue become prone to change depending on the dialogical relation among consciousnesses.[43] Accordingly, the businessman and the little prince are crossed with their different ideas of "ownership."

The little prince explores his consciousness as he questions himself in each dialogue with the other characters, which leads to the little prince's awakening. Thus, the double-sided answerability generates an unending process of communication for each speaker and listener. The little prince anticipates a response to all his questions all the time, and he does not let any questions go unanswered. In this respect, he fits well with the Bakhtinian concept of the speaker who "talks with an expectation of a response, agreement, sympathy, objection, execution, and so forth."[44] Accordingly, in a dialogue, there is an interdependent relationship between people's utterances; Bakhtin states, "[e]ach utterance refutes, affirms, supplements, and relies upon the others, presupposes them to be known, and somehow takes them into account."[45] Therefore, all the characters' utterances swim around the island of language, bumping into each other and producing new ideas. Still, Bakhtin notices that some utterances do not receive an immediate articulated response; what the listener gets from a dialogue finds its form either in behaviour or speech in another dialogic

---

[42] Exupéry, 95.
[43] Bakhtin, *Problems*, 88.
[44] Bakhtin, *Speech*, 69.
[45] Ibid., 91.

relationship.[46] To illustrate, in *The Little Prince*, when the geographer says to the little prince that flowers are "in danger of speedy disappearance,"[47] the little prince remains silent. However, pondering upon the geographer's utterance, the little prince feels he is responsible for the rose he has left behind and decides to go back to his planet later. Furthermore, the businessman's words about the ownership of the stars and the fox's saying that one is responsible for what he has tamed remind the little prince of his three volcanoes and rose on his planet. Therefore, he says that he is beginning to understand[48] because he associates the businessman's and fox's referents with his volcanoes and rose. Emerson interprets the Bakhtinian concept of responsibility:

> The Russian word for responsibility (otvetstvennost) implies both a literal 'ability to respond,' that is 'responsiveness, answerability,' as well as a more ethically burdened meaning.[49]

Thus, his responsibility for the rose derives from his answerability to it.

Furthermore, the awakening of the little prince's and the narrator's consciousnesses results from the dialogues that they are involved in throughout the novella. It is noteworthy that the word "understand" is used twenty-seven times in the work. Drawing attention to the dialogic nature of "understanding," Voloshinov states that understanding another person's utterance requires that one adapt to it and respond to it in the corresponding context.[50] In this context, while the little prince seeks to relate all the ideologies he encounters to himself and to understand them, grown-ups tend either not to understand or to misunderstand. Both the narrator and the fox point out the lack of communication among people. The narrator complains that grown-ups cannot discern a boa constrictor digesting an elephant in the picture he has drawn in his childhood, and the fox claims that "[w]ords are the source of misunderstandings."[51]

According to Bakhtin, language embodies a worldview by imbuing it with ideology. This worldview is not singular because each self, who is also a user of language, constructs a distinct worldview through exchanges

---

[46] Ibid., 68-69.

[47] Exupéry, 108.

[48] Ibid., 140.

[49] C. Emerson, *The First Hundred Years of Mikhail Bakhtin* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1997), 283.

[50] V. N. Voloshinov, *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language,* trans. L. Matejka and I. R. Titunik (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1973), 102.

[51] Exupéry, 134.

of worldviews in dialogical relations. In this context, it is impossible to talk about a single and objective truth as it is constructed through exchanges between and among people who are involved in dialogue while searching for the truth.[52] Through dialogues, the self is endlessly reconstructed as long as the self is in a dialogical relationship with the other. Therefore, Bakhtin notes,

> The word does not exist in a neutral and impersonal language [...], but rather it exists in other people's mouths, in other people's contexts, serving other people's intentions: it is from there that one must take the word, and make it one's own.[53]

In this context, in *The Little Prince*, the title character learns from the fox, whom he meets on the Earth that "what is essential is invisible to the eye;"[54] then the little prince utters this sentence to the pilot/narrator in another context, and towards the end of the work, addressing the readers, the narrator repeats that what is important to us is not visible to the eyes but the heart.[55] He also says, "Oh, little prince! Bit by bit I came to understand the secrets of your sad little life."[56] The narrator comprehends why the little prince is notably worried about his rose and feels sorry about humanity, remembering his responsibility as a human being towards the people whom he loves and towards the world. Thus, the narrator's statement is not a product of an impersonal language; it is a living item existing in everybody's context, according to the circumstances in which it finds expressions in each context. Thus, in Bakhtinian words, language is "reinvigorated in renewed form (in a new context)."[57] This trait renders language generative as a living entity, indicating unfinalisability.

Unfinalisability is one of the most significant concepts in the Bakhtinian theory of dialogism because, in the Bakhtinian approach, dialogism brings about an unavoidably infinite change in the self's perception as a result of polyphonic and heteroglossic human relations. Through the interaction of the unique voices of the individuals, it becomes possible to talk about the diversity of the voices of the unfinalised selves, and these multiple voices of the distinct selves create polyphony; therefore, personalities evolve through language. That is why Bakhtin

---

[52] Bakhtin, *Problems*, 110.
[53] Bakhtin, *Dialogic*, 293-294.
[54] Exupéry, 139.
[55] Ibid., 150.
[56] Ibid., 43.
[57] Bakhtin, *Speech*, 166.

claims that "[t]here always remains an unrealized surplus of humanness; there always remains a need for the future, and a place for this future must be found."[58] Thus, there is no way for the last utterance in dialogism which always promises hope for the future. In *The Little Prince*, six years after the little prince's leaving the Earth for his planet, the narrator counterbalances his sadness with hope by telling his readers that the little prince is back if they see someone refusing to answer. The work is open-ended, and the last and ultimate word is not said because, as Bakhtin notes, "the ultimate word of the world and about the world has not yet been spoken, the world is open and free, everything is still in the future and will always be in the future."[59] Thus, the end of the work indicates a new beginning for the little prince, who becomes much more dependent upon his rose due to the things he has learnt on the Earth, and the narrator, who learns about humanity, the meaning of life, and the importance of love and compassion thanks to the little prince.

The dialogical reading of *The Little Prince* reveals that it is a polyphonic work because the author brings together a plurality of consciousnesses in a subversive carnivalesque manner. Engaging the main characters in dialogic interaction, Exupéry allows the consciousnesses of the little prince and the narrator to bump into and counteract other consciousnesses; thus, the narrator and the little prince are led to questioning themselves and each other towards understanding the meaning of life. The little prince's laughter becomes his way of expressing the truth and a manifestation of his victory over any authorities. The pilot/narrator becomes more aware of the superiority of values, such as love and compassion, to materiality, and the novella's open-ending invites the readers to produce multiple comments and conclusions and—through this process—to participate in a dialogic interaction with the novella's characters which in turn fosters the readers' intellectual growth.

References

Bakhtin, Mikhail. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays.* Translated by Michael Holquist and Caryl Emerson. Edited by Michael Holquist. Austin: Texas University Press, 1981.
Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics.* Translated and edited by Caryl Emerson. London: Minnesota University Press, 1984.

---

[58] Bakhtin, *Problems*, 37.
[59] Ibid., 166.

Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Rabelais and His World.* Translated by Helene Iswolsky. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984.

Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays.* Translated by Vem W. McGee. Edited by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: Texas University Press, 1986.

Cuddon, J. A. *Penguin Dictionary of Literary Terms and Literary Theory.* 4th ed. London: Penguin Books, 2000.

Dentith, Simon. *Bakhtinian Thought: An Introductory Reader.* London: Routledge, 1995.

Emerson, C. *The First Hundred Years of Mikhail Bakhtin.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. 1997.

Exupéry, Antonie de Saint. *The Little Prince.* 3rd ed. Translated by Katherine Woods. New York: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1995.

Harris, R. Ailen. "Bakhtin, Phaedrus, and the Geometry of Rhetoric." In *Landmark Essays on Bakhtin, Rhetoric and Writing,* 15-22. Edited by Frank Farmer. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1998.

Holquist, Michael. "Introduction." In *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays,* xv- xxxiii. Written by Mikhail Bakhtin. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Edited by Michael Holquist. Austin: Texas University Press, 1981.

Morris, Pam. *The Bakhtin Reader.* London: Arnold, 2003.

Stallybrass, Peter and Allon White. "Bourgeois Hysteria and the Carnivalesque." In *The Cultural Studies Reader,* 284-92. Edited by Simon During. London: Routledge, 1993.

Voloshinov, V. N. *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language.* Translated by L. Matejka and I. R. Titunik. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1973.

Chapter Eight

To Be Postdramatic
or Not to Be Political:
Heiner Müller's *Hamletmachine*

Mesut Günenç and Hakan Gültekin

> "It is not through the direct thematization of the political that theatre becomes political but through the implicit substance and critical value of its *mode of representation*."[1]

Historical periods of dramatic structure, character, mimesis and catharsis trace back to the great Aristotelian work of theatre criticism, *Poetics.* Aristotelian traditional values and conventional theatrical thoughts remained on the agenda until the end of the 19th century with a central focus on text, a well-developed structure, and character. Playwrights tried to create pure and unified drama related to Aristotle's ideas. As a direct reaction to Realism and Naturalism, historical avant-gardes focused on using media techniques and the mental and physical exposure of the audience. Instead of linear structure, fractured and unstageable works were seen on the stage. At the end of the 19th century, the rules of classical drama were facing fundamental changes. Avant-garde movements, the epic form, and other elements attempted to develop new dramatic forms. With the avant-garde movements, theatrical traits started to be used as coactions with spectators and property of presence. Reorganization of the theatre, trans-individual characters, multiple personality figures, fragmented and solipsist characters, hieroglyphic actors and alienated audiences have been observed in the 20th century. These avant-garde movements have changed in presentation, representation, text, and dialogue.

In the mid-twentieth century, Bertolt Brecht, the most significant theatre theorist, applies the technique of historicization to his epic theatre,

---

[1] Hans. T. Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre* (London: Routhledge, 2006), 178.

by which he tries to deconstruct the roots of dramatic traditions using alienation and the narrative technique to form a potentially political experience. Epic theatre is the pioneer of postdramatic theatre; Lehmann labels postdramatic theatre as a post-Brechtian theatre which "situates itself in a space opened up by the Brechtian inquiries into the presence and consciousness of the process of representation within the represented and the inquiry into a new 'art of spectating'."[2] Epic theatre endeavours to deconstruct the roots of the dramatic structure in the light of a political perspective; however, it still uses dramatic conventions. Lehmann believes that the story "remains the sine quo non for Brecht."[3] Apart from Bertolt Brecht, Lehmann also appeals to Antonin Artaud's *Theatre of Cruelty* to apprehend the political phase of postdramatic theatre. Lehmann (2006) views "Artaud as a major influence on his formulation of postdramatic theatre."[4]

At the end of the 1990s, Gerda Poschmann criticizes drama theory and its dependence on categories such as plot, character, and dialogue. In spite of theatre specialists like Beckett and Brecht and their inventive contribution, dramatic theory and its conventional elements continued to direct playwrights and performances. For this reason, Poschmann asserts that a new kind of drama, a new kind of staging and performance should be taken into consideration[5]. After Poschmann, Hans Thies Lehmann used the term *Postdramatiches Theater* in 1999 and seven years later his work was translated into English as *Postdramatic Theatre* (2006).

Since the term refuses a definite characterization and explanation, it is difficult to define the concept of postdramatic theatre in a coherent manner.[6] Specifically, the "post" prefix brought about ambiguities. Catherine Bouko clarifies this confusion over the prefix:

> The prefix "post" is confusing because it can be understood in two different manners: either as an approach that does not take the dramatic advances into account and wants to make a fresh start, or as a spectacular

---

[2] Ibid., 33.
[3] Ibid., 33.
[4] Ibid., 32.
[5] Gerda Poschmann, *Der Nicht Mehr Dramatische Theatertext. Aktuelle Bühnenstücke und Ihre Dramaturgische Analyse*. (Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1990), 7.
[6] Marvin Carlson, *Postdramatic Theatre and Postdramatic Performance*, *Rev. Bras. Estud. Presença, Porto Alegre* 5, no. 3 (2015): 578.

form that does not deny the possibilities of dramatic renewals but directs its research towards non-dramatic modes of expression.[7]

Postdramatic Theatre, the post side of drama, contains a post-theatre rejection of the idea whereby it evaluates theatre as a literary theory. Lehmann describes the contemporary works and performances by rejecting traditional values, the written text, and well-developed structures and forming postdramatic theatrical signs and aspects; furthermore, instead of postmodern, he uses the new term postdramatic and distinguishes three phases of theatrical staging: the linguistic text, the text of the staging and the performance text.[8] On the other hand, focusing on the term 'open character', he aims to abandon the dramatic representation and forms of heterogeneous performances. Postdramatic theatre does not represent a new type of text of staging and a new type of text, but it is a form where the quality of the performance text changes physically. Lehmann, in his seminal work *Tragedy and Dramatic Theatre*, also classifies the periods of theatre in three phases. The first one is predramatic, the second one is dramatic and the last period is postdramatic. Lehmann asserts that "the theory of tragedy must make its point of departure the distinction between predramatic, dramatic and postdramatic theatricality; this is what imparts to the basic tragic motif particular, historically specific contours that change from epoch to epoch."[9]

Postdramatic is not epochal as it contains deep historical theories and periods. In this context, it is clear that postdramatic theatre is a suitable method for exploring the phenomenon of historical and contemporary political issues such as globalization or neoliberalism, and may offer more accessible resources for a modern dialectical political theatre. Theatre as an art form has inevitably been shaped for centuries, both in theory and practice, by politics. From this perspective, although it is claimed to be non-political or at least to extinguish political issues from a different form than the traditional forms of political theatre, postdramatic theatre is not independent from political developments such as the rise of neoliberalism and globalization as the dominant sociological reality.

Political theatre is commonly reserved for plays that appeal to current political subjects, such as terrorism, war with terror and migration arguments. For Lehmann, postdramatic theatre practices "continue to be

---

[7] Catharine Bouko, "The Musicality of Postdramatic Theater: Hans-Thies Lehmann's Theory of Independent Auditory Semiotics," *Gramma: Journal of Theory and Criticism*, no. 17 (2009): 26.

[8] Hans. T. Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre* (London: Routhledge, 2006), 85.

[9] Hans.T. Lehmann, *Tragedy and Dramatic Theatre* (Routhledge, 2016), 4.

seen by many theatre practitioners as more suited to deal with social issues (unemployment, violence, social isolation, terrorism, issues of race and gender) than the traditional model of socially engaged drama."[10] He asserts that postdramatic theatre investigates the political through theatre with the use of representation. The political representation of the postdramatic theatre has always been open to discussion. Lehmann (2006) clarifies the fact that today's theatre differentiates itself from traditional political theatre genres. To him, "action art has its energetic centre no longer in the demand for changing the world, expressed by social provocation, but instead in the production of events, exceptions and moments of deviation."[11]

Theatre is not honestly mediated by politics, but by a certain representation. Lehmann states that it does not make sense to expect the theatre to represent political conflicts in the globalized world. The postdramatic theatre is a theatrical movement that has gone beyond the dramatic forms of the theatre and has brought a new discourse to dramatic performance. Though not directly related to traditional political theatre movements, it has not been insensitive to the political problems of the world it has been part of. One of the major works of the postdramatic theatre, Heiner Müller's *Hamletmachine* is an important example of bringing political situations to the stage through postdramatic methods. In addition, postdramatic theatre is a social phenomenon, like all forms of art. It has a dialectical role in the common heritage of humanity. Therefore, although it is not directly a kind of political theatre, it is not independent of ideology and political developments.

The author of the present play, Heiner Müller has a legendary status as a dramatist and reformer of the development of the non-linear form of the theatre in the second half of the 20th century. Heiner Müller was born in Eppendorf in 1929 and during his adulthood, he felt the full effect of Nazi brutality. Müller started writing in 1948 and continued all through the Cold War and his enterprise as a playwright came in 1957 with *The Wage Sinker*, a play which was dedicated to a worker who had to work under Nazis[12]. Due to his ideas, which describe the unsteadiness of the GDR (German Democratic Republic), his plays were banned until 1973. Instead of the German experience, Müller focuses in his plays on historical discourse, literature and mythology in order to create dense texts that

---

[10] Elinor Fuchs, "Postdramatic Theatre," *TDR: The Drama Review* 52, no. 2 (2008): 180.
[11] Hans. T. Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, 105.
[12] David Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamletmachine* (Routhledge, 2016), 2.

comment on both Germany and the rest of the world.[13] His major plays include *Germania Tod in Berlin* (*Germania Death in Berlin*, 1971), *Der Auftrag* (*The Mission*, 1979) and *Quartett* (*Quartet*, 1980). In his plays, Müller confronts the audiences with the actors to analyse the relationship between history, text, and performance. In this context, Wood clarifies that "Müller's work both engages with and transcends his own socio-historical context."[14] In contrast to other dramatists and authors, Heiner Müller brings to a head with how we observe historical events and plays and how we perceive them. His drama is essentially built upon the idea of socio-historical context and political drama.

On the other hand, Müller is an important figure who enhances the significant value of theatre with the help of representation. Michael Wood asserts that "Müller is regarded by many as both a pioneer and central practitioner of postdramatic theatre in terms of his work as writer and director."[15] In his plays, Müller practises a postdramatic illustration of history to enlighten present subjects. By means of his works, Müller is identified as a distinctive representative of postdramatic theatre. In his later works, explicit time and space are no longer observed. Non-hierarchical structure, non-linear fragments with no defined source, and repeatedly no definite speaker/character, give his works a postdramatic character. His work is not only an example of postdramatic theatre, but it represents a political mode of postdramatic theatre within the historical context. In this historical context, "Müller chooses to make theatre in a political way instead of making political theatre." [16] "Making theatre" provides a qualified performance and interrogative audience and in postdramatic theatre, "indeterminate nature, fundamental aspects of it are not pre-ordained."[17]

In a sense, Müller represents both the political conflict and the postdramatic side with the use of monologue, chorus and discontinuity.

---

[13] H.A Arnold, "Arlene A. Teraoka: The Silence of Entropy or Universal Discourse: The Postmodernist Poetics of Heiner Müller," *GDR: Bulletin* no. 14 (1988): 9-11.

[14] Michael Wood, "Performing the Collective. Heiner Müller's 'Alone with These Bodies' ('Allein mit diesen Leibern') as a Piece for Postdramatic Theatre," *Postdramatic Theatre and Political*, eds. Karen Jürs Munby, Jerome Carroll and Steve Gilles, (Bloomsbury, 2013), 255.

[15] Ibid.

[16] Jan Deck, "Politisch Theater machen – Eine Einleitung," eds. Jan Deck and Angelika Sieburg. *Politisch Theater machen: Neue Artikulationsformen des Politischen in den darstellenden Künsten*, (Bielefeld: transcript, 2011), 14.

[17] Jerome Carroll, Steve Gille and Karen Jürs Munby, "Introduction: Postdramatic Theatre and the Political," *Postdramatic Theatre and Political*, eds. Karen Jürs Munby, Jerome Carroll and Steve Gilles, (Bloomsbury, 2013), 12.

Müller paves the way for the connection of past and present in the light of postdramatic techniques using Shakespeare's and Brecht's different historical allusion. He distorts the reflection of different events and society by confusing modern characters and historical ones with a breaking of voices and the use of different texts. In light of the discussion on the relationship between postdramatic and political theatre, this study analyses Heiner Müller's play *Hamletmachine*.

In line with his agenda and his poetics, Müller's most popular play to date is *Hamletmachine*. Heiner Müller, revising the classic drama of *Hamlet*, signs his name as a reformist avant-garde playwright in the Western world. *Hamletmachine* was written in 1977 and the action takes place in West Germany/Munich. First of all, Müller clarifies the title of the play as *Hamlet in Budapest*; since the play presents the relationship between workers in Hungary and Hamlet the play was titled *Hamletmachine* and it asks the question, "What is the balance between the human and the mechanical?."[18] Müller himself clarifies the title of the play as "the first preoccupation I have when I write drama is to destroy things. For thirty years Hamlet was a real obsession for me, so I tried to destroy him by writing a short text, Hamletmachine."[19] The title of the play refers to Shakespearean Hamlet's letter to Ophelia using the word "machine."[20] Müller also uses Andy Warhol's statement "I want to be a machine, wouldn't you" and cites it in the play. [21] Barnett clarifies Warhol's statements as "his point is that life would be easier if everything were automated, a position not dissimilar to that of the Hamlet figure in the play."[22]

Like the classical structure of *Hamlet*, *Hamletmachine* consists of five parts but it is abnormally short for it contains only nine pages. The headings in *Hamletmachine* begin with capital letters. The sections are not specified as acts in the text. Each scene relates itself to the dialogue within, though, the headings differ in each scene. Hence there is no clear

---

[18] David Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamletmachine*, 5.

[19] Rotringer Slyvere and Heiner Müller, *Walls*. In Müller, Germenia, trans. and annot. Bernard and Caroline Schütze, ed. Lotringer (New York: Semiotext(e), 1990), 13-61, here 55-6.

[20] Doubt thou the stars are fire; / Doubt that the sun doth move; / Doubt truth to be a liar; / But Never doubt I love. / 'O dear Ophelia, I am ill at these numbers; /I have not art to reckon / My groans: but that /1 love thee best, O most best, believe it. Adieu. / 'Thine evermore Most dear lady, whilst / this machine is to him, HAMLET. (II. ii)

[21] Andy Warhol quoted in EricShanes, Andy Warhol (London: Sirricco, n.d.), 30.

[22] David Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamlet Machine*, 5.

linear storyline –it only arranges the fragments. These five sections do not contain a unified plot that is attributed to the protagonist and a central narrative. Müller's aim is to reflect on a problematic text in which it is difficult to understand who narrates the text. There is no clear relationship between text and character. Readers and audiences cannot determine who the text masters are.

In the first scene of the play, Hamlet, represented as a semantic image for Marxist intellectualist, is presented as the son of a dead high ranking member of the Communist Party. Ghost represents both the history of the West and of communism in *Hamletmachine*; however, no speaker is indicated. The first scene of the play 'Family Album' starts with "I was Hamlet";[23] nevertheless it is not based upon a speaker. The opening line refers to a precarious narration. The speaker narrates a state funeral and his lines are represented with capital letters in the past tense. The speaker, shouting "SHOULD I HELP YOU UP UNCLE OPEN YOUR LEGS MAMA"[24], changes to the present tense. This revolt turns the speaker into a kind of revenger and it "supports a violent status-quo socio-political structure."[25] Towards the end of the first scene, Heiner Müller thematises Horatio, Polonius, the ghost, Gertrude and Cladius. Müller also quotes from *Hamlet*, *Richard the Third*, his own play *Bau* and T. S. Eliot's *Ash Wednesday*. The second scene begins with Ophelia's (Chorus/Hamlet) short monologue with a different stage direction "Enormous room. Ophelia. Her heart is a clock,"[26] with the use of present-tense narration "I am Ophelia"[27] and the switch from past to present is clearly significant."[28] Ophelia's monologue is a claim of independence and she tries to escape from captivity:

> I am Ophelia. The one the river didn't hold. The woman on the rope
> The woman with the arteries slit open The woman with the overdose
> SNOW ON THE LIPS The woman with her head in the gas oven.
> Yesterday I stopped killing myself. I am alone with my breasts my thighs
> my womb. I demolish the tools of my imprisonment the chair
> the table the bed (…) I set fire to my prison. I throw my clothes on the
> fire.[29]

---

[23] Heiner Müller. *Mauser* (Berlin: Rotbuch, 1978), 90.

[24] Ibid., 90.

[25] Jonathan Kalb, "On Hamletmachine: Müller and the Shadow of Artaud," *New German Critique*: *Special Issue on Heiner* Muller, no. 73 (1998): 46-66, here 53.

[26] Heiner Müller. *Mauser*, 89.

[27] Ibid.

[28] David Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamlet Machine*, 13.

[29] Müller, *Mauser*, 91-92.

Müller entitles the third part as 'Scherzo' which is "an Italian word that means a joke and often denotes a comic movement in a larger work."[30] The scene differs from other scenes since it consists of a dialogue: "Do you want to eat my heart, Hamlet. *Laughs*. Hamlet *hands in front of his face*: I want to be a woman."[31] Barnett clarifies that "It is worth noting, however, that the dialogue can hardly be considered a conversation."[32] Müller designates dialogues to Hamlet and Ophelia, but, some parts of the play are rather weird and impossible to understand as the dialogue does not represent a meaningful conversation. The scene also has a nightmarish context: *the dead philosophers throw their books at Hamlet. (...)* On a swing the *Madonna with breast cancer. (...) The breast cancer shines like a sun*"[33]. Hamlet's putting on Ophelia's clothes, Hamlet and Horatio's dance and Ophelia's striptease are represented. This scene also shows the transmutation of characters into other characters. After the only dialogue in the play, the longest scene 'Pest in Buda/ Battle for Greenland' represents the Hungarian Uprising in 1956. The speaker starts as Hamlet and later becomes Hamlet performer, taking off his costume and mask. [34] This scene thematises the decadence of Europe and the Communist Manifesto, and Hamlet performer takes up an axe and splits open the heads of Marx, Lenin, and Mao, played by three naked women. The last scene 'Maddering Endurance/Inside the Dreaded Armour/Millennia' represents Ophelia's transformation into Electra and is wrapped in bandages by two male surgeons. Ophelia's monologue is short and clear, and it echoes the second scene. It starts with "Here speak Electra" who identifies herself as a revenger. [35]

All of these scenes specify that the traditional notion of character and space no longer apply. Also, there is no progression through time. Müller explains his precariousness while he was writing the play; he had

> no idea whatsoever how it could be realized on stage, not the slightest idea. There was a text, and there was no space in my imagination for the text, no stage, no actors, nothing. It was written in a kind of soundproof zone, and that has been happening with me increasingly. It was the same with *Hamletmachine*; there are those desperate stage directions that are impossible to realize, a symptom of my inability to imagine ways to realize them and see the space where these events could happen. That means these are at

[30] Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamlet Machine*, 16.
[31] Müller, *Mauser*, 92.
[32] Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamlet Machine*, 14.
[33] Müller, *Mauser*, 90.
[34] Ibid.
[35] Ibid., 94.

bottom plays or texts whose only lace of action is my brain or head. They are performed here, within this skull. How do you do that on a theatre stage?[36]

Heiner Müller resists the temptation to limit the structure of the play and represents a meticulous reading of the text. David Barnett clarifies that the "play openly resists attempts to limit its meaning by interpreting its lines, as even a cursory reading of the speeches reveals."[37] The roots of dramatic characteristics are questioned in *Hamletmachine* though it is divided into five scenes. In this regard, Lehmann provides a clear explanation as "Heiner Müller's *Hamletmachine* invokes the five-act structure of tragedy even as it takes leave of drama."[38] Müller himself points out that "the theatre is an essentially conservative institution that is primarily concerned with turning complex, potentially revolutionary artistic meditations on human experience into packageable commodities that can be sold to and consumed by audiences."[39] Müller believes that the playwright leaves conventional modes and represents experiential equipment and hence audiences find themselves in moments of crises.

Müller's text diverges from the dramatic form. In dramatic theatre, every line and dialogue has a role and it creates a logical structure. A well-developed structure with beginnings, middles and ends give a linear time structure, hierarchical order, and specified location. In *Hamletmachine*, it is difficult to understand what is being represented on the stage; instead of characters, the play refers to figures since "Müller refuses to attach a name to the speaker of the first scene. This decision already disconnects the words from a discrete person and invites us to think beyond the confines of the individual."[40] Müller also invites us to think about the non-hierarchical structure of the text. While the first scene refers to Hamlet, "Pest in Buda" rejects his existence, while "Europe of the Woman" refers to Ophelia's existence, "Maddening Endurance" transforms her into Electra and in the middle of the play "The Scherzo" refers to the dialogue and accepts Hamlet's and Ophelia's existence.

Besides having five different sections and multiple identities, different language is also used in *Hamletmachine*. "Multilingual theatre texts dismantle the unity of national languages"[41], which indicate the postdramatic

---

[36] Müller, 218-9.
[37] David Barnett, *Heiner Müller's The Hamletmachine*, 46.
[38] Hans. T. Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, 6.
[39] Barnett, 19.
[40] Ibid., 37.
[41] Hans. T. Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, 147.

feature of "polyglossia". In his work, Lehmann employs Heiner Müller's text as an example for polyglossia. In *Hamletmachine,* the playwright makes use of the English language in two passages, and word structure and syntax gathered from different texts through appealing to intertextuality. Needless to say, it is "polyphonic monologues often without assigned speakers, which lends itself to postdramatic forms of staging."[42]

Hamletmachine accommodates not the only density of signs, non-hierarchical structure and polyphonic monologues related to postdramatic signs, but also media and multimedia theatre related to postdramatic aspects. The use of media creates new modes of representation and the text leaves the dramatic structure. Lehmann clarifies the role of media as: "if we remain, spectators/viewers, if we stay where we are – in front of the television – the catastrophe will always stay outside, will always be objects for a subject."[43] What is worth noting is that the last scene and different details in the play represent multimedia theatre and performance art: *"Deep sea. Ophelia in a wheel chair. Fish debris corpses and corpse pieces go by", "Unnoticed by the Hamlet Actor, stage hands arrange a refrigerator and three television sets. Sounds of the refrigerator. Three television programs without sound."*[44] Media triggers audiences' feelings and thoughts; in this way, audiences will no longer stay outside the performance.

In his play *Hamletmachine*, Müller features popular cultural elements, symbolized by the consumption culture produced by Neoliberalization, which has been the dominant ideology of the ruling class since the 1970s. Müller blends the classic elements of *Hamlet* with popular culture concepts. For example, Coca-Cola, the symbol of the international consumer industry, and Dostoyevski's famous novel protagonist Raskolnikov can be observed in successive lines in a HAMLET ACTOR's monologue. It can also be seen by the audience that HAMLET is upset about Doctor Zhivago and his dogs. These narrative techniques include both the concept of Parataxis, which describes the state of the disappearance of the dramatic hierarchy and the Plethora concept, which means the random concentration of dramatic indicators. According to what this study reveals, these are not random choices. It is no coincidence, for instance, that Heiner Müller quoted Andy Warhol, who has succeeded in

---

[42] Karen J Munby, "Parasitic Politics: Elfriede Jelinek's 'Secondary Dramas' Abraumhalde and Faust In and out." In *Postdramatic Theatre and the Political*, eds. Karen Jürs Munby, Jerome Carroll and Steve Gilles, (Bloomsbury, 2013): 215.

[43] Hans. T. Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, 184.

[44] Müller, *Mauser*, 97.

becoming a popular culture icon for all time and even played a role in the maturation of the so-called popular culture.

Müller employs postdramatic elements to political criticism. The dramatic existence of Warhol's philosophy, which states that he wants to be mechanized and asks others' opinions on this issue, points to alienation, a classical Marxist concept. With his monologue, "I want to be a machine. Arms to grab legs. *Black television screen. Blood from the refrigerator.*"[45] HAMLET ACTOR draws a portrait of an actor-labourer alienated from his own labour and the society in which he lives. In the play, Müller's placement of an actor who plays Hamlet in addition to the traditional "Hamlet" character comes into prominence in this alienation respect. HAMLET ACTOR, in addition to the aforementioned words, delivers other speeches indicating that he is alienated from his work and the society in which he lives:

> I am not Hamlet. I don't play a role anymore. My words have nothing to say to me. The drama was cancelled. The building behind me is being built. Drama doesn't care about my people, people who don't. It's not my business anymore. I will no longer play together.[46]

Those words indicate that the character is alienated from the environment and labour as an actor; since no ordinary healthy actor says I can't play a role anymore. The actor is ultimately a labourer, and an actor who is conscious of his labour knows that his words will contribute to both society and art. Müller's HAMLET ACTOR is portrayed like a factory worker alienated from his own labour who cannot buy the vehicle he produces in the factory. In terms of narrative technique, this depiction is realised by postdramatic elements. After the long tirade, HAMLET ACTOR's closing the scene with an axe, breaking the statues of Marx, Lenin, and Mao, depicted as naked women can also be interpreted as a symbolic salute to the depiction of this kind of alienation.

Another symbolic political figure highlighted by Müller in the play is the concept of Ghost. Here, the ghost is a reference to both the ghost in Hamlet and "the spectre haunting in Europe" in the opening sentence of the Communist Manifesto (1848). In the Communist Manifesto, the ghost that haunts the old powers of Europe wanders in Müller's text over the 'ruins of Europe'. Müller removed Hamlet's ghost from his context in accordance with the postdramatic narrative and reduced it to communism. This reduction is not a positive one. Müller begins with the words out of

---

[45] Ibid., 96.
[46] Ibid., 93.

Richard III, one of Shakespeare's most overbearing characters ever: "RICHARD THE THIRD I THE PRINCEKILLING KING * OH MY PEOPLE WHAT HAVE I DONE UNTO THEE."[47] These lines, which are often mentioned in the postdramatic writing with the capitalisation technique, indicate that Shakespeare's Richard III, one of the most ruthless fictional characters ever, was a tyrant. Referring to Richard III's words, HAMLET thinks just like this hunchback and says something is rotten "in this age of hope". In the years when the play was written, the idea of socialism, a new hope for humanity, began to be eroded in countries such as the Soviet Union, Hungary, Czechoslovakia, and Poland. While the Soviet Union was on the brink of Glasnost and Perestroika, which envisioned transparency and democracy, the footsteps of the Prague Spring in Eastern Europe, the Hungarian Initiative and the first non-communist union "Solidarnosc" in Poland were already in progress. In the Far-East Asia, on the other hand, China gradually began to look to the capitalist neo-liberalisation policies. The decay mentioned by the character of HAMLET in the play is the frustration and disappointment of socialism, which was once the hope of the working class and the oppressed nations. Müller presents this frustration to the audience in postdramatic fiction.

The tragic heroine of the original Hamlet play, Ophelia, is once again tragic in *Hamletmachine*. This time, however, she takes part in the play with a postdramatic interpretation that reveals the social position of the modern woman. In the last part of the play, the body of Ophelia was wrapped like a mummy. And, says:

> Here speaks Electra. In the heart of darkness. Under the sun of torture. To the cities of the world. In the name of the victims. I reject all of the semen that I received. I turn the milk of my breasts into deadly poison. I take back the world that I bore. I suffocate the world that I bore between my thighs. I bury it in my shame. Down with the joy of submission. Long live hate, contempt, rebellion, death. When she walks through your bedrooms carrying butcher knives you'll know the truth.[48]

This representation is in line with the principle of the symbolic position of the body in the postdramatic narrative. The embalming process is carried out by two male characters. This scene is instructive in that it symbolizes male-dominated oppression on the woman. Desperately mummified, Ophelia expresses a revolt manifesto with her words, though not by her movements. In the name of all the oppressed of the world, it

---

[47] Ibid., 87.
[48] Ibid., 94.

rejects all the sperm she receives and the main source of human life is now a poison. Ophelia says she wants to take back the world in which she feels that she can't breathe anymore –the patriarchal and male-dominant world. In bandages, Ophelia says she will change this world, and the curtain closes. Just like Electra, taking revenge for her father's death by killing her own mother, Ophelia declares herself the revenger of all victims whatever their gender.

References

Arnold, Herbert A. "Arlene A. Teraoka: The Silence of Entropy or Universal Discourse: The Postmodernist Poetics of Heiner Müller." *GDR: Bulletin* 14, no. 1 (1988): 9-11. doi.org/10.4148/gdrb.v14i1.848.

Barnett, David. *Heiner Müller's The Hamletmachine*, Routledge. 2016.

Bouko, Catharine. "The Musicality of Postdramatic Theater: Hans-Thies Lehmann's Theory of Independent Auditory Semiotics." *Gramma: Journal of Theory and Criticism*, no. 17 (2009): 25-35.

Carlson, Marvin. "Postdramatic Theatre and Postdramatic Performance." *Brazilian Journal on Presence Studies Alegre* 5, no. 3 (2015): 577-593. doi.org/10.1590/2237-266053731.

Carroll, Jerome, Gilles Steve and Munby, Karen J. "Introduction: Postdramatic Theatre and the Political." In *Postdramatic Theatre and Political*, edited by. Karen Jürs Munby, Jerome Carroll and Steve Gilles, 1-31. New York: Bloomsbury, 2013.

Deck, Jan. "Politisch Theater machen – Eine Einleitung." In *Politisch Theater machen: Neue Artikulationsformen des Politischen in den darstellenden Künsten*, edited by Jan Deck and Angelika Sieburg Bielefeld: transcript, 2011.

Fuchs, Elinor. "'Postdramatic Theatre Review." *TDR: The Drama Review* 52, no. 2 (2008): 178-183.

Kalb, Jonathan. "On Hamletmachine: Müller and the Shadow of Artaud." *New German Critique, Special Issue on Heiner Müller,* no. 73, (1998): 47-66.

Kalb, Jonathan. *The Theater of Heiner Müller*. New York: Limelight Editions, 2001.

Lehmann, Hans T. *Postdramatic Theatre*, translated by Karen Jurs-Munby. New York: Routledge, 2006.

Lehmann, Hans T. *Tragedy and Dramatic Theatre*. New York: Routledge, 2016.

Munby, Karen J. "Parasitic Politics: Elfriede Jelinek's 'Secondary Dramas' Abraumhalde and Faust In and out." In *Postdramatic Theatre*

and the Political, edited by Karen J. Munby, Jerome Carroll and Steve Gilles, 209-23. New York: Bloomsbury, 2013.

Müller, Heiner. *Mauser*. Berlin: Rotbuch, 1978.

Poschmann, Gerda. *Der nicht mehr dramatische Theatertext. Aktuelle Bühnenstücke und ihre dramaturgische Analyse*. Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1990.

Slyvere, Rotringer and Müller, Heiner. *Walls*. In Müller, Germenia, translated and compiled by Bernard and Caroline Schütze, 13-61. New York: Semiotext(e), 1990.

Wood, Michael. "Performing the Collective. Heiner Müller's 'Alone with These Bodies' ('Allein mit diesen Leibern') as a Piece for Postdramatic Theatre." In *Postdramatic Theatre and Political*, edited by Karen Jürs Munby, Jerome Carroll and Steve Gilles, 255-73. New York: Bloomsbury, 2013.

CHAPTER NINE

BELONGING TO THE FAMILY
IN TONI MORRISON'S *A MERCY*

HILAL ŞENGENÇ

Set in 17th century America where European conquest[1] peaked with the system of the plantation of slavery (started with the Middle Passage), Toni Morrison's *A Mercy* (2009) is a neo-archival retelling of colonization, immigration, and slavery. This experience became traumatic for Native Americans and African-Americans; however, their trauma has been left out in western archival history.[2] Like many writers of "black cultural politics,"[3] Morrison assumed it an ethical[4] responsibility to represent these processes as an experience of trauma. She responds through the "agency"[5]

[1] For Europeans, the conquest by Columbus was symbolic and caused the "reconfiguration" of world history. It meant "human progress," or the beginning of "modern world history" and capitalism to expansionist Westerners since European civilization became the global "centre" politically, culturally, financially and technically after 1492. For native peoples of America and their descendants (Iberians, Amerindians, Native Americans) and Africans, the encounter with Europeans meant the condemnation of a history of "exploitation and ethnocide," and also the tribute to a history of defiance and "survival." For the issue of conquest, see Steve J. Stern, "Paradigms of Conquest: History, Historiography, and Politics," *Journal of Latin American Studies* 24 (1992): 1-34,
http://www.jstor.org/stable/156943.
[2] Erica L. Johnson, "Building the Neo-Archive: *Dionne Brand's* A Map to the Door of No Return," *Meridians: Feminism, Race, Transnationalism* 12, no. 1 (2014): 155, https://doi.org/10.2979/meridians.12.1.149.
[3] Stuart Hall, "New Ethnicities," in *Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*, eds. David Morley and Kuan-Hsing Chen (New York: Routledge, 1996), 441.
[4] Norman Saadi Nikro, "Situating Postcolonial Trauma Studies," *Postcolonial Text* 9, no. 2 (2014): 1-2,
https://www.postcolonial.org/index.php/pct/article/viewFile/1865/1706.
[5] Samuel Durrant, "Surviving Time: Trauma, Tragedy, and the Postcolonial Novel," *Journal of Literature and Trauma Studies* 1, no.1 (2012): 101,

of the subjugated, and thus faces a "profound historical forgetfulness"[6] as she gives voice to the non-European part of the colonial encounter. Hers is a neo-archival "performance of subjectivity"[7] enabling the characters, who represent many others unheard in historical accounts, to govern "their own fates" within the world of "historical fiction" and breaking imprisonment and muteness as once "subaltern" identities.[8] This provides a gloomy "accurate" reconstruction of the past[9] retold by slaves as witnesses of the traumatic Middle Passage and plantation slavery. Nevertheless, Morrison's exploration of slavery is striking because enslavement—the sole experience the characters have in common, whose trauma they share with each other—turns into a means of survival. (Protagonists) Native American Lina, Barbadian Florens, the Mother, (minor characters) European indentured slaves Willard and Scully, and "mixed-raced"[10] Sorrow (red curly-haired, silver-gray eyed shipwreck survivor) get cured on the Vaarks' plantation in Virginia as they overcome their "anxiety of belonging,"[11] feelings of loss, and estrangement thanks to the family they build. This study focuses on Kai Erikson's "gathering of the wounded" to examine how "communal trauma"[12] functions in *A Mercy* socially, and how it unifies characters within the family, and helps them survive as witnesses who work-through traumas by sharing their own stories and listening to the other's.

> For years the neighboring farm population made up the closest either man would know of family. A good hearted couple (parents), and three female servants (sisters, say) and them helpful sons. Each member dependent on them, none cruel, all kind. Especially the master who, unlike their more-or-

https://muse.jhu.edu/.

[6] Stuart Hall, "Racism and Reaction," chap. 21 in *Five Views of Multi-Racial Britain* (London: Commission for Racial Equality, 1978), 25.

[7] Stephen Knadler, "Traumatized Racial Performativity: Passing in Nineteenth-Century African-American Testimonies," *Cultural Critique*, no. 55 (2003): 74, http://www.jstor.org/stable/1354649.

[8] Dave Gunning, "S.I. Martin's *Incomparable World* and the Possibilities for Black British Historical Fiction," *Journal of Postcolonial Writing* 43, no.2 (2007): 208, 213, http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17449850701430622.

[9] Charles E. Bressler, *Literary Criticism: An Introduction to Theory and Practice*, 4th ed. (New Jersey: Pearson, 2007), 214.

[10] Jessica Wells Cantiello, "From Pre-Racial to Post-Racial? Reading and Reviewing *A Mercy* in the Age of Obama," *MELUS* 36, no. 2 (2011): 177, http://www.jstor.org/stable/23035286.

[11] Toni Morrison, "Home," in *The House That Race Built*, ed. Wahneema Lubiano (New York: Random House, 1998), 10, https://books.google.com.tr/books.

[12] Kai Erikson, "Notes on Trauma and Community," *Trauma: Explorations of Memory,* ed. Cathy Caruth (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP, 1995), 187.

less absent owner, never cursed or threatened them. He even gave them gifts of rum during Christmastide and once he and Willard shared a tipple straight from the bottle. His death had saddened them enough to disobey their owner's command to avoid the poxed place [...] With Master Vaark content to roam his house and not appear anywhere else, scaring or rattling anybody, Willard felt it safe and appropriate for him and Scully to stay loyal and help the Mistress repair the farm.[13]

Facing the master's death, Willard meditates on becoming family, which reflects the need for belonging and is a recurrent theme throughout the novel which is also often uttered by other slaves. The need for belonging turns into a preoccupation and is accompanied by a feeling of loss they overcome only within the family circle. Therefore, the family formed by a variety of people ranging from migrants to slaves is a key to Morrison's treatment of slavery. Despite retelling its trauma from a subjugated subject position, she shuns the idea of the Middle Passage[14] and slavery as the reason for trauma which generates melancholy or death. Morrison is optimistic since she wields trauma's unifying potential emerging in acts of mercy and in giving ear to one another. The characters

---

[13] Toni Morrison, *A Mercy* (London: Vintage, 2009), 141-142.

[14] Triangular trade across the Atlantic forcibly taking Africans to the Americas is "the defining moment of the African-American experience" whether black writers have traditional, Afrocentric, or syncretic perspectives representing blackness. On "middle passage" in black literature, see Carl Pedersen, "Middle Passages: Representations of the Slave Trade in Caribbean and African-American Literature," *The Massachusetts Review* 34, no. 2 (1993): 225-27.
http://www.jstor.org/stable/25090419.
Depending on Paul Gilroy's "black Atlantic model," where it signals a disastrous breach with Africa, it hinders, Clifford suggests, unified black history and identity because the trauma of slavery is not left behind, yet still troubles blacks: "recurring break where time stops and restarts is the Middle Passage. Enslavement and its aftermaths—displaced, repeated structures of racialization and exploitation—constitute a pattern of black experiences inextricably woven in the fabric of hegemonic modernity.'' See James Clifford, *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 1997), 264.
Transatlantic writers assume "time" refracted, and thus challenge the perception in "post-Enlightenment narratives of progress" which portrays the West as a secure shelter. Instead, the coexistence of "the past" in "the present" highlights "trauma" of the crossing black migrants re-experience today. Through reviving of middle passage experiences and characters, "the dead" are cast as witnesses of African slavery and also of contemporary "migration[s] of people from Africa and the Caribbean." See Jenny Sharpe, "The Middle Passages of Black Migration," *Atlantic Studies* 6, no. 1 (2009): 98-100,
http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14788810802696311.

manage to survive because they become family to each other despite different racial backgrounds.

Trauma in *A Mercy* functions as a language and background that people have in common and share by a feeling of belonging to "community." Erikson explains this via "communal trauma" or "gathering of the wounded." It is an effect of the paradoxical nature of trauma that it can create an atmosphere of "kinship" governed by "a group's spirit" despite its isolative influence causing an individual's exclusion from society. Rather than reinforcing the ties between the traumatized who are separated or lack previous contact with each other, sharing painful occurrences produces a site of encounter where they can construct a new "identity." Friendliness, understanding, and attachment can compensate for the former austerity, despair, and recurrent haunting of the "wounding experience" coming as nightmares, daydreams, or flashbacks. For victims who are deprived of a "sustaining community," being a member of the group of traumatized can be the catalyst for recovery.[15]

The sense of being different and the need for safety are the most important motives behind a community. The spirit of the group of the wounded is fuelled by "estrangement."[16] Alienated from "the rest of humanity," survivors of tragic events assemble "into groups" of people with similar frames of mind. What makes them get closer is their transformed sense of self, as well as manners of "relating to others," and perceiving of the world. For example, individuals upset by trauma often feel incapable of managing "their own lives," for "the laws" and "decencies" of the familiar world look as invalid, as if they had never existed. A feeling of suspension leads to a constant stressful expectancy of calamity,[17] for the traumatized assume their surroundings unsafe the "omens" of the threat they see but cannot distinguish them from real perils. Moreover, theirs is a shared world of disorder and non-continuity governed by alteration and wickedness—called "broken connection."[18] Fragility and suspicion arising from loss of security, self-confidence, and "worthlessness"[19] make them explain disturbing occurrences not in the light of "logic and reason" but in supernatural ways. However, individuals who cannot cope with circumstances caused by difference restore their

---

[15] Erikson, "Notes on Trauma and Community," 187, 190.

[16] Ibid.,186.

[17] Ibid.,194.

[18] Robert Jay Lifton, *The Broken Connection* (New York: Basic Books, 1983).

[19] Erikson, "Notes on Trauma and Community," 193, 198.

connection with reality when they generate "group culture" held together by common viewpoints.[20]

In *A Mercy*, at the core of estrangement lies enslavement. It is not merely an African reality. The Vaarks' farm in Maryland, where slaves from different races are gathered, becomes a "transnational locale" and represents New England before colonization.[21] Morrison's "multiracial family"—formed by slaves and owners—is a strategy for challenging American racial essentialism which favoured the dichotomy of black and white and later dominated the multiracial atmosphere of pre-colonial America.[22] The thing ignored during the new construction of "a two-caste society" was America's being a land of several "types of people, of all colours and different degrees of intermixture of European, American, African and Asian."[23]

Multiracial characterization is, therefore, Morrison's neo-archival tactic of supplementing American history via retelling American "origins narrative" from the perspective of the silenced. The creation of "the origins myth," Valerie Babb suggests, corresponds to the beginning of the settlement in the 17th century. To procure community consciousness and form unity among migrants from various European nations and classes, the idea of "a single white race" was encouraged by Puritan elites. Their periodicals, religious and historical writings, reinforced whites' superiority for justifying the colonization. Accordingly, it turned into "divine destiny" to displace Indians for property and enslave Africans for financial growth. While "the grand myth of a chosen people's compact with God to establish an exemplary City upon a Hill"[24] targeted union between Europeans, it obliterated "social plurality" that existed in America before its becoming a nation of whites. Thus the marginalization of non-whites via the origins myth effected the synonymizing of "whiteness and national

---

[20] Ibid., 185, 194.

[21] Maxine L. Montgomery, "Got on My Traveling Shoes: Migration, Exile, and Home in Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*," *Journal of Black Studies* 42, no. 4 (2011): 628, 631. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41151363.

[22] Cantiello, "From Pre-Racial to Post-Racial?" 168, 178.

[23] Jack D. Forbes, *Africans and Native Americans: The Language of Race and the Evolution of Red-Black Peoples*, 2nd ed. (Urbana: U of Illinois P, 1993), 65.

[24] Cathy Covell Waegner, "Ruthless Epic Footsteps: Shoes, Migrants, and the Settlement of the Americas in Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*," *Post-National Enquiries: Essays on Ethnic and Racial Border Crossings*, ed. Jopi Nyman (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2009), 91.

identity" while preventing Indian and African voices from being heard in canonical narratives.[25]

Furnishing Indian, African and European slaves with a community to share traumatic pasts, Morrison's family becomes a vehicle for correcting the monophonic history through a "multivoiced"[26] narrative. This alternative "history" emerges as an account of trauma that is forgotten, remembered, told, and heard. Trauma is only knowable when it is communicated, and recovery is possible when it is claimed and transmitted.[27] What Lina, Florens, her mother, Willard, and Scully have in common is that they are witnesses and via their testimonies, a different historical reality appears; namely, the trauma of Indians' extermination, of the Middle Passage, and of exiled Europeans.

Multiracial characterization, that is, the voices excluded from European historiography, can also be explained by Morrison's employment of parody and intertextuality. They are the means of revealing and correcting the injustice of American history which, Geneva Cobb Moore observes, contradict founding American principles of equality, democracy and liberty. Addressing *A Mercy* as "parodic inter-textuality," Morrison keeps the other side of the story alive and challenges American history. She intends to prevent history from repeating itself through her portrayal of the European settlement in America which is given as the reason for the trauma of colonization, genocide, and slavery for Indians and Africans. In Morrison's hands, the novel becomes polyphonic "parasitic hypertext" fashioned in regards to primary "hypotext[s]" like "Bacon's Rebellion, the Amherst smallpox blankets, Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*, Dante's *Inferno*" along with several biblical references.[28]

Among these sources, Bacon's Rebellion is specifically noteworthy. It illuminates Morrison's deployment of trauma since the trauma is aligned with the power of creating a united family out of a few people who are not only isolated from society but also different from each other. Bacon's Rebellion, "a poorly understood and underestimated historical event," possibly was, Waegner suggests, a convincing model for the fictional

---

[25] Valerie Babb, ""E Pluribus Unum?" The American Origins Narrative in Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*," *MELUS* 36, no. 2 (2011): 147-151, http://www.jstor.org/stable/23035285.
[26] Waegner, 91.
[27] Cathy Caruth, *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP, 1996), 37, 41, 27.
[28] Geneva Cobb Moore, "A Demonic Parody: Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*," *The Southern Literary Journal* 44, no. 1 (2011): 2-4, 15, http://www.jstor.org/stable/23208766.

family because the former, like the latter, involved "all classes and ethnicities" at a time when "the laws determining servitude and slavery [weren't] closely tied to race." The year was 1673, and the setting was pre-colonial America where "the 'people's war' was led by members of local gentry against that very class, the rebels supported by a checkered army of blacks, some Natives, whites, mulattoes, freedmen, slaves, and the indentured."[29] However, harsher slave codes were announced which generated "chaos in defence of order [b]y eliminating manumission, gatherings, travel and bearing arms for black people only; by granting license to any white to kill any black."[30]

In this respect, the unity formed by diverse rebels is revived through the ostracized togetherness of Lina, Florens, Willard, Scully, Sorrow, and the Vaarks. It portrays a country "that has always been multiracial,"[31] and subverts the idea of America as an "unpeopled land" where "no civilization existed prior to European arrival."[32] Hence, Morrison's choice of Bacon's Rebellion is significant as a harbinger of the termination of the multiracial environment available in America before the mid-17th century.[33] Laws, which systematically demarcated the spheres of white and black during the construction of the American nation, inaugurated institutionalized "racial hierarchy and racism."[34] Although enslavement and race were not related, after the rebellion, an understanding of race "codified" by physical features emerged.[35] Among them, "color" was the "primary organizing principle" differentiating human beings.[36] A reference to the disappearance of multiracialism is Florens's discovery of her "darkness [she is] born with" as the cause of her difference she would experience badly if she remained outside family circle. It is in the house of Widow Ealing and daughter Jane where she becomes color conscious, for she is ostracized by white villagers looking "at [her] [naked] body across distances without recognition." "She is Afric," therefore, she is "not the same"—enough for justification of their examining Florens "for a tail, an extra teat," or a split

---

[29] Waegner, "Ruthless Epic Footsteps," 102-3.

[30] Morrison, *A Mercy*, 8.

[31] Cantiello, "From Pre-Racial to Post-Racial?" 6.

[32] Baab, "E Pluribus Unum?" 158.

[33] For the replacement of multiracial atmosphere of "the pre-United States" by race and color based system, see Cantiello, 178.

[34] For Morrison's insertion of historical data into fictional record, as referred by Berlin and Roediger, see Cantiello, 169-170.

[35] Cantiello, "From Pre-Racial to Post-Racial?" 171.

[36] Robyn Wiegman, *American Anatomies: Theorizing Race and Gender* (Durham: Duke UP, 1995), 24.

tongue "like a snake's" to see "whether or no [she is] the Black Man's minion."[37]

   A Mercy is a testimony to slavery; with each slave, bought by Jacob at different times and telling his/her own version of the experience, we, as readers, become witnesses to its before and after. Lina, the Native American[38] slave, appreciates, like Willard, the multiracial familial atmosphere on Jakob and Rebekka's plantation. There, she finds the chance for a full survival as a witness of the wars between Indians and colonizers. These wars resulted in the mass extermination of various tribes due to their being enforced to leave the land at gunpoint.[39] Lina, via her record of the "germ warfare,"[40] refutes Europeans' claim for being valiant explorers:

> Her people had built sheltering cities for a thousand years and, except for
> the *deadthfeet* of the Europes, might have built them for a thousand more.
> As it turned out the sachem had been dead wrong. The Europes neither fled
> nor died out [..] They would come with languages that sounded like dog
> bark; with childish hunger for animal fur. They would forever fence land,

---

[37] Morrison, *A Mercy,* 109, 111-113.

[38] The English perceived Africans and Native Americans differently in terms of slavery. Africans were attributed physical moral and cultural inferiority that was irredeemable, yet, Indians' image varied. Despite being assumed inferior, and detested due to "skin color," "heathenism," and "reputed lack of civility," Indians were described as "noble savages" by scholars who did not meet but wrote about them "in a more detached fashion." Identification with and admiration of "indigenous peoples and cultures" was the result. By embarking on social and physical similarities between Indians and Europeans, evidenced "their distant European origins," natives "were Europeanized" to befit Europeans' goals. Assuming them ignorant due to not being "exposed to [...] English culture" (they were already considered ready and "intellectually capable of absorbing the imperatives" of Christianity and western culture), it was the English mission to supervise them on the way to civilization. For Hakluyt, colonization attempted not banishing but coexisting with the natives. The image of the Noble Savage did not preclude their enslavement. English colonials justified "military means" for both defending "their interests" and retaliation whenever they met nonconformity. Their civilizing task gave them, "Christians," "the right [...] to wage just wars against infidels." Their harsh reaction after losing Roanoke (the first English colony) in 1591 exemplifies this. Slaughtering natives and "burning down" villages were methods applied during colonization. See Betty Wood, "*Beastly Lyvynge:* Images of West Africans and Native Americans," in *The Origins of American Slavery* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1997), 30-37.

[39] Moore, "A Demonic Parody," 5.

[40] Ibid., 6.

ship whole tress to faraway counties, take any woman for quick pleasure, ruin soil, befoul sacred places and worship a dull, unimaginative god [...] Cut loose from the earth's soul, they insisted on purchase of its soil, and [...] they were insatiable. It was their destiny to chew up the world and spit out a horribleness that would destroy all primary peoples.[41]

Lina's testimony is a "non-linear" record of history produced orally[42] via "[m]emories of her village peopled by the dead" who "turned [...] to ash."[43] She is troubled by the guilt of surviving "the destruction of her families" and overcomes "[t]he shame" of survival by making a "vow never to betray or abandon anyone she cherished."[44] Being a witness turns Lina's shame into a moral burden of remembering and telling her people's trauma. This echoes Morrison's idea of "memory" as "a form of willed creation" facilitated by the "deliberate act of remembering."[45] Recollection and testifying become Lina's precautions against oblivion. She reflects on any occasion, which helps with the duty towards her people and the reclaiming of her indigenousness. Consequently, Lina's narrative produces "counter-memory," an alternative to written lineal history, because she accumulates it from indigenous history which is ignored by the western historical archive.

---

[41] Morrison, *A Mercy,* 52.

[42] This type of history is peculiar to literature depicting African-American experience and consists of a "counter-memory" formed through "look[ing] to the past for the hidden histories of those excluded from dominant narratives." See George Lipsitz, "Myth, History, and Counter-Memory," in *Politics and the Muse: Studies in the Politics of Recent American Literature*, ed. Adam J. Sorkin (Bowling Green: Bowling Green State UP, 1989): 162.

Morrison employs counter-memory in her novels where "supernatural and a profound rootedness in the real world" are intertwined without "taking precedence over the other". See Toni Morrison, "Rootedness: The Ancestor as Foundation," in *Black Women Writers (1950-1980)*, ed. Mari Evans (New York: Anchor/Doubleday, 1984), 342.

Counter-memory, namely, uttering "what is remembered" from exceptional occurrences in history, offers an alternative to the hegemony "of written and lineal history." See Chiji Akoma, "The 'Trick' of Narratives: History, Memory, and Performance in Toni Morrison's *Paradise*," *Oral Tradition* 15, no.1 (2000): 4, https://hdl.handle.net/10355/66682.

[43] Morrison, *A Mercy*, 47.

[44] Ibid.,47.

[45] Toni Morrison, "Memory, Creation and Writings," *Thought* 59, no. 235 (December 1984): 385, https://blogs.umass.edu/brusert/files/2013/03/Morrison_Memory-Creation.pdf.

Achieving recovery through remembering the past she once denies is possible when she embraces all traumatic identities as her own. Lina, who has been converted, named as "Messalina" and "taken to live among kindly Presbyterians," thus, convinced of her heathenness and allowed to "be purified" by Christianity, survives on the strength of "memory."[46] During the days following her purchase by Sir, before Mistress's arrival, she overcomes "[s]olitude" by recalling[47] without yielding to melancholy. She works-through[48] by compromising the past with the present and constructs a new reality ("self-invention") effected through "piecing together scraps of what her mother taught" with "her own sources."[49] It is a mixture of "neglected rites" and "Europe medicine," in which "scripture" is amalgamated with "native" and "lore."[50] Lina's invention heals her, and she thus resembles Morrison's family whose members, "[m]inus bloodlines" as the indentured Scully maintains, depend on each other for life.[51]

Despite being a neo-archival strategy of supplementing history from the Indians' perspective, Lina's record offers an alternative depiction of slaveholders. According to Lina, the Vaarks "[are] exceptions to the sachem's revised prophesy."[52] Besides their unusual landholding via careful "distinction between earth and property," targeting a simple living "by tillage rather than eat[ing] up the land with herds, [and] measures that kept their profit low," their attitude toward slaves renders them incompatible with colonizers whose "*dead feet*" brought nothing but destruction to any lands they trod on.[53] The reason for their estrangement is their "honest free-thinking." It is also the thing that has provided Lina and other slaves with a "small" yet "tight family" where she has a relishable "place."[54] She articulates the anxiety of "being alone in the world without family"—"belonging to no one"—she re-experiences when Rebekka gets ill with pox after Jakob's death.[55] Therefore, she passionately prays for

---

[46] Morrison, *A Mercy*, 45, 46.

[47] Ibid., 46.

[48] "Acting-out" and "working-through" are different responses to trauma. See Dominick LaCapra, interviewed by Amos Goldberg, June 1998, The Multimedia CD 'Eclipse of Humanity,' Yad-Vashem.

[49] Ibid., 48, 46.

[50] Ibid., 46.

[51] Ibid., 152.

[52] Ibid., 52.

[53] Ibid., 53.

[54] Ibid., 56.

[55] Ibid., 45, 56.

Rebekka's health as she believes this will guarantee the maintenance of this family whose members would otherwise remain as "orphans, each and all."[56]

The demand for community and family reveals the Africans' trauma of the Middle Passage through Florens and her mother's stories. Florens, like Lina, Willard, and Scully, has a constant fear of losing the people she is attached to. At a very young age, she is bought by Jacob from the Portuguese slaver D'Ortega who offers him a slave in return for some debt. Florens is traumatized due to being abandoned by her mother and fixated to the moment when she is voluntarily bartered away instead of "her little boy."[57] She "must be sixteen,"[58] yet still remembers being wounded by the barter:

> Me watching, my mother listening, her baby boy on her hip. Senhor is not paying the whole amount he owes to Sir. Sir saying he will take instead the woman and the girl, not the baby boy and the debt is gone. A minha mae begs no. Her baby boy is still at her breast. Take the girl, she says, my daughter, she says. Me. Me.[59]

The mother's abandonment of Florens shapes her understanding of the world. She interprets events (even a pea hen's refusal of brooding or a dog's silhouette she visions in the steam rising out of a kettle) as references to the wounding experience recurrently appearing her in dreams. When such shapes emerge, "that night," she is "sure" of "see[ing] a minha mae standing hand in hand with her little boy."[60] Since Florens accuses the mother - she cannot understand - the reason for her choice, and interprets it as lack of affection she dreams her mother is "always wanting to tell something." The memory of separation is still fresh, so Florens desires to forget it and prevent it from haunting her, as her "look[ing] away from"[61] the mother and continuing to sleep reflect. Hers is a

---

[56] Ibid., 57.
[57] Ibid., 4.
[58] Ibid., 3.
[59] Ibid., 5.
[60] Ibid., 1.
[61] Ibid., 99.

"belated"[62] reaction—a way of fulfilling her wish of having eluded the shock of desertion by "a minha mae[63]

For Florens, who is bitten by the same bug as the others, the family spirit existing on the plantation serves well in her coping with abandonment. Particularly, her relationship with Lina can compensate for the loss of the mother. It hinges on a mutual "[m]other hunger—to be one or have one" together with a constant "longing" leading them to one another.[64] While parenting motivates Lina to satisfy an "eternal yearning for the home," which underlies "her [own] barrenness," it offers Florens a chance to accomplish "her need to please," [65] which reveals her endless fright of losing belongingness. Therefore, Florens is pleased to belong to Lina, the Indian surrogate mother who has cherished the black girl since her arrival in Virginia.

Florens's deep longing for belonging erases any notion of freedom from her mind. That's why she cannot construe the ex-slaves' frustration of being forced to work after "their years of debt are over."[66] Her dependence on Lina is replaced by a blind devotion to the free black blacksmith with whom she has an affair. He is the teenage Florens's only source of safety and happiness. From the smithy's perspective, however her devotion is an object of derision. He disparages her and declares that the desire to belong has turned her into "a slave by choice."[67] Ironically, it becomes her means of liberation when she re-experiences abandonment by the blacksmith. When Malaik, the little "foundling" he has adopted, and not herself, is preferred again, Florens risks killing her lover.[68] She is aware that it is "losing [him]" that makes her "[f]ree [at] last" "from all those who believe they have claim and rule over [her]."[69] This is the first time she has the courage to confront and tell her story of enslavement without which the motive behind her assault on the smithy would remain deficient. He has not understood the basis of her love for and dependence

---

[62] For the specifics of "belatedness" of trauma see Dominick LaCapra, *Representing the Holocaust: History, Theory and Trauma* (Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1994), 173-74; and Cathy Caruth, "Traumatic awakenings," in *Unclaimed*, 91-112.

[63] "[A] minha mae" was translated form Portuguese into English as "my mother." See John Updike, "Dreamy Wilderness," review of *A Mercy*, by Toni Morrison, *The New Yorker*, November 3, 2008, https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/.

[64] Morrison, *A Mercy*, 61.

[65] Ibid., 58, 94.

[66] Ibid., 38.

[67] Ibid., 139.

[68] Ibid., 134.

[69] Ibid., 155, 159.

on him. Therefore, she carves it, "a confession", onto the floor of "the room where Sir dies." Her record is to be read so that a solution to the conundrum—"who is responsible?"—might be found.[70]

Florens's story explains her response to desertion. It will be completed if a minha mae's story is heard. Throughout the last six pages of *A Mercy*, the mother's voice is heard addressing Florens's reproach of being abandoned[71] and sold to Vaark. As a victim of the Middle Passage, her witness account discloses the slave trade as the thing that is to blame for her daughter's present situation. She demands to be heard and records how African families suffer from separation, death, and torture to satisfy "the whitened men['s]" greed; how their houses are burned, they are killed, or captured, put in chains and loaded onto "the house that floats on the sea" to be traded; how unbearable it is to be sold by blacks; how many slaves on the ship venture death to get rid of "chains around [necks, waists, and ankles]" and jump; how the passage made her a nobody without a country, family, language, or habits, but "negrita." She remembers and transmits that "negrita" corresponds to everything hidden "in the color of her skin," and that's why she was "purchased." As a negrita who "caught Senhor's eye," she realized the danger that was unavoidable for her daughter.[72] Accordingly, she confesses, she preferred to give her, not the boy, to Jacob. She knows that it is belonging, albeit a different one:

> One chance, I thought. There is no protection but difference. You stood there in those shoes and the tall man laughed and said he would take me to close the debt. I knew Senhor would not allow it. I said you. Take you, my daughter. Because I saw the tall man see you as a human child, not pieces of eight. I knelt before him. Hoping for a miracle. He said yes. It was not a miracle. Bestowed by God. It was a mercy. Offered by a human.[73]

---

[70] Ibid., 1, 157.

[71] Akoma reports Aimable Twagilimana's description of "rememory" as "an activation of the past, to the time of stories told by mothers and grandmothers, to the Middle Passage, and even to Africa, the land of origins." Abandonment in *A Mercy* becomes a rememory in which the image of the crossing is crystallized and transferred into present as "a thought of past." Rememory here functions as a bridge connecting Florens and her mother by whom it is called up and acted out as a past experience that does not stay in the past. Giving voice to the silenced to make them tell what is forgotten via remembering is a challenge posed by the author against obliterate narratives of history. See Akoma, 6-7.

[72] Morrison, *A Mercy*, 162-165.

[73] Ibid., 164-165.

    At the heart of this difference lies Jacob's empathetic personality that renders him a good master, even a father, in the eyes of each slave. For instance, he diagnoses black codes, which gave several privileges to whites while depriving blacks of the right to life, as "lawless laws encouraging cruelty." As a man abhorring the trade in flesh, he interprets it as "trading [one's] conscience for coin," and suffers humiliation from D'Ortega's offer of slaves in return for his debt. Most importantly, being an orphan himself, it is his "disturbing pulse of pity for orphans and strays" that prevents the slave mother's plea from falling on deaf ears. What would otherwise be "the most wretched business" done with a "substitute for a man" grows into an act of "rescue[ing] an unmoored, unwanted child" who, like himself, is being thrown away.[74] Consequently, besides retelling the history of Africans, that is, their trauma of the slave trade, a minha mae echoes other characters' pleas for belonging to "family" through her testimony. It reiterates the same feeling of safety which Willard, Lina, Florens, and Scully are so anxious to keep because the "companionship" "they had carved [...] out of isolation,"[75] and dependence on the master and each other have facilitated their survival.

    In conclusion, an analysis of *A Mercy* in the light Kai Erikson's idea of "communal trauma" has shown that the novel is a sound reflection of Toni Morrison's aim at giving the European settlement in the New World as the reason for the trauma of colonization, massacre, and enslavement for Native Americans and Africans. As a contemporary black female writer who revisits the Middle Passage and slavery, Morrison contributes to the rebuilding of Native American and particularly black identities, and to the integration of this traumatizing experience into the "literary and historical archive"[76] formed by white culture. Keeping the other side of the story alive and representing it as a history of trauma through an intermingling of history, imagination, and memory, namely, voicing the experience of colonization from the perspective of the silenced Indians, Africans, and even lower-class whites are her way of challenging American history. It is Morrison's moving depiction of slavery on an early 17th century American plantation as an experience uniting people with one another across their traumas, rather than detaching them, and the portrayal of a non-stereotypical slaveholder that raise one's hopes for a future in which yesterday's injustices will never be repeated.

---

[74] Ibid., 9, 26, 31, 24.
[75] Ibid., 153-154.
[76] Gunning, "S.I. Martin's *Incomparable World,"* 204.

References

Akoma, Chiji. "'The 'Trick' of Narratives: History, Memory, and Performance in Toni Morrison's *Paradise*." *Oral Tradition* 15, no. 1 (2000): 3-25. https://hdl.handle.net/10355/66682.

Babb, Valerie. "'E Pluribus Unum?' The American Origins Narrative in Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*." *MELUS* 36, no. 2 (2011): 147-64. http://www.jstor.org/stable/23035285.

Bressler, Charles E. *Literary Criticism: An Introduction to Theory and Practice.* 4th ed. New Jersey: Pearson, 2007.

Cantiello, Jessica Wells. "From Pre-Racial to Post-Racial? Reading and Reviewing *A Mercy* in the Age of Obama." *MELUS* 36, no. 2 (2011): 165-83. http://www.jstor.org/stable/23035286.

Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History.* Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP, 1996.

Clifford, James. *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 1997. https://books.google.com.tr/books.

Durrant, Samuel. "Surviving Time: Trauma, Tragedy, and the Postcolonial Novel." *Journal of Literature and Trauma Studies* 1, no.1 (2012): 95-117. https://muse.jhu.edu/.

Erikson, Kai. "Notes on Trauma and Community." In *Trauma: Explorations of Memory*, edited by Cathy Caruth, 183-99. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP, 1995.

Forbes, Jack D. *Africans and Native Americans: The Language of Race and the Evolution of Red-Black Peoples*. 2nd ed. Urbana: U of Illinois P, 1993.

Gunning, Dave. "S.I. Martin's *Incomparable World* and the Possibilities for Black British Historical Fiction." *Journal of Postcolonial Writing* 43, no. 2 (2007): 203-15. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17449850701430622.

Hall, Stuart. "New Ethnicities." In *Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*, edited by David Morley and Kuan-Hsing Chen, 441-49. New York: Routledge, 1996.

Johnson, Erica L. "Building the Neo-Archive: *Dionne Brand's* A Map to the Door of No Return." *Meridians: Feminism, Race, Transnationalism* 12, no. 1 (2014): 149-71. https://doi.org/10.2979/meridians.12.1.149.

Knadler Stephen. "Traumatized Racial Performativity: Passing in Nineteenth-Century African-American Testimonies." *Cultural Critique*, no. 55 (2003): 63-100. http://www.jstor.org/stable/1354649.

LaCapra, Dominick. *Representing the Holocaust: History, Theory, and Trauma*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1994.

Lifton, Robert Jay. *The Broken Connection*. New York: Basic Books, 1983.

Lipsitz, George. "Myth, History, and Counter-Memory." In *Politics and the Muse: Studies in the Politics of Recent American Literature*, edited by Adam J. Sorkin, 161-78. Bowling Green: Bowling Green State UP, 1989.

Montgomery, Maxine L. "Got on My Traveling Shoes: Migration, Exile, and Home in Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*." *Journal of Black Studies* 42, no. 4 (2011): 627-37. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41151363.

Moore, Geneva Cobb. "A Demonic Parody: Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*." *The Southern Literary Journal* 44, no. 1 (2011): 1-18, http://www.jstor.org/stable/23208766.

Morrison, Toni. *A Mercy*. London: Vintage, 2009.

Morrison, Toni. "Memory, Creation and Writings." *Thought* 59, no. 235 (1984): 385-90. https://blogs.umass.edu/brusert/files/2013/03/Morrison_Memory-Creation.pdf.

Morrison, Toni. "Home." In *The House That Race Built,* edited by Wahneema Lubiano, 3-12. New York: Random House, 1998. https://books.google.com.tr/books

Morrison, Toni. "Rootedness: The Ancestor as Foundation." In Black Women Writers (1950-1980), edited by Mari Evans, 339-45. New York: Anchor/Doubleday, 1984.

Nikro, Norman Saadi. "Situating Postcolonial Trauma Studies." *Postcolonial Text* 9, no. 2 (2014): 1-21, https://www.postcolonial.org/index.php/pct/article/viewFile/1865/1706.

Pedersen, Carl. "Middle Passages: Representations of the Slave Trade in the Caribbean and African-American Literature." *The Massachusetts Review* 34, no. 2 (1993): 225-38. http://www.jstor.org/stable/25090419.

Sharpe, Jenny. "The Middle Passages of Black Migration." *Atlantic Studies* 6, no. 1 (2009): 97-112, http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14788810802696311.

Updike, John. "Dreamy Wilderness." Review of *A Mercy*, by Toni Morrison. *The New Yorker*, November 3, 2008. https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2008/11/03/dreamy-wilderness.

Stern, Steve J. "Paradigms of Conquest: History, Historiography, and Politics." *Journal of Latin American Studies* 24 (1992): 1-34, http://www.jstor.org/stable/156943.

Waegner, Cathy Covell. "Ruthless Epic Footsteps: Shoes, Migrants, and the Settlement of the Americas in Toni Morrison's *A Mercy*." *Post-National Enquiries: Essays on Ethnic and Racial Border Crossings*, edited by Jopi Nyman, 91-112. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2009.

Wiegman, Robyn. American Anatomies: Theorizing Race and Gender. Durham: Duke UP, 1995.

Wood, Betty. *The Origins of American Slavery*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1997.

CHAPTER TEN

TO BE REASONABLE OR TO BE MAD: THE POLITICS OF MADNESS IN CARYL CHURCHILL'S *SCHREBER'S NERVOUS ILLNESS AND MAD FOREST*

ÖMER KEMAL GÜLTEKIN

Churchill as a playwright is connected with the theme of madness and unreason. Mentally disordered characters frequently populate the stage and unreason crosses the trajectory of reason in her plays. Taking a glance at her works, one can easily notice the prevalence and significance of madness in Churchill's plays. For instance, a radio play, *Hospital at the time of Revolution* written in 1972 is set in an Algerian hospital administered by Frantz Fanon, and the play is preoccupied with the characters that need psychological treatment for the damages inflicted by the revolution taking place in the country. *A Mouthful of Birds*, another play that Churchill composed in collaboration with David Ian and which was performed by the Joint Stock in 1986, stages short slices from the lives of a group of characters who are all mentally disturbed. In a similar manner, *Skriker* (1994), a prominent play drawing a respectable amount of public attention, is about two teenage women, Lily and Josie, being haunted by the shape-shifting fairy-tale figure; the Skriker. Some kind of mental problems are inherent in all the characters in this play: Josie is known to have killed her 10-day-old infant and the Skriker feeds on other women's babies to get personal retribution. These samples from three different decades demonstrate Churchill's lasting interest in madness throughout her career.

Madness, usually conceived as an illness, is doomed to be ignored by the "rational" members of society, and those people labelled "mad" are mostly consigned to the peripheries of a community. They are condemned to isolation in public or in hospitals and asylums, their existence is figuratively denied and their words are treated as non-existent. However,

madness is not a simple insanity to be discarded in Churchill's dramaturgy. Since the early years of her career, Churchill has employed mental disorder to challenge the politically dominant discourse and to provide alternative perspectives on reality. The isolated space of madness becomes the hub of the unspeakable, forbidden or hidden. Whatever is excluded or forbidden in a society is likely to reside in the mecca of the peripheries; that is, in madness. Madness, in this regard, is not mere unreason or insanity in Churchill's plays; it is interwoven with political meaning.

For the playwright, personal is never personal for its own sake. One of the maxims she adopted in her career is that the personal is political. Personal narratives of madness, therefore, staged in Churchill's plays, politically produce alternative perspectives and usually challenge the patriarchal and capitalist structure of society. *Schreber's Nervous Illness* and *Mad Forest*, as each title suggests, can be added to the list of the plays in which Churchill deals with madness. *Schreber's Nervous Illness*, being one of the earlier (radio) plays of the playwright, is based on the book *Memoirs of My Nervous Illness* published in 1903 and the frames of the play are restricted to the pathological descriptions of the patient. In *Mad Forest*, on the other hand, madness is a consequence of the political oppression and surveillance conducted before a revolution which itself turns out to be a madhouse. The aim of this study is to analyse the way Churchill utilises madness to challenge the "rational" and "logical" politics of the societies in *Schreber's Nervous Illness* and *Mad Forest*. Eventually, it will be argued that in Churchill's plays personal madness is not detached from social problems, and that madness provides a space of freedom to contain the realities discarded from the centre and to allow for diverse perspectives.

Exploring the meaning of the place of madness, Anna Harpin defines the term as follows: "To be mad is, according to the common idiom, to be out-of-place. One has lost the plot, gone out of one's mind, taken leave of one's senses; you are out to lunch, round the bend, away with the fairies, round the twist, in a dark place. . . . To be mad is to be both somewhere and yet nowhere, or at least not here, that is to say, 'reality'. It is, then, to be displaced, dislocated, gone."[1] To be mad, then, is the antonym/opposite of wisdom, reason, and rationality. While madness occupies the dark, weak and dangerous side of this binary opposition, the other side is laden with positive connotations such as safety, clarity, and certainty. As such, madness also carries a dilemma within itself: it is both present and absent

---

[1] Anna Harpin, "Dislocated: Metaphors of Madness in British Theatre." In *Performance, Madness and Psychiatry*, eds. Anna Harpin and Juliet Foster (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 187.

or "out of place." The mad one is physically present but he is also absent. His mental condition makes the others consider him to be absent. This dilemma unexpectedly provides madness with the potential to disrupt whatever is present. Amelie Howe Kritzer, focusing on the potential of madness to challenge patriarchal structure of traditional societies, stresses that "[m]adness is powerful, if anarchic, source of energy with the capacity to disrupt, fragment and overthrow the tyranny of phallic unity – and, by extension, those social structures that have been created to preserve it."[2] In view of this potential of madness to subvert the reign of existent order, patriarchal praxis attempts to send it out of place and isolate madness within predetermined frames of mental illness and thereby impeding the dissemination of this illness among the "healthy" members of society.

Tracking the trajectory of madness in Europe since the Middle Ages in his famous book *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*, Michel Foucault finds out that the dominant discourse of each episteme redraws the frames of madness and redefines what or who is to be included or excluded. While the mad were allowed to wander inside cities and among people up until Renaissance, since the 17th century, replacing the lepers - who were obliged to live in isolated houses in quarantine – they were pushed to the margins of the society to fill the cultural void of the lepers. Foundation of *Hospita General* in 1656, for Foucault, was a watershed moment of positioning madness against the concept of reason. From this moment on, madness would be transformed into an image of fear and insecurity to be abstained from. Foucault observes that in the 18th century, mad people were condemned for being idle and they were forced to work in madhouses; in the 19th century, the changing mindset of the community classified them as "immoral" beings and their madness was conceived as a punishment of their immorality. Also in the 18th century, mad people were no longer considered to be animals, but they were understood to be human beings with nervous distortions.[3] In this regard, doctors and psychologists claimed to treat and cure these people. Yet, for Foucault, doctors were not there to decide if they were mad or sane but instead they were the guardians of those hospitals. Their function was to keep madness and unreason away from the reasonable and the healthy.

---

[2] Amelie Howe Kritzer, "Madness and Political Change in the Plays of Caryl Churchill." In *Madness in Drama*, ed. James Redmond (New York: Cambridge UP, 1993), 204.

[3] Michel Foucault, *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*, trans. Richard Howard (New York: Vintage Books, 1988), 151-58.

Targets of Foucault's criticism, William Tuke and Philippe Pinel, are the reputed fathers of modern asylums set up to treat madness in the 19th century. Tuke and Pinel emancipate madness from its literal chains and patients in asylums are no longer chained and tied to stop their vagaries. However, Foucault underlines that Tuke, in religious disguise, and Pinel, in terms of morality, maintained the confinement of the mad. The guardians of their asylums did not resort to physical intervention as they used to and they uncuffed the mad in appearance. Nevertheless, they still kept moral handcuffs on their consciences, and they attempted to portray the moral guilt of the patients to the patients themselves. Foucault endeavoured to draw attention to the feeling of guilt and restraint imposed on the mad:

> The asylum no longer punished the madman's guilt, it is true; but it did more, it organized that guilt; it organized it for the madman as a consciousness of himself, and as a non-reciprocal relation to the keeper; it organized it for the man of reason as an awareness of the Other, a therapeutic intervention in the madman's existence. In other words, by this guilt the madman became an object of punishment always vulnerable to himself and to the Other; and, from the acknowledgment of his status as object, from the awareness of his guilt, the madman was to return to his awareness of himself as a free and responsible subject, and consequently to reason.[4]

The madman is transformed into an object to be observed by his own senses. It is planned in this system that the madman, feeling guilty of his misdeeds, which are called misdeeds by the social structure, was supposed to take heed of his transgression and return into a moral and reasonable state.

As such, asylums take on the task of the erasure of the different, the mad, and the Other. It cures the ill, the deviant, and the divergent individuals of society, and helps the organisation of community to be sustained and prevents the disturbance of peace among its members. "The asylum," in Foucault's words, "reduces differences, represses vice, eliminates irregularities. It denounces everything that opposes the essential virtues of society . . . The asylum sets itself the task of the homogeneous rule of morality, its rigorous extension to all those who tend to escape from it."[5] From this point of view, an asylum is a dystopic institution, first tracing the acts of the Other, and then destroying any change of opposition. It also has the power to label any kind of dissent as madness. Therefore, it can be

---

[4] Foucault, 247.
[5] Ibid., 258.

used not only as an institution of health but also as a weapon to deter objection.

Churchill sees an opportunity to portray opposition, difference, and multiplicity in the space allocated to madness in asylums, madhouses or hospitals. Before being homogenised by the guardians, physicians or the doctors, Churchill's characters challenge the pillars of the reasonable in their society. From within the borders of their allocated space, behind the tangible walls of the hospitals, and also from behind the invisible walls between them and the "reasonable," they cry out the unwanted realities of society. In *Schreber's Nervous Illness* it is Schreber, who undertakes the task of challenging the norms. The readers follow Schreber to the rabbit hole leading to his psychotic experiences of mental illness. His mind/hole, however, is not fraught with miraculously speaking animals or objects as in Alice's; it is rather inhabited by upper and lower Gods and the Rays sent by God to Schreber to divert him from the trajectory of the World Order.

Daniel Paul Schreber, a high judge was one of the famous patients of the turn of the century, who was hospitalised for ten years in the asylums in Leipzig and Dresden. He published his memoirs in a book titled *Memoirs of My Nervous Illness* and Churchill's play was mostly based on this book. The play pursues the progress of Schreber's illness from his first hospitalisation in Leipzig to his appeal for a release and defence of his own psychological state at a court. The structure of the play provides the reader with a chance to see both the inner and outer perspectives of a schizophrenic character. The inner monologues of Schreber are punctuated by the voices of the Rays, and the reports of the doctors, caretakers and a judge.

Schreber, being hospitalised in 1893 and released in 1902, at the very end of the century or in the *fin de siècle*, still carries the identity of the 19th-century madman. Acknowledging Pinel's argument to be a milestone, Foucault states that "[t]he classical mind condemned in madness a certain blindness to the truth; from Pinel on, madness would be regarded rather as an impulse from the depths which exceeds the juridical limits of the individual, ignores the moral limits fixed for him, and tends to an apotheosis of the self. For the nineteenth century, the initial model of madness would be to believe oneself to be God, while for the preceding centuries it had been to deny God."[6] Schreber does not believe himself to be a God but he believes that he is a rival of God and God is jealous of him. He repeatedly refers to the incessant battle between him and the Gods

---

[6] Foucault, 264.

and believes that other human beings do not recognise the meaning of his sacred acts: "During that first year at Sonnenstein my physicians could not judge my behaviour correctly, assuming of course that they were human beings. They did not know that I was fighting a sacred battle for the good of mankind . . . ."[7] In Foucault's words, Schreber claims "an apotheosis of the self" and he transgresses "the moral limits fixed for him." His behaviour deviates from the codes of conduct society imposes upon the individuals, and his venerable position as a judge necessitates him to be cured. Social norms demand a high judge to be a "rational" person and a moral example. Schreber's vagaries of religion jeopardises his reputation, and moreover, it is not only his personal reputation that is at stake, but his frenzies are also believed to disturb the social order and tarnish the respectability of his job.

Schreber's madness is not only about his mental state but also about his position in his society. A member does not have to comply with the norms within this society. As long as one does not apparently challenge these norms, s/he is allowed to live in this structure. In this sense, Schreber's madness is not decided as a result of his thoughts but as a result of his actions. He believes that his body is a site of miracles that can only be understood by him. Yet, it is not his beliefs that shape the perceptions of his observers. Rather, it is his bellowing and screams. At the end of the play, though the voices of the Rays are now reduced, Schreber still maintains his beliefs about God. However, that is enough for him to be judged reasonable to sustain his life and he is freed from the hospital. Therefore, asylum as an institution accomplishes its function by repressing differences and by adapting Schreber, at least visually, to his society. This is a dystopic society that forces its members to hide their opinions.

Churchill in this play, as she usually does in most of her plays, criticises the patriarchal tenet of society through the transsexual proclivity of the protagonist. In the play, Schreber rummages social gender roles with his "sick" thoughts. After he gets sick, Schreber starts to believe that his body transforms into a female body: "Though my outward life had improved there was still the attempt to unman me, not to renew the world but to degrade me, because it was thought that an unmanned body would lose its attraction for rays. My sexual organ was retracted, my moustache removed, . . . my body indeed shrank the size of a female body."[8] Schreber resists God's plan to "unman" him because it also means the loss of his reason. He believes that "unmanning" is God's attempt to strip him of his

---

[7] Caryl Churchill, *Schreber's Nervous Illness.* In *Churchill: Shorts* (London: Nick Hern Books, 1990), 74.

[8] Ibid.,76.

reason. He later explains his fear of unreason as follows: "The female nerves that had penetrated my body in great masses could gain any influence over my way of thinking."[9] Although he is clearly experiencing a mental problem, he still holds onto the prevalent patriarchal logic in his mind and he identifies femininity with unreason and weakness. He resists God's plans not only for the sake of his masculinity but also so as not to lose his reason. Patriarchal order shaping Schreber's understanding detects femininity as a threat.

Schreber's familial education also serves the ends of patriarchy. He reveals that he was brought up "according to strict moral principles" and he "practiced such moderation in matters of sex."[10] Such strict moderation fuels Schreber's mental problems further and, just as Foucault underlines, Schreber humiliates himself for transforming into a woman. When his wife witnesses this condition, the imagined Rays, existing only in his mind, insult him by degrading his manhood, saying "Are you not ashamed in front of your wife?" or "Fancy the President of the Court of Appeal letting himself be fucked."[11] It is only when he acknowledges his new identity that his hallucinations become less and less painful for him. However, he needs to hide his thoughts and feelings from his guardians. Kritzer mentions that "[i]t is not until he finds ways to trivialize his femininity, however, manifesting it only in episodes of posing in front of a mirror wearing ribbons and cheap jewellery, that he succeeds in obtaining release from the asylum."[12] Therefore, Schreber is released from the asylum without rejecting his "irrational" beliefs. Rather, to get out of the asylum it is enough for a member to conform without internalizing those rules.

Approximately two decades after writing *Schreber's Nervous Illness*, Churchill carried a historical turning point of Romania onto stage. Unlike *Schreber's Nervous Illness*, *Mad Forest* represented the moments of insanity experienced by a huge nation on the brink of a revolution against the long-lasting and notorious rule of Nicolae Ceausescu. In the published version of the play, the author introduces with an epigraph cited from *A Concise History of Romania*:

> On the plain where Bucharest now stands there used to be 'a large forest crossed by small muddy streams . . . It could only be crossed on foot and was impenetrable for the foreigner who did not know the paths . . . The

---

[9] Churchill, *Schreber's Nervous Illness,* 76.
[10] Ibid., 78.
[11] Ibid.,78.
[12] Kritzer, 207.

horsemen of the steppe were forced to round it, and this difficulty, which irked them so, is shown by the name . . . Teleorman – Mad Forest.'[13]

Visiting Romania right after the revolution at the very end of 1989, Churchill experienced the same confusion of the horsemen of the steppe, and the metaphor of a mad forest complied perfectly with the present condition of Romania. The tension accumulated by the surveillance and repression of the Romanian state eroded the nerves and disturbed the mental state of Romanian citizens. As a foreigner having the chance to observe and interview with many people in Romania, the playwright, as quoted in Mary Luckhurst's article, would describe the condition of Romania as "a whole spectrum of paranoia at one end, stretching through to a very reasonable suspicion at the other."[14]

The main story of the play follows two distinct families, the Vladus and the Antonescus. The first and third parts trace their reactions to pre- and post-revolution conditions. In the first part, mostly silence prevails between the fragments, showing that people are afraid of being heard by the members of the Securitate – the secret service of Romania. The second part, on the other hand, abandons these two families and explores the days of the revolution, presenting a kaleidoscope of interviews held with random Romanians. All the interviewees sitting on the stage, pretend to be alone while relating their own perspectives about the revolution. Their narratives juxtapose disconnected vignettes without a single, complete version. In the last part of the play, voices start to arise with the alleged freedom gained by the revolution.

Political repression pushes the Romanians from the public sphere into their personal world, which is populated by imaginary and mythical figures; such as dead ancestors, Vampires, Angels, and ghosts. Churchill's use of such surreal characters alongside real and rational ones becomes a reflection of the paranoia and suspicion ruling their private lives. Her dead Grandmother befriends Flavia, a teacher and the mother of the Antonescu Family. The Grandmother tells Flavia that she is dead because she pretends that this isn't her life. She believes that she will have another chance to live another life. She does not want to start living this life because "it would hurt."[15] In the play another character that is

[13] Caryl Churchill, *Mad Forest*: In *Plays Three* (London: Nick Hern Books, 1998), 103.
[14] Mary Luckhurst, "On the Challange of Revolution." In *Cambridge Companion to Caryl Churchill*, eds. Elaine Aston and Elin Diamond. (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2009), 64.
[15] Caryl Churchill, *Mad Forest*, 120.

accompanied by another surreal character is Priest. He feels guilty for not
being able to "stand against" the Ceausescus because he is afraid and not
free. He knows that he cannot talk to people but he says to Angel:

> PRIEST. So it's not safe to go out to people and when you can't go out
> sometimes you can find you can't go in, I am afraid to go inside myself,
> perhaps there is nothing there, I just keep still. But I can talk to you, no
> one's ever known an angel work for the Securitate, I go out into the blue
> and I sink down down inside myself, yes then I am free inside, I can fly out
> in that blue, that is what the church can give people, they can fly about
> inside in that blue.[16]

The victims of the regime, who cannot physically escape from its
politics, move to the space of madness or unreason to escape from
punishment and pain. Yet the mystery about the revolution is not solved
and the play concludes with a chaotic dancing scene, where everyone
randomly starts punching one another.

Madness harbours diversity, freedom and political wisdom in *Mad
Forest*. While asylums or hospitals still endeavour to discard madness
from the public sphere, Churchill succeeds in showing the reason that
hides in unreason. The prominent example of reason being masked by
unreason comes out at a scene after the revolution, in the third part of the
play. Gabriel, Vladu family's son, is injured during the chaotic battle in
the revolution. When his family and friends visit him at the hospital, the
playwright subtly introduces a mentally damaged character to reveal the
mysteries and question lying under the disguise of the revolution:

> PATIENT. Did we have a revolution or a putsch? Who was shooting on
> the 21st? And who was shooting on the 22nd? Was the army shooting on
> the 21st or did some shoot and some not shoot or were the Securitate
> disguised in army uniforms? If the army was shooting, why haven't they
> been brought to justice? And were they still shooting on the 22nd? Were
> they now disguised as Securitate? Most important of all, were the terrorists
> and the army really fighting or were they pretending to fight? And for
> whose benefits? And by whose orders?[17]

The other characters first call him "mental wounded" and "crazy," and
then he is kindly dismissed from Gabriel's room. In Foucault's terms, he is
sent back into his isolation and he does not have a place at the centre of
the community, or, as Harpin states, his place is nowhere and he is not

---

[16] Ibid., 115.
[17] Ibid., 142-43.

here. Nevertheless, in a disconcerting manner, the questions he asks are the most reasonable and critical questions in order to discover what is behind this revolution. Ultimately, the play makes the reader/audience ask who is reasonable and who is mad, who is healthy and who is sick, and eventually, who is to decide.

To conclude, Churchill's portrayal of madness as such highlights that madness is not only determined by mental conditions; social and political contexts play a critical role in defining what is reasonable and what is not. The playwright carries in her plays *Schreber's Nervous Illness* and *Mad Forest* the peripheral to the centre and gives voice to the isolated and to ignored perspectives. While exploring madness in these plays, the playwright demonstrates that the space allocated to madness in the social structure harbours unexpected rationalities. The same space also becomes a fertile ground for the preservation and propagation of diversity. Divergent perspectives discarded from the centre of society and deemed to be forgotten by the public find freedom to exist in this space. In *Schreber's Nervous Illness* the protagonist's gender paradox discloses the social prejudices on femininity and questions their reliability within the "madness" of Schreber. In *Mad Forest*, on the other hand, the most "reasonable" realities are saved for the space of madness as political discourse does not allow them to be prominent. Both plays, using individual examples of madness, take advantage of the freedom provided by the space of madness and attribute political meanings to it. By means of madness, Churchill subtly challenges the already established norms of society.

References

Churchill, Caryl. *Mad Forest*. In *Plays Three*, 103-81. London: Nick Hern Books, 1998.

Churchill, Caryl. *Schreber's Nervous Illness.* In *Churchill: Shorts,* 57-94. London: Nick Hern Books, 1990.

Foucault, Michel. *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason,* translated by Richard Howard. New York: Vintage Books, 1988.

Harpin, Anna. "Dislocated: Metaphors of Madness in British Theatre." In *Performance, Madness and Psychiatry*, edited by Anna Harpin and Juliet Foster, 187-215. Palgrave Macmillan: London, 2014.

Kritzer, Amelie Howe. "Madness and Political Change in the Plays of Caryl Churchill." In *Madness in Drama*, edited by James Redmond, 204-16. New York: Cambridge UP, 1993.

Luckhurst, Mary. "On the Challange of Revolution." In *Cambridge Companion to Caryl Churchill*, edited by Elaine Aston and Elin Diamond, 52-70. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2009.

Chapter Eleven

Bone and Flesh, Death and Life: Human Body and Cultural Memory in *Anil's Ghost*

Ayşegül Turan

Anil's Ghost is introduced with a note from the author, in which Michael Ondaatje presents a cursory overview of recent Sri Lankan history so as to provide the reader with the background with which to contextualize the novel:

> From the mid-1980s to the early 1990s, Sri Lanka was in a crisis that involved three essential groups: the government, the antigovernment insurgents in the south and the separatist guerrillas in the north. Both the insurgents and the separatists declared war on the government. Eventually, in response, legal and illegal government squads were known to have been sent out to hunt down the separatists and the insurgents.
> *Anil's Ghost* is a fictional work set during this political time and historical moment. And while there existed organizations similar to those in this story, and similar events took place, the characters and incidents in the novel are invented.
> Today the war in Sri Lanka continues in a different form.[1]

Ondaatje, starting *Anil's Ghost* with this note, positions the novel at the intersection of history and literature. In doing so, he takes up the challenging task of representing violence through the intermingling of personal stories and collective history. After the publication of the novel, he, especially as a Sri Lankan-Canadian author, points to the difficulty of writing about political and ethnic turmoil in one's home country from outside: "It is an odd state to be in, blowing the whistle on your home country. What exactly is the morality? What is your responsibility to the

---

[1] Michael Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost* (New York: Vintage, 2000), no page number.

place you come from? Obviously, that concerns me. I wasn't sure how to write that story, how to write the war in Sri Lanka."[2] In the end, Ondaatje chooses to write the stories of bodies: dead, alive, tortured, wounded, scarred, sometimes missing but never forgotten. As the violence of ethnic strife becomes etched onto human bodies, bones start to serve as a repository of cultural memory. In the novel, "Sailor," the skeleton of a recently murdered and buried body, stands for all those bodies that have disappeared under not-so-mysterious circumstances, i.e. when people know that the disappeared are victims of one group or the other yet, out of fear, no one is willing to talk about the perpetrators. In other words, the attempt to give Sailor a name and a face becomes emblematic of the desire to acknowledge the loss and suffering as well as honouring the dead in the midst of ongoing violence. In the novel, the conscious effort to strip the bodies of their identity and to anonymize them does not lead to their ultimate erasure from history; on the contrary, they, through the lifeless bones and remains, draw attention to this attempt and hence become an essential part of cultural memory. In this article, I will focus on the representations of the body in various forms to examine how not only the bodies but also Ondaatje's novel, which is very much about bodies, emerge as objects and agents and of cultural memory of violence and trauma.

The narrative thrust of the novel revolves around Anil Tissera, a forensic anthropologist who, after living in England and the US for fifteen years, returns to her homeland Sri Lanka as part of an international human rights group. She is to work together with Sarath Diyasena, a local archeologist, and together they will help with the investigation of mass murders by identifying the victims of unknown extrajudicial executions. When they discover a recently buried skeleton among the centuries-old remains in a government-controlled ancient burial site, their work takes a dangerous turn in the violent and volatile atmosphere of the country. In their attempt to identify Sailor, the name they give to the skeleton, they enlist the help of various characters such as Palipana, Sarath's once renowned and currently disgraced teacher who has lost his sight and lives with his niece Lakma in the middle of wilderness; Ananda, the traditional artist in charge of painting Buddha statues who has become an alcoholic after the disappearance of his wife, and Gamini, Sarath's brother who works as a surgeon and witnesses the casualties of the ethnic strife on a daily basis. The novel's non-linear structure with a multitude of

---

[2] Michael Ondaatje, "Michael Ondaatje's Cubist Civil War," interview by Dave Weich, *Powells Books*, October 10, 2006,
https://www.powells.com/post/interviews/michael-ondaatjes-cubist-civil-war.

temporalities and spaces compels the reader to bring different fragments together to have a broader view of the society in the same way Anil and Sarath are trying to reconstruct both the body and the life story of Sailor. In a way, characters' and the reader's work mirror one another: they are both on a quest to discover the greater picture; in the case of the protagonists it is Sailor's identity which would eventually lead to his murderers and perhaps justice, and in the case of the reader it is to explore the limits and possibilities presented by fictional narratives of traumatic individual and collective histories.

With respect to *Anil's Ghost*, Ondaatje has been repeatedly criticized for his refusal to openly engage with the politics of Sri Lanka and also for refraining from commenting on the political violence and various perpetrators. Most of the early reviews and later critical pieces about the novel, firstly, bring up the author's rather ambiguous and vague stance as well as the political, ethical and social implications of writing about civil war. Ryan Mowat, referring to the aforementioned note at the beginning of the novel, states that "[the novel's reference] to 'insurgents' and 'separatists' rather than their well-known names betrays a reluctance to directly engage with the war."[3] In a similar manner, Margaret Scanlan notes that the novel "reproduces no political rhetoric, adjudicates no political claims, projects no political solutions. […] We understand early that we will find no master narratives, no organic psychologies, no resolution and no moral."[4] While these remarks facilitate an understanding of the novel's relatively detached perspective and lack of background information about Sri Lankan political history, Ondaatje himself offers a new dimension to the novel. He asserts that it is not a historical novel; rather, "it's a very fictional world. I didn't want to write the public portrait of the place, but the situation of the individual in a country like this. I was more interested in how people live: how does fear affect you, and denial?"[5] Thus, the narrative directs its attention to a number of individuals whose lives, in one way or another, have been affected by the civil war. Although this micro-level approach through individualized stories, at first glance, may seem to disconnect the narrative from its specific historical and socio-political context, the novel nonetheless opens up transnational connections by means of interspersed sections in which

---

[3] Ryan Mowat, "An Aesthetics of War: The Postcolonial Ethics of *Anil's Ghost*," *Journal of Postcolonial Writing* 49, no.1 (2013): 28.
[4] Margaret Scanlan, "*Anil's Ghost* and Terrorism's Time," *Studies in the Novel* 36, no.3 (Fall 2004): 302.
[5] Maya Jaggi, "Michael Ondaatje in Conversation with Maya Jaggi," *Wasafiri* 16 no. 32 (2000): 7.

people from different parts of the world are portrayed as suffering from political violence with similar outcomes, i.e. torture, disappearances and extrajudicial murders. Fictionalized narratives of violence and trauma from all over the world indicate the need to deal with the painful histories through fiction, with the hopes that the suffering that is separated by spatiality and temporality can be brought together and memorialized through storytelling. Indeed, this is also Ondaatje's intention: "In many ways, the book isn't just about Sri Lanka; it could be Guatemala or Bosnia or Ireland. The stories are very familiar in other parts of the world."[6] In this manner, localized stories become part of the broader cultural repository and the representation of the human body–dead and/or alive– and the novel itself emerge as objects and agents of cultural memory.

Astrid Erll provides a provisional definition of cultural memory as "the interplay of past and present in socio-cultural contexts."[7] This broad definition allows for the inclusion of a wide variety of phenomena as part of cultural memory studies such as individual acts of remembering in a social context, group memory (family, friends, etc.) or national memory. At this point, Jeffrey K. Olick draws attention to the use of the concept of "remembering" (a cognitive process taking place in individual brains) on a metaphorical level in cultural memory.[8] That is how we are able to talk about a specific group's or nation's memory, namely through the metaphorical transfer of the individual act of remembering to the level of collective and cultural remembering. Literature emerges as one of the most readily available and employed media of cultural memory. Erll, in her discussion of literary works as a means of cultural memory, lists a number of mnemonic functions they fulfil, such as "the imaginative creation of past lifeworlds, the transmission of images of history, the negotiation of competing memories and the reflection about processes and problems of cultural memory."[9] When we consider the novel's representation of these dead and alive bodies, the narrative both reflects and produces cultural memory. On the one hand, the fictional portrayal of the ethnic strife in Sri Lanka is inspired by the historical circumstances as mentioned by the author himself at the beginning. By focusing on the stories of the

---

[6] Ibid, 7.

[7] Astrid Erll, "Cultural Memory Studies: An Introduction," in *Cultural Memory Studies: An International and Interdisciplinary Handbook,* eds. A. Erll and A. Nünning (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2008), 2.

[8] Jeffrey Olick, "Collective Memory: The Two Cultures," *Sociological Theory* 17, no.3 (1999): 336.

[9] Astrid Erll, *Memory in Culture*, trans. Sara B. Young (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 144.

individuals and their personal tragedies, the novel underscores the disruption and destruction of everyday life. In the novel, the political ideologies of the three sides, namely the government, Tamil Tigers and the Sinhalese separatists, are not discussed; in fact, it is almost dismissed, as indicated by the sentence, "*the reason for war was war*."[10] Hence, the novel depicts not the cause but the effect of the conflict: the unspeakable violence that emerges as the common denominator in the cultural memory of the society. Through this portrayal, the novel itself also becomes part of the cultural memory. On the other hand, in its attempts to remember and represent the loss, *Anil's Ghost* operates as an agent of cultural memory. One of the central questions the novel raises is how to remember a past that is too painful to remember? The novel does not offer a clear-cut answer to this question; in fact, it underlines the impossibility of coming up with a one-fits-all solution as well as the need to commemorate the absence created by the violent past. In doing so, it contributes to and becomes part of the cultural memory of Sri Lanka. Ondaatje's ambivalent attitude toward the depiction of historical details with respect to the ethnic strife can also be regarded as a conscious decision to limit and contain any possible connection to political standpoints. In this manner, the novel prioritizes human suffering over political actors in its contribution to cultural memory.

It is no coincidence that with a novel so much about remembering and forgetting, the idea of the archive comes to the foreground. Mrinalini Chakravorty notes that "the novel's account of the disinterred, disappeared, assassinated, and injured reflects an archive of death."[11] The idea of the archive not only indicates an accumulation of bodies over time–in this case, either physically present or present through their absence–but also an inventory that can be methodically examined, sorted, and catalogued. Antoinette Burton, who likens the narrative to an "archive of bones," remarks: "[F]ragments and shards, ashes and dust, rag and bone. From these unspeakable remnants forensic scientists have laboured to extract the kinds of testimony that living witnesses often cannot, despite and of course because of the pathos of their memories, provide: objective and verifiable evidence of criminal intent which becomes, in turn, the basis for the pursuit of justice in local, national and international tribunals."[12] This is exactly what Anil undertakes with regard to Sailor:

---

[10] Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost*, 43 (emphasis in original).
[11] Mrinalini Chakravorty, "The Dead That Haunt *Anil's Ghost*: Subaltern Difference and Melancholia," *PMLA* 128, no. 3 (2013): 542.
[12] Antoinette Burton, "Archive of Bones: *Anil's Ghost* and the Ends of History," *Journal of Commonwealth Literature* 38, no.1 (2003): 39.

first, to establish the cause of his death, then identify him and last but not
least present the scientific evidence and report both to the local authorities
and more importantly to the United Nations. By fulfilling these steps, she
aims to establish the identity of the victim and "reclaim these bones from
anonymity and for justice."[13] She believes that the bones will tell the truth.
For Anil, truth is firmly grounded in science and its objectivity. As she
examines the skeleton, analyses the soil samples or conducts research on
different larvae to determine where Sailor was originally murdered and
buried, she is, in fact, after the irrefutable truth about his death and the
responsible party. While this notion of irrefutable truth is challenged by
other characters in the novel, such as Palipana describing truth as just
another opinion, Anil also realizes that her adherence to scientific methods
and a firm belief in truth can take her only so far unless she gains a more
acute understanding of the pain and suffering around her. It is Ananda's
reconstruction of Sailor's skull that brings this rupture and creates
profound awareness in Anil. Once they pinpoint the area Sailor used to
live, Ananda visits villages, observes the general facial characteristics and
physical structures, then he brings the skull to life, in a metaphorical
manner. Anil and Sarath are struck by the peaceful expression on the face.
When Sarath recounts Ananda's wife Sirissa's disappearance because of
abduction three years ago, "Anil could no longer look at the face, saw only
Ananda's wife in every aspect of it. She sat down and started weeping.
[…] She realized that the face was in no way a portrait of Sailor but
showed a calm Ananda had known in his wife, a peacefulness he wanted
for any victim."[14] During the reconstruction of Sailor's skull, the memory
of one victim is superimposed upon another, underlining the impossibility
to look at one body, or collection of bones, and not to remember all those
others that have been missing or dead. The individual act of remembering
cannot be separated from the collective loss. That does not mean that one
face or one body becomes interchangeable with another face or body that
has been lost; rather, they exist through relationality, the interminable
link–death–that connects them all in the eyes of survivors. In addition to
the uncanny intermingling of Sirissa and Sailor in Ananda's creation, it is
the corporeal relationality between Ananda and Sailor that makes the
identification possible in the first place. Anil's observation that Ananda
uses his body in a similar fashion as indicated by Sailor's bones enables
the determination of his profession, ultimately leading to his name. These
connections contribute to Anil's insistence that Sailor can represent other

---

[13] Ibid, 42.
[14] Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost*, 185-187.

victims and should be used to do so in order to bring peace and closure to those still alive.

While the skeleton of Sailor, who is later identified as Ruwan Kumara, a miner[15], holds the centre in the archive of the death, it is not only the dead bodies that carry the marks of violence; the living ones have a story to tell as well. Surrounded by physical and psychological violence, they have become wounded too. In the novel, death is represented as coming from anywhere and everywhere without any explanation. These deaths are shrouded in silence, "of not knowing how, when or why these deaths occurred, or even if they have occurred at all."[16] Although death, despite all the pain and suffering, offers a kind of closure in itself, disappearances present a more challenging case for those left behind. Gabriele Schwab underscores the double-function of disappearances: they aim "to erase the very existence and name of the disappeared person and to intimidate the population with a hitherto unknown form of invisible terror."[17] People, on the one hand, want to look for their loved ones and find some answers; on the other hand, they are aware that asking questions may cause their disappearance as well. With no answers, they are left to imagine the best (that they are still alive) and the worst (that they have suffered from a painful death), which will only prolong their own agony. As the disappeared also fade away from official records, they still live in the memories of their loved ones as well as the collective memory that commemorates those whose fates are unknown.

Anil's Ghost, in general, can be read as the intersecting and overlapping stories of collective and individual trauma. The acts of forgetting and remembering, seeking justice for the disappeared and the emphasis on the interminable link between the alive and dead point to various ways of acknowledging the trauma and, if possible, coming to terms with it. One of the widely used definitions of trauma is provided by Cathy Caruth as "an overwhelming experience of sudden or catastrophic events in which the response to the event occurs in the often delayed, uncontrolled repetitive appearance of hallucinations and other intrusive phenomena."[18] While Caruth's conceptualization of trauma mostly focuses on individual

---

[15] Ibid., 269.

[16] Victoria Burrows, "The Heterotopic Spaces of Postcolonial Trauma in Michael Ondaatje's *Anil's Ghost*," *Studies in the Novel* 40, no.1&2 (Spring & Summer 2008): 170.

[17] Gabriele Schwab, "Unofficial Wars: The Politics of Disappearance," *European Review* 22, no.4 (October 2014): 643.

[18] Cathy Caruth, *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996), 11.

experiences and their causes and effects with, at times, universalizing tendencies, postcolonial trauma studies call for a more nuanced reading of trauma with particular attention to collective and individual traumas and their points of intersection. Michelle Balaev states that "extreme experience cultivates multiple responses and values; trauma causes a disruption and reorientation of consciousness, but the values attached to this experience are influenced by a variety of individual and cultural factors that change over time."[19] In the case of Ondaatje's novel, the reader comes across a plethora of characters who experience trauma on different levels. Although most of the characters are witnesses to physical violence and live with the fear of it they are all psychologically traumatized by the prevailing violence in the country. The collective trauma affects individuals with varying degrees, hence shaping individual traumatic experiences in numerous ways. While trauma is generally examined through its profound negative impact on individuals and communities, Irene Visser elaborates on the complexity of trauma:

> Trauma has both centripetal and centrifugal tendencies; it is not by definition coherent in cause and effect. It can negatively affect individuals and communities, forcing open fault lines […] Yet it can also positively affect individuals and communities by consolidating a sense of belonging, of kinship and mutual trust […] trauma, then is a very complex phenomenon. It is not only to be understood as acute and event-based, but can also be chronic and non-event based; it can be debilitating and disruptive to individuals and communities but it can also create a stronger cohesion and a renewed sense of identity.[20]

Visser's elaboration on the possible positive effects of trauma emphasizes a sense of collective belonging that is traumatic events bringing people together with potentially recuperative consequences. In this view, individual and collective trauma are inseparable from one another since they are largely affected by the same social and historical circumstances. The emphasis on the societal factors does not indicate a denial of the individual characteristics of each traumatic event or story; on the contrary, it aims to provide a starting point to explore the underlying components before delving into the specifics of each case. Within the

---

[19] Michelle Balaev, "Literary Trauma Reconsidered," in *Contemporary Approaches in Literary Trauma Theory,* ed. M. Balaev (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 4.

[20] Irene Visser, "Trauma and Power in Postcolonial Literary Studies," in *Contemporary Approaches in Literary Trauma Theory,* ed. M. Balaev (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 109-110.

context of Ondaatje's novel, it is impossible to disentangle the collective trauma stemming from the civil war and the personalized individual stories. Ultimately, most of these traumatic events have their roots in the conditions created by the civil war.

When we consider the major characters in the novel, they all suffer from the effects of this traumatic atmosphere. Sarath, after his wife's suicide, has minimized his interaction with others, solely focusing on his work. Every time Anil asks a political question, he makes sure that her tape recorder is turned off. When "every side is killing and hiding the evidence […] [and] No one knows who the victims are,"[21] his survival depends on being cautious to the degree of almost paranoia. Palipana's young niece Lakma, after witnessing the brutal murder of her parents, has severed her ties with the outside world, using her cognitive abilities at a minimum–only to communicate with and take care of frail Palipana. When Ananda's efforts to cope with his wife's disappearance fail, he finds consolation in alcohol. He even tries to kill himself right after completing the reconstruction of Sailor's skull. While these characters can be united through their loss of a loved one, Gamini, Sarath's surgeon brother, stands apart with witnessing the violence on a greater scale. His work at Accident Services Hospital, nicknamed "Gunshot Services,"[22] brings him face to face with victims, injured or dead, on a daily basis. Although his cold and indifferent tone while elaborating on the injuries and victims, initially, strikes Anil, and the reader, it actually indicates a method for self-preservation along with a form of trauma. He takes drugs to work non-stop, sleeps at the hospital and has no life other than the one in the hospital. As "the country exist[s] in a rocking, self-burying motion,"[23] no one can remain outside of its destructive path. Scanlan draws our attention to the isolation of these characters; they no longer establish healthy relationships, be it social or romantic; the only communities in which they partake are temporary ones consisting of healthcare workers or scientists.[24] Within the framework of the novel, being alive corresponds to losing your psychological well-being and taking steps toward self-destruction, or perhaps the undead being constantly haunted by the dead. Indeed, the novel's ending emphasizes this sense of being haunted by what one experiences or witnesses. *Anil's Ghost*, in the end, does not offer closure with regard to Anil's story. The reader is left wondering if she was able to leave the country and present her report to the authorities. Whether the

---

[21] Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost*, 17.
[22] Ibid, 127.
[23] Ibid, 157.
[24] Scanlan, "Terrorism's Time," 311.

report will create any difference constitutes another question. With the death of Sarath, the efforts for the report have only added one more body to the archive of death, one more story to be told. Sarath is Anil's ghost, as she joins other Sri Lankans who are victims, witnesses and survivors of the violence in the country.

The novel, despite its emphasis on the manifold consequences of psychological and physical violence upon individuals, in general refrains from presenting graphic depictions of violence. However, three scenes from the novel, through their depiction of physical violence, help towards a comprehension of the importance of the human body and memory in the text. The first scene takes place when Anil and Sarath are on their way to Colombo and come across a driver lying in front of his truck. At first, they do not think much of it and drive on; but then they realize something must be wrong and go back. Once they get back there, they see that "he was almost unconscious. Someone had hammered a bridge nail into his left palm and another into his right, crucifying him to the tarmac."[25] For Anil, this is the first time that she witnesses the almost haphazard violence in Sri Lanka in such an intimate manner. As they take the driver to the hospital in the city, she strives to relieve his pain by pouring the saline solution into his hands. The scene is striking for its almost complete lack of conversation. The only conversation between the driver and Anil consists of, "'What's your name?' 'Gunesena.' 'Do you live near here?' The man rolled his head slightly, a tactful yes and no, and Anil smiled."[26] Rather than words, it is his body that expresses his pain. Elaine Scarry states that pain resists linguistic signification and most of the time it is not the one in pain who expresses herself/himself but someone else who speaks on her/his behalf.[27] In this instance, Ondaatje leaves the driver's pain undescribed, thus underlining its severity. Neither Sarath nor Anil (nor the narrator) can speak on behalf of him and voice his bodily pain and suffering. This linguistic absence once again points to the problems of representing violence and pain. Moreover, the only identifying information provided by the victim is his first name, which is impossible to verify. In this instance, Anil's initial attempt at small talk is encountered with vagueness, indicating the unwillingness to provide information about oneself even to those who help you. Indeed, the information is unnecessary since what matters only is his bodily pain, suffering, and the protagonists' desire to help him regardless of social or political identifications.

---

[25] Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost*, 111.

[26] Ibid, 113.

[27] Elaine Scarry, *The Body in Pain: the Making and Unmaking of the World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985), 6

The second scene delineates the assassination of the President, which is a fictional version of the actual assassination of the Sri Lankan President Premadasa in 1993. A suicide bomber blows himself up, killing the President and those around him with more than a hundred people injured. The scene of the attack is described as such: "Some flesh, probably from the bomber, was found on the wall of the building across the street. The right arm of Katugala rested by itself on the stomach of one of the dead policemen."[28] This graphic portrayal presents the bodies of victims and perpetrators as becoming one through their annihilation. Indeed, it is almost impossible to separate the bodily parts of the different people. Yet, what distinguishes this act of violence from all the others is the dismemberment of the President's body, both literally and figuratively. As there is nothing left of the President after the bombing (the doctors wait for a corpse in vain), it is also the political body as represented by the presidency that has disappeared, thus leaving the future of the country open to different possibilities.[29] Furthermore, the scene is emblematic of the violence engulfing the whole society; all parties are implicated and as Sarath remarks before, "we have all blood on our clothes"[30] either by participating in it or by remaining silent. The metonymic relationship between dismembered bodily parts and society, along with the political authority, emphasizes the fragmentation from the micro to the macro level.

The last scene to be analysed is about Sarath, who can be regarded as trying to remove that blood by helping Anil to present concrete evidence to the UN. In an attempt to save her life, Sarath first disputes Anil's findings in front of a national committee and then risks his own life to secretly give her Sailor's body. She finds her own tape recorder in Sailor's chest with a full recording of the national committee meeting and Sarath's voice at the end whispering, telling her to complete the report and leave the country immediately. This depiction of Sarath's voice coming out of Sailor's body literally corresponds to what they have been trying to do: speaking for the dead, speaking through the dead. At this moment, Sailor finds a voice for himself. However, this voice costs Sarath his life. In the following pages, Gamini recognizes his brother from the "innocent scars" in his body–a broken rib from a fall during childhood, a scar on the elbow from a bike crash–when it comes to the rest of his body, "Sarath's chest said everything. It was what Gamini had fought against. Now this body lay on the bed undefended. It was what it was. No longer a counter of argument, no longer an opinion that Gamini refused to accept. Oh, there

---

[28] Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost*, 295.
[29] Antoinette Burton, "Archive of Bones," 49.
[30] Ondaatje, *Anil's Ghost*, 48.

seemed to be a mark like that made with a spear."[31] This time it is Sarath's body that tells a story, a story that Gamini is all too familiar with after seeing so many victims of torture and murder, and now he recognizes all those wounds left on his brother's body. Jennifer Ballangee states that "in order to communicate […] a message, torture must be presented or represented to a witnessing audience."[32] In the novel, the characters, as well as the reader, have become witnesses to different forms of torture and pain. In all these three scenes, the human body gains a different significance through the violence inflicted upon it. In the end, all of them become part of the cultural memory through their various qualities and limitations. As the novel reminds the reader of the loss of so many lives and those who have disappeared, it is not their erasure it affirms; on the contrary, it compels the reader to think about the absences, silences, and omissions, and record them in the archives of cultural memory.

Ondaatje's fictional narrative of the recent Sri Lankan history, through his emphasis on the stories of people instead of political agendas of different parties, discloses the extent of physical and psychological trauma inflicted on people from diverse backgrounds and their attempts at survival. The portrayal of violence and trauma presents a number of challenges, particularly when it is inspired by actual historical events. As literature provides a venue to re-imagine contested histories and stories as well as revealing the problems of this process of imagination, it, nonetheless, adds another story to our repository of cultural memory. In this particular novel, it is not only Anil's story but also the stories of others who cannot speak for themselves and can only be remembered for their silence and absence. The dismemberment and disintegration of the human body in multiple ways, as represented and referred to by the novel, gradually stand for the dissolution of the main fabric of society and a sense of belonging, hence turning Sarath and Sri Lanka in general to Anil's ghost. Ondaatje is well aware of the fact that Sri Lanka can no longer serve, or be represented, as the imaginary homeland nostalgically celebrated and memorialized. The relentless violence within the country erases any possibility of a diasporic yearning for the homeland. However, it is the longing for the gone, the missing or the disappeared that haunts the undead and compels them to remember and remind others.

---

[31] Ibid, 289.

[32] Jennifer Ballangee, *The Wound and The Witness: The Rhetoric of Torture* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2009), 9.

References

Balaev, Michelle. "Literary Trauma Theory Reconsidered." In *Contemporary Approaches in Literary Trauma Theory*, edited by Michelle Balaev, 1-15. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

Burrows, Victoria. "The Heterotopic Spaces of Postcolonial Trauma in Michael Ondaatje's *Anil's Ghost*." *Studies in the Novel* 40, no.1&2 (Spring & Summer 2008):161-177.

Burton, Antoinette. "Archive of Bones: *Anil's Ghost* and the Ends of History." *Journal of Commonwealth Literature* 38, no.1 (2003): 39-56.

Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996.

Chakravorty, Mrinalini. "The Dead That Haunt *Anil's Ghost*: Subaltern Difference and Melancholia." *PMLA* 128, no. 3 (2013): 542-558.

Erll, Astrid. *Memory in Culture*, trans. Sara B. Young. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.

Erll, Astrid. "Cultural Memory Studies: An Introduction." In *Cultural Memory Studies: An International and Interdisciplinary Handbook,* eds. A. Erll and A. Nünning, 1-19. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2008.

Jaggi, Maya. "Michael Ondaatje in Conversation with Maya Jaggi." *Wasafiri* 16, no. 32 (2000): 5-11.

Mowat, Ryan. "An Aesthetics of War: The Postcolonial Ethics of *Anil's Ghost*." *Journal of Postcolonial Writing* 49, no.1 (2013): 28-39.

Olick, Jeffrey. "Collective Memory: The Two Cultures." *Sociological Theory* 17, no.3 (1999): 333-48.

Ondaatje, Michael. *Anil's Ghost*. New York: Vintage, 2000.

Ondaatje, Michael. "Michael Ondaatje's Cubist Civil War." Interview by Dave Weich, Powells Books, October 10, 2006, https://www.powells.com/post/interviews/michael-ondaatjes-cubist-civil-war.

Scanlan, Margaret. "*Anil's Ghost* and Terrorism's Time." *Studies in the Novel* 36, no.3 (Fall 2004): 302-317.

Scarry, Elaine.*The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985.

Schwab, Gabriele. "Unofficial Wars: The Politics of Disappearance." *European Review* 22, no.4 (October 2014): 642-651.

Visser, Irene. "Trauma and Power in Postcolonial Literary Studies." In *Contemporary Approaches in Literary Trauma Theory*, ed. Michelle Balaev, 106-130. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

CHAPTER TWELVE

CHANGING REPRESENTATIONS OF IGBO WOMEN IN BUCHI EMECHETA'S *THE SECOND CLASS CITIZEN* AND CHINUA ACHEBE'S *ANTHILLS OF THE SAVANNAH*

CANSU ÇAKMAK ÖZGÜREL

To depict modern representations of Nigerian women within the postcolonial and post-independent Nigerian society, Nigerian authors Albert Chinualumogu Achebe (1930-2013) and Buchi Emecheta (1944-2017) produced different yet substantial portraits of the new Nigerian women with a vision which advocates that women should play a prominent role in society. Buchi Emecheta in *Second Class Citizen* (1974) demonstrates that Nigerian females can achieve economic and social independence which they lost in time on account of British colonialism and the African understanding of patriarchy. In *Anthills of the Savannah* (1987), Chinua Achebe's first developed female protagonist, Beatrice, leads and guides the people around her in a postcolonial and an independent African state along with the other strong female figures. While Achebe defines Beatrice as the modern African woman who has a good education and holds a significant position in the government, Emecheta, in her semi-autobiographical novel, depicts Adah as an extraordinary woman in terms of fulfilling her ideals and ambitions to be a librarian, to go to London and to be a writer. This article aims to analyse the changing representation of African women -specifically Igbo women- in postcolonial Nigeria in Emecheta's *Second Class Citizen* and Achebe's *Anthills of the Savannah*.

Along with colonization, the previous social position of women was appropriated according to European patriarchal values that were nurtured

by Christian principles and myths.[1] As April L. Gordon states about the declining role of African women in colonial rule, "[t]he commercialization of agriculture through the introduction of cash crops altered the customary gender division of labour in many ways mostly disadvantageous for women."[2] Thus, as the ways that Nigerian women used to earn their living slowly vanished during colonial rule, their economic roles, and responsibilities that empowered them socio-politically also disappeared. Additionally, the absence of women's participation in the economic sphere rendered them powerless and worsened their socio-cultural rights and status. The British colonial rule ignored and undermined female political presence and power while women's responsibilities toward their families -economic and domestic duties- grew.[3] What is more, the introduction of private ownership of land made it almost impossible for women to own land and grow cash crops for income since they did not have the means to buy it.[4] Even after independence, African male leaders would continue the colonial legacy by sustaining the same imposed Western patriarchal values that were not originally in accordance with the former African patriarchal values.[5] Hence, women are subjected to "double colonisation" which "[refers] to the ways in which women have simultaneously experienced the oppression of colonialism and patriarchy."[6] Colonisation celebrates male achievement while women are to be subjugated by the principles of colonial discourse and values of European patriarchy.[7]

All in all, oppressive rules of patriarchy and lingering traces of colonialism (even after the decolonization process) come into question while attempting to establish a better position for Nigerian women. Colonialism brought alterations in every aspect of life, some of which were beneficial for Nigerian females. Some former privileges of women in terms of financial, social, political and marital rights were influenced by European patriarchy in the twentieth century with the changes in gender

---

[1] Carolyne Dennis, "Women and State in Nigeria: the Case of Military Government 1984-85," in *Women, State and Ideology: Studies from Africa and Asia*, ed. Halef Afsha (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987), 15.

[2] April L. Gordon, "Women and Development," in *Understanding Contemporary Africa*, eds. April L. Gordon and Donald L.Gordon (Colorado: Lynne Reinner, 1996), 254.

[3] A. Gordon, "Women and Development," 254.

[4] Ibid., 255.

[5] Ibid., 250.

[6] John McLeod, *Beginning Postcolonialism* (Manchester: Manchester UP, 2000), 175

[7] McLeod, *Beginning Postcolonialism,* 175-176.

relations in colonised Nigeria. Hence, they were doubly-colonised and mostly ignored in public life in terms of having proper education and earning enough money. Women who were not Western and white were projected as exotic sexual objects of "Western heterosexual male desire," whereas white Western women were iconized owing to their Western-epitomized higher morals and civil standards.[8] However, in Igbo society, the position of women is not that simplistic, as an Igbo woman could achieve or earn the respect that was originally thought to belong to males "through intelligence, resourcefulness, industry, resilience, talent, wealth or impeccable character."[9] Emecheta is highly critical of male dominance and female subjugation taken as the norms within the society, while her determination to preserve the social structures and positions (such as being a daughter, sister, wife, and mother) enable women to obtain and sustain power to a certain extent.

Second Class Citizen depicts the new Igbo woman through protagonist Adah who is a quite unusual Igbo girl. She is unconventional in that she should have submitted to the oppressive patriarchal understanding permeating her society and her family; however, she always finds a way to assert herself in the existing patriarchal and oppressive order. As poverty is a significant issue for the majority of families in Nigeria, unfortunately, education for girls is not seen as of primary importance to those families. Likewise, Adah is not considered to be the mother's first choice and it is decided that her brother will go to the expensive school that Adah wants to attend.[10] Her family is forced to make a choice between their children due to economic reasons, but unfortunately, the choice that is made is not in favour of Adah, so she suffers from gender inequalities in terms of education. However, there is also the fact that the more educated a girl gets, the more her bride price will increase, which also complicates the bridewealth in Igbo society.

> [Adah] got great satisfaction, too, from the fact that Francis was too poor to pay the five hundred pounds bride-price Ma and the other members of her family were asking. She was such an expensive bride because she was "college trained", even though none of them had contributed to her education. The anger of her people was so intense that none of them came to the wedding.[11]

---

[8] Ibid., 175-176

[9] Marie Umeh, ed., *Emerging Perspectives on Buchi Emecheta* (Trenton: Africa World, 1996), 1.

[10] Buchi Emecheta, *Second Class Citizen* (New York: George Braziller, 1975), 9-10.

[11] Ibid., 24.

Since Adah is determined to continue studying to be a librarian, she has to find a way to accomplish her purpose. In order to be successful in what she aspires, she manipulates the institution of marriage for her own sake. When she agrees to get married without a bride price, she actually has a plan for her future. She chooses to marry Francis without a bride price, which is very unconventional in Igbo society. Nevertheless, not being able to pay Adah's costly bride price, Francis' family would be in debt to Adah's family -or Adah in this case- for a long time and this puts Adah in an advantageous position since she does not have to follow every decision in Francis' family and she can reasonably object and thus be in a more powerful position compared to her former life with her mother's relatives. Also, Adah's refusal of the bridewealth means her rejection of becoming a profitable source of wealth for her own extended family, which characterises one of Adah's rebellions against the Igbo traditions that she cannot benefit from.

In formulating solutions to the self-realization of the individual, Emecheta is very much to the point; her female characters in the novels, as well as her semi-autobiographical protagonist, Adah, are quite successful at being "weavers of [their] own destiny" as long as they rescue themselves from being dependent by education and economic self-sufficiency."[12] Although Adah is actually quite content with her life in Lagos as she is "cushioned by the love of her parents-in-law, spoilt by her servants and respected by Francis's younger sisters,"[13] she aspires to continue her education to be a librarian and later a writer since she feels that being content with all this would be "superficial."[14] While not refusing the roles that she traditionally fulfils as a dutiful mother, wife and a daughter-in-law, she also does not refrain from developing intellectually and individually, due to her education.

Adah's intellectual development is not encouraged by Francis either when she wants to become a writer since he thinks that "[t]he white man can barely tolerate us men, to say nothing of brainless females like you who could think of nothing except how to breast-feed her baby."[15] He fails to decolonize his mind from the falsely exposed notion of inferiority and oppression unlike Adah who believes that she, an Igbo woman, stands a chance

---

[12] Tuzyline Jita Allan, "The Joys of Motherhood: A Study of a Problematic Womanist Aesthetic," in *Womanist and Feminist Aesthetics: A Comparative Review* (Athens: Ohio UP, 1995), 98.

[13] Emecheta, *Second Class Citizen*, 26.

[14] Ibid., 26.

[15] Ibid., 167.

of being published one day in London despite the cold welcome or
discriminating attitude. Adah does not accept the discrimination and
inferiority but challenges the idea of the superiority of white men. In
addition, she demystifies the colonial myth about the honesty and civilised
nature of the white folks when she discovers that Trudy, the British daily-
minder for Adah's children, mistreats and neglects her children so much
that one of them develops meningitis due to exposure to unhygienic
environment and malnutrition:

> […] one of the myths that she had been brought up to believe: that the
> white men never lied. She had grown up among white missionaries who
> were dedicated to their work, she had then worked among American
> diplomats who were working for their country in Nigeria, and since she
> came to England the only other white she had actually mixed with were the
> girls in the library and Janet. She had never met the like of Trudy before.
> In fact she could not believe her ears; she just gaped in astonishment.[16]

The tension between Adah and Francis reaches its climax when Francis
burns her manuscript, which is Adah's "brainchild," and actually reflects
his patriarchal and misogynistic attitude which is predominantly the result
of the patriarchal values of his upbringing. Upon burning Adah's
manuscript, Francis defends himself by claiming that "my family would
never be happy if a wife of mine was permitted to write a book like that,[17]
which reveals his insecurity and an inability to make decisions by himself,
even though he is miles away from his homeland. Adah is also aware that
"Francis could never tolerate an intelligent woman."[18] They have a
marriage that is filled with many challenges emerging especially when
they start to live in London. Thus, Adah decides that divorce would be a
way of escaping from Francis, but the utterance of divorce in Igbo culture
is not tolerated. As Ngcobo states:

> The image of divorced women in our society and our literature is negative.
> Only a handful may earn the understanding of the community such as in
> cases where the woman has a clean reputation which contrasts sharply with
> her husband's maltreatment of her. Only in a few cases do some women
> win the sympathy of the public. This is confirmed if they are seen to
> behave with dignity after the divorce. On the whole a wife will do
> everything to endure even a stressful marriage, for in a divorce she comes
> out the loser: Even when her husband is the offending party, society sees

---

[16] Ibid., 52-53.
[17] Ibid., 170.
[18] Ibid., 168.

her as having failed to hold him in place-therefore his failure is her failure as well.[19]

Being able to conceive of a world completely isolated from her traditional way of thinking (her Igbo way of life) is not an option for Adah and she still blames herself saying that "[if] she would not have had this urge to write now; her marriage would have been saved, at least for the time being, because she knew that sometime later she was going to write."[20] However, yielding to the demands of an oppressive husband is definitely not a step for achieving greater things in an Igbo woman's life, and although being a wife and a mother is important in their culture and identity, she believes she does not have to be oppressed by the expectation of her husband and her society. Birth control becomes an issue when Adah does not want to get pregnant again before she gets accustomed to her new life in London. Emecheta points out one of the struggles in monogamy in the context of an Igbo family, as both Francis and Adah grow up in a society that values the woman's fertility and curses birth control practices. As educated parents, Francis and Adah should be in control of their family planning ignoring the outdated and superstitious beliefs and practices of their culture. Nevertheless, only Adah wants to apply birth control until she is harshly rejected and condemned by Francis who thinks that birth control caps are "invented for harlots and single women."[21] In this respect, Adah's concerns are quite unusual for a traditional Igbo woman since a woman's control over her body is a relatively new concern and traditionally an Igbo woman did not use any contraceptive methods to prevent unwanted pregnancies. Hence, Adah is creating a new Igbo woman image that has her say and independence since she is economically superior, taking control not only of her life but also her body. In short, Adah is redefining her roles and rights.

Anthills of the Savannah also employs a female protagonist who can be considered to be a new Igbo woman who will be confident enough to lead society, since the existing male-favoured system fails to be the solution. In this respect, this female protagonist, Beatrice, is the metaphor that signifies the major change that should be made in society. The fictitious Kangan state depicted in *Anthills of the Savannah* could well be considered as an alternative state suggested by Achebe. As postcolonial

---

[19]Lauretta Ngcobo, "African Motherhood-Myth and Reality," in *Criticism and Ideology: Second African Writers' Conference Stockholm 1986*, ed. Kirsten Holst Petersen (Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, 1988), 149-150.

[20] Emecheta, *Second Class Citizen*, 168.

[21] Ibid.,146.

Nigeria has been ruled and administrated exclusively by men so far and they have failed to a large extent in terms of building socio-cultural and socio-economic stability and peace, Achebe urges a system change in nation-building that calls for the participation of the new Nigerian woman that is embodied by Beatrice in *Anthills of Savannah*. Achebe expresses how he feels about women's participation in African societies; he says:

> It's not enough for men to work out what women should do now. I think women should organize themselves to speak, from a real understanding of our situation and not just from a copying of European fashions, women's lib and things like that, but out of our own traditions to work out a new role for themselves. This is the challenge I throw both to the men and to the women, but particularly to the women.[22]

Beatrice Okoh is portrayed to have a strong character with a very determined and self-assured nature which enables her to take "a walloping honour's degree in English from London University."[23] She has a significant position in the government as the Senior Assistant Secretary in the Ministry of Finance and because she graduates from college with an honour's degree, Sam (the young dictator) expresses his admiration by saying that "Our Beatrice beat the English to their game."[24] In this respect, Beatrice becomes a different representation of an Igbo woman, who not only has a good job, but who is also capable of being at the top of the administration of her country. Beatrice reflects her self-righteous rebellion when she is constantly told that she cannot be too ambitious among her androcentric environment:

> I was determined from the very beginning to put my career first and, if need be, last. That every woman wants a man to complete her is a piece of male chauvinist bullshit I had completely rejected before I knew there was anything like Women's Lib. You often hear our people say: But that's something you picked up in England. Absolute rubbish! There was enough male chauvinism in my father's house to last me seven reincarnations![25]

One of the important features of Beatrice's representation as the new Igbo woman is her strong character that is demonstrated by her rebellious nature due to the oppression that she experienced from her own father in her childhood. Like Adah, she is oppressed by patriarchal realities both at

---

[22] Bernth Lindfors, ed. "An Interview with Chinua Achebe," in *Conversations with Chinua Achebe* (Jackson: UP of Mississippi, 1997), 150.
[23] Chinua Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah* (New York: Anchor, 1988), 57.
[24] Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah*, 68.
[25] Ibid., 81.

home and in the Igbo society. Beatrice specifically underlines her awareness of the existing male oppression and states that it is not something that she "picked up in England,"[26] but it has always been with her. When she remembers the bitter memories of her childhood, she questions the oppressive attitude of her father and the passive-aggressive nature of her mother. Her father is an abusive man who resorts to physical violence toward his wife and children while her mother sustains the violence at home by remaining silent and doing nothing to prevent it although she is oppressed physically and mentally by him, too. Beatrice's questioning of her physically and verbally abused childhood sheds light on the physical violence in families, while, at the same time, developing her character. However, unlike Adah, Beatrice manages to gain self-confidence via her education and career earlier than Adah does, since Beatrice has more options to achieve what she desires.

Ironically, Beatrice bears a name that is actually an indicator of the patriarchal code of her society and she has to face the feeling of inferiority regardless of her successful degree from London University or her high-esteemed position in her career. Nwanyibuife, Beatrice's baptism name, means "a female is also something,"[27] her birth was not a joyful event to celebrate for her mother since she had five daughters but not a single son. Beatrice expresses her mother's disappointment in her by stating "I didn't realize until much later that my mother bore me a huge grudge because I was a girl -her fifth in a row though one had died- and that when I was born she had so desperately prayed for a boy to give my father."[28] Since in the patriarchal Igbo community, giving birth to a son (preferably to sons) is a sign of respect and appreciation both from the family and society for a mother since she would guarantee the continuation of the family. In this case, Beatrice's mother resents having another baby girl who will not be capable of continuing the legacy of her family as she will eventually get married and move out of her family.

Due to her failed attempt of looking for affection and intimacy from her parents, Beatrice weaves a cocoon to isolate herself from the members of her family, and by doing this she actually grows up to be a distant woman who is quite skeptical and cynical of the people around her. In a way, she developed a defence mechanism that would prevent her from getting hurt by her loved ones. In this respect, she resembles Adah who is urged to learn how to be self-sufficient earlier in life so as not to be damaged and to move on with her life. By employing reason and

---

[26] Ibid., 81.
[27] Ibid., 79.
[28] Ibid., 79-80.

judgement when she has to cope with an issue, Beatrice is not portrayed as a stereotypically coy or naive woman who can be easily seduced by any man. On the contrary, she does not fall for any tricks or "sweet tongues" that her suitors might use to lure her as she is perfectly aware of her own beauty and qualifications. Furthermore, she objects to being a damsel-in-distress and refuses to wait for a man since she is quite confident about her strength as an individual. However, she does not lack emotional depth as Beatrice and Chris have an affectionate and quite an impassionate relationship. Even though Chris is a fugitive as he is given the death penalty and is being searched for by the government, Beatrice does not miss the chance to meet him despite the danger that she will probably be in, so she is quite brave for embracing an active role in their relationship. Beatrice is not a passive lover and decides to spend a night with Chris before he leaves the town. It is clear that she predicts she may not see Chris for a while, but still Beatrice is determined not to accept a weak role in a love affair that would reduce her to a simple fiction character in a love story:

> Why should she accept this role of a star-crossed lover in a cheap, sentimental movie waving frantically from the window of an express train at her young man at his window in another train hurtling away on opposite tracks into a different dark tunnel? And so she rebelled with a desperate resolve grounded on a powerful premonition that Chris and she had tonight come to a crossroads beyond which a new day would break, unpredictable, without precedent; a day whose market wares piled into the long basket on her head as she approached the gates of dawn would remain concealed to the very last moment.[29]

Beatrice states that she does not wait for anyone even any man to rescue her, and as Jago Morrison states, "with Beatrice, we are offered a woman who is the intellectual equal of male companions."[30] She does not fit into the description of a stereotypical female that is continually – falsely- represented as acting in accordance with her emotions and not her logic; on the contrary, Beatrice always employs her intellectual nature in making decisions and does not have idle dreams. In one of her conversations with Chris, Beatrice makes such a remark about the situation of Kangan: "Well, you fellows, all three of you, are incredibly conceited. The story of this country, as far as you are concerned, is the story of three of you."[31]

---

[29] Ibid., 181.
[30] Jago Morrison, *The Fiction of Chinua Achebe* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 150.
[31] Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah*, 60.

Beatrice means Sam, Chris, and Ikem and explicitly mocks their vanity as they are so self-centred and preoccupied with their own agenda. Also, as Carroll states, "their connectedness is asserted not through solidarity but through competition and resentment: this is the world in which their careers have developed."[32] The reason why she has the potential to influence and lead people is that she has "her modern self" and "prophetic self."[33]

Beatrice's reason is generally contrasted with the weakness of masculine male characters whose power is ostensibly effective and endless. She is associated with Idemili, the daughter of Almighty, who is sent "to bear witness to the moral nature of authority by wrapping around Power's rude waist a loincloth of peace and modesty."[34] Her endeavour, as Muoneke argues, to "wrap modesty around Sam's rampaging power" is the embodiment of her prophetic role which also could be illustrated when she warns Sam against his corruption and betrayal of his country for his own benefit.[35] As stated above, Beatrice is courageous enough to think that it is the women's turn to tell men what should be done to change the country for the better, so she is quite bold in her actions and thoughts, unlike Chris whom she finds to be too reasonable to speak openly about what he thinks. Beatrice is quite critical of the other male character's opinions, especially Ikem's, on the position of women in their society. She criticises the prevalent notion that the role and position of women should also be decided by males. She argues that women are seen as last resort when males fail to come up with any solutions. However, Ikem later admits Beatrice helps make him realize "the new role of women" and hands her a letter which will encourage Beatrice to take an active role as she leads the naming ceremony of Elewa's baby.[36]

Achebe portrays Beatrice as an individual who makes logical choices and realistic deductions in order to display her reasonable nature. As Simon Gikandi argues, "In his detailed representation of Beatrice, as both a narrator and character, Achebe also seeks to narrate a salvational perspective."[37] Beatrice, a woman of reason, functions as a mediator in the world of irrational men and women and becomes the sole survivor of the

---

[32] David Carroll, *Chinua Achebe: Novelist, Poet, Critic* (London: Macmillan, 1990), 170.
[33] Romanus Okey Muoneke, *Art, Rebellion and Redemption: A Reading of the Novels of Chinua Achebe* (New York: Peter Lang, 1993), 148.
[34] Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah*, 93.
[35] Muoneke, *Art Rebellion and Redemption*, 148.
[36] Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah,* 151.
[37] Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah,* 138.

narrators due to her practical insight and correct evaluation of the events. Upon the exercise of extreme authority in Sam's dictatorship, Beatrice grows restless and agitated since she is not sure about her security. When she witnesses Sam's reckless use of his authority, Beatrice realizes that they are all under a great threat. As Robin Ikegami states, Beatrice's "concerns are not based solely on egoistical interests, like Chris's and Ikem's initially are, but in the connections between people, the interconnectedness of all."[38] She successfully senses the growing threat concerning all three of them and warns Chris against this approaching danger. Hence Beatrice succeeds in leading and guiding people and she literally unites them safely under her roof unlike the male characters – or narrators – in *Anthills of the Savannah*. She becomes the symbol of change in her society while being a role-model for Elewa and Agatha who come from a lower social background than Beatrice. For instance, Beatrice stays calm and she comforts Elewa who learns that her boyfriend, Ikem, gets suspended and is being searched for by the government. Not yielding to depression or grief, Beatrice is aware that she should look after this girl since Elewa yearns for her sisterhood and compassion and Beatrice says "[m]y sister, make you no worry yourself. As we de alive so, na that one better pass all …"[39] It is clear that Beatrice sympathises with Elewa's concerns and problems rather than looking down on her emotions even though they have almost nothing in common.

Beatrice can transcend the barriers of her socio-cultural and socio-economical class; although she holds a degree in English, she speaks Pidgin English with Elewa but not in a condescending manner as it is obvious that Beatrice wants to show Elewa that she can understand what Elewa is going through and is ready to help her. The fact that Beatrice can connect with people from different backgrounds by embracing the differences between them enables her to be a surviving narrator at the end of *Anthills*. To illustrate, she can overcome the difference between her and Elewa since she is able to predict what is happening in their country "The future she saw unfolding so relentlessly before them would demand brutal courage, not squeamishness, from the likes of Elewa and herself, from now on."[40] After the sudden death of Ikem, Beatrice takes care of Elewa and although Beatrice is suspicious of her at first, Elewa proves herself to be a mature young woman, making Beatrice her role-model.

---

[38] Robin Ikegami, "Knowledge and Power, the Story and the Storyteller: Achebe's *Anthills of the Savannah*," in *Postcolonial Literatures: Achebe, Ngugi, Desai, Walcott*, eds. Michael Parker and Roger Starkey (London: Macmillan, 1995), 75.
[39] Achebe, *Anthills of the Savannah,* 138.
[40] Ibid., 157.

As Romanus O. Muoneke points out, Ikem was impeccably successful in carrying Beatrice to her leading role at the end.[41] Beatrice's wish to alter the traditions for the benefit of the future of women and their society could be best exemplified with the naming ceremony of Ikem and Elewa's daughter since it is unprecedented to have the ceremony initiated by a woman. As Muoneke argues, "In this ceremony the role of women is defined and given free expression," when "Beatrice performs the ritual role traditionally reserved for men, and does not subsume the role men play, [but] adds a new dimension, invigorating society with the strength, fortitude, endurance, and fruition of the Earth Mother."[42] Not only does Beatrice decline the new ruler's invitation to the state funeral that is arranged for Chris, but also undergoes a transforming role in her nature as she is the redeemer of Igbo society promising hope and improvement with the naming ceremony. The baby girl is named "Amaechina" meaning "May-the-path-never-close", which as Gagiano argues, is the most apparent symbol of the endeavour in the novel for a transformative society since the Nigerian society they dwell in is no longer conventional or rural but is modern and urban.[43] Still adhering to her Igbo roots, Beatrice chooses an Igbo name for her, yet the naming ceremony bears both the elements from Christianity, Islam, and pagan rituals of Igbo society, and the start of an unprecedented interpretation of already-existing rituals. Thus, Beatrice is the embodiment of the new woman, who will be capable of steering society to a hopeful course, and it is vital for them not to close this symbolic path so as to make drastic changes for the future of their daughters and sons. Morrison notes that "Achebe invents considerable importance in gender as an axis of positive political change."[44] On the significance of the name that Beatrice decides for the baby Achebe states:

> Amaechina is a real name and the implications of the "path", "May-the-path-never-close," is really that is only a boy who can keep the family homestead alive, and the path they are talking about is the path that leads to the family's compound. Girls don't count because they go out, they marry elsewhere. It is only the boy who stays in the compound. If there is no boy, then the compound closes. This is why if you find a family that is having difficulty having a male issue, but finally succeeds, they are likely to call him Amaechina: their hope of immortality hangs on this one person.[45]

---

[41] Muoneke, *Art, Rebellion and Redemption*, 151.
[42] Ibid., 152.
[43] Annie Gagiano, *Achebe, Head, Marachera: On Power and Change in Africa* (London: Lynne Rienner, 2000), 107.
[44] Morrison, *The Fiction of Chinua Achebe*, 157.
[45] Lindfors, *Conversations*, 147.

Achebe calls all women in postcolonial countries of Africa "to bring sanity to an insane world dominated by the masculine principle, to rebuild and heal the society devastated by male aggression and abuse of power."[46] The future which Achebe signals in *Anthills* is full of hope and endeavour for women to overcome the oppressive patriarchy since they will be capable of "reconciling the contrary forces and binary oppositions that define the postcolonial state"[47] Beatrice, who has formal higher education in the United Kingdom, is a representation of the modern and independent Nigerian woman who can reform the conventional traditions and become a leader in her society, the Igbo woman whose conventional roles and duties have been changed to fulfill the expectations of postcolonial Africa.

Emecheta and Achebe, both being Igbo writers, feel the necessity of defining the modern Igbo woman's role and status in the Igbo society after the independence of Nigeria. Accordingly, the female protagonists in *Second* and *Anthills* assert themselves as individuals in the patriarchal order of Igbo society; both Adah and Beatrice have to struggle against oppression and discrimination in similar ways although their educational backgrounds, jobs, marital status and socio-political roles in society differ in many ways. Adah reflects the traits and qualities of the new Igbo woman who is confident and determined enough to make use of the opportunities that colonialism brought to Nigeria in order to become an independent, intellectual, and a fully-realised woman while not yielding to the old fashioned traditions of her identity which would not be in her favour. However, Emecheta does not eliminate all the elements of her African (specifically Igbo) identity and culture in defining the new role of the modern Nigerian woman; on the contrary, she celebrates and emphasizes some of them which can be of use in her development and gaining of integrity. Adah fulfils her dream to be a writer while she does not give up all the constituents of her Igbo identity. Likewise, Beatrice in *Anthills* is a sophisticated woman with a high-profile career who has also the ability to preserve the cultural, traditional and religious characteristics of her Igbo identity as manifested in the naming ceremony. While Beatrice can be a hopeful symbol of the new Igbo woman as a survivor at the end of the novel, Adah can be one of the first representations of a modern and diasporic African woman who is able to overcome many problems in life and succeed in the end.[48]

---

[46] Muoneke, *Art, Rebellion and Redemption,* 152.

[47] Gikandi, *Reading Chinua Achebe*, 147.

[48] This chapter is a modified version of my master's thesis submitted to Hacettepe University, Ankara in 2016, entitled "Changing Representations of African

References

Achebe, Chinua. *Anthills of the Savannah*. New York: Anchor, 1988.

Allan, Tuzyline Jita. "The Joys of Motherhood: A Study of a Problematic Womanist Aesthetic." In *Womanist and Feminist Aesthetics: A Comparative Review*, 95-117. Ohio UP, Athens, 1995.

Carroll. David. *Chinua Achebe: Novelist, Poet, Critic*. London: Macmillan, 1990.

Dennis, Carolyne. "Women and State in Nigeria: the Case of Military Government 1984-85." In *Women, State and Ideology: Studies from Africa and Asia*, edited by Halef Afsha, 13-28. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987.

Emecheta, Buchi. *Second Class Citizen*. New York: George Braziller, 1975.

Gagiano, Annie. *Achebe, Head, Marechera: On Power and Change in Africa*. London: Lynne Rienner, 2000.

Gikandi, Simon. *Reading Chinua Achebe: Language& Ideology in Fiction*. London: J.Currey, 1991.

Gordon, April L. "Women, and Development." In *Understanding Contemporary Africa*, edited by April L. Gordon and Donald L. Gordon, 249-272. Colorado: Lynne Reinner, 1996.

Ikegami, Robin. "Knowledge and Power, the Story and the Storyteller: Achebe's Anthills of the Savannah." *Postcolonial Literatures: Achebe, Ngugi, Desai, Walcott*, edited by Michael Parker and Roger Starkey, 65-81. London: Macmillan, 1995.

Lindfors, Bernth, ed. *Conversations with Chinua Achebe*. Jackson: UP of Mississippi, 1997.

McLeod, John. *Beginning Postcolonialism*. Manchester: Manchester UP, 2000.

Morrison, Jago. *The Fiction of Chinua Achebe*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.

Muoneke, Romanus Okey. *Art, Rebellion, and Redemption: A Reading of the Novels of Chinua Achebe.* New York: Peter Lang, 1993.

Ngcobo, Lauretta. "African Motherhood-Myth and Reality." In *Criticism and Ideology: Second African Writers' Conference Stockholm 1986*, edited by Kirsten Holst Petersen, 142-154. Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, 1988.

Women in Buchi Emecheta's *Second Class Citizen* And Chinua Achebe's *Things Fall Apart* and *Anthills of the Savannah".*

Umeh, Marie, ed. *Emerging Perspectives on Buchi Emecheta*. Trenton: Africa World, 1996.

CHAPTER THIRTEEN

THE BATTLE OF EROS AND THANATOS IN *THE SENSE OF AN ENDING* BY JULIAN BARNES

M. MIRAC CEYLAN

The Sense of an Ending is the Man Booker Prize-winning novel of 2011 by Julian Barnes. The novel is about love, a new concept of history with an original definition by Barnes, time's relation to memory, the deceptive nature of man's memory, and constructions of appearances. *The Sense of an Ending* also depicts an old man's contemplations on life, how the sense of an ending in life is felt concerning the life instinct and the death instinct. In this sense, it stands as a rich source for literary criticism. The novel presents us two contradictory characters in the representations of Eros and Thanatos: Tony Webster, the adult narrator, and Adrian Finn, his friend from high school. Tony is afraid of the idea of death, while Adrian willingly faces it by committing suicide. Throughout his life, Tony tries to avoid the concept of death. However, Tony's life does not gain importance or meaning even though he chooses to live. In the end, Tony finds himself powerless to re-shape his own life that inevitably becomes a trivial one. Furthermore, Tony's and Adrian's literary interests contribute to the interpretation of the performance of life and death instincts in their lives.

Sigmund Freud, as a groundbreaking neurologist of the twentieth century, was the founder of Psychoanalysis. His studies on consciousness, unconscious, dreams, sexuality, and violence play a significant role in modern psychology. His inspiring and foundational ideas are still discussed and used as a guide for understanding human psychology. In *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, Freud introduced the instincts of life and death. He points out that from the beginning of our lives, we have these two opposing instincts within us which are in constant battle. As we have an urge to live our lives, we also have an urge to bring destruction to them. The essence of Freud's two opposing instincts of life and death comes

from physiology.[1] Freud was inspired by the German physiologist E. Hering's theory on two contradictory substances "operating in contrary directions, one constructive or assimilatory and the other destructive or dissimilatory."[2] Although Freud did not use the name Thanatos for the description of the death instinct, the name refers to the Greek god of death. With this theory, Freud states that living organisms preserve their instinct to live and defeat their instinct to die by uniting with each other.[3] Therefore, for human beings, sexual intercourse is one of the main ways to keep Eros superior to Thanatos. Freud explains this by saying: "We might suppose that the life instincts or sexual instincts which are active in each cell take the other cells as their object, that they partly neutralize the death instincts […] and thus preserve their lives."[4] By the overflowing of libido to the love object, the life instinct dominates the death instinct.

According to Freud, everything in life is centered on pleasure and pain relations[5] and "people are motivated to approach pleasure and avoid pain."[6] For Freud, human beings naturally run away from pain. In *Civilization and its Discontent*, Freud emphasizes that "the only purpose in life is to seek pleasure."[7] In this sense, pleasure is equal to Eros and pain is to Thanatos; human beings always try to avoid, or ignore, Thanatos and want to embrace Eros. In *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, Freud explains how the instincts work:

> For a long time, perhaps, living substance was thus being constantly created afresh and easily dying, till decisive external influences altered in such a way as to oblige the still surviving substance to diverge ever more widely from its original course of life and to make ever more complicated *detours* before reaching its aim of death. These circuitous paths to death, faithfully kept to by the conservative instincts, would thus present us to-day with the picture of the phenomena of life.[8]

---

[1] Sigmund Freud, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Group Psychology and Other Works* (London: Vintage, 2001), 49.

[2] Ibid., 49.

[3] Ibid., 50.

[4] Ibid., 50.

[5] Sigmund Freud, *Civilization and its Discontent* (England: Penguin Books, 2002), 6.

[6] Tory Higgins, "Beyond Pleasure and Pain," *American Psychological Association* 52, no. 12 (1997): 1280. DOI: 10.1037//0003-066X.52.12.1280.

[7] Daniel Cho, "Thanatos and Civilization: Lacan, Marcuse, and the Death Drive," *Policy Futures in Education* 4, no. 1 (2006): 20. DOI: 10.2304/pfie.2006.4.1.18.

[8] Freud, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Group Psychology and Other Works,* 38.

The only aim of the living substances is to reach death, which is a point that all paths in life end up at. Freud uses the term "cathecting" to refer to the overflowing of libido to a love object. Here, Eros, or the life instinct, achieves the process of cathecting against the death instinct to preserve itself. In "Being in Love and Hypnosis," Freud analyzes the position of ego in love. The ego in love treats the loved object as if it is his ego.[9] In other words, "…when we are in love a considerable amount of narcissistic libido overflows on to the object."[10] Step by step, the object of love becomes "sublime and precious"[11] as the ego in love decreases in value. As a result, the object of love consumes the ego, and self-sacrifice begins.[12] The ego is at a stage where the individual can perform self-sacrifice and unable to see any flaw in the loved object.

The Sense of an Ending is divided into two chapters. The first chapter is dedicated to the memories of Tony Webster, who is now a retired history professor, leading a very ordinary life. The second chapter is dedicated to the contemplations of Tony Webster on what he has told in the first chapter. In this sense, the novel does not have a conventional beginning, middle, and end. The first chapter is narrated by the present consciousness of Tony Webster, who is now in his 60's, and the story he tells has been evoked by a letter from Sarah Ford, the mother of his high school lover Veronica, in which Mrs. Ford writes that she leaves to Tony the diary of Adrian and £500 with it. As Tony receives the letter, all of a sudden, Tony's mind becomes full of question marks. The old narrator, Tony, stresses the fact that what he tells is his "reading now of what happened then"[13] of his high-school memories. Therefore, his standpoint as a narrator falls into questionable and unreliable ground. In Tony's memory, high school years were long forgotten and not very clear. Yet, in the first part, he introduces us to his classmates, especially Adrian. Adrian was a proper and a promising student from his class who was fond of Camus and Nietzsche, while Tony read Orwell and Huxley.

Tony had a girlfriend called Veronica. Their love affair can be classified as an unconventional one since they had sexual intercourse after they broke up. One weekend, Tony visits Veronica's parents in their house and stays there for a few days. There he meets with Sarah Ford who warns Tony about Veronica saying: "Don't let Veronica get away with you too

---

[9] Ibid., p. 112.

[10] Ibid., p. 112.

[11] Ibid., p. 113.

[12] Ibid., p. 113.

[13] Julian Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending* (London: Vintage Books, 2012), 41.

much."[14] Hearing this, Tony does not know what to do, but in his memory, he preserves some scenes about Sarah Ford since, at the very beginning of the novel, there are some events remembered and listed in "no particular order"[15] including Mrs. Sarah Ford. Even at the end, Sarah Ford's uncanny role in the formation of Tony's narration does not clarify all the events about Mrs. Ford. After some time, Tony gets a letter from Adrian asking Tony's permission to date with Veronica. Tony writes a letter back in which he condemns and curses both Veronica and Adrian and mentions the warning he got from Mrs. Ford about Veronica. Afterwards, Tony forgets about the content of the letter and how harshly he wrote back. He leaves England for a long time, and when he comes back, he learns that Adrian has killed himself. Right after Tony is informed about the suicide of Adrian, what Tony thinks is whether his father's baldness is inherited or not. Tony experiences Thanatos through the death of his friend, and his Eros—expressed through his choice to live—pushes him to think about his appearance in his old age. He consciously tries to repress his Thanatos, fearing to face it firsthand. As the plot unfolds, Tony learns that Adrian got Mrs. Ford pregnant and, as a result, committed suicide.

Freud believes that one can preserve his life instinct by transmitting the self-destructiveness to others, which inevitably results in violence.[16] Life and death instincts work through binary oppositions. Violence becomes the mouthpiece of Eros, struggling to beat Thanatos. When Tony writes the response about Adrian and Veronica's relationship, from the violent language he uses, it is obvious that his Eros and Thanatos are in a battle. The letter's impact on Tony helps his death instinct to rule over his body. The performance of Thanatos involves the use of violence.

This love affair, which ends in despair for Tony, damages him. For Tony, "we all suffer damage, one way or another."[17] Yet, the important part of damage in life is about "how we react to the damage, whether we admit it or repress it."[18] Tony believes that some people admit their damages and keep on living, while some others repress them and live their lives, trying to help other damaged people and to avoid any other damages that may come. Tony warns us about the latter which is the case he experiences when he gets old: Tony works at the library of a hospital, helping sick and dying people. The reason why Tony is damaged is not

---

[14] Ibid., 28.

[15] Ibid., 3.

[16] Ryan D. Miller, *Thanatos-Eros, Being non-Being: A Psychoanalytic-Existential Connection* (Master's thesis, University of Nebraska, 1999), 21.

[17] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 44.

[18] Ibid., 44.

only about having been cheated. He is damaged because Adrian's suicide reminds him of the presence of Thanatos within human beings.

In the letter he leaves behind, Adrian says that "life is a gift bestowed without anyone asking for it […] and everyone has the right to renounce the gift no one asks for."[19] Tony has never dared to renounce that gift as Adrian did. Therefore, when Tony's mother says to him that "you're a clever boy but not so clever as to do anything like that,"[20] after informing Tony about the suicide of Adrian, her statement can be rephrased as: you're not a coward but not so fearless as you'd do anything like that. When Tony meets with Margaret (his wife after Veronica), he excludes Veronica from his life story because his story with Veronica includes Adrian's suicide, Thanatos in life. Therefore, Adrian becomes the symbol of *memento mori* for Tony, reminding him of the fact that death is inevitable and it will come for him one day. *The Sense of an Ending* is a good example of how people are aroused, disturbed, or shaken by the long-forgotten or misremembered memories. Tony does not deny death; rather, he shows an escapist attitude towards it. In Tony's terms, living is "the unworthy passivity of merely letting life happen to you."[21] The relationship between Eros and Thanatos, or Tony and Adrian, is built on "action versus passivity;"[22] Thanatos represents action, while Eros, in the sense that Tony performs, represents passivity.

For Barnes, "death is the one appalling fact which defines life,"[23] but without the concept of death, life would lack its very meaning. The title of the novel is taken from Frank Kermode's book on fiction *The Sense of an Ending*, which was published in 1967. According to Kermode, for a narrative to gain meaning, it should carry a promise to reach to an end at some point.[24] While reading a story, we attribute meaning to it because we know that it will end. Therefore, the meaning is caused by the sense of an ending. Similarly, in *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, Freud admits that he agrees with Schopenhauer's idea: "Death is the true result and to that extent the purpose of life."[25] When one knows that death is imminent, the present moment becomes more important. By postponing the idea of his sense of an ending, Tony drains the meaning out of his life. His narrative

---

[19] Ibid., 48.

[20] Ibid., 47.

[21] Ibid., 50.

[22] Ibid., 51

[23] Julian Barnes, *Death* (UK: Vintage, 2017), 36.

[24] Frank Kermode, *The Sense of an Ending* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 7.

[25] Freud, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Group Psychology and Other Works,* 50.

becomes a very ordinary one whose hero is "neither victorious nor defeated,"[26] whereas Adrian embraces life by experiencing the very end of it. His life story gained importance because the sense of an ending was not avoided. This may be the reason why Mrs. Ford writes that "the last months of his life were happy"[27] for Adrian. Tony envies Adrian not because of his death but because of "the clarity of his life."[28] That is, Tony believes that the more you live, the more you spoil the clarity of your life. As a result, your life story becomes a more confusing one. For Barnes, "life is full of pain and suffering and fear, whereas death frees us from all this."[29] By committing suicide, Adrian sets his life free of all the miseries, whereas Tony keeps carrying them all. A year on from the suicide of Adrian, Tony contemplates on the death of his friend:

> Perhaps the lack of mystery about his death meant that his case was more easily closed. We would remember him all our lives, of course. But his death was exemplary rather than 'tragic'—as the Cambridge newspaper had routinely insisted—and so he retreated from us rather quickly, slotted into time and history.[30]

Both the life and the death of Adrian are described as clear and active by Tony. Yet, his nature never allows him to act in such a way. He is aware of the fact that "he survived to tell the tale."[31] As a result, Tony's identity declines in value while Adrian's flourishes. He is the one who does not and will not understand the things around, as Veronica keeps telling him.

In his famous memoir called *Levels of Life*, Barnes holds up a mirror to his own story of losing his wife and the question of suicide that inevitably comes to the surface: "The question of suicide arrives early, and quite logically...if I cannot live without her, if my life is reduced to mere passive continuance, I shall become active."[32] Similarly, Tony also thinks that living life in the way he does is a passive mode of living in which he lets life happen to him. In this sense, Tony's case can be taken as the embodiment of Hamlet's famous monologue:

---

[26] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 56.

[27] Ibid., 65.

[28] Ibid., 104.

[29] Julian Barnes, *Nothing to be Frightened of* (Canada: Random House, 2008), 193.

[30] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 54.

[31] Ibid., 56.

[32] Julian Barnes, *The Levels of Life* (London: Vintage, 2014), 80.

> Whether 'tis nobler in the mind to suffer
> The slings and arrows of outrageous fortune
> Or to take arms against a sea of troubles
> And by opposing end them[33]

If death resembles sleep, Tony is afraid of the dreams he will witness. Tony does not try to oppose the "whips and scorns of the time"[34] because opposing them would inevitably bring a sense of an ending. Tony's will is puzzled. His passivity stems from the fear of facing the unknown dream. As a result, Tony is supposed to withstand the hardships of living. In the end, he is the one who is shaped, held, and moulded by time. Adrian, on the other hand, gives shape to his life; he holds the ropes of time in his hands and shows an active form of living through the full embracement of the death instinct.

There is the question of accumulation raised by Adrian in his diary. Adrian forms a link between mathematics and the accumulations in life: the plus and the minus events. Human beings accumulate memories as they keep living. However, the process of accumulation differs in both characters. Adrian "took charge of his own life, he took command of it, he took it in his hands…"[35] After reading a part of Adrian's diary, Tony starts questioning his way of accumulation in life—whether it has many additions, subtractions, or multiplications—and a feeling of unrest takes over his mind. It is as if the sense of his ending leads Tony to re-evaluate his life, his accumulations, and his actions. The moments when Tony is faced with Thanatos are the moments when all his life is situated on a wobbling bridge, an image that can perfectly serve as a metaphor for life. Life is what happens between two points, which are generally called birth and death, or Eros and Thanatos. This bridge for Tony is occupied with unrest in the present time of the narrator, and, as a result, is shaky.

In *Nothing to be Frightened of*, Barnes elaborates on the importance of memory in the formation of one's own identity:

> Memory is identity. I have believed this since— oh, since I can remember. You are what you remember. You are what you have done; what you have done is in your memory; what you remember defines who you are; when you forget your life you cease to be, even before your death."[36]

---

[33] William Shakespeare, *The Complete Works of William Shakespeare* (Kent: Wordsworth Editions, 1999), 688.

[34] Ibid., 688.

[35] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 88.

[36] Barnes, *Nothing to be Frightened of,* 140.

Tony excludes Veronica and Adrian from his memory because he is disturbed by the presence of Thanatos. Therefore, his memory and identity are formed accordingly. By forgetting about Veronica and Adrian, Tony ceases to be the real Tony. Figuratively, he experiences his intellectual death before his physical death. Before Mrs. Ford's letter, Tony is the retired historian who has an ex-wife called Margaret and a daughter called Susan. With the coming of the letter, his memory is evoked, and, as a result, his identity is expanded. "To die when something new is born— even if that something new is our very own self?"[37] The letter from Mrs. Ford is a turning point in Tony's life. It is the moment when the old Tony dies and the new Tony, whose mind is completely ruled by unrest, is born. Tony portrays his odd situation: "So when this strange thing happened— when these new memories suddenly came upon me—it was as if, for that moment, the time had been placed in reverse. As if, for that moment, the river ran upstream."[38]

Tony's love for Veronica at his young age, as well as the love he had for Margaret (his ex-wife), does not include the Freudian understanding of love elements. From what he narrates, the overflowing of narcissistic libido into the loved object is not seen in his love affairs. Tony's narration of his high school memories does not depict Veronica as a precious and a sublime being. Moreover, Tony's ego does not diminish in value, which, for Freud, is what happens to ego during the process of loving someone. There is no self-sacrifice made for love by Tony. Tony appears as an outsider in his own life. He never comes to a point where he, out of love, happens to define his ego through the ego of the loved person. This full attachment never occurs in his life. Instead, he always stands outside the egos and identities, even his own. Tony comes to a point where he asks Veronica: "Do you think I was in love with you back then?''[39] Tony asks this question because his life is situated on shaky ground, and asking such a question proves that he is not actually in love with Veronica. In his youth, Veronica only serves as the satisfier of Tony's libidinal desires. On the other hand, the case is not very different for Veronica's love for Tony. In the end, both characters have different intentions about each other, and the Freudian understanding of love has nothing to do with it.

Adrian is a keen reader of Albert Camus and Friedrich Nietzsche. Thus Camus plays a significant role in the novel. The narrator repeats the same quote as Camus: "Suicide was the only true philosophical question."[40] In

---

[37] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 105.
[38] Ibid., 122.
[39] Ibid., 106.
[40] Ibid., 13.

The Myth of Sisyphus, the statement continues as: "judging whether life is or is not worth living amounts to answering the fundamental question of philosophy."[41] Camus defines suicide as the only true philosophical question, pointing out that many people commit suicide because they find life not worthy to live, and he concludes that "the meaning of life is the most urgent question."[42] For Nietzsche, "…death is opposed to life. The living is merely a type of what is dead, and a very rare type."[43] Nietzsche also indicates the presence of conflicting instincts, and he identifies the living as a being who is already dead. When Robson, a boy from Tony's class, commits suicide because he has got his girlfriend pregnant, Adrian relates this event to Eros and Thanatos. He says "Thanatos wins again,"[44] knowing that Eros and Thanatos are always in a battle within us. Although these two instincts are in a constant fight, there is no doubt that every life will experience an end, either provoked by the person himself or by natural causes. Therefore, to avoid the idea of the sense of an ending in life becomes meaningless and childish. Adrian is aware of Freud's concept of life and death instincts. When Adrian, similarly, gets Mrs. Ford pregnant and, as a result, commits suicide, Thanatos wins again. The representation of the battle of Eros and Thanatos is repeated in the novel. For the cases of Adrian and Robson, the coming of an offspring— caused by their Eros— strengthens their Thanatos. It can be proof about how Eros and Thanatos work in binary oppositions. In *Le Suicide*, Durkheim elaborates on the moments when suicide rates reach their peak.[45] He observes that "…the hours and the days of the week when greatest social activity took place were also those when suicide rates peaked."[46] Therefore, there is an uncanny relationship between Eros and Thanatos. Durkheim demonstrates how the activities that would normally manifest the life instinct for some people can cause the death instinct to gain power in some others, which proves the binary opposition between them. While some people enjoy the gift bestowed on them, others strongly reject it. Adrian's case illustrates Camus's observation that committing suicide is the renunciation of a meaningless life.

---

[41] Albert Camus, *The Myth of Sisyphus* (New York: Vintage Books, 1991), 8.

[42] Ibid., 8.

[43] Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Gay Science* (UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 110.

[44] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 13.

[45] Roisin Heely, "Suicide in Early Modern and Modern Europe," *The Historical Journal* 49*,* no. 3 (2006): 906, https://www.jstor.org/stable/4091587.

[46] Ibid., 906.

On the other hand, Tony is a reader of Orwell and Huxley. These two writers are well known for their dystopic novels. While Adrian reads about philosophy, Tony reads dystopic novels foreshadowing the future world and warning those who will keep on living. Throughout the novel, Tony repeats this statement: "I have an instinct for survival,"[47] which is defined as "cowardice" by Veronica. For Veronica, Tony's life instinct stems from the fear of death. If one, like Tony, is fond of reading dystopic novels, this means that he is either curious about or afraid of what will befall upon him in the future. Tony's survival instinct leads him to read about future scenarios so that he could take precautions or feed his curiosity about what will happen in the future.

After all these significant events have turned Tony's life upside down, Tony gains a new awareness:

> But time…how time first grounds us and then confounds us. We thought we were being mature when we were only being safe. We imagined we were being responsible but were only being cowardly. What we called realism turned out to be a way of avoiding things rather than facing them. Time… give us enough time and our best-supported decisions will seem wobbly, our certainties whimsical.[48]

He realizes that avoiding the idea of death is a lie and running away from this idea shakes the bridge of life. "You get towards the end of life—no not life itself, but of something else: the end of any likelihood of change in that life. You are allowed a long moment of pause, time enough to ask the question: what else have I done wrong?"[49] In the end, Tony is unable to identify and explain his sense of an ending. He knows that something is about to end, but he is hesitant to name it. He contemplates the possibility of his misunderstanding of other things besides the relationship between Veronica and Adrian, which causes his unrest.

"We are alive and are going to die, all at once or one at a time."[50] In the end, Tony figures out that by forming an artificial identity and memory, he has turned his life story into a trivial one. The fact that he helps sick and dying people proves that Tony is damaged by Thanatos. He is the type of person who represses his damages instead of admitting them. The moment he reads what he wrote as a reply to the relationship of Adrian and Veronica can be classified as a moment of a reversed epiphany

---

[47] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 42.
[48] Ibid., 93.
[49] Ibid., 149.
[50] Kermode, *The Sense of an Ending*, 95.

in which he does not experience a spiritual manifestation but rather a materialistic downfall. His metaphor of a river running upstream can be the depiction of this reversed epiphany. For Kermode, time is made up of ticks and tocks. Each tick represents life, while each tock represents death.[51] By repressing Thanatos, Tony tries to hear only the ticks of the time, while Adrian always hears both of them. At an age when the tick-tocks of time become more audible, he realizes that the Tony he knows is not the real one.

According to Erich Auerbach, "we try to give some kind of order and design to the past, the present and the future."[52] This is what Tony tries to do when he says: "…this is my reading now of what happened then."[53] The adult Tony realizes that his narration of life has huge gaps which make it incomplete and unfulfilled. "What we forget, however, is that all those beginnings, middles and ends are fictions; life can be re-written with thousands of different versions, which will not arrive anywhere."[54] By forgetting about his past, Tony tries to give an order and a design to his present and future. However, all his attempts fail with the emergence of Mrs. Ford's letter. While Tony tries to define all his life under the presence of Eros, Thanatos inevitably comes to the surface, which at the end fills Tony's life with unrest: "There is accumulation. There is responsibility. And beyond these, there is unrest. There is great unrest."[55] His seeking of pleasure eventually ends in great pain. At a very late point in his life, Tony realizes that he has accumulated more losses than winnings. Tony defines himself as an "old fool"[56] who suffers loneliness and who carries the burden of being reminded of the things he has long-forgotten. By putting off confronting himself with the sense of an ending, he does not evolve into a more mature human being who is full of life, but he falls into a miserable condition which he is too old to get rid of.

---

[51] Ibid., 45.

[52] Erich Auerbach, *Mimesis* (US: Princeton University Press, 1953), quoted in Frank Kermode, *The Sense of an Ending* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1965), 93.

[53] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 41.

[54] Zekiye Antakyalıoğlu, "*The Sense of an Ending*: Frank Kermode and Julian Barnes," in *English Studies: New Perspectives*, ed. Mehmet Ali Çelikel and Baysar Tanıyan (UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015), 330.

[55] Barnes, *The Sense of an Ending*, 150.

[56] Ibid., 131.

References

Antakyalıoğlu, Zekiye. "*The Sense of an Ending*: Frank Kermode and Julian Barnes." In *English Studies: New Perspectives*, edited by Mehmet Ali Çelikel and Baysar Tanıyan, 327-335. UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015.

Auerbach, Erich. *Mimesis*. US: Princeton University Press, 1953.

Barnes, Julian. *Nothing to be Frightened of*. Canada: Random House, 2008.

Barnes, Julian. *The Sense of an Ending*. London: Vintage Books, 2012.

Barnes, Julian. *The Levels of Life*. London: Vintage, 2014.

Barnes, Julian. *Death*. London: Vintage Books, 2017.

Camus, Albert. *The Myth of Sisyphus*. New York: Vintage Books, 1991.

Cho, Daniel. "Thanatos and Civilization: Lacan, Marcuse, and the Death Drive." *Policy Futures in Education* 4*, no.* 1 (2006): 18-30. DOI: 10.2304/pfie.2006.4.1.18.

Freud, Sigmund. *Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Group Psychology and Other Works*. London: Vintage, 2001.

Freud, Sigmund. *Civilization and Its Discontent*. England: Penguin Books, 2002.

Healy, Róisín. "Suicide in Early Modern and Modern Europe." *The Historical Journal* 49, no*.* 3 (2006): 903-919. https://www.jstor.org/stable/4091587.

Higgins, E. Tory. "Beyond Pleasure and Pain." *American Psychological Association* 52, no. 12 (1997): 1280-1300. DOI: 10.1037//0003-066X.52.12.1280.

Kermode, Frank. *The Sense of an Ending*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Miller, Ryan D. "Thanatos-Eros, Being non-being: A Psychoanalytic-Existential Connection." M.A. Thesis, University of Nebraska, 1999.

Nietzsche, Friedrich. *The Gay Science*. UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

Shakespeare, William. *The Complete Works of William Shakespeare*. Kent: Wordsworth Editions, 1999.

CHAPTER FOURTEEN

EVER AFTER:
A NEO-VICTORIAN RETROSPECTION

ELA İPEK GÜNDÜZ

Contemporary postmodern novels that are inspired by history as the representation of a collective past are mostly rewritings of certain periods, issues, concerns, and figures. In these novels, there exists a two-dimensional timeline of the past: remembering and representing it via a contemporary perspective and the commented fragmented version of the past. In other words, "the presentness of the past"[1] is inserted into the novel. Like historical texts, these new historical novels claim to carry truth only as a "discourse, human construct, signifying system."[2] The truth about the past is always already commented on. These novels emphasise the artificiality of the historical texts and the inevitable textuality of reality. As a sub-branch of these new historical novels in contemporary times, Neo-Victorian novels that are interested in Victorian notions have emerged. For Louisa Hadley, the Neo-victorian novel is a "contemporary fiction that engages with the Victorian era, at either the level of plot, structure, or both."[3] Graham Swift's novel *Ever After* (1992) as a historically self-conscious novel that parallelises the Victorian and the contemporary times is a Neo-Victorian novel. The Victorian voice of Matthew Pearce in his diary and Bill Unwin's present voice commenting on the Victorian issues pave the way to "a dual plot structure which depicts [a] twentieth-century academic engaging with the textual remains of the fictional Victorians."[4]

---

[1] Elisabeth Wesseling, *Writing History as a Prophet: Postmodernist Innovations of the Historical Novel* (Amsterdam: John Benjamin's Publishing Company, 1991), 11.

[2] Linda Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction* (London & New York: Routledge, 1988), 93.

[3] Lousia Hadley, ed., *Neo-Victorian and Historical Narrative: The Victorians and Us* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 4.

[4] Ibid., 4.

While carrying these reminiscences of the past, Swift deploys an enigmatic narrative style within which the notions of life, death, suicide, and love turn out to be the themes that are paralleled via the Victorian core of the novel that unveils the existential dilemma of the contemporary narrator.

Why Neo-Victorian novels specifically focus on Victorian times is a crucial point to analyse. For Richard Bradford, "the very notion of Britishness was a creation of the nineteenth century […]. Late twentieth and early twenty-first-century novelists tend to treat the nineteenth century as a shibboleth."[5] The wide range of topics of the Victorian times and the way that contemporary authors deal with them turn the Neo-Victorian genre into a prolific entity. As Kate Mitchell asserts:

> Neo-Victorian fiction prompts authors, readers and critics to confront the problem of historical recollection. These novels grapple with the issue of how to package the Victorian past for the tastes and demands of contemporary readers, how to make 'retro' accessible […].[6]

While representing the relation of the Victorian past to the present, the contemporary urge to depict certain notions of that specific era and how these issues are presented are the outstanding characteristics of Neo-Victorian novels. To some extent, the contemporary world has some parallelisms with the Victorian era. Gary Day asserts that "what we understand as modernity and postmodernity can simply be seen as different facets of Victorianism."[7] Victorian notions and problems continue to exist in different ways and that is why contemporary writers focus specifically on the Victorian period. For Matthew Sweet, "Victorian culture was as rich and difficult and complex and pleasurable as our own; that the Victorians shaped our lives and sensibilities in countless unacknowledged ways; that they are still with us, walking our pavements, drinking in our bars, living in our houses, reading our newspapers, inhabiting our bodies."[8] Neo-Victorian inclination focuses on the parallelisms and differences between these two different epochs.

As the products of the postmodern mentality, Neo-Victorian novels emphasise the specific ways in remembering the past through a variety of

---

[5] Richard Bradford, ed., *The Novel Now* (UK: Blackwell, 2007), 93.
[6] Kate Mitchell, *History and Cultural Memory in Neo-Victorian Fiction Victorian Afterimages* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 3.
[7] Gary Day, ed., *The Varieties of Victorianism: The Uses of the Past* (New York: Palgrave, 1998), 2.
[8] Matthew Sweet, *Inventing the Victorians* (London: Faber and Faber, 2001), xxiii.

possible meanings. In a way, these attempts are maintained to make sense of the present. The Neo-Victorian novel regenerates certain aspects of the Victorian world, such as science, the crisis of religious faith, palaeontology, and Darwinian theory, from a present-day perspective. As Marie L. Kohlke has asserted that "the neo-Victorian ... repeatedly raise[s] important questions of social justice and may yet prove instrumental in interrogating, perhaps even changing, current attitudes and influencing historical consciousness in the future."[9] These novels are aware of the fact that the past is gone, but they want to re-establish this specific era in which certain painful instances took place. In *Ever After*, Graham Swift focuses on the Victorian as a specific historical site through which a general perception would be inserted into the personal past. *Ever After*

> [as] […] the living palimpsest […] throws disturbing light on the past and the present, and on the history that connects them. There is thus always a poignant sense of loss in Swift's complex retrospect, yet whether they go so far as to project a bleakly pessimistic vision of a postmodern world that has lost confidence in its own future, is open to question.[10]

Swift draws an analogy between the Victorian past and the present by focusing on the science/ religion dichotomy of the Victorian past that turns out to be the existential questioning of modern times. From this perspective, it can be said that there is a sense of longing for the past deeds of the original outbursts of the individuals who lived at those times. Thus, larger-scale Victorian notions—such as Darwinism—that affect the lives of human beings become the backdrop of the novel. The Victorian and contemporary protagonists occupy the leading position in the story. By presenting the Victorian via a male figure who has the dispute of science and religion in his mind as a result of the death of his little son, Swift positions this Victorian story as the epitome of his novel through which the modern narrator tries to find a point of reconciliation about death in his own life.

In his novel *Ever After*, Graham Swift uses the process of the passage of time by focusing on the personal issues of the characters. The difference

---

[9] Marie- Luise Kohlke, "Introduction: Speculations in and on the Neo-Victorian Encounter," *Neo-Victorian Studies* 1, no.1 (Autumn 2018): 10.
[10] John Rignall, "From Picturesque to Palimpsest: Landscape and History in the Fiction of Walter Scott and Graham Swift," in *Victorian Turns, Neo-Victorian Returns: Essays on Fiction and Culture,* ed. Penny Gay, Judith Johnston, and Catherine Waters (UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2008), 155.

of his narrative stems from the fact that while tracing the memory lines of the protagonists, he also deciphers both the personal and the public past.

> Graham Swift explores difficult relationships between parents and child, between private and public histories, between past and present, as his memory-lines loop and coil, and as his characters find symbols through which to communicate in their streams of consciousness both the unsaid and the unsayable. Over all, though, towers Swift's interest in his characters' confessions, his concern for chronicling their moments of recognition, and his deep commitment to viewing them within the historical ties linking past and present.[11]

Graham Swift's interest in deciphering personal conflicts via drawing an analogy between the narrator's experiences and a Victorian ancestor's experiences exemplifies how Neo-Victorian interest nourishes itself. There are some parallel problems between these two protagonists. After inheriting a clock as a wedding gift, Bill Unwin, the contemporary narrator, begins researching his Victorian ancestor, Matthew Pearce, whose journals are textualized reminiscences of the past. In the years between 1854 and 1860, with the death of his son Felix, Matthew begins questioning religion. Especially after becoming familiar with some developments in geology and being acquainted with Darwinian evolutionary theory, his life changes. That is one aspect of Bill's being attracted to Matthew's manuscripts. Another aspect is that Bill wants to return to his academic career and Matthew's manuscripts may be a good source for reaching his goals.

After his wife's death, Bill wants to return to his academic career in the university with his Pearce research via Ellison fellowship. This attempt results in "writing his account of the retreat from the present into the dislocated regions of the past, trying to piece together an identity that he can entertain as authentic."[12] This problem of authenticity is related to his existing speculations about the essence of his own life. Because of the way that Bill handles the Victorian material to find answers to his existing problems, the Neo-victorian fashion of the novel becomes more personal and raises existential questions about life and time. While aiming at preserving his present authentic self, Bill struggles between the past and the present, the real and the imaginary, and death and life. This confusion turns out to be the question of finding his true existence:

---

[11] D. L. Higdon, "'Unconfessed Confessions': The Narrators of Julian Barnes and Graham Swift," in *The British and Irish Novel Since 1960,* ed. James Acheson (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1991), 181.

[12] Daniel Lea, *Contemporary British Novelists: Graham Swift* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2005), 134.

I am not me. Therefore, was I ever me? That is the gist of it. A proof of all this lies before your very eyes. Or at least before mine, since you have no means of comparison and only my word to go on. But that is the point: these words […] are not mine […]. I have never begun to write anything as – personal – as this. Yet this way in which I write is surely not me […] Is this how I am?[13]

Bill Unwin firstly aims at finding some answers to his decision to commit suicide, and as the narrator, he confesses that he wants to present the reasons to the readers as well: "Perhaps these pages will eventually explain. Perhaps they will give me an explanation."[14] In this way, he begins speculating about life and death. Although there is the limit of time (the span of physical life) and on the surface understanding of human relationships, Bill realizes that there are unseen aspects of the self, and these mysterious sides of the self may come into existence. In a way, "the consciousness of the repressed returns with a repetitious insistence to iterate the fragility and provisionality of the masks [the people] adopt"[15] and helps the individual to endure the hardships and restrictions of life. Likewise, Swift's narrator, Bill Unwin, struggles to solve this enigma by denying the limitations that the reality of his life imposes on him. He attempts to dig into the multi-layered entities of the personal and the public past burying the exceeding notions of the limitless reality. Bill says: "We are not who we think we are, only figures in some eternal, amoral masque […]."[16] Besides, other people in his life also fail to realise who he is: "No one would recognise me, but nobody would want to ask me about the real me. (Though I wonder who he is—really I do)."[17] He tries to reach this clarification of finding his true self by searching the dusty shelves of his memory which combines the traces of both the personal past and the palimpsest text of the Victorian ancestor.

The narrator begins the novel explaining the fact that these are "the words of a dead man" after an unsuccessful suicide attempt. With this act of self-annihilation, he cuts his ties with future expectations related to his limited life. Thus, his narration represents his "life dominated by loss and tragedy to come to terms with a reality from which all that had been stable and knowable has withdrawn."[18] This story reflects the struggles in his self together with the deaths of his beloved ones, his mother, his wife, and his

---

[13] Graham Swift, *Ever After* (London: Pan Books, 1992), 4.

[14] Ibid., 4.

[15] Lea, *Contemporary British Novelists: Graham Swift,* 127.

[16] Ibid., 98.

[17] Ibid., 117.

[18] Ibid.*,* 128.

stepfather. The loss of his family members "destabilises his sense of identity, rendering him lonely, loveless and with a strong conviction of his inauthenticity."[19] After these deaths in his life, he begins speculating about the meaning of life which he pessimistically perceives as doubtful. At first, the readers are acquainted with his feelings of "mourning" for his wife and mother and his "melancholia" due to his insecure feelings about life and death. His childhood memories of his father's suicide fostering his feelings of guilt may also be a source of his present crisis. As a consequence, he begins digging out his more ancient past as an academic by analysing the letters of his Victorian ancestor Matthew Pearce.

John Glendening asserts that Neo-Victorian novels show how the Victorian era is "more intellectually and imaginatively engaged than ours because of their combustible mixture of rationalism, romanticism, conservatism, religion, complacency, activism, and curiosity about itself and its past."[20] That may be one of the reasons why Graham Swift specifically remembers and represents Victorian times via the Victorian protagonist who suffers from the dilemma between science and religion. In the Victorian story, Lyme Regis which is full of fossils becomes a place in which the Victorian man gets involved in speculating about the formation of the world. In this Victorian core of the novel, an ichthyosaur—the scientific finding of Matthew's geological research—becomes a symbol of Matthew's questioning the biblical view on the position of humanity in nature. Influenced by Darwin's *Origin of the Species*, Matthew speculates about the existence of human beings: "Why should we suppose that futurity holds for us any guaranteed estate and that we occupy a special and permanent place in Creation?"[21] Reading Matthew's speculations about the arbitrariness of the universe, Bill questions the meaning of existence and the past: "The past, they say, is a foreign country and I fictionalise […]. O immortalists! To leave one's mark! To […] write a book! The struggle for existence? The struggle for *remembrance*."[22] He questions humanity's desire for eternity.

Glendening remarks that "The nineteenth-century intellectual and spiritual drama of fossils [does not] … provoke outright crises of faith in its characters; many believers in the 1800s avoided spiritual travail, ignoring the implications of fossils or of anything else that would affect

---

[19] Ibid., 128.
[20] Ibid., 55.
[21] Swift, *Ever After*, 135.
[22] Ibid., 231.

religious faith."[23] However, Matthew is directly affected by the conflict between science and religion. Speculating about religion, he asks: "if the world existed so long without Man upon it, why should we suppose that … we occupy any special place in creation?"[24] Likewise, Bill begins questioning his life when he feels its dissolution because of the deaths of his father, mother, and wife. In *Ever After*, the "crises of faith" are not related to God; the characters aim to find meaning in their own lives. Bill, after his mother's death, begins investigating Mathew Pearce's notebooks through which he re-visualises his life. Matthew tells his father-in-law (a vicar) that "he no longer believed in God. Result: scandal, divorce … [Bill's] mother's version ('They took things seriously in those days, darling')."[25] As it is seen, Bill re-enacts these moments from a presentist perspective. By questioning his ancestor's notebooks and in researching his outbursts, Bill begins evaluating himself as well:

> It is the personal thing that matters. The personal thing. It is knowing who Matthew Pearce was. And why he should matter so much to me. And why things mattered so much to him, when (what difference did it make? What difference does it make?) he might have gone on living happily ever after.[26]

Despite the zeitgeist of an era that affects the lives of the individuals, personal perceptions are more important in understanding the lives of human beings. That is why Swift focuses more on the individual perceptions of his characters in his neo-Victorian attitude. Bill's evaluation of the ambiguous meaning of human life is the ultimate concern of the novel: "Why is *anything* special? Either everything is special, which is absurd. Or nothing is special. Which is meaningless."[27]

The novel repetitively uses the idea of "death" involved in "life" instead of the title "Ever After" reminding the readers a fairy tale qualification with a happy ending. Bill Unwin, the contemporary narrator, begins the novel: "These are, I should warn you, the words of a dead man."[28] It is understood that eternal happiness granted by "ever afters" will no longer be possible because of the existence of death. Especially

---

[23] John Glendening ed., *Science and Religion in Neo-Victorian Novels: Eye of the Ichthyosaur* (London: Routledge, 2013), 60.
[24] Swift, *Ever After*, 135.
[25] Ibid., 47.
[26] Ibid., 49.
[27] Ibid., 234.
[28] Ibid., 1.

after getting in touch with an ichthyosaur, it is implied in the novel that "the eternity evoked by religion is no longer possible due to his having seen an ichthyosaur."[29] Matthew has been brought up as a devout Christian, but—as an Oxford graduate and a man of science—he believes that

> […] in 1840, after three years' exposure to scholarly scepticism and the rigours of science, he would not have relinquished the belief that every word [the Bible] contained was the literal and immutable truth […] [which] meant that the profounder questions of existence were settled and one was free to go out on to the surface of the world […]. [It] brought you back to the central fact: nature's handiwork, and man's too, since it exploited the unchanging laws that were part of nature's design, was evidence of God's.[30]

He begins questioning the Bible due to the scientific explanations that he reaches. Mostly affected by Felix's death, his researches in geology and palaeontology pave the way for questioning the religious dogmas. This reality revealed in his notebooks indirectly affects Bill who is also struggling to find an explanation for his losses. In a way, his ancestor's experiences may lead him to come to terms with his problems.

While providing information about the historical context of Matthew's story, Bill emphasises his existential dilemma by commenting on it as the present eye. Especially after his little boy Felix's death, Matthew begins questioning his faith:

> How different my present powers of patience, of humble submission to Providence, had I not taken that journey. God knows how much since than I have pretended. God knows!— but there, in a phrase, is the essence of my pretence.[31]

After seeing the skull of the ichthyosaur, Bill comments about Matthew's thoughts as "the moment of [his] unbelief. The beginning of [his] make-belief…feels himself starting to fall, and fall, through himself."[32] Swift deals both with Matthew Pearce's official history and Bill Unwin's contemporary urge to reconstruct Pearce's life including his experience with the ichthyosaur.

---

[29] Glendening, *Science and Religion in Neo-Victorian Novels: Eye of the Ichthyosaur,* 61.
[30] Ibid., 102–103.
[31] Swift, *Ever After,* 99.
[32] Ibid., 101.

> The twentieth-century narrator's frequent admissions about gaps in his knowledge, his often-revised interpretations, and his complex orchestrations of historical knowledge foster suspicion about his narrative reliability while, in metafictional fashion, intimating that fiction distorts fact and to some degree fact often becomes fictionalized in its telling.[33]

While commenting on his Victorian ancestor, Bill fictionalises both the personal and the public past. He does not refrain from explaining to the reader that facts and the imaginary are blurred:

> The script is only the beginning: there is the whole life. Let Matthew be my creation. He would have appreciated the commitment—not to say the irony. And if I conjure out of the Notebooks a complete yet hybrid being, part truth, part fiction, is that so false? … So what is real and what is not? And who am I? Am I this or am I that?[34]

Bill's relationship with his mother Sylvia, his father's suicide, his anger toward his stepfather Sam whom he thought to be his real father, the deaths of Ruth, Sylvia, and Sam, his dubious position in the university, and his rivalry with his colleague are the external factors of his unbalanced psychology as a middle-aged man who questions the passage of time and the meaning of life and death. His Victorian ancestor's story—which carries similar concerns—deepens the layers of his narrative: "Bill seeks refuge in literature in the wake of his father's suicide, Matthew turns to religion for consolation after his mother's demise."[35]

Bill shows the impossibility of reaching authenticity regarding existential questions in contemporary "neo" times by stressing Matthew's doubt when Matthew encounters a religious dilemma in seeing the ichthyosaur. The arbitrariness of the universe Matthew apprehends through Felix's death is a major reason: "I cannot believe that in this prodigious arbitrariness there is any purpose that grants life to a child only to withdraw it after two years…"[36] Another reason is the place of human beings on earth: "… the entire record of human history is as a wink in the world's duration. And if the world existed so long without Man upon it, why should we suppose that futurity holds for us any guaranteed estate

---

[33] Glendening, *Science and Religion in Neo-Victorian Novels: Eye of the Ichthyosaur,* 62-63.
[34] Swift, *Ever After,* 90.
[35] Glendening, *Science and Religion in Neo-Victorian Novels: Eye of the Ichthyosaur,* 126.
[36] Swift, *Ever After,* 102.

and that we occupy any special and permanent place in creation?"[37] The problem of impermanence links up with that of extinction. By showing Matthew Pearce's crisis of faith, Bill reflects on the questions about religion and the meaning of life of many Victorians, especially in the mid-Victorian times.

Bill recognizes parallelisms between his situation and that of Pearce whom he rethinks by investigating his notebooks and recreating a fragmented imaginary version. He is interested in the story of Matthew because he has seen the parallelism between his love for his wife Ruth and Matthew's love for his wife Elisabeth. For Bill, love is a very important aspect of life; thus, he cannot find meaning in his own single life before Ruth: "'I wonder, by my troth, what thou and I did, till we lov'd…?'These things are meant to be."[38] For both characters, one of the most important things in their lives is their love for their wives. Besides, both characters try to position love in the centre of their lives to lessen the effects of their miseries:

> Both experience a moment of unbelief that darkens the rest of their lives, Pearce when he beholds the ichthyosaur and Unwin when he learns about the death of the man thought to be his father. To a degree Unwin's love for his spouse, his allegiance to romantic love, compensates for this loss […].[39]

Still, Bill's unbelief in life stems from the very existence of the reality of death. Swift quotes from Sir Walter Raleigh:

> *Even such time, which takes in trust*
> *Our youth, our joys, and all we have,*
> *And pays us but with age and dust;*
> *Who in the dark and silent grave*
> *When we have wandered all our ways*
> *Shuts up the story of our days.*[40]

All people embrace the reality of life, but all their life efforts seem futile because they will be all alone and aged and their existence will come to an end. Bill speculates about these lines being reality and concludes by

---

[37] Ibid., 135.
[38] Ibid.,77.
[39] Glendening, *Science and Religion in Neo-Victorian Novels: Eye of the Ichthyosaur,* 70.
[40] Swift, *Ever After,* 71.

saying "life is reconciled with death."[41] In other words, despite the harshness of the idea that the end of one's existence means nothingness, death is the confirmation of life:

> We have to die of something: a lung cancer, a throat cancer, a brain tumour, a bullet in the head. But not of love, never of love […]. Some of us want recognition, some of us don't […]. No one would recognize me, but nobody would want to ask me about the real me. (Though I wonder who he is— really, I do) […]. It's wrong, of course. Suicide. My father was wrong. Ruth was wrong. I—But I' still here. We don't have the right. To take ourselves from ourselves. And from other people. It's cowardly. It's selfish.[42]

For Bill, romantic love may be a solution as a tool to reach ever after happiness, but there is this inevitability of death and suicide. Bill tries to give meaning to his life by remembering his past and his Victorian ancestor's past. They both have "a noncommunicable grief."[43] The grief is because of the loss of the beloved ones. Although Bill wants to find a solution to his existential dilemma through love (as a transgressive point that will be eternal), the love relationships between males and females are mostly reflected via marriages that are stuck in temporality and carry certain conflicts between the two sexes. Through Bill's investigation of his Victorian ancestor's manuscripts, which starts with a clock, the novel aims at depicting love as a notion that goes beyond time. In other words, "love conquering temporality in a very uncomplicated way seems to be the clock's symbolic import—precisely because it stands outside time and is immune to its depredations."[44] Still, it is disputable whether love can endure the hindrances of life. Bill seems unhappy when he speculates about his marriage with Ruth, his mother's complicated relations with Sam, and the unhappy end of his Victorian ancestor's marriage. Besides, all these relationships are torn apart with the death of one party, which reinforces the idea that due to the inevitable interference of death, the lovers can't continue their love "happily ever after."

Bill's existential problems are thus related to death as an essential part of life. Based on a Freudian explanation, after the deaths of his beloved ones, Bill's emotions fluctuate between the two extreme emotions of

---

[41] Ibid., 71.

[42] Ibid., 116-118.

[43] Julia Kristeva, *Black Sun: Depression and Melancholia* (Columbia: Columbia University Press, 1989), 3.

[44] Lea, *Contemporary British Novelists: Graham Swift*, 145.

"mourning"[45] and "melancholia."[46] After losing his wife, Bill experiences
a "temporary diminishment of selfhood that arises from the loss of the
object as a by-product of the traumatic blow to cathectic[47] relation." As a
result of this loss, his subjectivity is shattered, and he needs "decathexis."[48]
Bill's cathectic involvement—the reflection of his self that is directed to
the object of love who is Ruth— symbolises his own narcissistic self's
loss and explains his will to commit suicide after her death. Bill passes
through the process of mourning when he loses his wife, but his present
emotion is melancholia since he experiences "painful dejection, cessation
of interest in the outside world, loss of the capacity to love, inhibition of
all activity, and a lowering of the self-regarding feelings to a degree that
finds utterance in self-reproaches and self-revilings, a delusional expectation
of punishment."[49] Besides, he is aware that his loss is the reason for his
melancholia because "he knows whom he has lost but not what he has lost
in him."[50] Melancholia may be apt to describe the existing feelings of Bill
since Freud asserts that "in mourning it is the world which has become
poor and empty, in melancholia it is the ego itself […] [in mourning there
is] a loss in regard to an object [whereas in melancholy there is] a loss in
regard to his ego."[51] Freud mentions that when a person who has a loss
feels ambivalent feelings for his narcissistic self because he does not direct
his love to an object, he may hate the object in himself that substitutes for
the loved one. In that sense, there may be self-torment, and this may lead
him to suicide as in the case of Bill:[52]

---

[45] "The natural grieving response to the loss of a valued person or object" (Ibid.,
148).

[46] "An ongoing condition of psychic disturbance not necessarily related to a
specific act of loss but bearing the hallmarks of grief, despair and the depression of
libidinal energies" (Ibid., 148).

[47] "Cathexis is the canalisation of libidinal energy into a particular object-relation
the intricate network of psychological factors that tie the subject to the object. The
work of mourning involves the painful disconnection that they are no longer
practically operative or symbolically efficient" (Ibid., 148).

[48] As Freud explains: "An object-loss was transformed into an ego-loss and the
conflict between the ego and the loved person into a cleavage between the critical
activity of the ego and the ego as altered by identification" (Ibid., 148-149).

[49] Ibid., 244.

[50] Ibid., 245.

[51] Ibid., 246-247.

[52] "The analysis of melancholia now shows that the ego can kill itself only if,
owing to the return of the object-cathexis, it can treat itself as an object—if it is
able to direct against itself the hostility which relates to an object and which
represents the ego's original reaction to objects in the external world" [Sigmund

> But how can I explain it? The pictures mock me. They are, and they are not
> Ruth… And nothing is left but this impossible absence […]. Ah yes, the
> monstrosity, the iniquity of love—that another person should be the world.
> What does it matter if the world (out there) is lost, doomed, if there is no
> sense, no purpose, rhyme or reason to the schemeless scheme of things?[53]

The meaning of life is lost for Bill and "life no longer matters"[54] to him.
Similarly, Matthew's conflicts—deciphered via his son's death, his
scientific research, and his doubts about religion—affect his marriage and
love and become the source of his mourning. Bill wonders about the most
painful and life-changing situation in Matthew's life; is it "the failed
marriage or the ideological anguish?"[55] When Bill sees parallel notions in
Matthew's letters, Bill is confronted more with his problems as a self. In
both cases, the Victorian and the contemporary, the emotional outbursts of
the individuals when they experience love, hate, and death are the same.
Thus, the melancholic narrator Bill's traces of memory are blurred[56]
because he fictionalises the notebooks that he has found. He declares: "I
invent. I imagine. I want them to have been happy… People aren't defined
by other people. We have to be ourselves."[57] *Ever After* has a non-linear
narration. As the narrator, he fictionalises both his own life story—
because he remembers the events in the way he wants to remember—and
Matthew's story— "I see Matthew … watching Elizabeth at her dressing
table when she loosens her hair. She smiles at his watching smile in the
mirror"[58]—because he has bits and pieces of his letters. Besides, Bill adds
some layers to his narration concerning his present melancholic feelings.

　　Speculating about existence, the Neo-Victorian novel *Ever After*
questions the significance of science, religion, love, life, and death. Both
Matthew and Bill try to reach the truth about personal and social pasts as a
means of responding to the existential questioning of their lives. Bill is not

---

Freud, "Mourning and Melancholia," in *The Standard Edition of the Complete
Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: On the History of the Psycho-Analytic
Movement Papers on Metapsychology and Other Works*, trans. James Strachey,
Vol. 14 (London: The Hogarth Press, 1920), 245].

[53] Swift, *Ever After,* 256.

[54] Kristeva, *Black Sun: Depression and Melancholia,* 6.

[55] Swift, *Ever After,* 212.

[56] "Everything has gone by […] but [he is] faithful to those bygone days, [he is]
nailed down to them, no revolution is possible, there is no future […]. An
overinflated, hyperbolic past fills all the dimensions of psychic continuity"
(Kristeva, *Black Sun: Depression and Melancholia*, 60).

[57] Swift, *Ever After,*213.

[58] Ibid.,124.

sure about his own life and about Matthew's telling the truth, but he continues to fictionalise the past with a presentist perspective. Thus, Swift focuses on the self-realisation of his protagonist. Bill reflects on the meaning of life because of the losses of the loved ones which are not directly related to the science and religion dichotomy as in the case of Matthew. Yet, the deaths of the loved ones and the encounter of the ichthyosaur are significant past reminiscences distorting the present evaluations of the Victorian and the contemporary protagonists respectively. Bill says: "It is difficult to know how people will react when they see an ichthyosaur. I can understand it with Felix… But with an ichthyosaur?"[59] As a representative of Neo-Victorianism, despite the impossibility of reaching the truth about the past, Swift attempts to narrate the Victorian via a contemporary personal perspective that carries the notions of life, death, and love to elaborate on the multi-layered entity of selfhood.

References

Bradford, Richard, ed. *The Novel Now.* UK: Blackwell, 2007.

Day, Gary, ed. *The Varieties of Victorianism: The Uses of the Past.* New York: Palgrave, 1998.

Freud, Sigmund. "Mourning and Melancholia." In *the Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud: On the History of the Psycho-Analytic Movement Papers on Metapsychology and Other Works.* Translated by James Strachey, 243-258. Vol. 14. London: The Hogarth Press, 1920.

Glendening, John, ed. *Science and Religion in Neo-Victorian Novels: Eye of the Ichthyosaur.* London: Routledge, 2013.

Hadley, Louisa, ed. *Neo-Victorian and Historical Narrative: The Victorians and Us*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

Higdon, K. "'Unconfessed Confessions': The Narrators of Julian Barnes and Graham Swift." In *The British and Irish Novel Since 1960,* edited by James Acheson, 174-191. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1991.

Hutcheon, Linda. *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction*. London & New York: Routledge, 1988.

Kohlke, Marie-Luise. "Introduction: Speculations in and on the Neo-Victorian Encounter." *Neo-Victorian Studies* 1, no.1 (Autumn 2018): 1-18.

Kristeva, Julia. *Black Sun: Depression and Melancholia.* Columbia: Columbia University Press, 1989.

---

[59] Ibid., 100-101.

Lea, Daniel. *Contemporary British Novelists: Graham Swift.* Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2005.

Mitchell, Kate. *History and Cultural Memory in Neo-Victorian Fiction Victorian Afterimages.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

Rignall, John. "From Picturesque to Palimpsest: Landscape and History in the Fiction of Walter Scott and Graham Swift." In *Victorian Turns, Neo-Victorian Returns: Essays on Fiction and Culture,* edited by Penny Gay, Judith Johnston, and Catherine Waters, 148-158. UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2008.

Sweet, Matthew. *Inventing the Victorians.* London: Faber and Faber, 2001.

Swift, Graham. *Ever After.* London: Pan Books, 1992.

Wesseling, Elisabeth. *Writing History as a Prophet: Postmodernist Innovations of the Historical Novel.* Amsterdam: John Benjamin's Publishing Company, 1991.

CHAPTER FIFTEEN

ONCE UPON A HUMANIST TIME:
POSTHUMANISM AND FAIRY TALES

SEDA PEKŞEN

> "Life itself is the most Wonderful of Fairy Tales"
> Hans Christian Andersen[1]

Posthumanism is a term with various definitions and the one I will adopt is the one Ralf Remshardt gives by referring to Donna Haraway's "Cyborg Manifesto." Remshardt suggests that as a term of cultural criticism "posthumanism aims at dismantling the many binaries endorsed by Western dualism: body/mind, self/other, culture/nature, global/local, and so forth."[2] Posthumanist critics, like Roy Ascott, argue that it is time to "redefine what it is to be human."[3] Such a redefinition would first require the deconstruction of anthropocentric thought. In this line of thinking, the human species is no longer central or superior, but it still is "a geological force capable of affecting all life on this planet"[4]; hence the term "anthropocene" addresses this new age of globalization and technology. In *How We Became Posthuman*, Katherine Hayles argues,

---

[1] Gregory Maguire, "Foreword," in *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* ed. Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith (New York: Penguin Books, 2010), Kindle.

[2] Ralf Remshardt, "Posthumanism," in *Mapping Intermediality in Performance,* ed. Sarah Bey-Cheng, Chiel Kattenbelt, Andy Lavender and Robin Nelson (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010), 136.

[3] Roy Ascott and Edward A. Shanken, *Telematic Embrace: Visionary Theories of Art, Technology, and Consciousness* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003), **quoted in** Ralf Remshardt, "Posthumanism," in *Mapping Intermediality in Performance,* ed. Sarah Bey-Cheng, Chiel Kattenbelt, Andy Lavender, and Robin Nelson (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010), 136.

[4] Lars Shmeink, "Dystopia, Science Fiction, Posthumanism, and Liquid Modernity," in *Biopunk Dystopias: Genetic Engineering, Society and Science Fiction* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2016), 42.

> The posthuman does not really mean the end of humanity. It signals instead the end of a certain conception of the human, a conception that may have applied, at best, to that fraction of humanity who had the wealth, power, and leisure to conceptualize themselves as autonomous beings exercising their will through individual agency and choice.[5]

According to Rosi Braidotti, when we talk of life, it is not just about "subjective" human life but also "objective" life common to all beings. Therefore, we need "to acknowledge all those ghosts, all those human others that have been repressed during the process of humanization: animals, gods, demons, monsters of all kinds."[6] In such a posthumanist view, subjectivity becomes "embodied, embedded and in symbiosis" with animals, the environment, and machines. The humanist subject, according to Michèle Barrett, is "white, rich, male"[7] and—according to Rosi Braidotti—"is not and has never been universal."[8] Women, children, and non-white people were not the ones at the center of the humanist discourse; they were always others along with non-humans.[9] In this regard, Cary Wolfe argues:

> As long as this humanist and speciest *structure* of subjectivization remains intact, and as long as it is institutionally taken for granted that it is all right to systematically exploit and kill nonhuman animals simply because of their species, then the humanist discourse of species will always be available for use by some humans against other humans as well, to countenance violence against the social other of *whatever* species-or

---

[5] Katherine Hayles, *How We Became Posthuman: Virtual Bodies in Cybernetics, Literature, and Informatics* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1999), 286.

[6] Rosi Braidotti, *The Posthuman* (London: Polity, 2013), **quoted in** Lars Shmeink, "Dystopia, Science Fiction, Posthumanism, and Liquid Modernity," in *Biopunk Dystopias: Genetic Engineering, Society and Science Fiction*, (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2016), 43.

[7] Michéle Barrett, *The Politics of Truth: From Marx to Foucault* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991), **quoted in** Tony Davies, *Humanism* (London: Routledge, 1997), 59.

[8] Rosi Braidotti, *The Posthuman,* **quoted in** Lars Shmeink, "Dystopia, Science Fiction, Posthumanism, and Liquid Modernity," 31.

[9] Since I will focus on the relationship between humans and animals in the posthumanist context, although I will not be elaborating on any kind of human group as the other with reference to the tales, it is of significance to highlight this divisive nature of the humanist discourse so as to present a better understanding of the unifying nature of the posthumanist outlook.

gender, or race, or class, or sexual difference.[10]

The humanist discourse has been available for use and that is why there have been movements against the exploitation of women, animals, nature's resources, other humans over the last 200 years, as Robert Pepperell points out.[11]The understanding of this, according to Pepperell, is what posthumanism is about because "the recognition that none of us are actually distinct from each other, or the world, will profoundly affect the way we treat each other, different species and the environment. To harm anything is to harm oneself."[12] Fukuyama argues that "humans are cultural animals who can modify their own behavior based on learning and pass that learning on to future generations in nongenetic ways."[13] I find posthumanist rewritings of fairy tales extremely important in terms of passing on to the next generation this recognition of who we are and knowledge of how we harm ourselves and our environment. As Haraway argues, the pleasure we get in the confusion of boundaries is "a clear-sighted recognition of connection across the discredited breach of nature and culture."[14] She further suggests that "we can learn from our fusions with animals and machines how not to be Man, the embodiment of Western logos."[15] One of her suggestions for a solution is retelling the old stories to "reverse and displace the hierarchical dualisms of naturalized identities."[16] This is what we find in Kate Bernheimer's collection *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me*, which consists of forty rewritings of tales from all over the world with all kinds of others set in spaces where the ontological boundaries are dismissed. Here, I will only focus on four of those tales which deconstruct the binaries of the older versions by transgressing the boundaries between human and animal, foregrounding the fluidity of all the characters involved. The first tale, "The Girl, the Wolf, the Crone" by Kellie Wells, is a rewriting of three different versions of the well-known "The Red Cap" by the Grimm Brothers, "Little Red Riding Hood" by Charles Perrault, and the

---

[10] Cary Wolfe, *Animal Rites: American Culture, the Discourse of Species, and Posthumanist Theory* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2003), 8.

[11] Robert Pepperell, *The Posthuman Condition: Consciousness Beyond the Brain* (Bristol: Intellect Books, 2003), 172.

[12] Ibid., 172.

[13] Francis Fukuyama, *Our Posthuman Future: Consequences of the Biotechnology Revolution* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2002), 137.

[14] Donna Haraway, *Simians, Cyborgs, and Women: The Reinvention of Nature* (New York: Routledge, 1991), 152.

[15] Ibid., 173.

[16] Ibid., 175.

anonymous French version entitled "The Grandmother." The other two tales, "The Swan Brothers" by Shelley Jackson and "Halfway People" by Karen Joy Fowler, are rewritings of "The Six Swans" by the Grimm Brothers, whereas the last one, "The Wild Swans" by Michael Cunningham, is a rewriting of Andersen's version of the same tale. Bernheimer says in her introduction to the collection:

> I have a sense that a proliferation of magical stories, especially fairy tales, is correlated to a growing awareness of human separation from the wild and natural world. In fairy tales, the human and animal worlds are equal and mutually dependent. The violence, suffering, and beauty are shared. By reading this book, you become part of a welcoming, old, nonhierarchical, and new tradition.[17]

The tales in the collection—which portray characters both human and nonhuman (animals, colours, mosquitos, bodies without souls, and body parts) taking on life, being intertwined with each other, and turning hybrid—achieve what Ann Weinstone argues for posthumanism in *Avatar Bodies*; it "sutures people together out of variegated components. It links people to technologies, to nonhumans, to forces, to animals, and even … to insects."[18]

In "The Girl, the Wolf, the Crone," Kellie Wells' rewriting of "The Red Cap," the girl with the incredibly red cheeks is asked by her aging mother to take the loaf of bread from her hands to the sickly wolf, who, she thinks, will appreciate it. The mother warns Red Cheeks against "primordial women with faces like the bottom of a river" residing in the woods, and it is "a crusty old woman with a face like fallen cake" that tries to deviate her from the path.[19] When the old woman beats Red Cheeks to the sick wolf's house, she declares that she will eat him. Seeing that he has no other choice, the wolf unzips his coat–that is, his skin–and drags his body into the mouth of the old woman. The woman spits his bones out and the wolf keeps talking to her from inside her belly, mostly quoting from the Bible. Derrida criticizes the cultural practices of sacrifice and eating as

---

[17] Kate Bernheimer, "Introduction," in *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* ed. Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith (New York: Penguin Books, 2010), Kindle.

[18] Ann Weinstone, *Avatar Bodies: A Tantra for Posthumanism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2004), 3.

[19] Kellie Wells, "The Girl, the Wolf, the Crone," in *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* ed. Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith (New York: Penguin Books, 2010), Kindle.

"a noncriminal putting to death."[20] He calls this *carno-phallogocentrism* and argues that the "Thou shalt not kill" has never been understood as "Thou shalt not put to death the living in general."[21] According to Derrida, the animal is the other who has been looking at us.[22] The animal does not know its nudity since there is no nudity in nature. However, man is ashamed of his nakedness because he knows his nakedness, which brings with it the consciousness of good and evil.[23] When the animal other is consumed by the old woman, he is not wiped out of existence; on the contrary, he becomes one with the old woman in his ultimate nakedness, an embodiment of the good-evil binary, a subaltern-within who persistently speaks.

The old woman greets Red Cheeks inside the wolf's skin, while the wolf inside her belly expresses his sorrow for the little girl. The old woman's big breasts, her opposable thumbs, and the wolf's bones lying on the bed give her away; however, for the convenience of the tale, Red Cheeks preserves her naivety and crawls into bed with what she still thinks is the wolf. Thus, the old woman swallows her whole. The trio turns into a matryoshka doll as Red Cheeks goes through two sets of throats and finds herself lodged in the wolf's belly inside the old woman's body. The grandmother hides her evil self inside the wolf's naked skin, while the wolf remains as nothing but flesh. The girl wears her grandmother's clothes right before she is eaten up. She is, just like her grandmother used to be, what Nietzsche calls "the animal with red cheeks,"[24] the animal who is prone to shame and who needs to cover it up with dresses/masks. In this context, to be naked and to be ashamed would also mean putting off all the social/cultural masks and baring one's soul exactly as it is in nature with all its flaws and its dark spots. Here, it is the animal within, the wolf that is laid bare for others to see. When Derrida defines the animal as the other, he talks of the crossing of borders between man and animal: "Crossing borders or the ends of man I come or surrender to the animal- to the animal in itself, to the animal in me and the animal at unease with itself."[25]

---

[20] Jacques Derrida, "'Eating Well,' or the Calculation of the Subject: An Interview with Jacques Derrida," in *Who Comes After the Subject?* ed. Eduardo Cadava, Peter Connor, and Jean-Luc Nancy (New York: Routledge, 1991), 112.

[21] Ibid., 113.

[22] Jacques Derrida, "The Animal That Therefore I Am (More to Follow)," trans. David Wills, *Critical Inquiry 28* (Winter 2002): 372.

[23] Ibid., 373.

[24] Friedrich Nietzsche, *Thus Spoke Zarathustra* (Great Britain: Penguin Books, 1961), 112.

[25] Derrida, "The Animal," 372.

The gaze of the animal thus becomes a mirror to the man. The wolf—the animal other within—abolishes the superiority of the human, lying inside the woman's belly and uttering religious quotes.

It is more than a reversal of roles, or a subversion, since the line separating good and evil, right and wrong, victim and criminal becomes rather blurry. With the huntsman's arrival, the three voices coming out of one body get muddled as well. As the girl and the wolf keep talking to each other—"My, oh my, what a big spleen you have!" "The better to chide you with, lovely!"—the old woman "let[s] rip a musical belch," from which Red Cheeks recognizes her as her grandmother and remembers the "delicious wolf soup she used to make her."[26] The old woman has already explained at this point that the possession of the loaf of bread stands for fertility, which Red Cheeks's mother took away from her. This is a reference to the oral tradition version of the tale where the replacement of the older generation by a younger one is emphasised and where, through the evil and cunning wolf's manipulation, the little girl eats the old woman's flesh and drinks her blood, thereby taking up her place in the cycle of life.[27] Yet, in "The Girl, the Wolf, the Crone," Red Cheeks's mother does not feel quite ready to join the cycle of life by taking up her place among the women with faces like the bottom of a river and sends the huntsman to get the loaf of bread back. The huntsman's confusion—when he finds out that what he thought to be "a quivering aspic of flesh"[28] was, in fact, the wolf and what he thought to be the wolf was, in fact, a very old woman—is the kind of confusion this particular tale creates in the reader's mind with all the transgressed boundaries, viz., the kind of confusion of boundaries that Harraway recommends. In the anonymous version, the grandmother is killed by the wolf, in Perrault's version, both the grandmother and the little girl are killed by the wolf, and in the Grimms' version, the huntsman kills the wolf saving both women. In this rewriting, however, the wolf returns to his fatherland to recover, the old woman pretends to smoke a sausage—once again highlighting the carno-phallogocentrism of the human—and the girl does not seem to have much of a prospect ahead since the huntsman thinks "no brazen-faced rose that rutilant was worth deflowering, bread or no bread," and he saves her only because he sees her holding the loaf of bread that the grandmother "grudgingly passed down to

---

[26] Wells, "The Girl, The Wolf."
[27] Yvonne Verdier, "Little Red Riding Hood in Oral Tradition." *Marvels & Tales: Journal of Fairy-Tale Studies* 11, no. 1-2 (1997), 101-123.
[28] Wells, "The Girl, The Wolf."

her daughter."[29] Thus, the story-within-story effect caused by the mixture of the three versions is juxtaposed with a literal character-within-character effect, which serves the purpose of Kellie Wells as she indicates in her postscript: "to untell a story."[30] She refers to her rewriting as "the corruption of" the tale in which she has flattened the characters to allow them "become a container for ideas," which, she thinks, contributes to the "subtextual richness."[31] Thus, her characters are both "flat and complex at once," turning reality in fiction into "a shared hallucination."[32]

Another example from the same collection is Shelley Jackson's "The Swan Brothers," which is a rewriting of the Grimm Brothers' "The Six Swans." As soon as the tale begins, the reader is pulled into it through the second person narrative. First comes the identification and later the information as to who you are identifying with. The events do not take place once upon a time, in a galaxy far far away, but "you are walking down a familiar street at dusk."[33] So the blurring of the boundaries starts right at the beginning by first eliminating the distinction between the protagonist and the reader on familiar grounds. The "you" of the tale finds a book of tales on the street and starts reading. It is hard to discern whether the woman who "is a daughter, and more importantly, a sister, who is involved in the long, difficult, and not always rewarding work of saving her brothers" is a description from the book that the protagonist is reading or a woman she comes across on the familiar street.[34] Yet, it doesn't matter:

> Because you've also lived—you've been living and reading for years, sometimes both at once—you are not surprised that people often repeat their most unpleasant experiences. It's probably for the same reason we tell the same stories over and over, with minor variations […]. It is cozy to have one's expectations met, though there is also, always, the possibility […] that things will turn out differently, this time.[35]

---

[29] Wells, "The Girl, The Wolf." Smoking a sausage, the huntsman's comments, and the grandmother's grudge may well be interpreted from a feminist viewpoint with emphasis on the concept of fertility; however, since my aim here is to present a posthumanist approach, I will not offer such an interpretation.
[30] Ibid.
[31] Ibid.
[32] Ibid.
[33] Shelley Jackson, "The Swan Brothers," in *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* ed. Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith (New York: Penguin Books, 2010) Kindle.
[34] Ibid.
[35] Ibid.

Things turn out differently in this rewriting because, as we can see from the first description of the woman, she doesn't seem quite like the self-sacrificing daughter/sister of the patriarchy whose ordeal is but the result of the anger of a notorious female archetype—a witch in the Grimms' version. What Jackson rather highlights is "how she must have envied her brothers' animal freedom even as she worked to save them from it"[36]; the focus, therefore, is on their animal freedom, as opposed to her human slavery. The witch-against-human dichotomy of the Grimms' version is thus replaced with a longing for escaping humanity altogether.

The tale consists of fragments with different narrative voices. In the second fragment, the third person narrator refers to the woman as "the performance artist," giving her an individual identity as opposed to her dependent existence in the old version in which she is one king's daughter, another's wife, the witch's victim, and the brothers' self-sacrificing sister.[37] As she performs her art, the narrator both praises her skills in spinning threads out of nettles and questions her position: "Is self-sacrifice always a virtue? If their positions were reversed, would her brothers do the same for her? Would she want them to? What is it *like* to fly?"[38] That last question which begs the desire and the curiosity to fly is the reason why she cannot be sure if she would want to be saved, which brings forth questions such as "Is it that awful to turn into an animal? Is the witch's curse really a curse or is it rather a blessing?" As she dreams of turning into a swan like her brothers, "she cries out […] and, amazed by the sound she makes, spreads her wings and hurls herself through the window into the rushing sky."[39] She thus fulfills her wish in her mind's eye.

The third fragment is about her dreams of flying: "Swimming in air […] she rises effortlessly, the sky is hers."[40] Her only fear is not being able to return to earth, to her murderer. Later, in a different fragment, we learn from the youngest brother's lover that this swan brother has adapted to his hybridity, having one-night stands when he takes up his human form for "quarter of an hour" every night.[41] From the viewpoint of the lover, flying is the most impressive trait of the brother and is considered a blessing rather than a curse; the lover tells the brother "I want you exactly the way you are."[42] Turning into a swan becomes a revolt against the whole system

---

[36] Ibid.
[37] Ibid.
[38] Ibid.
[39] Ibid.
[40] Ibid.
[41] Ibid.
[42] Ibid.

of binaries and boundaries, giving the brothers the freedom to fly away from that system. Their sister spreads her wings by becoming an artist. Either way, flying turns into a metaphor for defying the law of the father who reacts as follows:

> 'My sons were the flighty ones. My daughter was always super down-to-earth,' says the father. 'It was a surprise when she told us she wanted to be an artist. We tried to steer her toward something more practical. My wife suggested she take Home Ec. That's where she learned to sew, so we feel that we've contributed. Indirectly.'[43]

The performance artist finishes the six shirts and thus comes the opening night, which keeps on going among the blur of fragments throughout the tale. Some characters are fragmented as well, just as the sixth brother who gets stuck with one wing since his magic shirt has one sleeve missing. There is the woman with the silver hands and her lover with the chicken feet. The woman with the silver hands becomes a friend, then a lover to the artist; the swans are her brothers one time, her children the next. The artist gets confused from time to time whether she is eating animals or her children. The six swan brothers and the six robbers of the older version in whose house they dwell become the same towards the end. Thus, everything is interwoven like the shirts the artist weaves: the fragments, the people, their roles, their gender, the animals, their lives. This is indicated by Jackson in a separate fragment entitled "etymology" in which she explains that both the words textile and text originate from the same Latin root meaning "to weave."[44] All this fragmentation, as well as transgression, foregrounds the strict boundaries that are drawn in the older version of the tale, thereby pointing at its unrelatedness to the actual human condition which is always interlaced with every other being in existence. The tale has also a weave of endings, all happening simultaneously, that underlines the plurality of life in which everyone is dreaming, dreaming of flying, dreaming *and* flying. The female character who finds the book at the beginning of the tale is reading and walking; the book turns into a bird, and she turns into a bird and flies, reading. Jackson describes her experience of the Grimms' tale as "a compulsive repetition with variation."[45] She weaves for the reader variations of her own experience, of life, and of the human condition, whereby binaries become obsolete.

---

[43] Ibid.
[44] Ibid.
[45] Ibid.

In "Halfway People," another rewriting of the "Six Swans" by Karen Joy Fowler, Maura, telling her own story to her child to put him to sleep, meets the sixth swan brother with the one wing left where his arm should be. As it happens, "no woman in the world could sleep a night under that wing and not wake up in love."[46] Here, although there is again a preference of the animal over the human, the fragmentation of the sixth brother is deemed a curse as he is not at peace with his hybridity and yearns to become fully animal leaving his humanness behind. When a flock of white birds passes over the house, the man runs out to watch them "his wing open and beating like a heart," upon which Maura asks if the spell couldn't be broken; the wing, he says, "*is* the spell broken."[47] He is stuck in between, half swan and half man, unable to look up to a king who has sent his sister to the stake, unable to live among the people who were willing to watch her burn. "He was the only one whose heart remained divided. 'A halfway heart, unhappy to stay, unhappy to go,' he said," likening his situation to Maura's mother's, whom—after her disappearance when Maura was little—Maura's father places in bedtime stories sometimes as a fish, other times as a seal, and then as a woman.[48] Maura's mother was a woman unable to find peace when rich people and their demands got between her and her house by the ocean. Similarly, the man with the one wing feels sorry for himself and hurt, waking up with his human feet after a night of dreams in which he flies. He longs to be in the air, but his humanness gets between him and the air.

Cary Wolfe argues that speciesism as an institution "relies on the tacit agreement that the full transcendence of the 'human' requires the sacrifice of the 'animal' and the animalistic, which in turn makes possible a symbolic economy in which we can engage in what Derrida will call a 'noncriminal putting to death' of other *humans* as well by marking *them* as animal."[49] When the swan brother is exiled by the king due to his "deformity," he takes shelter in a ship; however, he is accused of being the cause of the crew's misfortunes and is thrown overboard: "As he fell, his arm had become a second wing. For just one moment he'd been an angel. And then, a moment later, a swan."[50] The crew's attitude towards the swan brother is what Badmington calls "reactive solidarity"; the kind of "human

---

[46] Karen Joy Fowler, "Halfway People," in *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* ed. Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith (New York: Penguin Books, 2010), Kindle.
[47] Ibid.
[48] Ibid.
[49] Wolfe, "Animal Rites," 6.
[50] Fowler, "Halfway."

unity" in the "repulsion of the other" and with the intention of "independence from the other."[51] Thus, the humanist argument is turned upside down as the swan brother sacrifices his humanness for the sake of the full transcendence of his animality. His brother later reports to Maura "My brother had seen the face of the mob before … and it made him regret being human. If he's a swan again, he's glad."[52] He puts an end to his hybridity by completely embracing his otherness, which allows him to fly to his freedom away from those who try to put him to death, whether symbolically or literally. He thus transgresses the boundaries set for him by the spell of the witch and by the society that outcasts him.

In "The Wild Swans," Michael Cunningham brings the one-winged brother into the real world because he is treated as an outcast in the palace—joked of, shunned, or else suspected of some mental deficiency. In the Andersen version of the tale, as Cunningham says in his postscript that his version was based on, the stepmother Queen tells the eleven brothers to "fly out into the world and get [their] own living."[53] This is what the twelfth brother in Cunningham's rewriting does although "he could land only the most menial of jobs."[54] Thus, Cunningham draws the curtain separating the fairy world and his own. However, the real world does not prove any easier to the one-winged man: "The wing was graceful but large–it was awkward on the subway, impossible in cabs. It had to be checked constantly for lice. And unless it was washed daily, feather by feather, it turned from the creamy white of a French tulip to a linty, dispiriting gray."[55] As Fukuyama suggests, "A wide variety of animals share a number of important characteristics with humans. Human beings are always making sentimental reference to their 'shared humanity' but in many cases what they are referring to is their shared animality."[56] What this refers to in the case of Cunningham's tale is the shared otherness. The reader is told that most nights the one-winged brother could be found in a bar, which is very conveniently located on the outer edges of the city, a bar that welcomes all kinds of fairy tale losers. So, in Cunningham's tale, all

---

[51] Neil Badmington, *Alien Chic: Posthumanism and the Other Within* (London: Routledge, 2004), 48.

[52] Fowler, "Halfway."

[53] Hans Christian Andersen, *The Complete Illustrated Works of Hans Christian Andersen* (London: Chancellor Press, 2001), 560.

[54] Michael Cunningham, "The Wild Swans," in *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith (New York: Penguin Books, 2010), Kindle.

[55] Ibid.

[56] Fukuyama, "Posthuman Future," 145.

the others of the fairy tales are here among us, on the margins, waiting to be seen, waiting to be heard, and they are all good company. Such an ending to the tale resonates with Latour's suggestion that "If we do not change the common dwelling, we shall not absorb in it the other cultures that we can no longer dominate, and we shall be forever incapable of accommodating in it the environment that we can no longer control. Neither Nature nor the Others will become modern. It is up to us to change our ways of changing."[57]

In the forty tales of Bernheimer's collection, change is inevitable and necessary, as are multiplicity and unity. The unity they represent in the way they all lead the reader to reconsider his/her perception of life stands as a model of the kind of multiplicity, unity, and harmony that I have attempted to underline. Kirsten Møllegaard writes in her review of the collection: "These retellings are well suited for a mature reader who will appreciate their narrative flexibility, playfulness, and intertextual acrobatics, and probably also at some point drive the reader back to the traditional texts."[58] As I have suggested in a previous article,[59] the oldest versions of these tales which belong to a culture of oral tradition seem to be closer to a posthumanist outlook with their emphasis on unity and harmony among all, humans and non-humans. Therefore, it would be safe to assume that the various retellings and rewritings of these tales over the centuries have completed a cycle in which the long period of humanist viewpoints might be considered the downfall right before the upward movement restarted. Since it is a cyclical movement, each step carries with it traces of the previous. In that sense, Badmington's reference to Derrida becomes relevant:

> If, Derrida noted, meaning depends upon difference, then meaning forever depends upon the *trace* of the other–the excluded, the different-within the same. […] he pointed out, 'without a trace retaining the other as other in

---

[57] Bruno Latour, *We Have Never Been Modern,* trans. Catherine Porter (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1993), 145.

[58] Kirsten Møllegaard, "Critical and Creative Perspectives on Fairy Tales: An Intertextual Dialogue between Fairy-Tale Scholarship and Postmodern Retellings by Vanessa Joosen," review of *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* eds. Kate Berhheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith, *South Atlantic Review* 76, no. 1 (Winter 2011): 148.

[59] Seda Pekşen, "Children's Literature as a Tool for Gender Appropriation," *Ankara Üniversitesi Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya Fakültesi Dergisi* 52, no. 2 (2012): 151-166.

the same, no difference would do its work and no meaning would appear.'[60]

Another significance of these tales is that they force the reader to reconsider their perception of the traditional versions of these fairy tales, which they may read to their children, thereby shaping the worldview of the next generation. This is a fact that many of the writers in the collection mention in their postscripts when explaining how they were inspired to rewrite those particular tales based on their own experiences of listening to them as children and reading them to their own. Humans are superior beings in the sense that they are the ones who have the power to make a change for the whole environment and all living things, through a selfless acceptance of multiplicity and unity. Man needs to move beyond the human by transgressing the boundaries he has set between himself and his non-human others, and he should embed such a view of the world in the minds of the new generations to create a radical change and make it long-lasting. To me, this is what the "post" of posthumanism is all about. Retelling the old tales might be an effective starting point so that humans will be encouraged to write their own stories with a similar outlook in the coming ages.

References

Andersen, Hans Christian. *The Complete Illustrated Works of Hans Christian Andersen.* London: Chancellor Press, 2001.

Ascott, Roy and Edward A. Shanken. *Telematic Embrace: Visionary Theories of Art, Technology, and Consciousness.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003.

Badmington, Neil. *Alien Chic: Posthumanism and the Other Within.* London: Routledge, 2004.

Barrett, Michéle. *The Politics of Truth: From Marx to Foucault.* Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991.

Bernheimer, Kate. "Introduction." In *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. New York: Penguin Books, 2010. Kindle.

Braidotti, Rosi. *The Posthuman.* London: Polity, 2013.

---

[60] Jacques Derrida, *Of Grammatology,* trans. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976) quoted in Badmington, *Alien Chic,* 153-154.

Brothers Grimm, the. *The Complete Fairy Tales*. Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Editions, 1997.

Cunningham, Michael. "The Wild Swans." In *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. New York: Penguin Books, 2010. Kindle.

Davies, Tony. *Humanism.* London: Routledge, 1997.

Derrida, Jacques. "The Animal That Therefore I Am (More to Follow)," translated by David Wills. *Critical Inquiry 28* (Winter 2002): 369-418.

Derrida, Jacques. "'Eating Well,' or the Calculation of the Subject: An Interview with Jacques Derrida." In *Who Comes After the Subject?* edited by Eduardo Cadava, Peter Connor and Jean-Luc Nancy, 96-119. New York: Routledge, 1991.

Derrida, Jacques. *Of Grammatology.* Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976.

Fowler, Karen Joy. "Halfway People." In *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. New York: Penguin Books, 2010. Kindle.

Fukuyama, Francis. *Our Posthuman Future: Consequences of the Biotechnology Revolution.* New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2002.

Haraway, Donna. *Simians, Cyborgs, and Women: The Reinvention of Nature.* New York: Routledge, 1991.

Hayles, N. Katherine. *How We Became Posthuman: Virtual Bodies in Cybernetics, Literature, and Informatics*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1999.

Jackson, Shelley. "The Swan Brothers." In *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. New York: Penguin Books, 2010. Kindle.

Latour, Bruno. *We Have Never Been Modern*, translated by Catherine Porter. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1993.

Maguire, Gregory. "Foreword." In *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. New York: Penguin Books, 2010. Kindle.

Møllegaard, Kirsten. "Critical and Creative Perspectives on Fairy Tales: An Intertextual Dialogue between Fairy-Tale Scholarship and Postmodern Retellings by Vanessa Joosen." Review of *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Berhheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. *South Atlantic Review 76,* no. 1 (Winter 2011): 145-148.

Nietzsche, Friedrich. *Thus Spoke Zarathustra.* Great Britain: Penguin Books, 1961.

Pekşen, Seda. "Children's Literature as a Tool for Gender Appropriation." *Ankara Üniversitesi Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya Fakültesi Dergisi* 52, no. 2 (2012): 151-166.

Pepperell, Robert. *The Posthuman Condition: Consciousness Beyond the Brain.* Bristol: Intellect Books, 2003.

Remshardt, Ralf. "Posthumanism." In *Mapping Intermediality in Performance,* edited by Sarah Bey-Cheng, Chiel Kattenbelt, Andy Lavender and Robin Nelson. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010.

Shmeink, Lars. "Dystopia, Science Fiction, Posthumanism, and Liquid Modernity." In *Biopunk Dystopias: Genetic Engineering, Society and Science Fiction*, 18-70. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2016.

Verdier, Yvonne. "Little Red Riding Hood in Oral Tradition." *Marvels & Tales: Journal of Fairy-Tale Studies* 11, no. 1-2 (1997): 101-123.

Weinstone, Ann. *Avatar Bodies: A Tantra for Posthumanism.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2004.

Wells, Kellie. "The Girl, the Wolf, the Crone." In *My Mother She Killed Me, My Father He Ate Me: Forty New Fairy Tales,* edited by Kate Bernheimer and Carmen Giménez Smith. New York: Penguin Books, 2010. Kindle.

Wolfe, Cary. *Animal Rites: American Culture, the Discourse of Species, and Posthumanist Theory.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2003.

CHAPTER SIXTEEN

SARAH KANE'S EXPERIMENTATION
WITH THE PINTERESQUE IN *BLASTED*

YIĞIT SÜMBÜL

Sarah Kane led a highly conservative life until her college years in which she directed her attention to studying drama and playwriting and put away her beliefs in any kind of social institutions. Until her death by suicide at the age of 28 in 1999, Kane finished her studies in drama, took courses on playwriting, wrote a couple of sketches at a minor theatre company and got hospitalized twice for severe depression which turned out to be a fruitful source of inspiration for her later writing.[1] Kane's short literary career proved relatively productive with the publication of five full-length plays and one short screenplay. She earned an immediate reputation, or rather notoriety, after the performance of her first play, *Blasted*, in 1995 at the Royal Court Theatre[2] on which she received severe criticism due to her "immature", "filthy" and plainspoken representation of violence and rape with an abusive language on stage[3]. Kane produced four more plays in the following four years, *Phaedra's Love* (1996), *Cleansed* (1998), *Crave* (1998) and *4.48 Psychosis* (2000), along with the screenplay titled *Skin* (1995) with similar themes explored and similar controversy stirred.

Kane's *Blasted* depicts several kinds of violence -physical, sexual, verbal and psychological- inflicted first by the protagonist Ian, a middle-aged local journalist and a spy for the government, on Cate, a young and gullible girl in her early twenties, and then by an unnamed soldier on Ian

---

[1] David Greig, "Introduction." In *Sarah Kane: Complete Plays* (London: Methuen, 2001), 90.

[2] Royal Court Theatre, "Blasted at The Royal Court Theatre." *Royal Court Theatre Productions Limited* (1995). Accessed August 17, 2016, https://royalcourttheatre.com/whats-on/blasted/.

[3] Richard Eyre and Nicholas A Wright, *Changing stages: a view of British and American theatre in the twentieth century* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2001), 400.

in a claustrophobic hotel room in Leeds. Kane's *Skin*, on the other hand, reflects the victimization of a racist skinhead by a black woman whom he falls in love with. She explores similar themes like violence, sexual abuse and lack of belief in *Phaedra's Love*, a loose rewriting of Seneca's *Phaedra* given a present-time setting and performed in 1996 for the first time, through Phaedra's sexual interest in her stepson, Hippolytus, culminating in the former's suicide and the latter's death by mutilation in and by the public. Kane's third play *Cleansed* deals with issues like incest, homosexual love, physical violence and mutilation, gender reassignment and drugs in a place like a detention camp. Her last two plays *Crave* and *4.48 Psychosis* sacrifice plot and characters to technical and stylistic experimentation with emphasis on the disturbed psychologies and turbulent nostalgic yearnings of the speakers. The former gives voice to four speakers, each named with a letter from the alphabet -A, B, C, M-, in their overlapping, self-contradicting and autobiographical narratives. The latter, on the other hand, does not even appoint a speaker to the fragmented lines which turn out to be an account revealing the psychotic relapse of a depressed patient in the small hours.

Alex Sierz describes Sarah Kane's drama as disengagement with the traditional naturalist drama which dominated the European and American stage in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century.[4] It draws heavily on classical Roman tragedy, specifically Seneca's with its explicit representation of violence on the stage, and Jacobean tragedy with such themes as incest, mutilation and bloodshed. Kane's name has also been associated with the turn-of-the-century tendency called "postdramatic theatre" formulated by the German theoretician Hans-Thies Lehmann in his book of the same name. According to Lehmann, Sarah Kane is one of the first practitioners of postdramatic theatre with her sacrificing of plot and logic for the sake of "an autonomous theatricality".[5] Similarly, in her introduction to the first English edition of Lehmann's book, Jürs-Munby delineates Kane as a postdramatic dramatist – her *4:48 Psychosis* and *Crave* being distinctive examples – in her experimentation with untraditional forms and incorporation of the audience into the dramatic action as well as the meaning-making process.[6] In addition, contrary to most of her contemporaries, Kane departs dramatically from Brecht's epic

---

[4] Aleks Sierz, *In-yer-face theatre: British drama today* (London: Faber and Faber, 2001), 120-121.
[5] Hans-Thies Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, trans. Karen Jürs-Munby (London and New York: Routledge, 2006), ix, 18.
[6] Karen Jürs-Munby, "Introduction." In *Postdramatic Theatre* (London and New York: Routledge, 2006), 6.

tradition in her ideal to create an experiential effect on the audience with the action going on on the stage. Her experiential theatre, however, bears the thematic and stylistic traces of Samuel Beckett's absurd drama, Edward Bond's cruelty plays and Harold Pinter's comedy of menace.[7] Among these influences, Pinter's famous menace plays and a set of technical devices named Pinteresque after his work find the most evident repercussions in Kane's plays. Pair characters, monosyllabic language verging on triviality, enclosed space for a setting and the claustrophobic atmosphere, presence of the signs of an external threat, internal peace being ravished by an outsider, power struggle among characters and pauses in-between speeches which characterize Pinter's famous works are frequently used by Kane throughout her career, especially in her first play *Blasted*. This study, in this respect, aims to analyse Kane's *Blasted* in terms of the technical devices referred to as Pinteresque and thematic aspects associated with Pinter's comedy of menace.

The Online Oxford English Dictionary defines the term Pinteresque as "of or relating to Harold Pinter; resembling or characteristic of his plays [which] are typically characterized by implications of threat and strong feeling produced through colloquial language, apparent triviality, and long pauses".[8] In the Swedish Academy's manual on Pinter's winning of the Nobel Prize, the style Pinteresque is given a comprehensive definition as follows:

> Pinter restored theatre to its basic elements: an enclosed space and unpredictable dialogue, where people are at the mercy of each other and pretence crumbles. With a minimum of plot, drama emerges from the power struggle and hide-and-seek of interlocution. Pinter's drama was first perceived as a variation of absurd theatre, but has later more aptly been characterised as 'comedy of menace', a genre where the writer allows us to eavesdrop on the play of domination and submission hidden in the most mundane of conversations. In a typical Pinter play, we meet people defending themselves against intrusion or their own impulses by entrenching themselves in a reduced and controlled existence. Another principal theme is the volatility and elusiveness of the past.[9]

---

[7] Graham Saunders, *Love me or kill me: Sarah Kane and the theatre of extremes* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2002), 224.
[8] OED Online Dictionary, Entry on "pinteresque", Accessed: August 17, 2016, http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/pinteresque.
[9] Harold Pinter, *Art, Truth and Politics: The Nobel Lecture* (London: Route, 2005), 22-23.
http://www.route-online.com/wp-content/uploads/2009/03/art-truth-and-politics-ebook1.pdf.

Zerhy-Levo also makes a short list of the elements that define Pinteresque as "Pinter's atmospheric gift, […] a rhythmic powerful dialogue [and] the authority to make an audience accept unexplained actions".[10] What she means by the atmospheric gift Pinter's menace plays possess is the tense atmosphere which constantly gives the impression that the peace within the walls will soon be ravished by an external threat. The rhythmic powerful dialogue, on the other hand, refers to Pinter's use of neat timing and pauses in-between speeches as a technique to restrain language within the borders of triviality. Shaw adds a fourth element to this list, contending that Pinter's comedy of menace always involves a power struggle and "the potential destruction of an individual who contends with authority"[11] as a means of political commentary. As widely known, Pinter's menace plays always culminate in the confrontation of the inside characters living in a claustrophobic atmosphere with the menacing parties coming from the chaotic outside world; and out of the power struggle they engage in over domination comes the elimination of one party by the other either by means of death or psychological submission. For instance, in two of Pinter's early plays, *The Birthday Party* (1958) and *The Dumb Waiter* (1960), the way the protagonists – Stanley and Gus respectively - end up illustrates this point very effectively. There is an ongoing power struggle between the protagonists and other characters/forces in these plays culminating in, for example, Stanley's psychological submission in the former and Gus' prospective death in the latter.

As a response to the tradition of the theatre of the absurd, Pinter's comedy of menace also makes use of pair characters whose personalities and speeches contradict one another, adding more to the deliberate meaninglessness of action and triviality of language. The language of Pinter's menace plays, on the other hand, is reduced to monosyllabic expressions, overlapping speeches and meaningless arguments leading to more question marks rather than resolving the plot. "The lines [the characters] utter are never descriptive enough for the reader/audience to grasp exactly what they are talking about".[12] In addition to this, the language of Pinter's menace plays is interspersed with silences known widely as "Pinter pauses" which say as much as spoken words do. As

---

[10] Yael Zarhy-Levo, The Theatrical Critic as Cultural Agent: Constructing Pinter, Orton and Stoppard as Absurdist Playwrights (New York: Peter Lang, 2001), 37.

[11] Marc E. Shaw, "Unpacking the Pinteresque in *The Dumb Waiter* and Beyond." In *Harold Pinter's The Dumb Waiter*, ed. Mary F. Brewer (New York: Rodopi, 2009), 213.

[12] Naoko Yagi, "A Realist-Naturalist Pinter Revisited." In *Harold Pinter's The Dumb Waiter*, ed. Mary F. Brewer (New York: Rodopi, 2009), 7.

Pinter himself argues: "There are two silences. One when no word is spoken. The other when perhaps a torrent of language is being employed. This speech is speaking of a language locked beneath it. That is its continual reference. The speech we hear is an indication of that which we don't hear.[13] The two above mentioned plays are regarded as the best examples of Pinter's menace plays in which the Pinteresque is best manifested by means of language, setting, and characters. In both plays, for instance, the setting is one claustrophobic room whose internal peace is ravished by outsiders. In *The Birthday Party*, the pair characters Goldberg and McCann come into Stanley's world from an unknown external source which is described by the two as dangerous and troublesome. Similarly, in *The Dumb Waiter,* the pair characters Gus and Ben find themselves in a claustrophobic basement room with no windows, depicting the external world through newspaper articles and personal accounts as a chaotic place. The language in *The Birthday Party* is far from making sense, especially when Goldberg and McCann are interrogating Stanley with trivial questions like "which comes first the chicken or the egg?".[14] Similarly, the dialogues between Ben and Gus in *The Dumb Waiter* are mostly in the form of monosyllabic, overlapping expressions, swiftly changing from one subject to another.

Kane's first play *Blasted* does not actually offer much of a plot other than two people, stuck in a hotel room, talking about various things and a set of sexual abuses of one character on another. It opens with Ian and Cate, a 45-year-old journalist and government spy from Leeds and a 21-year-old Southerner girl, coming into the luxurious hotel room in which they engage in a series of pointless action and talking. The two-pass time with small talk over their long-consumed relationship, Ian's sickness and mysterious job in the government along with Cate's occasional seizures especially after Ian forces her to perform oral sex on him. As Cate escapes the room through the bathroom window, an unnamed soldier comes into the room and begins to dominate Ian verbally, physically and sexually at gunpoint. After the soldier interrogates Ian about his job, the hotel is blown up by a mortar bomb. After getting conscious again, the two men exchange opinions and memories regarding the savageness of the outside world until the soldier rapes Ian, eats his eyes and finally kills himself with a bullet in the head. When Cate returns with a baby on her arms, she finds Ian in a miserable condition and decides to go out again in order to

---

[13] Harold Pinter, "Introduction." In *Pinter Plays: One* (London: Methuen, 1976), 14.
[14] Harold Pinter, "The Birthday Party." In *Harold Pinter: Plays One* (London: Faber and Faber, 1996), 46.

find some food for all three of them. Before she goes, she realizes that the baby is already dead and buries it under the floorboards. In Cate's absence, Ian feels so hungry that he eats the dead body of the baby. Cate returns with some food with blood running down her legs, an indication that she was raped by soldiers in exchange for the food, and watches Ian die in misery.

Even though this plotline seems considerably loose and inconsequential, it abides by the experimentalism pertaining to the decade in which the play was written along with the experientialism which characterizes the in-yer-face theatre. Indeed, the final decades of the twentieth century saw a decline in playwrights' interest in piecing together a plot that is coherent and complete in itself along with strife at liberating the performance from the domination of the written text.[15] This tendency that Lehmann designates as "postdramatic theatre" has veritably manifested itself by an increase in the use of fragmented, sketchy dramatic texts with an emphasis on the interaction between the performer and the audience. In an interview given to a fellow playwright, Kane explains how she came up with the idea of this unordinary plot:

> With *Blasted* I think that it was a direct response to material as it began to happen. I knew that I wanted to write a play about a man and a woman in a hotel room, and that there was a complete power imbalance which resulted in a rape. I started writing and one night I switched on the news [...] And there was a very old woman's face in Srebrenica just weeping […] So I thought, "what could possibly be the connection between a common rape in a Leeds hotel room and what's happening in Bosnia"? And suddenly the penny dropped and I thought, "of course it's obvious - one is the seed and the other is the tree."[16]

Kane's mingling of these two seemingly irrelevant topics –that is the private case of two lovers in a hotel room in the Western Europe with the case of a global tragedy in Eastern Europe- serves bigger purposes than just raising awareness to the violence governing the world and criticizing the indifference of the general public to the massacre carried out in Bosnia. It completely changes the perception of drama at the turn of the century and lays the foundations of a uniquely direct, blunt and to-the-face kind of theatre aiming to shake the audience out of its banal passiveness and habituality by means of an incoherent plot secondary to the

---

[15] Hans-Thies Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, 16.

[16] Dan Rebellato, "Brief Encounter Platform." In *Public Interview with Sarah Kane* (London: Royal Holloway College, 1998), Accessed August 20, 2016, https://shotgunplayers.org/online/blasted-reviews.

performative aesthetics of the play. However, Kane's technical and thematic breakthrough is not born out of the blue, but out of her exposure to Pinter's drama and the style Pinteresque named after the playwright.

Very much like in most absurd plays, which Pinter's early plays are representatives of, Kane's *Blasted* opens with a similar pair of characters, Ian and Cate, who represent completely opposite personalities. Throughout the play, Ian gradually establishes domination over Cate by means of his offensive, dirty language which is contradicted by Cate's naïve, even sometimes silly, expressions. For instance, Ian's talk to his colleague on the phone reveals his dirty language, hence his character: "That one again, I went to see her. Scouse tart, spread her legs. No. Forget it. Tears and lies, not worth the space. No. […] Tosser".[17] Cate's always-neat and grammatically-correct English is constantly contradicted by Ian's grammatically-poor, dirty English full of swearwords, insults and slang words, which situate both characters into opposite binaries of personality and symbolism. Furthermore, Ian's racist and homophobic comments are always contrasted by Cate's political correctness, which adds a new dimension to his coarseness and aggression that help him establish domination over her:

> Ian: Yes. His mother's a *lesbos*. Am I not preferable to that?
> Cate: Perhaps she's a nice person.
> Ian: She *don't* carry a gun.
> Cate: I expect that's it.
> Ian: I loved Stella till she became a witch and *fucked off with a dyke*, and I love you, though you've got   the potential.
> Cate: For what?
> Ian: *Sucking gash*.
> Cate: (Utters an inarticulate sound)
> Ian: You ever *had a fuck* with a woman?
> Cate: No.
> Ian: Do you want to?
> Cate: Don't think so. *Have you? With a man*.
> Ian: You think I'm a *cocksucker*? You've seen me. (He vaguely indicates his groin.) How can you think that?
> Cate: I don't. I asked. You asked me.
> Ian: You dress like a *lesbos*. I don't dress like a *cocksucker*.
> Cate: What do they dress like?
> Ian: Hitler was wrong about *the Jews who have they hurt* the queers he should have gone for *scum them and the wogs and fucking football fans send a bomber over Elland Road finish them off*.[18] (italics mine)

---

[17] Sarah Kane, *Complete Plays*, 13.
[18] Ibid., 18-19.

In addition, Ian tries to prove himself physically superior to Cate when he forces her to kiss him and perform oral sex on him. Ian's violent and aggressive character is juxtaposed with Cate's childish and fragile personality seen in her sucking of her thumb and stuttering when she feels under pressure. This is clearly seen in the stage directions when Ian forces her to have sex with him: "Ian kisses her. She responds. He puts his hand inside her shirt and moves it towards her breast. With the other hand he undoes his trousers and starts masturbating. He begins to undo her shirt. She pushes him away. […] He starts to kiss her again. […] Cate panics. She starts to tremble and make inarticulate crying sounds. Ian stops […] She sucks her thumb".[19] The play employs pair characters again with Cate going out and Soldier coming in. With the coming of Soldier, the power struggle changes direction, as soldier is both physically and linguistically more powerful and aggressive than Ian as well as being better-armed. Soldier establishes his domination over Ian by force, first urinating over his pillows and then raping him in a frenzy, as indicated in the stage directions: "He gets up and turns Ian over with one hand. He holds the revolver to Ian's head with the other. He pulls down Ian's trousers, undoes his own and rapes him – eyes closed and smelling Ian's hair. The Soldier is crying his heart out".[20] Soldier's accounts regarding his past reveal that he has been through a great deal of trouble, potentially worse than Ian's, which gives him a self-assigned right to dominate Ian along with everybody else.

The pair characters in the play constantly engage in unpredictable dialogues and mundane conversations which do not necessarily serve the ends of a plot that Kane keeps at minimum. From the very beginning of the play, Ian and Cate discuss various things, jump from topic to topic and deny the audience a meaning of any sort. They begin talking about the hotel, Cate's mentally challenged brother, Ian's marriage, Cate's choice of clothes, her occasional seizures and then move on to Ian's deadly smoking habit, Cate's boyfriend Shaun, sex, Ian's real job in the government and even football at some point, which does not offer a coherent plotline to the audience. Reminiscent of Lehmann's formulation of postdramatic theatre, the traditional dialogue in Kane's plays does not render service to communication between characters, but rather serves gap-filling purposes in the actors' engagement with the audience. In Lehmann's own words, in such postdramatic plays, "the actual dialogue takes place between sound and sound space, not between the interlocutors. The figures each speak on

---

[19] Ibid., 14.
[20] Ibid., 49.

their own".[21] The same thing applies to the dialogue between Ian and Soldier who talk about the war, sex, homosexuality, and rape until the Soldier abruptly kills himself. This is very reminiscent of the dialogue between Gus and Ben in Pinter's *The Dumb Waiter*, which does not go beyond a trivial discussion about whether "lighting the kettle" or "putting on the kettle"[22] is the correct expression. This fragmental speech pattern is accompanied by a series of pointless actions, even verging on triviality, which serves the ends of complicating the plot further. For example, at the beginning of the play, Ian orders sandwiches from the room service and, after some time, they hear a knock on the door. Ian startles and takes his gun from the holster. When Cate opens the door, they see nobody, just a tray of sandwiches in front of the door. On the next morning, things get even weirder, with the second knock at the door, followed by a third and more knocks to which Ian responds by knocking back:

> There are two loud knocks at the outer door. Ian draws his gun, goes to the door and listens. The door is tried from outside. It is locked. There are two more loud knocks.
> Ian: Who's there?
> Silence. Then two more loud knocks.
> Ian: Who's there?
> Silence. Then two more knocks. Ian looks at the door. Then he knocks twice. Silence. Then two more knocks from outside. Ian thinks. Then he knocks three times. Silence. Three knocks from outside. Ian knocks once. One knock from outside. Ian knocks twice. Two knocks. Ian puts his gun back in the holster and unlocks the door.[23]

Although, at first glance, this looks like a secret code between Ian and the person on the other side of the door, it turns out that Ian does not even know Soldier who comes in with a rifle in his hands after Ian unlocks the door. The dialogue sometimes acquires a rather swift and sharp manner in the form of questions and answers accompanied by the triviality of the subject of the dialogue as well as the action. This is quite reminiscent of Pinter's famous play *The Birthday Party* in which the pair characters Goldberg and McCann interrogate the protagonist, Stanley, about which comes first, chicken or the egg, in a very serious manner. Independently of the play's allusions to the war in Bosnia, the action throughout the play is fragmented, incoherent and far from making sense, which strengthens

---

[21] Hans-Thies Lehmann, *Postdramatic Theatre*, 76-77.
[22] Harold Pinter, "The Dumb Waiter." In *Harold Pinter: Plays One* (London: Faber and Faber, 1996), 125-126.
[23] Sarah Kane, *Complete Plays*, 35-36.

Kane's hand in terms of unsettling and disturbing the audience to the point of external consciousness. The fragmentation of the plot, the incoherence of dialogue and the breaking of the dramatic-dialogic form shakes the audience out of its habituality and invites it to an active meaning-making process, strengthening the experiential effect.

Another central element of the Pinteresque is the air of menace, which gives Pinter's self-crafted genre "comedy of menace" its name, manifesting itself by means of a juxtaposition between the setting of the play, which is usually an enclosed, claustrophobic room with no physical contact with the outside world and the world beyond the walls which is depicted by the characters as mysterious, dangerous and chaotic. The characters inside the walls are always disturbed by a mysterious feeling of threat coming from the outside to ravish the peace inside. In *Blasted*, the only setting is the claustrophobic hotel room whose luxury and peace at the beginning of the play is juxtaposed with the accounts given about the outside through Ian's observations from the window and the newspaper accounts that he reads.

At the beginning of the play, Ian looks through the window and describes the city as: "Hate this city. Stinks. Wogs and Pakis taking over."[24] However, the air of danger outside signified with the words "taking over" does not find a reflection in the hotel room, as Ian is busy with making advances to Cate. When there is a knock at the door, Ian's startling gives the audience the impression that he is afraid of something coming from the outside, possibly related to his mysterious job in the government. The same impression is created when Ian is startled at the loud ringing of the phone. At this point, Ian reports an incident to, possibly, his colleague in the news agency, in which the external world is described once more as a catastrophic and chaotic place in which survival is a miracle: "A serial killer slaughtered British tourist Samantha Scrace […] in a sick murder ritual comma, police revealed yesterday point new par. The bubbly nineteen-year-old from Leeds was among seven victims found buried in identical triangular tombs […] Each had been stabbed more than twenty times and placed face down comma, hands bound behind their backs".[25] This scene is quite reminiscent of the scene in Pinter's *The Dumb Waiter* in which Ben, one of the two protagonists, reads newspaper accounts about an old man run over by a lorry in the street and a little girl killing a cat. Similarly, the appearance of the sandwiches and breakfast plates at the door from an unknown source is the equivalent of the coming of objects like matches and letters by means of the dumb waiter in Pinter's play.

---

[24] Ibid., 4.
[25] Ibid., 12.

Saunders also observes that "there are other similarities which include Gus, Ben, and Ian all working as hired killers for sinister organizations, the continual checking and rechecking of their guns […] Ian and Cate's anxiety whenever they hear a knock [and] the lack of human agency that delivers [things]."[26] With all these elements combined, Kane's *Blasted* seems to be drawing on Pinter's work, specifically *The Dumb Waiter* and *The Birthday Party.*

As a trademark of the Pinteresque, the internal peace of the one-room setting is ravished by the external forces in Kane's *Blasted*, as well. After Ian warns Cate not to go out saying "it's too dangerous,"[27] Cate begins to develop a sense of threat, too, as she is the one who startles when there is a knock on the door for the second time. However, this happens rather slowly in the play, as the audience's expectations for a resolution about the upcoming external threat are always frustrated by the coming of sandwich and breakfast trays with no sign of who is bringing them other than a few mentions of the black room service personnel. Even though Ian and Cate are well aware that there is a war going on outside, they seem to feel so perfectly safe inside the walls of the hotel room that they enjoy their breakfast, the sausages and bacon on it being their only concern, as Cate is vegetarian. When Soldier finally arrives as the representative of the outside, he strengthens the air of menace in the play with his accounts about what is out there. When he finds out that Cate has escaped through the bathroom window, Soldier gives the audience another clue about the reality outside on the streets, though not satisfying them with a full account and, thus, keeping the mystery alive, saying: "Gone. Taking a risk. Lot of bastard soldiers out there."[28] The same mystery is sustained with the explosion that concludes the second scene whose cause turns out to be a mortar bomb that destroys the hotel. Yet, where the bomb comes from is never explained to the audience, so the air of menace is felt until the end.

The mysterious, dangerous outside world is indirectly depicted once more when Soldier gives Ian an account of one of his team's forays at a house which ends with the slaughter of a family. He recounts: "They held the men while I fucked the women. The youngest was twelve. Didn't cry, just lay there. Turned her over and – Then she cried. Made her lick me clean. Closed my eyes and thought of – Shot her father in the mouth.

---

[26] Graham Saunders, *Love me or kill me: Sarah Kane and the theatre of extremes*, 56-57.
[27] Sarah Kane, *Complete Plays*, 28.
[28] Ibid., 38.

Brothers shouted. Hung them from the ceiling by their testicles".[29] It is
obvious that the menace in the outside world is not limited to the war and
the doings of Soldier who continues to reveal his past in which he broke a
woman's neck and snapped her spine by stabbing her between her legs.
When Soldier demands Ian to write his story in the newspaper so that
people will see the reality outside, Ian rejects by telling him that nobody
would be interested in his story. Instead, Ian reads another newspaper
article which proves no less disturbing than the first, adding more to the
picture of the catastrophic "outside": "Kinky car dealer Richard Morris
drove two teenage prostitutes into the country, tied them naked to the
fences and whipped them with a belt before having sex".[30] Towards the
end of the play, Cate comes back from outside with some food in her
hands and blood oozing down between her legs, proving that she has
bargained her body for the food. She says: "A woman gave me her baby.
[…] Don't know what to do with it".[31] However, the baby ends up dead
and eaten by the hopeless Ian, proving that the outside finally invaded the
inside completely, devastating the protagonist, Ian, both psychologically
and physically very much like Stanley in *The Birthday Party* and Gus in
The Dumb Waiter.

   One last element that defines the Pinteresque is the pause or silence
which Pinter himself describes as an opposition to "that tired, grimy
phrase: 'Failure of Communication.'"[32] For him, silence tells as much as
speech does, sometimes even more, in a situation when communication
comes to the verge of rupture. Pinter elaborates on his use of silences as a
characteristic of his plays saying: "When true silence falls we are still left
with echo but are nearer nakedness. One way of looking at speech is to say
that it is a constant stratagem to cover nakedness."[33] In Pinter's plays,
silences and pauses are used as a strategy to give clues about the
characters' real identities, feelings and thoughts by pushing them to the
very extremes where speech loses its capacity to express. Silences have
proved quite functional and expressive in the theatre of post-war Europe
where dialogue brought only destruction and death. The post-war
European dramatists understand that the dramatic-dialogic discourse has
hitherto reduced itself to general catchphrases and clichés, and they resort

---

[29] Ibid., 43.
[30] Ibid., 48.
[31] Ibid., 51.
[32] Harold Pinter, "Between the Lines." *The Sunday Times*, March 4, 1962, 25.
[33] Harold Pinter, "When True Silence Falls," in *European Literature from Romanticism to Postmodernism: A Reader in Aesthetic Practice*, ed. Martin Travers (New York: A&C Black, 2001), 323.

to absence or deferral of words in order to more faithfully represent the prevailing speechlessness and anxiety of their time. More specifically, "Pinter capture[s] th[is] anxiety and ambiguity of life in the second half of the twentieth century with terse, hypnotic dialogue filled with gaping pauses and the prospect of imminent violence."[34] This central element of the Pinteresque, however, does not find its way into Kane's *Blasted* as soundly as her other plays *Cleansed* and *Crave*. In the scene where Ian is startled by the knocks on the door, Kane makes use of silences to contribute to the absurdity of the situation as well as to add to the mystery pervading the play from the beginning. Then, Soldier uses silence as a means to suppress Ian psychologically, revealing his fears and frail personality to the audience. At the end of the play, Cate watches the dying Ian in silence only accompanied by the sound of the rain with her thumb again in her mouth. Her silence is rather telling regarding her character which remains childish and fragile even after all she has gone through. Even though *Blasted* does not offer much of 'Pinter Pause', it certainly leads the way to Kane's later plays in which she displays her mastery in the use of silences and pauses.

Sarah Kane's short literary career and limited number of plays have attracted considerable critical attention among scholars of drama all around the world due to her outstanding stance against traditional forms and subject matters which have dominated stages in the western world for centuries. Her drama marks a breakthrough in the 90s with the explicit depictions of violence and sexual content on the stage along with the unconventional language and the performative elements which are to be labelled later as "postdramatic" in the following decades. However, Kane's drama is not completely independent from the influences of previous forms of theatre. Kane's plays have been examined a number of times in their relations and responses to the Theatre of the Absurd of the post-war period in their plots, to the Theatre of Cruelty of the 60s and 70s in their use of violence, to the Brechtian Epic Theatre in their political outlook and even to the Senecan tragedies along with Jacobean tragedy in their reflection of explicit violence, mutilation and bloodshed on the stage.

Kane's *Blasted*, perhaps her best-known play, offers much for a similar parallel reading with the preceding drama thanks to its subject matter drawing heavily on violence, sexuality, and war as well as to the technical

---

[34] Mel Gussow and Ben Brantley, "Harold Pinter, The Playwright of the Pause, Dies at 78", *The New York Times*, December 25, 2008, Accessed November 18, 2016, http://www.nytimes.com/2008/12/26/theatre/26pinter.html.

and linguistic elements it utilizes. However, the play proves rather fruitful
for reading in relation to the potential influences of Harold Pinter's self-
crafted style called the Pinteresque on Kane both thematically and
technically. The major characteristics of the Pinteresque including the air
of menace pervading the play, a minimum of language verging on
triviality with repetitive and sometimes complicated expressions, pair
characters in a power struggle or individual characters in an identity crisis
and silences find their ways into Kane's play, making it a potential
Pinteresque play of menace.

   Blasted takes place in a one-room setting from the beginning till the
end, which proves rather claustrophobic for the characters as time passes
and the plot is kept at a minimum with a pair of characters engaging in a
power struggle over domination of one another. The dialogues are never
serving the ends of a plot, either, with a constant change of topic,
sometimes verging on absurdities. The characters are always on edge with
a feeling of threat coming from the outside whose source remains
unknown to them, as well as to the audience, throughout the play. The
play ends, very much like Pinter's menace plays, with the internal peace of
the setting being ravished by outside forces, which leads to the collapse of
the protagonist both physically and psychologically. Even though Kane
makes us of silences and pauses more abundantly in her later plays,
Blasted also offers some examples of them used with a purpose of adding
to the mystery pervading the atmosphere and to give clues about the
characters' true personalities. With all these elements taken into
consideration, it is quite affirmable that Kane acknowledges Pinter's
influence on her art[35] and masterfully experiments with the Pinteresque in
her first play.

References

Eyre, Richard, and Nicholas A. Wright. *Changing stages: a view of British
    and American theatre in the twentieth century*. New York: Alfred A.
    Knopf, 2001.
Greig, David. "Introduction." In *Sarah Kane: Complete Plays*, edited by
    David Greig, ix-xviii. London: Methuen, 2001.

---

[35] See: Marc E. Shaw, "Unpacking the Pinteresque in the Dumb Waiter and
Beyond." 222 & Graham Saunders, *Love me or kill me: Sarah Kane and the
theatre of extreme*, 56-57.

Gussow, Mel, and Ben Brantley. "Harold Pinter, The Playwright of the Pause, Dies at 78." New York Times, December 25, 2008. Accessed November 18, 2017.
http://www.nytimes.com/2008/12/26/theatre/26pinter.html.

Kane, Sarah. *Complete Plays*. London: Methuen, 2001.

Lehmann, Hans-Thies. *Postdramatic Theatre*, translated by Karen Jürs-Munby. London and New York: Routledge, 2006.

OED Online Dictionary. "Pinteresque.", Accessed November 11, 2017.
http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/pinteresque.

Pinter, Harold. *Art, Truth and Politics: The Nobel Lecture*. London: Route, 2005.   http://www.route-online.com/wp-content/uploads/2009/03/art-truth-and-politics-ebook1.pdf.

Pinter, Harold. "Between the Lines." The Sunday Times, March 4, 1962.

Pinter, Harold. "The Birthday Party." In *Harold Pinter: Plays One*, 1-84. London: Faber and Faber, 1996.

Pinter, Harold. "The Dumb Waiter." In *Harold Pinter: Plays One*, 111-150. London: Faber and Faber, 1996.

Pinter, Harold. "Introduction: Writing for the Theatre." In *Pinter Plays: One*, 9-16. London: Methuen, 1976.

Pinter, Harold. "When True Silence Falls." In *European Literature from Romanticism to Postmodernism: A Reader in Aesthetic Practice*, edited by Martin Travers, 321-323. New York: A&C Black, 2001.

Rebellato, Dan. "Brief Encounter Platform: Public Interview with Sarah Kane". London: Royal Halloway College, 1998.
https://shotgunplayers.org/online/blasted-reviews.

Royal Court Theatre. "Blasted at The Royal Court Theatre." January 12, 1995. Accessed August 17, 2016. https://royalcourttheatre.com/whats-on/blasted/.

Saunders, Graham. *Love me or kill me: Sarah Kane and the theatre of extremes*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2002.

Shaw, Marc E. "Unpacking the Pinteresque in The Dumb Waiter and Beyond." In *Harold Pinter's The Dumb Waiter*, edited by Mary F. Brewer, 211-230. New York: Rodopi, 2009.

Sierz, Aleks. *In-yer-face theatre: British drama today*. London: Faber and Faber, 2001.

Yagi, Naoko. "A Realist-Naturalist Pinter Revisited." In *Harold Pinter's The Dumb Waiter*, edited by Mary F. Brewer, 1-16, New York: Rodopi, 2009.

Zarhy-Levo, Yael. *The Theatrical Critic as Cultural Agent: Constructing Pinter, Orton and Stoppard as Absurdist Playwrights*. New York: Peter Lang, 2001.

CHAPTER SEVENTEEN

THE ROLE OF ART TOWARDS AN UNDERSTANDING OF REALITY: THE AESTHETIC ON THE DEFENCE OF CONSCIOUSNESS

ANNA ASIATIDOU

What is Reality? A kind of question that may be perceived as vague, common, and shallow even though any effort to answer it seems extremely complex. Forming a standard definition for Reality stirs dispute. In a simplified effort to understand what reality is, we can distinguish between a philosophical meaning of Reality and a daily meaning of it. The philosophical meaning discussed in this work is based on the perception of absolute and divine truth. It is more of an idealistic notion involving the sensual, the divine, and true beauty. The secular meaning of reality is perceived as the practical life, actuality, and a material reality secured by the fact of physical phenomena. However, the true question is not what Reality is but who forms reality. Is reality a given condition independent of our wants and wishes or an individually formed condition? Complex by its intrinsic value, the concept of reality (real life) flirts with the concept of beauty represented by artistic forms, discourses, and expressions, such as poetry. My discussion focuses on Platonic philosophy, Kantian philosophy, and the Aesthetic movement as basic ideological stations that negotiate the nature of the relation between the aesthetic and reality. Equally, it incorporates post-material studies on art that point out the need for a shift of interest from reality to consciousness and contemporary theories on the aesthetic that contribute to the understanding of the interrelation between the perception of life and the perception of the aesthetic as truth.

The dialogical relationship between art and life is rooted in the ancient philosophical inquiries about aesthetics and the latter's relation to human nature and reality. In the famous Platonic dialogues of *Symposium*, *Phaedrus*, and *Republic*, Socrates, the main participant-philosopher, carries on long

conversations about art, beauty, and knowledge of the soul in the quest of pure truth and divine reality. The complex concepts of art, beauty, knowledge, and truth/reality become understandable through conversation, a form of expression that encourages free speech. Throughout the dialogues, the participants are engaged in a dialectic process to discover the truth of their matter. "Dialectic" is a term that Plato used in his *Republic*[1] to define knowledge in the highest state of human cognition and was later adopted by the Neoclassical philosopher Kant as the quality of aesthetic judgement.[2] Dialectic enables man to know, "the soul's ability and activity of conducting the kind of discourse that allows it to deal properly with the forms"[3] and "the soul's ability and process of engaging properly in a dialogue."[4] The genuine knowledge that Plato describes is pure thinking independent of any particular situation, and dialectic united with the dialogic (engagement in dialogue) aims to produce truth. Accordingly, Kant advocates that pure knowledge is mixed with nothing empirical and views art as a means of facilitating the perception of things as unknown. In *Phaedrus*, Socrates declares that true knowledge can be achieved through "know thyself" (γνώθι σεαυτον), that is, the belief that we do not know anything if we do not understand and know first ourselves. Accordingly, in *Republic*, the knowledge of ourselves can be reached through genuine rhetoric,[5] which "is an art by which a speaker guides another to the truth by adjusting his words to the other's soul."[6] Socrates stresses the importance of the form of logos as a means of teaching individuals to discover the truth about themselves and, in general, the truth. In Plato's *Symposium*, knowledge is "innate in the soul, and its eyes have only to turn around and be activated to behold the truth."[7] Plato explains the concept of genuine rhetoric as the form of logos, discourse that promotes dialectic search. Accordingly, he advises rhetoricians to speak rhythmically and musically.[8] Thus, he describes the process of finding the

---

[1] Plato, *Republic*, trans. Benjamin Jowett, https://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/55201.

[2] Immanuel Kant, "Selections from Critique of Judgment [1793]," in *Basic Writings of Kant*, ed. Allen W. Wood, trans. James C. Meredith (USA: Modern Library, 2001), 309.

[3] Plato*, Republic*.

[4] Ibid.

[5] Ibid.

[6] Elizabeth Asmis, "'Psychagogia' in Plato's 'Phaedrus,'" *Illinois Classical Studies* 11, no. 1/2 (1986): 156, http://www.jstor.org/stable/23064075.

[7] Plato, *Symposium*, trans. Benjamin Jowett, https://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/1600.

[8] Ibid.

truth, or knowledge, based on the same terms (form and rhythm) that a poetic value can be judged. In *Phaedrus*, the problems in the form of Lysias' speech make Socrates doubt the beauty of the performance. Through this dialogue, we can realize how the existence or lack of beauty in the form creates ambivalence about the value of and the pleasure given by logos (speech). The significance of form in the determination of aesthetic value and pleasure will be adopted as the main principle in the nineteenth-century Aesthetic movement. Additionally, Socrates states,

> My bossom is full, [...] I could make another speech as good as that of Lysias, and different. Now I am certain this is not an invention of my own, who am well aware that I know nothing, and therefore I can only infer that I have been filled through the ears, like a pitcher, from the waters of another though I have actually forgotten in my stupidity who was my informant.[9]

After he has uttered a well-organized and convincing speech, he admits to Phaedrus that his words are inspired by the Nymphs:

> Go and tell Lysias that to the fountain and school of the Nymphs we went down, and were bidden by them to convey a message to him and to other composers of speeches [...] to all of them we are to say that if their compositions are based on knowledge of the truth, and they can defend or prove them [...] then they are to be called [...] lovers of wisdom or philosophers [...].[10]

Socrates not only connects the beautiful use of logos with the awakening of the mind but also considers his eloquence, the beauty in the form of his logos, as a divine gift. Thus, the accomplishment of a beautiful work does not depend on secular matters of life but divine inspiration. The ancient belief in the sanctity of beauty/form and the independence of inspiration— beauty is given by form through inspiration—were preserved by the Romantic poets who advocated the divine origins of man's creative imagination and the poet's prophetic role. The Romantic view of the independent creative imagination inspired the principle of Aestheticism which considered artworks independent from ideological, political, and moral orientations. Although artworks are not oriented to any of these fields, as witty works of superior perception, they can influence the shaping of social perceptions about life. Similar views are expressed in Plato's *Symposium* in which Diotima's discourse—as it was transmitted

---

[9] Plato, *Phaedrus*, trans. Benjamin Jowett, http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/1636.
[10] Ibid.

from Socrates to his companions—posits beauty in the spiritual sphere, rendering it with divine qualities:

> But what if man had eyes to see the true beauty—the divine beauty, I mean, pure and clear and unalloyed, not clogged with the pollutions of mortality and all the colours and vanities of human life—thither looking, and holding converse with the true beauty simple and divine? Remember how in that communion only, beholding beauty with the eye of the mind, he will be enabled to bring forth, not images of beauty, but realities (for he has hold not of an image but of a reality), and bringing forth and nourishing true virtue to become the friend of God and be immortal, if mortal man may. Would that be an ignoble life?[11]

As Socrates in *Phaedrus*, Diotima connects beauty with the awaking of the consciousness and views it as the ultimate pursuit of the human nature. Supporting the purpose of life centered on aesthetics, Diotima's discourse is particularly dynamic and revealing for a contemporary reader who is interested in aesthetics. Her speech could be the words of a forerunner aesthete since it presents beauty as indifferent to secular concerns and aims, and relates the concept of beauty to divinity, purity, and immortality. Diotima's definition of true beauty is not a beauty of a simple image but a beauty that is attained through mental procedures—like inspiration and imagination—which form reality.

The independence of the aesthetic from the secular is articulated also by Kant through an analysis of the aesthetic judgement. For Kant, the "'pure' aesthetic experience consists of disinterested contemplation of an object that pleases for its own sake without reference to reality or to the external ends of utility or morality."[12] Living in the age of reason, Kant theoretically alleviates the tension between religion and science by suggesting the explanation of basic religious principles based exclusively on human reason. The domination of pure reason—which is thinking that lacks sensible influences and restrictions—is developed theoretically in his treatises as an understanding shaped in freedom and released from social, secular, and practical causes and restrictions. Kant supported the need for a pure reason for the production of pure knowledge. At the same time, he focused on the limitations of reason to produce knowledge. As a middle solution, he proposed the aesthetic which contains an antithesis in its qualities. The aesthetic can be perceived as a means of producing new forms of knowledge, or a transcendental principle consisting of universal a

---

[11] Plato, *Symposium*.
[12] Kant, "Selections from the Critique of Judgment," 293-294.

priori qualities which produce no knowledge. Plato believed that art may
be beneficial when it expands human knowledge; Kant added that art can
give something more where reason is limited. The aesthetic comes into
being by itself based on the force of unlimited imagination. Hence,
beauty—which is the form of the aesthetic—has self-determined qualities
and an end in itself; thus, beauty can produce new knowledge. Kant found
in aesthetics the endless conditions/possibilities for knowledge and
introduced a new concern, the critique of taste. According to Kant, the
critique of taste is the only condition in the field of aesthetics that can be
applied as the dialectic process that leads to knowledge. Following the
eighteenth-century Kantian concerns about the social function of religion,
the nineteenth-century critic and poet Mathew Arnold focused on art's
social function. Arnold viewed art (poetry) as an elevating, quickening,
and suggestive power which helps us to unite scientific results with man's
desire for aesthetic pleasure and contact. Arnold suggested "a revival of
religion to improve conduct and taste" and a religion whose social
function is based on the service of taste "rather than on its validity."[13] In
other words, the aesthetic/the beautiful as a motive for human survival and
creativity substitutes for a declining religious faith.

The Aesthetic movement appeared during the first decades of the
nineteenth century and continued until the end of it. Although the ways of
expression and aims of aesthetes varied, aestheticism in all of its stages
was connected with radical social thought. In its early stage or "Aristocratic"
aestheticism, Aestheticism was a continuation of Romanticism, regarded as
"a spiritual transcendence […] a spiritual revolt against bourgeois
materialism."[14] Yet, Romanticism supported the sociopolitical relevance
of art from which Aestheticism was progressively liberated. In the "Art for
art's sake" stage of the Aesthetic movement, "the prophetic conception of
the artist shares in common an appeal to aesthetic autonomy as a counter
principle to bourgeois-utilitarian values."[15] Autonomy is used as a
withdrawal from the political and social worlds. Progressively, in
"Radical" aestheticism, the autonomy of the art and the artist controls the
authenticity of artistic truth, which, in turn, is perceived as the fittest law
to direct the political and social worlds. Hence, the aesthetic "withdrawal
of art from reality becomes transformed to merge art and reality or to posit

---

[13] John H. Fisher, "An Anthropological View of the Teaching of Literature," *The
Bulletin of the Rocky Mountain Modern Language Association* 25, no. 1 (1971):
32, http://www.jstor.org/stable/1346605.
[14] Gerald Graff, "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," *Social Research* 40, no. 2
(1973): 312, http://www.jstor.org/stable/40970141.
[15] Ibid., 312.

art as the legislating agent in reality."[16] What remained stable in all the phases of Aestheticism was aesthetes' special devotion to the qualities of beauty and taste as well as the relation of Aestheticism to reality. Based on Aestheticism's acceptance of artistic autonomy, the aesthetic (art) acts as a means of approaching reality, escaping from reality, and/or shaping reality.

Post-material studies on art demonstrate a re-theorizing of reality's concept based on the analysis of its relation to the aesthetic, or, otherwise, aestheticism's denial of its relation to reality. Raymond Williams supports that industrialism, capitalism, and the indifference to arts intensified the need for imaginative autonomy and, in general, art's isolation from the social life as a way to preserve the artistic value.[17] The need for art's autonomy was publicly recognized by taking the form of a movement, Aestheticism, and Aestheticism's motto "art for art's sake" was a declaration of a self-sufficient art. Under the scope of Aestheticism, "the universal forms of consciousness were transmuted into deification of the private imagination of the individual artist."[18] Richard Gilman points out that literature has no need for "experience of any kind except the aesthetic one"[19] and "no reason for being other than to test and exemplify new forms of consciousness, which, moreover, have had to be invented precisely because actuality is incapable of generating them."[20] Thus, Aestheticism emphasises the autonomy of art; it creates reality through a self-sufficient creative imagination, spirituality, individual mind, and consciousness, as opposed to the already established principles of materialism, socialism, and universalism. In his "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," Gerald Graff observes that under the scope of Aestheticism, strictly pre-determined, fixed concepts of reality and history are emerging as a pure creation of the imagination and, thus, are perceived as open-ending concepts, unlimited as far as their possible forms concern.[21] In a way, Aestheticist art re-theorizes the concept of reality by itself since it does not solely widen the perceptions of consciousness. Unintentionally, through the path of its autonomous imagination, Aestheticist art can also reflect the social crisis and can provide an understanding of it; in this way, Aestheticist art

---

[16] Ibid., 313.
[17] Raymond Williams, *Culture and Society: 1780-1950* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1958), 30-48.
[18] Graff, "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," 317.
[19] Richard Gilman, *The Confusion of Realms* (Random House, 1969), 48.
[20] Ibid., 72.
[21] Graff, "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," 328.

constitutes a critical realism.[22] Regarding the re-engagement of the aestheticist art with the social reality, Gilman supports the idea that the desire of the radical aesthetes and their aristocratic forerunners to defeat expectations and assumptions of the bourgeois class reinforces their engagement with the social world; the artist sets himself/herself free from bourgeois modes of perception since he/she introduces "new forms of consciousness."[23] Therefore, literature as artistic expression is a new creation that enriches the world by adding to it something which did not exist before. Furthermore, literature does not mirror or interpret something previously given. Gilman's view leads us to three basic properties of the relation between the aesthetic, art (literature), and reality. Primarily, the concept of reality is an unfixed one. The reality that is produced through the imagination and inspiration of the literary works is "self-sufficient and self-justified"; thus, literature externalizes multiple consciousnesses that comprise reality. Secondly, literature reveals the interconnectedness characterizing the traditional understanding of art, the social, and the real. The perception of literature, not as a reflection of something pre-existed but as a creation that adds to the world something new, reminds us of Plato's valuing the significance of art toward an understanding of reality. Gilman's view adopts the Platonic view that true art should give something good and something new both where there is nothing and where there is something exhausted. Thus, art does not refer to the existing conception of reality (physical world) but the beginning of new perceptions of reality or perceptions above it. Gilman claims that the double nature of art being real but, at the same time, not a part of the reality and literature's capability as something true—produced out of pure perceptions—form reality. The understanding of art's double nature is manifested in the relationship of literature and reality through the dialectic process that is based on the Platonic notion of antilogike. Through the application of antilogike, the independence of literature from reality and/or the concern of literature with reality can be true and, thus, real.

Creating or inspiring beyond reality, literature inevitably has a social function which is that of changing social perspectives. Simultaneously, objective reality offers the ground where art/literature can blossom even as a reaction. Hence, the contrasting character of the relationship between art and reality is rooted in art's and reality's dialogic properties in the course of their interaction. Moving on to an extreme manifestation of Aestheticism, in *The Performing Self*, Richard Poirier claims that literature, life, reality,

---

[22] Graff, "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," 334.
[23] Richard Gilman, "The Idea of the Avant-Garde," *Partisan Review* 39 (1972): 395, http://www.unz.com./print/PartisanRev-1972q3.

and history share the same scope by pointing out the quality of fiction in all of them. [24] According to Graff, this position may appear to represent the very reverse of aestheticism since it eliminates the boundary that aestheticism draws between fiction and the real world: "It may even represent the ultimate logic of aestheticism in an aggressive mood, in which reality and history are absorbed by the literary imagination."[25]

The nineteenth-century moral and ethical objections towards aestheticism were preserved in the "20th century's critical approaches," which, according to Forest Pyle, "could all be said to share [an] aversion to aestheticism."[26] As a movement, Aestheticism is based on the autonomy of the aesthetics, and that is exactly where the twentieth-century critic Adorno based his Aesthetic theory. Pyle comments on Adorno's theory:

> Adorno's Aesthetic theory stands as perhaps its most magisterial if austere achievement, aestheticism is understood dialectically as a critique of the commodification of culture and, simultaneously, as the withdrawal into a reified and ultimately fetishistic conception of an autonomous and pseudo-sacred art.[27]

Pyle points out that Adorno's theory draws our attention to the contrasting qualities of the aesthetic's autonomy and aestheticism's self-demolished promises. The autonomization of the art/poetry from any concern of the real-life could shake at the same time the basis of the aesthetic. Art's unidentified relation with any other aim apart from its autonomy can turn it into an isolated, self-referential, and self-consuming act. In "Aesthetics, Theory, and the Profession of Literature," Marc Redfield supports that aesthetics is pressed by the complexities that come with the efforts to approach and understand it through the dialectic process. The application of the dialectic process in the pursuit of knowledge and truth leads to the aesthetic's "self-destruction" as soon as the aesthetic becomes materialized by taking the form of art/literature; then, however, the aesthetic's reiteration occurs through its isolation as an autonomous and self-aimed creation.[28] Another conflicting quality of the aesthetic concerns the

---

[24] Richard Poirier, *The Performing Self: Compositions and Decompositions in the Languages of Contemporary Life* (USA: Oxford University Press, 1970), 77.
[25] Graff, "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," 328.
[26] Forest Pyle, "Kindling and Ash: Radical Aestheticism in Keats and Shelley," *Studies in Romanticism* 42, no. 4 (2003): 428,
http://www.jstor.org/stable/25601642.
[27] Pyle, "Kindling and Ash: Radical Aestheticism in Keats and Shelley," 429.
[28] Marc Redfield, "Aesthetics, Theory, and the Profession of Literature: Derrida and Romanticism," *Studies in Romanticism* 46, no. 2 (2007): 233,

transformation of its orientation. Graff refers to the change of aestheticism's orientation; he highlights that although aestheticism began as an aristocratic opposition to the bourgeois society, eventually, it "resurfaced in a radicalized form, adapted and assimilated to the drive for 'liberation' conducted by the cultural left."[29] A leftist interpretation of the aesthetic is that art offers (for the aesthetic) the moral condition of freedom (according to Kant's definition of morality) that society denies.[30]

Reaching a realization about the nature of Aestheticism, we can claim that for the aesthetic to exist, its isolation and relation with reality are equally demanded. Even after taking the form of an artwork, the aesthetic cannot be perceived as an act itself. What seems to rescue it from its total self-destruction because of its transmutation to matter is the performance of this materialization by a subject-artist. The subject–artist acts according to a private motive. Inevitably, the aesthetic takes a form that depends on the subject that expresses it. Thus, although it is a discrete force, the aesthetic is realized as a form through the activation of the artist and his/her motive. Focusing on poetry's and psychoanalysis's common interest—the beautiful and the true—in the pursuit of "know[ing] thyself," Meg H. Williams underlines their common approach to the aesthetic's isolation, their understanding of the contradicting qualities of the aesthetic, and their effort to connect different approaches to the aesthetic in order to be led to new perceptions of it, the self, and reality. In both poetry and psychoanalysis, there is "an internal dialogue that takes place in response to an aesthetic object,"[31] and there are analogies in their artistic modes of knowing, perceiving, and, generally, aesthetics as a means of gaining knowledge. Thus, the aesthetic has to do with the reality of our "inward sense," and the material reality, which is a result of our inward sense, can be affected by the aesthetic.[32] Both poetry's and psychoanalysis's actions are performed based on the relation of the two participants with the aesthetic object. In psychoanalysis, the analyst and the analysand focus on the aesthetic object, which is the process of psychoanalysis. Similarly, in the case of poetry, the poet and the reader interact by focusing on the aesthetic object, the poem. Apart from understanding that their focus is on the aesthetic object, the two participants primarily should be unaware of

---

http://www.jstor.org/stable/25602100.

[29] Graff, "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics," 314.

[30] Terry Eagleton, *The Ideology of the Aesthetic* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2000), 65.

[31] Meg H. Williams, *The Aesthetic Development: The Poetic Spirit of Psychoanalysis: Essays on Bion, Meltzer, Keats* (London: Karnac Books, 2010), xv.

[32] Ibid., xvi.

each other to be able, after the analysis of the object, to re-orient themselves and to re-establish their analysis. In this way, every interpretation is a gain of knowledge, and the multiple perceptions and interpretations of the aesthetic object and thyself widen the possibility of perceptions of what is real. The aim of psychoanalysis, like that of poetry, is not to expose yourself and your reality but to create a new perspective on it. To explore art's dependencies and the degree of its self-evaluation, contemporary theories on aesthetics focus on art's inwardness, that is, they examine "what art itself understands."[33] Indeed, it might be deemed uncertainty as art's innermost quality is true. Art's inner qualities of non-finalization, diversion, and anxiety shape art's independent truth. Art's independent truth—which can be also understood as independent perceptions of reality—is a result of an inner dialectic process of its volatile means and purposes. Free from the obligation of clarifying its goals, art highlights truth as its introvert quality and its form/aesthetic as its extrovert quality, preserving its self-evaluation as a multi-perspective truth. Art's maintenance of its objectification towards "the tension between itself and its antithesis" captures its autonomy since "only the autonomous self is able to turn critically against itself and break through its illusory imprisonment."[34]

Contemplating the conflicting fibers of art and the roots of the need for art's autonomy, we are at the point where the existing distance between the two main perspectives of reality is lessened. The philosophical perception of reality is based on the pursuit of the better (in itself) through the control of its conflicts. The social perception of reality is a fixed and common accepted pace of life. Both philosophical and social perceptions of reality are equally accepted under art's social activation as an asocial factor. Moreover, both perceptions of reality are accepted under art's effect in consciousness which progressively leads to social change and a transformation of reality as a philosophical and daily life perception. The new theories about the aesthetic extract the value of an artwork from its capability to provoke questions while it refuses to give certain answers. Therefore, through the process of art's self-definition, the literary theory also reaches a point of acknowledging the kind of knowledge that art can produce. Art must preserve the effect of uncertainty through the avoidance

---

[33] Robert Hullot-Kentor, "Introduction," in *Aesthetic Theory*, Vol. 88, ed. Gretel Adolfo and Rolf Tiedemann, trans. Robert Hullot-Kentor (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1997), xiii.

[34] Theodor W. Adorno*, Aesthetic Theory*, Vol 88, ed. Gretel Adolfo and Rolf Tiedemann, trans. Robert Hullot-Kentor (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1997), 117.

of giving answers, considering the danger of becoming a part of fixed canonicity against which art is located a priori as an aesthetic form. In general, it seems that the attempt of emptying art from its philosophical humanism is in vain. Through its effect of vigilance and uncompromising nature, art suggests changes in the systems of regular activity that man is taught to identify as reality. In the long term, it always works, even unwittingly, for a human's betterment by its persistence in pointing out his false conditions and/or capturing the possibilities and presuppositions of more ideal ones. Despite the nineteenth-century Aestheticism's demonstration of art as independent from didacticism, the aesthetic effect is identified as a kind of education which supports the acceptance of the different, the alternative, and the possible. Thomas Docherty points out the alternity of art, claiming that the aesthetic form has "an attitude of potentiality, an attitude that releases thought like a dance, like an event; and such an attitude is one of a deep hospitality."[35] Although the view of the aesthetic (artistic approach) and antilogike (philosophical approach) as means of approaching reality is a part of the ancient Platonic philosophy, it finds a link with contemporary actuality through the changes in modern thinking about the perceptions of truth. Characteristically, Andrew Bowie writes:

> Issues which emerge in relation to literature are, when connected to developments in contemporary philosophy, germane to issues concerning our self-understanding which do potentially play an important role in engaging with virtually any area of modern society.[36]

In this respect, the aesthetic takes the form of an unfixed experience integral to the truth that culture and philosophy can contemplate. Moreover, if we consider Dollimore's claim that the aesthetic can be perceived as a means of expanding human interest in new unidentified spaces of human thinking, these unidentified spaces may not constitute self-perceptions or perceptions of truth because of their aversion in everything that is taken for granted, especially the self-evident massive experience of reality which confirms what we should be or know about us and not what we are. Therefore, new aestheticism seems to reflect on the aesthetic that exists in art and can be captured as truth beyond the massive

---

[35] Thomas Docherty, "Aesthetic Education and the Demise of Experience," in *The New Aestheticism*, ed. John Joughin and Simon Malpas (Manchester University Press, 2003), 33.
[36] Andrew Bowie, "What Comes after Art?" in *The New Aestheticism*, ed. John Joughin and Simon Malpas (Manchester University Press, 2003), 72.

experience of daily life.[37] In poetry, this modern perception of the aesthetic is expressed by "a movement between aesthesis as a moment of pleasurable openness and ascesis as the moment of discipline and closure,"[38] or, as Heidegger notices, by a condition of "aletheia [...] unconcealment"[39] connecting aesthetics directly with the notion of truth.

As an aesthetic process that gives form to the intrinsic conflicts of the mind, art moves on the perception of the ideal as a moment of reality/truth. Therefore, it can be perceived as an aesthetic process that accepts an approach to the ideal not through fixed knowledge but a balanced psychic condition of accepting conflicting perceptions as true. In this respect, as a process that shapes the form of the aesthetic's self-identification and self-rejection, art can be also perceived as a space open to inexhaustible possibilities of knowledge. Mainly, it can be perceived as infinite forms/ways of the mind to approach an understanding of itself and to answer the timeless question of the meaning of human nature. A brief exploration of different scientific fields supports this perspective. In the field of religion, Ashish Dalela moves towards an aesthetic that recognizes its fundamental relation with religion[40] and can be perceived as a reminder of art's relation to beauty, perfection, and the divine. Alternatively, the theory of the neurosurgeon Eben Alexander[41] supports the possibility of consciousness existing beyond the material form of the human brain. In his aestheticized description of his personal afterlife experience, he declares the existence of consciousness out of the bodily hypostasis. In the field of Quantum mechanics and Astrophysics, Robert Lanza's theory of Biocentrism supports that "consciousness does not die with [the human death], but rather moves on."[42] Using his quantum double split experiment, he documents how consciousness and the material world are connected in the creation of reality towards the revelation of the universe

---

[37] Jonathan Dollimore, "Art in Time of War: Towards a Contemporary Aesthetic," in *The New Aestheticism*, ed. John J. Joughin and Simon Malpas (Manchester University Press, 2003), 46.

[38] Howard Caygill, "The Alexandrian Aesthetic," in *The New Aestheticism*, ed. John Joughin and Simon Malpas (Manchester University Press, 2003), 99.

[39] Martin Heidegger, "On the Origin of the Work of Art," in *Martin Heidegger: Poetry, Language,Thought*, trans. A. Hofstadter (London: Harper & Row, 1971), **quoted in** Robert Eaglestone, "Critical Knowledge, Scientific Knowledge and the Truth of Literature," in *The New Aestheticism*, ed. John Joughin and Simon Malpas (Manchester University Press, 2003), 153.

[40] Ashish Dalela, "The Vedic Theory of Aesthetics,"
http://www.ashishdalela.com/2017/03/31/the-vedic-theory-of-aesthetics.

[41] Alexander Eben, *Proof of Heaven* (Simon and Schuster, 2012), 17-21.

[42] Robert Lanzan and Bob Berman, *Biocentrism* (Bendella Books, 2009), 553.

as a mental construction. In the field of Molecular Engineering, Tony Wright and Graham Gynn highlight the relation between literature and self-awareness:

> Indeed, the myths and religious scriptures over time could be said to form a 'dementia diary' cataloging the emergence and progression of this serious and continuing slide into mental delusion and disconnection. Paradise has been transformed by our machinations into our present materialist, fear-based age of plastic and Prozac. Could these myths actually be a cultural remembrance of a time when we really were perceptually more complete, to a time in which there was less fear, less violence, less craving and more contentment? If so, today, in an age characterized by so much distraction, we have truly forgotten what we were and who we are.[43]

Similarly, Francoise Tibika writes:

> For us here, the most relevant message of the quantum revolution, is that our brain is receiving information coming from these waves of possibilities and is fabricating the image that we see, the colors the shape the smells the taste and the textures of all around us. Quantum theory tells us that the reality we see is only one of the many possible existing options […].[44]

Such claims provide the basis for an alternative and progressive retrospection of the ancient Platonic philosophy about reality/truth.

As a spiritual experience of beauty and perfection, the Platonic perception of reality directs our focus to the core of the most recent post-materialist theories about consciousness as a reality. Because art defends the free artistic consciousness and provides the experience of completeness through an immaterial inspiration of beauty, it is placed in the heart of what we can capture as reality. Such a standpoint affirms the aesthetic's location in a space where it interacts with reality and re-composes its perceptions. The relation of the aesthetic to reality may be perceived as reciprocal since the aesthetic can be accepted as a method of gaining knowledge and the perception of the process of knowing as an aesthetic experience. The aesthetic rejects a fixed perception of reality; thus, its destabilized and rebellious nature entices artists to embrace their inspired artworks as forms of understanding the relativity of reality under a condition of freedom and autonomy. The acknowledgment of art as the

---

[43] Tony Wright and Graham Gynn, *Return To The Brain Of Eden: Restoring the Connection between Neurochemistry and Consciousness* (Inner Traditions, 2014), 4.
[44] Francoise Tibika, "About 'Molecular Consciousness'," http://www.archive.scienceandnonduality.com/author/francoise-tibika.

expressive field of the aesthetic's extensive, multiple, and inspired practices which are perceived as instantaneous perceptions of truth or multiple perceptive realities leads to the realization that the understanding of art's nature is interconnected with the understanding of the nature of reality. The acceptance of the connection between art and reality restores the "usefulness" of art in practical terms through the daily experience of reality and motivates further discussions about the understanding of reality as relative and subjective. Equally, the understanding of the interrelations between the aesthetic and reality broadens our view of who has the power and by what means to change the perception of reality. The negotiating function of art towards the experience of reality expands the theoretical horizons about the workings of consciousness in the pursuit of reality/divine truth.

References

Adorno, Theodor W. *Aesthetic Theory*, Vol 88, edited by Gretel Adolfo and Rolf Tiedemann, translated by Robert Hullot-Kentor. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1997.

Asmis, Elizabeth. "'Psychagogia' in Plato's 'Phaedrus'." *Illinois Classical Studies* 11, no. 1/2 (1986): 153-172.
http://www.jstor.org/stable/23064075.

Bowie, Andrew. "What Comes after Art?" In *The New Aestheticism*, edited by John Joughin and Simon Malpas, 68-82. Manchester University Press, 2003.

Caygill, Howard. "The Alexandrian Aesthetic." In *The New Aestheticism*, edited by John Joughin and Simon Malpas, 99-118. Manchester University Press, 2003.

Dalela, Ashish. "The Vedic Theory of Aesthetics."
https://www.ashishdalela.com/2017/03/31/the-vedic-theory-of-aesthetics/

Docherty, Thomas. "Aesthetic Education and the Demise of Experience." In *The New Aestheticism*, edited by John Joughin and Simon Malpas, 23-35. Manchester University Press, 2003.

Dollimore, Jonathan. "Art in Time of War: Towards a Contemporary Aesthetic." In *The New Aestheticism*, edited by John J. Joughin and Simon Malpas, 36-50. Manchester University Press, 2003.

Eaglestone, Robert. "Critical Knowledge, Scientific Knowledge and the Truth of Literature." In *The New Aestheticism*, edited by John Joughin and Simon Malpas, 151-166. Manchester University Press, 2003.

Eagleton, Terry. *The Ideology of the Aesthetic*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2000.

Eben, Alexander. *Proof of Heaven*. Simon & Schuster, 2012.

Fisher, John H. "An Anthropological View of the Teaching of Literature." *The Bulletin of the Rocky Mountain Modern Language Association* 25, no. 1 (1971): 28-34. http://www.jstor.org/stable/1346605.

Gilman, Richard. *The Confusion of Realms*. Random House, 1969.

Gilman, Richard. "The Idea of the Avant-Garde." *Partisan Review* 39 (1972): 382-397. http://www.unz.com./print/PartisanRev-1972q3.

Graff, Gerald. "Aestheticism and Cultural Politics." Social Research 40, no. 2 (1973): 311-343. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40970141.

Heidegger, Martin. "The Origin of the Work of Art." In *Martin Heidegger: Poetry, Language, Thought*, translated by A. Hofstadter, 17-87. London: Harper & Row, 1971.

Hullot-Kentor, Robert. "Introduction." In *Aesthetic Theory*, Vol. 88, edited by Gretel Adolfo and Rolf Tiedemann, translated by Robert Hullot-Kentor, xi-xxi. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1997.

Kant, Immanuel. "Selections from Critique of Judgment [1793]." In *Basic Writings of Kant*, edited by Allen W. Wood, translated by James C. Meredith, 273-366. USA: Modern Library, 2001.

Lanza, Robert and Bob Berman. *Biocentrism*. Bendella Books, 2009.

Plato, *Phaedrus*, trans. Benjamin Jowett, http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/1636.

Plato, *Republic*, trans. Benjamin Jowett, https://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/55201.

Plato, *Symposium*, trans. Benjamin Jowett, https://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/1600.

Poirier, Richard. *The Performing Self: Compositions and Decompositions in the Languages of Contemporary Life*. USA: Oxford University Press, 1970.

Pyle, Forest. "Kindling and Ash: Radical Aestheticism in Keats and Shelley." *Studies in Romanticism* 42, no. 4 (2003): 427-459. http://www.jstor.org/stable/25601642.

Redfield, Marc. "Aesthetics, Theory, and the Profession of Literature: Derrida and Romanticism." *Studies in Romanticism* 46, no. 2 (2007): 227-246. http://www.jstor.org/stable/25602100.

Tibika, Francoise. "About 'Molecular Consciousness'." http://www.archive.scienceandnonduality.com/author/francoise-tibika.

Williams, Meg H. *The Aesthetic Development: The Poetic Spirit of Psychoanalysis: Essays on Bion, Meltzer, Keats*. London: Karnac Books, 2010.

Williams, Raymond. *Culture and Society: 1780-1950*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1958.

Wright, Tony and Graham Gynn. *Return To The Brain Of Eden: Restoring the Connection between Neurochemistry and Consciousness*. Inner Traditions, 2014.

CHAPTER EIGHTEEN

A CORPUS-BASED ANALYSIS OF WILLIAM BLAKE'S *SONGS OF INNOCENCE* AND *SONGS OF EXPERIENCE*

MELTEM MUŞLU

In the field of linguistics, electronic corpora and corpus-analytic tools have been widely used for more than fifty years. Corpus linguistics (CL hereafter) is "a linguistics methodology which is founded on the use of electronic collections of naturally occurring texts, viz. Corpora.''[1] McEnery and Wilson[2] define CL as the study of language based on examples of 'real-life' language use.

In the last five decades, with the acceleration in the development of computer technology in terms of processing speed and storage capacity of electronic data, and the structured compilation of written or transcribed speech texts, CL has undergone a remarkable revival. As Gries[3] states, CL is one of the fastest-growing methodologies in linguistics, which is also a lively and increasingly multilingual subject.[4] Corpus Linguistics is used in many areas, such as speech research, grammar, applied linguistics, culture, sociolinguistics, lexical studies, literature and stylistics.

Corpus stylistics is the study of literary style via computational tools applied to machine-readable literary works. It combines the science of linguistics with literary studies and is one of the growing interdisciplinary

---

[1] Silviane Granger, *A Bird's-eye view of learner corpus research. In computer learner corpora, second language acquisition and foreign language teaching,* ed. Granger, Sylviane. & Hung, Joseph. & Petch-Tyson, Stephanie. (Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 2002).

[2] Tony McEnery and Andrew Wilson, *Corpus Linguistics (Second Ed.).* (Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 2001).

[3] Stephan Gries, "What is corpus linguistics?" *Language and Linguistics Compass*, 3, (2009): 1–17.

[4] McEnery and Wilson, *Corpus Linguistics (Second Ed.).*

fields between the traditional and digital humanities.[5] As Stubbs[6] points out, either linguists or literary critics have neglected stylistics for different reasons. However, corpora can provide invaluable data for literary and stylistic analysis by providing comparative information through quantitative corpus. According to Stubbs, unique individual texts can be explained by only comparing them with what is normal and expected in general language use; "what happens millions of times is necessary in order to understand the 'unique.'"[7] Corpus stylistics is 'an approach that can link in with the concerns in literary stylistics and criticism', rather than as a field of study that competes with traditional literary studies.[8] In the past, intuition and intelligent handling were predominant. The use of digital methods in literary studies has made the analysis more systematic and technologically equipped.[9]

Corpus analysis validates subjective critical analysis since quantitative analysis guides qualitative analysis.[10] Using CL methodologies does not suggest that corpus techniques should replace manual analysis. On the contrary, it complements the manual analysis by covering additional aspects of a text and adding further techniques to the stylisticians' 'toolkit', with the help of which, analyzing the style associated with individual authors and works can get easier and less complicated.[11]

Although CL has been advancing towards complex quantitative research designs, even the basic toolkit of the field has provided insights into literature. For instance, in his study on Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*,

---

[5] Clarence Green, "Introducing the Corpus of the Canon of Western Literature: A corpus for culturomics and stylistics. Language and Literature," 26 no. 4 (2017): 282–299.
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/321773386

[6] Michael Stubbs, "Conrad in the Computer: Examples of Quantitative Stylistic Methods." *Language and Literature,* 14 no. 1 (2005): 5–24.

[7] Ibid., p. 5.

[8] Michaela Mahlberg, "Clusters, key clusters and local textual functions in Dickens." Corpora, 2 no. 1 (2007): 216.

[9]Jean-Gabriel Ganascia, ''The Logic of the Big Data Turn in
Digital Literary Studies''. Frontiers Digital Humanities, 2 no. 7. (2015).

[10] Dan McIntyre and Brian Walker, "How can corpora be used to explore the language of poetry and drama?" ed. McCarthy, Michael; O'Keeffe, Anne. *The Routledge Handbook of Corpus Linguistic*. (New York: Routledge, 2010), 516-530.

[11] Michaela Mahlberg and Dan McIntyre, "A case for corpus stylistics: Ian Fleming's *Casino Royale*," *English Text Construction,* 4, no. 2 (2011): 204–227.

Stubbs[12] applies, what he calls, 'very simple frequency stuff', such as word lists and collocations to capture important themes and style markers Conrad used. Stubbs stated that the most frequent words he found; such as *seem, like, looked, something, somebody,* and *sometimes,* reflect the vagueness and the sense of the inscrutable-which are the stylistic markers of Conrad.

Similarly, in their study, Scott and Tribble[13] did a keyword analysis of the distinctive words used in Shakespeare's play *Romeo and Juliet*. They built two different corpora; one consisting of *Romeo and Juliet* and the other consisting of all other Shakespeare plays. In the analysis, he compared the two corpora. Culpeper[14] also analyzed *Romeo and Juliet,* but his study focused on the distinctive keywords used by each individual character in the play. He constructed a comparison corpora consisting of the utterances produced by the other characters in the play. He came up with both expected and surprising findings: Romeo uses the words *beauty* and *love* more than the other characters; however, Juliet uses the conditional subordinator *if,* which support Juliet's preoccupation with different possible events that might occur.

Fischer-Starcke[15] employed a similar approach to analyze Jane Austen's *Northanger Abbey* by describing the distinctive keywords in the novel. In the analysis, two different comparison corpora were used: one consisting of Austen's six novels, and one consisting of other fictional texts that are contemporary with Austen. This kind of approach helps us to identify the distinctive words used in a particular literary work (rather than more general words associated with a high-level register).

As corpus stylistics is a developing field, other researchers also tried to apply corpus analysis methods to literature. Quite a number of studies focusing on poetry and verse can be found, Jaafar (2019), Jacobs,[16]

---

[12] Michael Stubbs, "Conrad in the Computer: Examples of Quantitative Stylistic Methods."

[13] Mike Scott and Christoper Tribble, *Textual patterns. Key words and corpus analysis in language education*. (Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 2006).

[14] Jonathan Culpeper, "Keyness: Words, Parts--of--speech and Semantic Categories in the Character-talk of Shakespeare's Romeo and Juliet." *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics* 14, no. 1 (2009): 29-59.

[15] Bettina Fischer-Starcke, "Keywords and frequent phrases of Jane Austen's Pride and Prejudice: A corpus-stylistic analysis." *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics* 14, no. 4 (2009): 492–523.

[16] Arthur M. Jacobs, "Explorations in an English Poetry Corpus: A Neurocognitive Poetics Perspective''. *Frontiers in Digital Humanities*. Available from: https://arxiv.org/abs/1801.02054v1, 2018.

Koristashevskaya,[17] Oliveria,[18] Leech,[19] Mahlberg and McIntyre,[20] Mahlberg,[21] O'Halloran,[22] Viana et. al.[23] to name a few.[24] The purpose of the current study is to apply corpus analysis methods to *Songs of Innocence* and *Songs of Experience*, written by the famous Romantic poet William Blake. Although researchers have studied Blake extensively for many years, as stated previously, applying corpus methods to his works may cover additional aspects of the texts and/or validates what has been said about them so far. Written from 1789 to 1794, in his collections *Songs of Innocence* and *Songs of Experience,* Blake made a relation between literature, nature, and the environment. Blake illustrated the coexistence between the human and nonhuman in nature and he embodied nature and environment through describing different earthly and natural creatures. He criticized the destruction of nature by human beings and industrial development.[25]

---

[17]Elina Koristashevskaya, "Semantic density mapping: a discussion of meaning in William Blake's Songs of Innocence and Experience." MRes thesis. (University of Glasgow, 2014).

[18] Iasmine S. Oliveira, "Robert Frost's Poems: Some Light from Corpus Analysis." *Revele*, 7, (2014): 125-140.

[19] Leech, Geoffrey, "Virginia Woolf meets Wmatrix." *Études de Stylistique Anglaise*, 4, (2013): 15-26. DOI: 10.4000/esa.1405

[20] Michaela Mahlberg and Dan McIntyre, "A case for corpus stylistics: Ian Fleming's *Casino Royale.*" *English Text Construction,* 4 no. 2 (2011): 204–227.

[21] Mahlberg Michaela, "Clusters, key clusters and local textual functions in Dickens." *Corpora*, 2 no. 1 (2007): 1-31.

[22] O'Halloran, Kieran. "Corpus-assisted Literary Evaluation." *Corpora,* 2 no. 1 (2007): 33–63.

[23] Viana Viana, Fausto Fabiana and Zyngier Sonia, "Corpus Linguistics and Literature: A Contrastive Analysis of Dan Brownd and Machado de Assis." Edited by Zyngier S, Viana V & Jandre J Textos e leituras: Estudos empiricos de lingua e literature (Texts and Readings: Empirical studies of language and literature) Rio de Janeiro: Publit, (2007): 233-256.

[24] See also Römer (2006), Chollier (2014), and Biber (2011) for the use of corpora in literature.

[25] Leila Baradaran Jamili and Sara Khoshkam, "Interrelation/Coexistence between Human/Nonhuman in Nature: William Blake's *Songs of Innocence* and *Songs of Experience," Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 8, no. 4. (2017): 14-20.

Research questions

1. What are the key semantic categories of the most frequent words used in *Songs of Innocence and Songs of Experience*?
2. What are the words used in describing the semantic categories
   - emotions
   - thought, belief, and knowledge
   - sensory systems, and
   - time?
3. To what extent are these categories similar to each other?

In order to answer the research questions, first, two corpora were created. The first corpus, *Songs of Innocence* (SoI), consists of 19 poems including The Shephard, The Lamb, The Chimney-Sweeper, The Divine Image and Infant Boy. The total number of words in SoI is 2422. The second corpus, *Songs of Experience* (SoE), consists of 26 poems including The Tiger, The Little Girl Lost, The Little Girl Found, The Chimney-Sweeper, The Garden of Love and A Poison Tree. The total number of words in SoE is 2880. The texts were taken from Project Gutenberg, which produces free electronic texts on the internet with copyright. While creating the corpora, the license statements and notes on the texts were excluded since they may affect the statistical results, such as the number of words used.

One of the aims of the study was to find out the key semantic categories of the words used and to what extent these categories were similar to each other. In order to find this, the corpora were analyzed by using Wmatrix developed by Paul Rayson. Wmatrix is a software tool for corpus analysis and comparison that includes corpus annotation tools such as USAS and CLAWS, and standard corpus linguistic methodologies such as frequency lists and concordances. The USAS category system is used for semantic tagging. As Rayson (2009) defines, 'the semantic tags show semantic fields which group together word senses that are related by virtue of their being connected at some level of generality with the same mental concept'. The groups include synonyms, antonyms, hypernyms and hyponyms. In the USAS system, each item (word) has one syntactic tag and one or more semantic tags assigned to it. In cases where a word has more than one syntactic tag, it is duplicated (e.g. each syntactic tag is given a separate entry). In the system, different categories are grouped under different codes. For instance, general and abstract terms are grouped under the group A, arts and craft under C, and emotion under E. Each group also consists of different subgroups, for example, Group E

(Emotion) consists of seven different subgroups: E2 for Liking, E3 for Calm/Violent/Angry, and E4 for Happy/Sad.

Together with Wmatrix, AntConc version 3.5.8 was also used for Concordancing. AntConc is a freeware corpus analysis toolkit for concordancing and text analysis developed by Laurence Antony (2019). A Concordance is a list of target words extracted from a text that indicates the context in which the word is used. It is a very functional tool for interpreting the data correctly since it presents the words in the context in which they are used, which helps researchers to see in what kind of environment a word is used and to guess its correct meaning. Along with Concordancing, POS tagging was used in the analysis. A POS tag (part-of-speech tag) is a special label assigned to each token (word) in a text corpus to indicate the part of speech and other grammatical categories, such as tense, number, and case, based on their context and definition.

Statistical analysis

To have an overall idea about a text, generally, most frequent words used in a specific text are found by using different software programs, such as WordSmith and AntConc. With the help of the WordList tool, these programs give a list of the words used in a text with their frequencies regardless of their parts of speech. Although looking at frequency lists are an essential starting point for a systematic textual analysis, counting individual words is not sufficient to understand a text fully.[26] For a more efficient analysis, lexical variety of a text should also be determined, and following it, a more detailed contextual analysis should be done. To find out the lexical variety, the type-token ratio, referred to as T/t hereafter, is calculated when doing the analysis. T/t ratio is a measure of vocabulary variation within a written text or a person's speech and it is a helpful measure of lexical variety.[27] A high T/t indicates a high degree of lexical variation while a low T/t indicates the opposite. In other words, the more types there are in comparison to the number of tokens, then the more varied the vocabulary is. T/t can be expressed as a percentage, multiplying the ratio by 100.[28] T/t ratio of a word represents

---

[26] Michael Stubbs, "Conrad in the computer: examples of quantitative stylistic methods. *Language and Literature,*" 14 no. 1 (2005): 5–24. DOI: 10.1177/0963947005048873.

[27] Graham Williamson, (2014). Available from: http://www.sltinfo.com/type-token-ratio.html

[28] Dax Thomas, "Type Token Ratios in One Teacher's Classroom Talk: An Investigation of Lexical Complexity. Retrieved 16 December 2014, from:

the percentage of that word within all words in a corpus, that is, the number of words that fall into per 100 words. The T/t ratio is calculated according to the following formula:

Type-token ratio = (number of types/number of tokens) * 100

The total number (sum) of words in a text is often referred to as the number of 'tokens'. However, several of these tokens are repeated in corpora.[29] The number of each different word is called 'type'. For instance, imagine having a corpus with 50 different words (type) occurring 73 times (token). In those 73 tokens, there are 50 so-called 'types'. The relationship between the number of types and the number of tokens for this sample would be: (50/73) * 100 = 68,5. It means that 68,5 of the words are from a certain type of group in 100 words. As Jacobs (2018, p.10) points out 'the number of types can be considered a co-estimate of the size of an author's (active) mental lexicon and vocabulary profile.' According to Simonton, for instance (1989, cited in Jacobs, 2017) 'better' Shakespeare sonnets are distinguished by their higher type-token ratio, more unique words, and a higher adjective-verb quotient.

Results and discussion

As stated previously, T/t ratio is used to find out the lexical variety in a text. The ratios for SoI and SoE are presented in the table below.

Table 1: Type-token ratio results

T-t ratio	types	tokens	%
SoI	937	2422	38,7
SoE	838	2880	29,1

As seen in Table 1 above, T/t ratio in SoI is 38,7; whereas, it is 29,1 in SoE. That is, although both corpora have a relatively low vocabulary range, it can be said that lexical variety is higher in SoE. Generally, poets have the widest vocabulary range because, compared to other genres,

http://www.birmingham.ac.uk/Documents/collegeartslaw/cels/essays/languageteaching/DaxThomas2005a.pdf.
[29] Graham Williamson (2009), http://www.sltinfo.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/typetoken-ratio.pdf Retrieved 3 August 2013.

poetry relies more heavily on the artistic choices made related to vocabulary. Poets generally select words that are less common and words that do not come to mind easily. In addition, a poem is usually short, and the demands of the form sacrifice function words.[30] Considering these, it is expected to find a high T/t ratio in poetry; however, it is not very high in Blake. The reason why T/t ratio is not very high in both SoI and SoE may be related to Blake's style. Blake has a simple style that is mainly accomplished through parallelism, a repetition of simple words or phrases, and using opposite words.[31]

Sematic categories in SoI and SoE

One of the aims of the study was to find out the semantic categories of the words used in SoI and SoE. Table 2 presents the results of the semantic categories found in SoI and SoE.

Table 2: Number of semantic categories

	Total # of words	**# of different types of semantic categories**
S SoI	2422	173
S SoE	2880	220

It is found that SoI consists of 2422 words, which are grouped under 173 different semantic categories, whereas, SoE consists of 2880 words that are grouped under 220 different categories. In the analysis, some words were classified under two or more different categories depending on the context in which they were used. For instance, the word *little* was grouped under these categories: N5 Quantities, A 13.7 Degree/minimizer, N 3.2 Size: small, T3 Time: new and young (e.g.: little lamb), and Z1 Personal names (e.g.: Little Lamb). The USAS system not only includes content words but also function words. For example, apostrophe s ('s) is not a word itself, but it is counted as a word in the semantic category list under the code Z5 (grammatical bin). Table 3 below shows the twenty

---

[30] Clarence Green, "Introducing the Corpus of the Canon of Western Literature: A corpus for culturomics and stylistics." (2017).

[31] Nazan Tutaş, "William Blake 'de Masumiyet ve Tecrübe: Kuzu ve Kaplan," *Folklor/edebiyat*, 20, no. 78, (2014/2): 83-90.

most frequently used semantic categories in SoI and SoE. In the table, words with a grammatical or discourse function, such as grammatical bins (Z5), pronouns (Z8) and discourse bins (Z4) were excluded since the aim of the study was to focus on the meaning of the words used rather than their grammatical functions.

Table 3: Twenty most frequent semantic categories in SoI and SoE.

SoI	Freq	%	SoE	Freq	%
E4.1+ happy	**80**	**3,3**	B1 anatomy/physiology	92	3,2
B1 anatomy/physiology	61	2,5	M1 moving, coming, going	60	2,08
L2 living creatures	47	1,93	M6 location, direction	51	1,8
E4.1- sad	44	1,8	T1.3 time: period	51	1,8
O4.3. color/color pattern	39	1,6	**E4.1- sad**	50	1,7
M1 moving, coming, going	36	1,5	L3 plants	45	1,6
S9 religion/the supernatural	**36**	**1,5**	S9 religion/the supernatural	38	1,32
M6 location, direction	34	1,4	W3 geographical terms	33	1,15
A1.1.1. general actions / making	31	1,3	A1.1.1. general actions/making	33	1,15
T1.3 time: period	27	1,11	L2 living creatures	33	1,15
A7+ probability: likely	26	1,07	Z6 negative	32	1,11
X3.2 sensory: sound	21	0,86	O4.3. color/color pattern	31	1,08
W3 geographical names	21	0,86	**E4.1+ happy**	**26**	**0,9**
K2 music & related activities	20	0,82	A7+ probability: likely	25	0,86
M2 putting, pushing, transforming	20	0,82	**E5- fear/shock**	21	0,72

Z6 negative	20	0,82	**E3- violent/angry**	19	0,6
X3.1 sensory: taste	19	0,78	M2putting,pushing,transporting	18	0,6
L3 plant	18	0,74	S3.2 intimacy/sex	15	0,52
N3.2- Size: small	18	0,74	T1.1.3 time: future	14	0,49
A9+ getting, possession	16	0,66	E2+ like	14	0,49

When the most frequent semantic categories in SoI and SoE were compared, it was seen that most words were related to emotions, descriptions of nature, and religion. It is not a surprising finding since like other Romantic poets, there is a special concern for passion, emotion, and nature in Blake's poetry. Blake focused on man's emotions and his interrelation with nature, which is also common in every Romantic poem.[32] Poetry expresses the poet's own mind, imagination and emotion. Therefore, Romantic poems take the experiences, thoughts, and feelings of the poets who wrote them as their subject matter, not the actions of the other men. In order to understand Blake's poetry better, a deeper analysis focusing on the aforementioned groups in the research questions would be necessary.

The most frequently used words in SoI were related to the category happy; which is classified under the group of emotions. When counting the number of words used in each category, different syntactic functions (parts of speech) or inflection (e.g. present or past tense conjugation, and gender and number agreement) were also calculated. For example, the word *merry* was used both as an adjective and as an adverb 9 and 7 times respectively. In SoI, the words used related to happiness was happy, merry/merrily, smile(s/d), laugh(ing/s), delight, cheerful, joys, rejoice and relief, all of which were used 80 times in total. On the contrary, words with the meaning of being happy were used only 26 times in SoE. The words used in SoE were a delight, joy(s), happy, smile(d/s), and rejoicing. When the words related to sadness were compared in SoI and SoE, it was found that more words related to the category sad were used in SoE. The

---

[32] Leila Baradaran Jamili and Sara Khoshkam, "Interrelation / Coexistence between Human/Nonhuman in Nature: William Blake's *Songs of Innocence* and *Songs of Experience,"* (2017).

words weep(ing/wept), woe, cry(ing), jealous(y), sorrow, despair, misery, piteous, howl(ing), pined, sulk, and grief were used 50 times in SoE; whereas, weep(ing), sorrow(s), grief, sobbing, woe(s), bereaved, cried and howl were used 44 times in SoI. A comparison of happy and sad categories showed that words related to happiness were almost double in SoI; whereas, words related to sadness were double in SoE. Words in the happy category were used 80 times, while sad were used 44 times in SoI. However, words in the sad category were used 50 times, while happy was used 26 times in SoE. Under the emotion group, words related to fear/shock and violent/angry were also compared since they too were frequently used. The words both in the fear/shock (fear) and violent/angry (wild, wrath) categories were used twice in SoI; whereas, they were used 21 and 19 times in SoE respectively. Under the fear/shock category, the words fear(s/ful), dread, and terror were used. Cruel(ty), wrath, fiend, angry, wild, unrest, threat, quarrel, and indignant were the words used under the violent/angry category. To have a better understanding of the results, the antonyms of these categories (or words) were also looked at although they were not the most frequently used categories. Two words (rest and peace) were used 9 times under the category calm in SoI, yet no words related to bravery were found. On the other hand, only one word in each category was used in SoE; the word peace (calm category) was used once and dare (bravery category) was used 4 times. Considering the content of each collection of poems, the results are not surprising. In *Songs of Innocence and Experience*, Blake focused on the contrary states of the human soul, such as good and bad, or the status of innocence and experience. Most poems in SoI have an opposite in SoE, for instance, The Lamb in SoI and The Tyger in SoE. By writing parallel texts, Blake could focus on the decay in human values; purity and a childlike perspective were the main elements in *Innocence* that explained Blake's ideal condition for humanity. However, in *Experience*, the struggle of spirit against oppression was the main topic. Since *Experience* talks about man's cruelty and shrewd rationality, finding more words related to the violent/angry category compared to *Innocence* is not a surprising result. Table 4 below summarizes the most frequent emotion words used in SoI and SoE.

Table 4: Most frequent emotion words in SoI and SoE

	SoI	**SoE**
Sad	44	50
Happy	80	26
Fear/shock	2	21
Violent/angry	2	19
Calm	9	1
Bravery	-	4

Considering the content of each collection, along with the words related to emotions, words related to knowledge were also analyzed since not only feelings but also experiences, understanding and knowing the environment around us are significant themes Blake directed his attention to. Table 5 presents the frequencies of words used related to knowledge and learning.

Table 5: Words related to knowledge and learning

	SoI	**SoE**
Knowledge & learning	11	11
No knowledge & not understanding	1	6
Thought / belief	5	7

As seen in the table above, more varied vocabulary with higher frequency count was used in SoE (24 times) compared to SoI (17 times). Although the frequency difference between the two collections is not statistically very different, the variety of words used is worth noting. The words think, feel, know, learn, and seek were used in SoI; whereas, in SoE, view, think, wonder, know, mystery, forget, find out, learn, seek, go over, search, feel, and perplex were used-paying more attention to wondering and searching. SoI's focusing on the innocent pastoral world of childhood contrasts with SoE's focusing on the adult world of corruption, repression and destruction of innocence by modern society, as a consequence of the French Revolution. By wondering, searching, finding and experiencing, manhood collapses instead of ameliorating.

According to Blake, experience, suffering, pain, and grief is the true reality of the world, or in other words, harsh reality is the experience. We can only be saved from our sins by freeing and intensifying the bodily senses, as Blake called 'an improvement of sensual enjoyment' in *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell*. Man's body is not distinct from his soul. It is how the senses can perceive the soul. That is, senses are important because they are an inseparable part of the soul. Therefore, the words related to sensory systems were also analyzed.

Table 6: Sensory systems

	SoI	SoE
Taste	19	8
Sound	21	12
Touch	1	-
Sight	14	13
Smell	-	1

The table above shows the (positive) words used related to the sensory systems. Related to the sense of taste, *sweet* was the common word used both in SoI and SoE. It was used 8 times in SoI, whereas 19 times in SoE (sweet 18, sweeter 1). However, when the concordance lines for *sweet* were read by using AntConc software, it was found that the word was used only once with the meaning of taste in *The Human Abstract* in SoE ('sweet to eat'). In all other usages, it was used figuratively, such as sweet smile, sweet love, sweet moans, sweet dreams, sweet flower, and sweet kiss. When the words related to the sense of hearing were analyzed, it was also seen that more words were used in SoI (21) compared to SoE (12). These frequencies include positive words, yet when the negative words (silent category) related to the sense of hearing were calculated it was found that there was a total of 30 words used in SoI and 15 words in SoE. The words and the frequencies are as follows: hear (9), hears (3), heard (3), sound (2), noise (2), groan (1), echoed (1), louder (1), thunderings (1), silent (4), quiet (1), hush (1), mute (1) in SoI; and heard (5), hear (4), hearing (1), growl (1) and groaned (1) in SoE. Only the word *stroke* was used once in SoI related to the sense of touch, and the word *smelling* related to the sense of smell was used once in SoE. See (4), seen (3), sees (1), saw (2), sight (2), watching (1), watchman (1), unseen (1), blind (1) were the words

used related to the sense of sight in SoI. See (6), saw (3), sees (1), seen (1), behold (1), beheld (1), invisible (1), blind (1) were used in SoE. Considering the importance of senses in Blake, it is surprising that the percentage of words used in the sensory system category is low. It is also surprising that the lexical variety is also low; generally, the same words were repeated and inflected.

Table 7: Time-Semantic Fields

	SoI	**SoE**
Past	X	used to (1)
Present	now (6) yet (2)	to this day (1)
Future	shall (8) soon (1) 'll (4) will (2)	shall (6) future (2) wilt (1) soon (4) shalt (1)
Time: period	night (10) day (6) morning (3) evening (1) year (3) Thursday (2) forever (1)	night (17) nights (1) day (10) summer (6) winter (5) morning (3) evening (2) may (1) hour (1) year (1) Thursday (1)
Time: beginning	X	eternal (2) endless (1)
Time: old, grown-up +	old (2) aged (1)	old (1) outworn (1) ancient (3)
Time: new, young (-)	little ones (2) babe (2) young (2) new (1) infant (11) infants (1)	youth (6) youthful (3) fresh (1) little ones (1) infant (3)

As seen in Table 7, when the time words used in SoI and SoE were compared, it was found that no words related to the past and beginning were used in SoI. SoI talks about the pastoral world of childhood, a period of being innocent and naïve, and having naïve hopes and fears. Therefore, it is not surprising that words under the category of time are mostly related to the present and future rather than the past. Similarly, since SoE talks about the experiences, corruption and repression of the adult world, words

related to present, past and future were all used. To have a better understanding of the time concept, the corpora were also POS tagged. Table 8 presents the results of POS tagging.

Table 8: Time-POS Tagging

	SoI	SoE
Present	172	202
Past	91	136

Although no words in SoI were found in the time category when the semantic fields of the words were looked at, when the corpus was POS tagged, it was found that the past tense was used 91 times. However, both in SoI and SoE, the present tense was used more frequently, which is consistent with the semantic field analysis. In SoE, the harsh experiences of adult life, destroying what is good in innocence was explained; the past was scrutinized and the current condition of the late 1700s was criticized. Present is an extension of past and we cannot live present life without past. Therefore, the whole collection of poems refers both to the present and past.

Conclusion

As mentioned before, corpus stylistics is not a field that competes with traditional literary studies but a field that can provide invaluable data for literary and stylistic analysis by providing comparative information through quantitative analysis and complementing the manual analysis with new techniques. The purpose of this study was to find out the semantic categories of words used in *Songs of Innocence and Experience* and to try to understand how these categories can be linked to what has been said about Blake's poetry.

In the analysis, firstly lexical variety in the two collections were compared (T/t ratio). Poetry is a genre that is identified with high lexical variety. However, it was found that both SoI and SoE is not very rich in terms of lexical variety. Nevertheless, when the style of Blake is taken into consideration, this is not a surprising result. Blake is known for his parallelism, repetition of simple words or phrases, and using opposite words.

When the semantic categories of the words used in SoI and SoE were compared, it was found that the most frequent category was happy in SoI, whereas the words related to sadness were more frequent in SoE. This not surprising since SoE talks about the corruption, repression and destruction of innocence by modern society. When the words in the knowledge and learning category were looked at, it was found that more varied vocabulary with higher frequency count was used in SoE compared to SoI, paying more attention to wondering and searching. Getting more experienced and searching for a better understanding of the world, unfortunately, ends with the collapse of manhood. According to Blake, senses are important because they are an inseparable part of the soul. Thus, words related to sensory systems were also analyzed. It was surprising to see that the percentage of words used in the sensory system category was low and not varied, as the same words were repeated, and although the word sweet was frequently used, in only one of the instances was it related to the sense of taste. In all other instances, it was used figuratively. Even though it is not uncommon to see figurative language in literature, it is surprising that not many words were used related to the sensory systems in Blake's poetry. Similarly, although no words related to the past and the beginning were used in SoI, the past tense was used 91 times. Consistent with the semantic field analysis, both in SoI and SoE, the present tense was used more frequently.

The current study focused on only four semantic categories (emotions thought, belief and knowledge, sensory systems, and time) in the *Songs of Innocence and Experience.* Despite some surprises, the results of the study were mostly expected. However, to understand Blake and his poetry better and to make a link with the literary studies and corpus studies, all semantic categories in the collections should be analyzed in detail.

References

Anthony, Laurence. (AntConc (Version 3.5.8) [Computer Software]. Tokyo, Japan: Waseda University. Available from https://www.laurenceanthony.net/software, 2019.

Chollier. Christine. "Textual Semantics and Literature: Corpus, Texts, Translation." *Signata* [Online], 5 (2014): http://journals.openedition.org/signata/461. DOI: 10.4000/signata.461

Culpeper, Jonathan. "Keyness: Words, Parts--of--speech and Semantic Categories in the Character-talk of Shakespeare's Romeo and Juliet." *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics* 14, no. 1 (2009): 29-59.

Douglas Biber. "Corpus Linguistics and the Study of Literature Back to the Future?" *Scientific Study of Literature* 1 no.1 (2001): 15-23. Doi: 10.1075/ssol.1.1.02bib

Fischer-Starcke, Bettina. "Keywords and frequent phrases of Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice*: A corpus-stylistic analysis." *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics* 14, no. 4 (2009): 492–523.

Ganascia, Jean-Gabriel, ''The Logic of the Big Data Turn in Digital Literary Studies''. Frontiers Digital Humanities, 2 no. 7. (2015). doi: 10.3389/fdigh.2015.00007

Granger, Silviane. *A Bird's-eye view of learner corpus research. In computer learner corpora, second language acquisition and foreign language teaching.* Edited by Granger, Sylviane. & Hung, Joseph. & Petch-Tyson, Stephanie. 3-33. John Benjamins, Amsterdam, 2002. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/lllt.6

Gries, Stephan. "What is corpus linguistics?" *Language and Linguistics Compass*, 3, (2009): 1–17.

Green, Clarence. "Introducing the Corpus of the Canon of Western Literature: A corpus for Culturomics and Stylistics." *Language and Literature*, 26 no. 4, (2017): 282–299 DOI:10.1177/0963947017718996 https://www.researchgate.net/publication/321773386

Jacobs, Arthur M. "Explorations in an English Poetry Corpus: A Neurocognitive Poetics Perspective''. *Frontiers in Digital Humanities*. Available from: https://arxiv.org/abs/1801.02054v1, 2018.

Jamili, Leila Baradaran and Khoshkam, Sara. "Interrelation/Coexistence between Human/Nonhuman in Nature: William Blake's *Songs of Innocence* and *Songs of Experience*." *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 8 no. 4 (2017): 14-20.

Koristashevskaya, Elina. "Semantic density mapping: a discussion of meaning in William Blake's Songs of Innocence and Experience." MRes thesis. University of Glasgow, 2014.

Leech, Geoffrey. "Virginia Woolf meets Wmatrix." *Études de Stylistique Anglaise*, 4, (2013): 15-26. DOI: 10.4000/esa.1405

Mahlberg, Michaela. "Clusters, key clusters and local textual functions in Dickens." *Corpora*, 2 no. 1 (2007): 1-31.

Mahlberg, Michaela and Dan McIntyre. "A case for corpus stylistics: Ian Fleming's *Casino Royale*." *English Text Construction,* 4 no. 2 (2011): 204–227. DOI: 10.1075/etc.4.2.03mah. John Benjamins Publishing Company.

McEnery, Tony. & Wilson, Andrew. *Corpus Linguistics (Second Ed.)*. Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 2001.

McIntyre, Dan.; Walker, Brian. "How can corpora be used to explore the language of poetry and drama?" ed. McCarthy, Michael; O'Keeffe, Anne. *The Routledge Handbook of Corpus Linguistic*.New York: Routledge, (2010): 516-530.

Nazan Tutaş. "William Blake 'de Masumiyet ve Tecrübe: Kuzu ve Kaplan." *Folklor/edebiyat*, 20, no. 78, (2014/2): 83-90.

O'Halloran, Kieran. "Corpus-assisted Literary Evaluation." *Corpora,* 2 no. 1 (2007): 33–63.

Oliveira, Iasmine S. "Robert Frost's Poems: Some Light from Corpus Analysis." *Revele*, 7, (2014): 125-140.

Rayson, P. Wmatrix: a web-based corpus processing environment, Computing Department, Lancaster University, 2009, http://ucrel.lancs.ac.uk/wmatrix/

Römer, Ute. "Where the Computer Meets Language, Literature, and Pedagogy: Corpus Analysis in English Studies." Edited by Gerbig, Andrea and Anja Müller-Wood 2006. *How Globalization Affects the Teaching of English: Studying Culture Through Texts*. Lampeter: E. Mellen Press. 81-109, 2006.

Scott, Mike and Tribble, Christopher. Textual patterns. Key words and corpus analysis in language education. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 2006.

Stubbs, Michael. "Conrad in the Computer: Examples of Quantitative Stylistic Methods." *Language and Literature,* 14 no. 1 (2005): 5–24. DOI: 10.1177/0963947005048873.

Thomas, Dax. "Type Token Ratios in One Teacher's Classroom Talk: An Investigation of Lexical Complexity." (2005), Retrieved 16 December 2014, from: http://www.birmingham.ac.uk/Documents/collegeartslaw/cels/essays/languageteaching/DaxThomas2005a.pdf.

Viana Viana, Fausto Fabiana and Zyngier Sonia. "Corpus Linguistics and Literature: A Contrastive Analysis of Dan Brownd and Machado de Assis." Edited by Zyngier S, Viana V & Jandre J Textos e leituras: Estudos empiricos de lingua e literature (Texts and Readings: Empirical studies of language and literature) Rio de Janeiro: Publit, (2007): 233-256.

Williamson, Graham, (2014). Available from: http://www.sltinfo.com/type-token-ratio.html

Williamson, Graham. (2009). http://www.sltinfo.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/typetoken-ratio.pdf Retrieved 3 August 2013.

Chapter Nineteen

Looking at Still Life and Ekphrasis through Van Gogh's Speaking Pictures in A.S. Byatt's *Still Life*

Asya Sakine Uçar

Bringing what is portrayed clearly into sight through many instances of characters' comments on paintings, the juxtaposition of verbal with visual modes occupies a privileged space in the narrativity of A.S. Byatt's *The Federica Quartet* that consists of *The Virgin in the Garden* (1978), *Still Life* (1985), *Babel Tower* (1996), and *A Whistling Woman* (2002). In the first novel, *The Virgin in the Garden*, while Frederica tries to attract young playwright Alexander's attention as she is playing young Elizabeth in Alexander's new drama *Astraea*, which is the focal point of the novel and which is intended to pay homage to the Coronation of Elizabeth II in 1953, her eldest sister Stephanie marries a clergyman, Daniel, in spite of her intellectual aspirations. Published in 1985, *Still Life* is the second installment of the series, and, as the title of the novel suggests, it is profoundly engaged with stillness and domesticity as a continuation of *The Virgin in the Garden*. Stephanie is tied down by marriage and motherhood, has abandoned her academic life, and now desperately seeks privacy and the rekindling of her imagination. Meanwhile, Frederica travels to the south of France—Saint-Remy-de-Provence—before taking up a place to study English at Cambridge. Alexander is in Arles for art as he is anxious about his next work, which is "the dramatization of the dispute, in the Yellow House, between Paul Gauguin and Vincent Van Gogh."[1] As Byatt comments in *Passions of the Mind*, "The idea of the second novel of the series—*Still Life*— was that it should, by contrast, be a very bare, very

---

[1] A. S. Byatt, *Still Life* (London: Vintage, 1995), 82.

down-to-earth, attempt to give the thing itself […]."[2] In *Still Life,* it is possible to look at 'still life' from two perspectives. On one hand, through Frederica and Stephanie, Byatt continues to echo the dilemma of choosing between the entrapment of domesticity and intellectual pursuit; in particular, Byatt's emphasis on birth and death finds form in Stephanie's still life. On the other hand, Van Gogh's presence is strong throughout the novel in which there is a special focus on his pipe, chair, friendship with Gauguin, asylum days, major works, and career-defining still-life paintings; Byatt's dilemma of writing in the plainest form possible is projected onto Alexander's struggles in writing a drama on Van Gogh whose quest to reach 'the thing itself' throughout his career is inspirational and provides the simplicity and exactness Alexander looks for.

The relationship between visual and verbal has always provoked debate since ancient times, and ekphrasis is a long-standing tradition, stretching from Homer's *Iliad*, through John Keats' "Ode on a Grecian Urn," to W. H. Auden's "Musée dex Beaux Arts." Ekphrasis consists of the prefix *ek* meaning "from" or "out of" and the root term *phrasi*—a synonym for the Greek *lexis* or *hermeneia* and the Latin *dictio* and *elocution*)—and originally meant a full or vivid description.[3] Throughout history, there have been many attempts to articulate a theory of ekphrasis as so many important scholars, academics, art historians, and writers have provided their definitions that reflect different dimensions or aspects to that ancient concept. As a term, the closest to the modern usage of ekphrasis is believed to have been mentioned by Simonides of Ceos who is known for his motto "painting is mute poetry and poetry is speaking picture." After him, Horace, in his *Ars Poetica*, declared "ut pictura poesis" (as is painting so is poetry), which explains poetry-painting, word-image, and verbal-visual dichotomy at the core of the ekphrastic way of thinking.

Since Horace, poetry and painting have been considered as sister arts and the similarities between them have been discussed. However, in his landmark work *Laokoön or The Limits of Poetry and Painting* (1962), Gotthold Ephraim Lessing claims that the two arts exist on different levels, painting in space and poetry in time. Expanding on Lessing's idea, James Heffernan—one of the foremost writers identified with ekphrasis—proposes a definition simple in form but complex in its implications,

---

[2] A. S. Byatt, *Passions of the Mind: Selected Writings* (London: Vintage Edition, 1991), 11.
[3] Peter Wagner, *Icons-Texts-Iconotexts: Essays on Ekphrasis and Intermediality* (Berlin: Gruyter, 1996), 12.

saying "ekphrasis is the verbal representation of a graphic representation."[4] Further researches reveal that this phenomenon arouses more interest among scholars, such as Jean Hagstrum who remarks on "the special quality of giving voice and language to the otherwise mute art object,"[5] drawing attention to *prosopopeia.*[6] Similarly, Bosveld remarks that in bestowing images with words, ekphrasis is an important rhetorical practice that enables a reader to feel like a participant in the visual experience, because as a literary expression, it allows the invigoration of the silent image of paintings, sculptures, objects, or moments by way of poetic language and presents two imaginations at work at the same time.[7] Apart from the modern definitions, Ruth Webb makes a direct reference to ancient studies of rhetoric by bringing up "a speech that brings the subject matter vividly before the eyes"[8] that was taught to students in Greek schools. Webb states that "the principal sources for the rhetorical conception of ekphrasis, the *Progymnasmata*, consist primarily of a set of definitions and instructions for the various exercises, of which ekphrasis was one"[9] and the surviving Greek sources on ekphrasis show that it was taught at the elementary stage of rhetorical training.[10] Be it painting or poetry, what lies behind the conception and the realization of every work of art is *energeia* (creative energy) that represents the ability to place before the eyes and make the audience feel involved in the events. As the art of describing works of art, ekphrasis presents a panorama of imaginary and real visuals poetically and aesthetically. It represents a mutual and intertextual medium that mute visuals and speaking words feed on, giving voice to or bestowing on one another a form or image.

Accordingly, Byatt frequently turns to visual arts in her fiction, and, as an extension of that, she broadly employs ekphrasis. While *The Virgin in the Garden* centers on Alexander's *Astraea*, a play about Elizabeth, and the novel begins with ekphrastic descriptions of the *Darnley Portrait* of the Queen at a museum, *Still Life* takes *Yellow Chair*, inspired by Van

---

[4] James Heffernan, "Ekphrasis and Representation," *New Literary History* 22, no. 2 (1991): 299.

[5] Jean Hagstrum, *Sister Arts: The Tradition of Literary Pictorialism and English Poetry from Dryden to Gray* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974), 18.

[6] An etymologically Greek figure of speech basically meaning personification.

[7] Jennifer Bosveld, *Elastic Ekphrastic: Poetry on Art / Poets on Tour Through Galleries* (Ohio: Pudding House Publications, 2003), 9.

[8] Ruth Webb, *Ekphrasis, Imagination and Persuasion in Ancient Rhetorical Theory and Practice* (Surrey: Ashgate Publishing, 2009), 14.

[9] Ibid., 17.

[10] Ibid., 87.

Gogh, whose life and struggles are such a substantial part of *Still Life* and, at some points, become a parallel storyline to that of Alexander as an artist. Van Gogh does not emerge as a character, but Alexander, as an omniscient narrator, engages with his ideas and contemplates Van Gogh's paintings, providing an ekphrastic interpretation. Byatt begins with a prologue that features a museum visit made by Alexander, Frederica, and Daniel at a later date than the events taking place in the novel itself. The exhibition is on post-impressionism and takes place at the Royal Academy of Arts in London, in 1980, seventeen years after the end of *The Virgin in the Garden*. At the exhibition, a long row of Van Gogh paintings, including *The Poet's Garden* and *Olive Pickers*, attracts Alexander's attention.

For *The Poet's Garden,* Alexander stares "at the serenely impassioned garden made out of a whirl of yellow brushstrokes, a viridian impasto, a dense mass of furiously feathered lines of blue-green, isolated black pot hooks, the painfully clear orange-red spattering."[11] By calling the painting *The Poet's Garden*, Van Gogh intentionally linked the image to the fourteenth-century poets Francesco Petrarch and Giovanni Boccaccio, as he writes in one of his letters: "Some time ago I read an article on Dante, Petrarch and Boccaccio, Giotto and Botticelli; my God, what an impression that made on me, reading those people's letters!"[12] Further in the letter, it is implied that Petrarch lived somewhere near Avignon where there are the same cypresses and oleanders that Van Gogh illustrates in his work. Van Gogh imagines a garden where Renaissance poets stroll through the bushes. Byatt directly quotes from Van Gogh who might have imagined his friendship with Gauguin to parallel the artistic and intellectual partnership between Petrarch and Boccaccio. Byatt's reference to *The Poet's Garden* at the beginning of the novel connectively illuminates Alexander's role in the novel as Van Gogh's relationship with Paul Gauguin is the origin of his play "Yellow Chair."

At the exhibition, another painting depicted through ekphrasis is Van Gogh's *Olive Pickers*, a work from his final days in southern France. In 1888, Van Gogh's trip to the sunny province of Arles revived not only his love of nature but also marked his most prolific years and best works. According to Hicks, during his stay in Arles, Van Gogh devoted a great amount of time to the still-life genre, including the sunflowers, the bedrooms, or chairs, as representations of himself.[13] He owes much of his

---

[11] Byatt, *Still Life*, 2.
[12] Leo Jansen, Hans Lujiten, and Nienke Bakker, *Vincent van Gogh: Ever Yours The Essential Letters* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2014), 586.
[13] Elizabeth Hicks, *Still Life in the Fiction of A. S. Byatt* (Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010), 15.

development to the countryside during his eighteen-month stay there. He lived in the famous yellow house, painted the yellow chair, and befriended Paul Gauguin with whom he had the incident that resulted in cutting his ear. In 1889, Van Gogh stayed at an asylum—located near olive trees or cypresses—in Saint-Remy-de-Provence and produced a series of olive paintings.[14] To a large degree, the artist's most productive years before succumbing to mental illness and subsequent suicide inspire Byatt in *Still Life*. Given that Van Gogh was ill and suffering from a kind of emotional turmoil, the feeling of relief he got from the trees is symbolically significant in the works that thematise nature, life, and death which has a place of some consequence in the general scope of the novel as Byatt brings the theme of birth and death forward through Stephanie's plotline. Not only is Alexander, the playwright of the novel, working on a dramatic piece based on Van Gogh's painting *Yellow Chair*, but the artist's tragic life and death also bear resemblances to Stephanie's pessimistic end.

The museum visit also includes some of the works of Gauguin, an early nineteenth-century French artist known for his exotic environments like Tahiti, bold colours, and unusual body proportions, as Alexander and Frederica notice in *Man with the Axe* and *Still Life, Fete Gloanec 1888*. In *Man with the Axe*, a work from his Tahitian period, the almost naked central figure holds an axe above his head, ready to strike a target. Alexander and Frederica's conversation on this work serves as an ekphrastic meditation. Focusing on the figure's androgynous aspects, Alexander tells Frederica that he "preferred his androgynes to be more obscured, more veiled, more suggested."[15] In *Still Life, Fete Gloanec*, two ripe pears, a bunch of flowers, and some other inanimate objects are laid on a red table. Alexander informs Frederica that Gauguin had flirted with a young woman named Madeline Bernard and had characterized her as "having the desirable, unattainable androgynous perfection."[16] Although Frederica thinks that the pears might stand for the woman's breasts and the flowers could be her hair, Alexander opposes her thought, asserting that the pears could be read as androgynous being partly male. The clashing female and male perspectives foreground the dilemma of the nature of androgyny because it incorporates both feminine and masculine aspects.

---

[14] The biographical information about Vincent Van Gogh is obtained from the book *Through the Eyes of Vincent Van Gogh: Selected Drawings and Paintings by the Great Master* (London: Arcturus Publishing, 2005), 64-83.
[15] Byatt, *Still Life*, 7.
[16] Ibid., 7.

Yet, for thinkers like Coleridge[17] and Woolf,[18] the androgynous mind is bright and great because it is characterized by the harmonious union of full capacity and balance. With their incompatible contemplations on still life, Alexander and Frederica introduce one thread of the narrative in *Still Life* that concerns the dilemma of women who cannot find a balance between the challenges of married life and a yearning for privacy and a revival of imagination. The two works by Gauguin could represent the Potter siblings, Frederica and Stephanie respectively. Frederica could be the androgynous figure that could be "anything" or "everything" with the joy, energy, and taste she has for life; she represents the kind of woman who enjoys life, men, sex, and nature. Frederica aspires to be an actress or writer, manages to go to Cambridge, and lives life to the fullest. Stephanie could be associated with a still-life painting (*Still Life Fete Gloanec*) as she is stuck between the domesticity of married life with children while wanting to go back to academic life.

Critical discussions concerning Byatt's fiction generally center on postmodernism, fairy tales, myths, and attempts to determine whether she is a realist or feminist. However, another important field worth enquiring about is her fondness of words and pictures and how they are connected with the characters she has created. In Byatt's writing, there is a painterly approach, not simply of description, but in the sense of wanting to "capture 'the thing itself' like a painter."[19] Intrinsically, she creates a language of fiction and paintings; Margarida Esteves Pereira states:

> A.S. Byatt's discussions of painting vis-à-vis language and writing are instructive as to the way she, so often in her fictions, uses actual pictures that suggest a specific image to the reader. In a certain sense, then, the use of pictures by Van Gogh, or by Matisse, Rembrandt, Vermeer, Velázquez,

---

[17] Coleridge has a famous remark on androgyny: "The truth is, a great mind must be androgynous" quoted from the book *Specimens of the Table Talk of the Late Samuel Taylor Coleridge* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1835), 51.

[18] In *A Room of One's Own* (Toronto: Broadview Press, 2001), Virginia Woolf explains why the best mind is androgynous: "I went on amateurishly to sketch a plan of the soul so that in each of us two powers preside, one male, one female; and in the man's brain the man predominates over the woman, and in the woman's brain the woman predominates over the man. The normal and comfortable state of being is that when the two live in harmony together, spiritually co-operating" (115).

[19] Olga Kenyon, *Women Novelists Today. A Survey of English Writing in the Seventies and Eighties* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1998), 77.

among others, evoke in the readers specific images of place, atmosphere, people.[20]

For instance, in Arles, Alexander realizes that the muddy brown line that had divided Van Gogh's *Yellow House* painting is an actual "soft muddy raised bank of an irrelevant ditch."[21] Similarly, Van Gogh's *Fishing Boats* is brought before the readers' eyes through an ekphrastic rendering when Frederica arrives at the beach party in Les Saintes-Maries:

> It was at some distance from other groups, in those days not yet numerous, on that beach. It had arranged itself around bright canvas bags and wicker baskets in the part-shade of a fishing boat. In those days also the boats were unchanged since Vincent Van Gogh had spent one week there in June 1888 and had painted them, red and blue, green and yellow, with coloured delicate masts erect, and the slanted, tapering yard-arms crossing each other on the pale mackerel sky.[22]

The way Van Gogh has illustrated the south of France accords almost completely with what Frederica and Alexander have seen at present. Frederica and Alexander notice that Van Gogh's *Yellow House* and *Fishing Boats* are recreations of actual places. These two paintings also exemplify exactness and accuracy that Alexander wants to achieve in his dramatic play *Yellow Chair*, which is also what Byatt wants to characterize in *Still Life's* general scope. Gail Davey comments,

> Byatt outlines the available alternatives to metaphor and uses several of these alternatives in Still Life—but still returns time and again to the difficulty of conveying all she wishes without metaphor. Byatt comments that she dwells on Van Gogh's difficulties in painting the Yellow Chair because she recognizes his dilemma as equivalent to her own. The pitfalls Van Gogh experiences in painting simple objects divested of metaphorical significance are identical to those Byatt encounters in presenting objects in plain words.[23]

---

[20] Margarida Esteves Pereira, "More than Words: The Elusive Language of A.S. Byatt's Visual Fiction," in *Writing and Seeing: Essays on Word and Image*, ed. Rui Homem Carvalho and Maria de Fatima Lambert (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), 219.

[21] Byatt, *Still Life*, 82.

[22] Ibid., 89.

[23] Gail Davey, "Still Life and the Rounding of Consciousness," in *Literature and Medicine*, Vol 352 (1998): 1544-1547.

The quest for a simple form might have urged Byatt to choose ''still life'' as the title of the novel and turn to Van Gogh whose numerous still-life paintings offer the plainness she seeks for. Emilie Bourdarot explains that "the novel's project is based on the idea that painting may be better equipped to render nature than language, and that achieving a perfect verbal equivalent of still lives might enable the novelist to reach the 'thing itself'."[24] That thing itself is directly linked to Byatt's aims of the plain and simple in her novel as with the still life paintings shifting the whole focus to themselves. The term still life (*natur morte* in French) denotes a specific genre of paintings consisting of a wide range of objects like fruit, flowers, kitchen utensils, or dead animals laid on a table. It is generally associated with Dutch artists; the Dutch word *stilleven* originally meant inanimate object.[25] Byatt's desire to reach the "thing itself" manifests itself in the titles she gives to Van Gogh's paintings. For instance, *Vincent's Chair* becomes *The Yellow Chair* and *Still Life with Coffeepot* is called *The Breakfast Table*. Van Gogh owes much of his popularity to still life that he most probably inherited from his Dutch upbringing and education. These titles make the subject matter of the paintings more representative, less contextualised, and, therefore, potentially closer to the "thing itself."[26]

Still, life demands realistic depiction with a focus on the thing itself, but it might indeed infuse a symbolic significance. Alexander—who tries to acquire the same dual authority in images and words—says, "The man could both paint and name a chair and bring into play his own terrors and hopes."[27] The yellow chair is generally identified with Van Gogh and has become a universal emblem for the artist. As the yellow chair is a symbol or metaphor for Van Gogh, to convey his state of mind and feelings, Alexander hopes to find the same simplicity in writing a drama without metaphors. As the central "icon" of the novel, Van Gogh's chair is a metonymical self-portrait meant to contrast with the painting of Gauguin's armchair. *Vincent's Chair* and *Gauguin's Chair* suggest an insight into the differences between the two painters in terms of character and temper. Alexander's elaborations on those paintings verify that:

---

[24] Emilie Bourdarot, "The Quest for the 'Thing Itself' in A. S. Byatt's *Still Life*," in *Picturing the Language of Images*, ed. Nancy Pedri and Laurence Petit. (Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013), 87.

[25] Hicks, *Still Life in the Fiction of A. S. Byatt*, 15.

[26] Nancy Pedri and Laurence Petit, *Picturing the Language of Images* (New Castle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013), 92.

[27] Byatt, *Still Life,* 85.

> He discovered first that it (like the fencing gloves) had been painted in the
> wake of the Gauguin debacle and as a companion piece to the portrait of
> Gauguin's empty chair (Effect of Night). Gauguin's chair, an ample, armed
> chair was painted in the dark against a lamplit green wall 'in dark brown-
> red wood, the seat of greenish rush, and in the place of the absent a lighted
> candle and two modern novels.'[28]

Given the idea that two chairs represent Van Gogh and Gauguin, it is
important to note that Van Gogh paints a simple, yellow chair with a pipe
and tobacco on it for himself. Those still objects and the chair itself could
be personalized to give an insight into Van Gogh's emotions and sanity.
On the other hand, the chair he paints as Gauguin's chair has striking
differences: the chair is much more colourful and decorated with a burning
candle and books on it. According to Barber and Gerlings, painters often
use still life as a recourse to expression when other means are blocked.
Again, when the mind is struggling for focus, the ability to produce a still
life can be the quickest way to resolve the problem.[29] Painters turning to
still life on canvas to remove obstacles in terms of expression could accord
with Byatt's writing *Still Life* with many still life objects, images, or
scenes. Alexander reads those paintings in such a way that he not only
projects Byatt's tussles of putting the novel together as plainly as possible
but his inquiry of Van Gogh, still life and yellow chair could also be
attributed to a similar attempt in writing his drama and contriving his path.

  Byatt's attempt at focusing on the thing itself comes to light through
Alexander, whose preoccupation with Van Gogh and his strivings in
writing a play about him find visual form in Van Gogh's paintings.
Furthermore, as the title of the novel suggests, still life, a genre in
painting, is also a way of life that entraps Stephanie, underlining the
dichotomy of intellectual commitment and a domestic, still life. In
Passions of the Mind, Byatt specifies that in *Still Life* "I wanted to write
about birth, about death plainly and exactly."[30] Stephanie has two children,
and the birth scenes of her children are conveyed in such a way that it is
possible to find connections with the dilemma she has been caught in as a
mother-wife and a book lover. Whenever the most inconvenient and
uncomfortable symptoms of pregnancy arise, she continues her readings of
Wordsworth. Stephanie has a deep urge to turn to literature, especially to

---

[28] Ibid., 84.

[29] Barrington Barber and Charlotte Gerlings, *Through the Eyes of Vincent Van
Gogh: Selected Drawings and Paintings by the Great Master* (London: Arcturus
Publishing, 2005), 151.

[30] Byatt, *Passions of the Mind: Selected Writings*, 11.

Wordsworth during her son Will's birth and to Dickens during her daughter Mary's birth.

Stephanie's still life and fondness of books are embedded in Van Gogh's *Still Life with Books*, "a profusion of yellow novels on a clear, brilliant pink ground."[31] This work of art reflects Stephanie's life; pondering on domestic imprisonment, Byatt refers to still life both as a genre in painting and a way of living. For Byatt, behind these books lies "in the imagination the heavy tomes, eaten away and dusty, of the Dutch still-life masters' reminders of the vanity of human wishes, of death."[32] During the Golden age of the Dutch trading empire, still life paintings generally depict tables that are loaded with an array of luxury items symbolizing the wealth acquired. *Vanitas*, a painting of still life that contains objects highlighting the transience of life and the vanity of earthly goods, also originated in this period. The association of still life with the idea that "life must inevitably end in death and decay"[33] clearly evokes Stephanie's sudden death. While trying to help a sparrow that goes under the unearthed fridge in the kitchen, she is electrocuted and dies in that terrible accident. What complements birth is death, and, unfortunately, Stephanie's still life ends in death, another form of stillness. Flora Alexander notes that Byatt sets Stephanie's death in a tradition of thinking about mortality by using as an epigraph the passage from Bede's Latin *Ecclesiastical History of the English People* in which the brevity of human life is illustrated by a sparrow flying into a lighted hall by one door and flying out the other.[34] Ironically, it is a sparrow that inadvertently causes Stephanie's death when she tries to rescue it from behind the refrigerator. As the title of the book evokes, Stephanie falls into a state of stillness for good. In Sue Sorensen's words, Byatt's discussion of Van Gogh parallels Stephanie's plotline "investigating the possibility that visual and verbal language can amalgamate in some revelatory manner, and coming to a similarly pessimistic conclusion."[35]

After losing his wife, Daniel—who has come back from the brink of suicide—is obviously in a crisis of faith and visits Alexander in his apartment. Alexander's walls are decorated with his old posters, including

---

[31] Byatt, *Still Life*, 84.

[32] Ibid., 84.

[33] Hicks, *Still Life in the Fiction of A. S. Byatt*, 2.

[34] Flora Alexander, "A. S. Byatt. Still Life," in Contemporary Women Novelists, ed. Flora Alexander (London: Arnold, 1989), 39.

[35] Sue Sorensen, "Something of the Eternal: A.S. Byatt and Vincent Van Gogh," *Mosaic: An Interdisciplinary Critical Journal* 37, no. 1 (2004): 70. http://www.jstor.org/stable/44030061.

Picasso's *The Boy with a Pipe*, *Saltimbanques*, an advertisement for his *Buskers*, and Rodin's *Danaide.* To these, he has added a poster of *Astraea*, *The Darnley Portrait* and small prints of Van Gogh's *Sunflowers* and *Yellow Chair*. Byatt also draws attention to the wall on which some sower/reaper paintings are hung which mark Van Gogh's preoccupation with death and pain towards the end of his career. The artist painted such works with different variations but generally highlighting a lonely figure strolling on a field with a glowing sun behind. In these works, Van Gogh finds a means of expressing his appreciation and connection to nature, earth, seasons, and cycles of life and death:

> The brushstrokes in 'The Sower' are almost tessellations, the sky flows with them, the furrows of purple earth run away from the central heavy gold sun, the sower scatters seeds of gold light which are brushstrokes in the pattern on to the dark morning clouds. They are thick and solid: they are the movement of light over things, of the eye over things. In 'The Reaper' Vincent's later spiraling forms are everywhere, curling and linking the white-hot furnace of the cornfield, the blue figure of the man, the purple mountains, the green air, into one substance, his vision. He radiated brushstrokes in a self-portrait from his own eyes like twin suns. It is new and the opposite of it is seen, and thought, and made.[36]

In "Van Gogh, Death and Summer" from *Passions of the Mind*, Byatt writes that the reaper is "Van Gogh's natural image of death, to set beside his image of the sower, sowing the yellow seeds of light into the purple clods of earth, beneath a golden sky."[37] Inspired by the French artist Jean-François Millet, Van Gogh created several *Reaper* and *Sower* paintings between the years 1888 and 1889, and it is believed that "the sower in Millet's painting was a rather noble and extraordinarily heroic figure, whereas Van Gogh saw the working peasant more realistically: strong but not noble, wrestling his living from the earth by the sweat of his brow and with a lifetime of unremitting toil."[38] Thus, painting such subjects has for him a double meaning—a physical one and a spiritual one. Van Gogh states, "If one wants to grow, one must fall into the earth."[39] In nature, Van Gogh finds the starting point of the individual's growth and improvement. In his early stages, he starts from the very bottom, the bottom of the earth

---

[36] Byatt, *Still Life*, 132.
[37] Byatt, *Passions of the Mind: Selected Writings*, 299.
[38] Barber and Gerlings, *Through the Eyes of Vincent Van Gogh*, 54.
[39] "Van Gogh. The Man and the Earth" *Ergo*, 4th August 2017, http://ergosumus1.altervista.org/blog/van-gogh-man-earth/

and humble people, as found in his depiction of earthly black "Potato Eaters." From Byatt's point of view,

> 'The Potato Eaters' is painted in the black light of the North: the characters in it painted 'in the earth in which they were sown' do not meet each other's eyes but are firmly linked, breaking bread, pouring coffee, in their dark hut, individuals subsumed in a common life. The painting has a moralizing intention: it is a sermon in paint about the basic necessities of human life.[40]

As a product from an earlier stage of his career, Van Gogh seems to be reflecting more on his social and moral views of society through art. But later on, his devotion to art grows, and the objects he has chosen—like the chair or the house—show that they stand for him and embody certain emotions. Identifying himself with Van Gogh inevitably leads Alexander to consider that his conflicts as a writer are reminiscent of Van Gogh, whose early artistic career was about fearing and fleeing the domestic but also idealizing and desiring its order. In the steps of Van Gogh, he also needs maturity and experience before moving on to find his voice.

In the same scene that Daniel visits Alexander in his apartment, Byatt stages a verbal still-life description in which Alexander cooks and serves Daniel a breakfast "of gammon and eggs, brown bread and mushrooms, tomatoes"[41] and coffee to "put some life into"[42] him. That last scene in which Alexander pours coffee from a blue pot into a golden cup immediately recalls Van Gogh's *Still Life: Blue Enamel Coffeepot, Earthenware and Fruit*. As mentioned before, in the novel, Byatt finds a shorter and more appropriate title for it which is "Breakfast Table." In depicting the painting in detail, Byatt quotes from one of Van Gogh's letters:

> A blue enameled tin coffee-pot, a royal blue and gold cup (on the left), a pale blue and white chequered milk jug, a cup—on the right—white, with blue and orange designs, on a yellow grey earthenware plate, a blue barbotine or majolica jug with red, green, brown designs, and lastly 2 oranges and 3 lemons; the table is covered with a blue cloth, the background is yellow green, making 6 different blues and 4 or 5 yellows and oranges.[43]

---

[40] Byatt, *Still Life*, 202.
[41] Ibid, 432.
[42] Ibid., 434.
[43] Ibid.,508.

Referring to that particular painting, Elizabeth Hicks claims that "in Byatt's fiction, the frame or the boundary between written text and embedded artwork is blurred;"[44] she recalls Jacques Derrida's philosophical essay on the aesthetics of painting, "Truth in Painting" (1987). Derrida introduces the idea of *parergon*, which is frame and *ergon* (work of art). Regarding *parergon*, Derrida says, "neither work (ergon) nor outside the work (hors d'oeuvre), neither inside nor outside, neither above nor below, it disconcerts any opposition but does not remain indeterminate and it gives rise to the work."[45] The frame separates the integral inside of the work of art not only from the outside but also from the wall it is hung on. What brings Byatt closer to Van Gogh is her firm belief that the painter reflected what he saw or thought as plainly or realistically as possible. Sue Sorensen asserts that what Byatt aims for in *Still Life* is "to redirect us toward a respect for Van Gogh's realistic inclinations and to accept him as a literary artist."[46] Alexander, who is too immersed in Van Gogh's commitment to truthfulness in his paintings, finds himself where the boundary between the text and the mentioned visual is blurred and leaves an impression that Alexander is in it, or that he regenerates it.

In *Still Life*, Byatt's habit of using a visually rich language and the inclusion of many paintings and painters could be examined in an ekphrastic framework, as such descriptions or elaborations, open a new window into understanding the characters, their motives, and the basic ideas behind the construction of the novel that may not be comprehended at first glance. He employs narrative techniques with a focus on intertextuality, references, allusions to myths, literary theories, history, and art. Byatt questions the adequacy of words and stresses the importance of reaching the thing itself; his ekphrastic descriptions prompt readers to initiate a process of visual and intellectual interpretation. Van Gogh and his works that are brought before our eyes through visual depictions transforming into an important narrative tool for Byatt and representing her explorations of pure, simple expressions. Ranging from his chair, house, asylum days, friendship with Gauguin to universally acclaimed major works, Van Gogh's presence is profound and has certain reflections especially in Alexander and Stephanie's storylines. *Still Life* does not just owe its title to the Dutch still-life genre in painting as Stephanie's "still life" as a married woman takes new turns with the birth of her two children but, unfortunately, ends in death, another form of stillness. What

---

[44] Hicks, *Still Life in the Fiction of A. S. Byatt*, 86.
[45] Jacques Derrida, *The Truth in Painting*, trans. Geoffrey Bennington and Ian McLeod. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), 9.
[46] Sorensen, "Something of the Eternal: A.S. Byatt and Vincent Van Gogh," 73.

is more to the point is Byatt's investigation of the visual and verbal language in creating a different kind of realism, one that is influenced by Van Gogh whose life, art, major works, and still life paintings exemplify a simple form that gives the thing itself and, thus, ensures a realistic, accurate vision inspiring Alexander to adopt a writing style which is free from the bonds of figurative language and in which a yellow chair is only the thing itself.

References

Alexander, Flora. "A. S. Byatt. Still Life." In *Contemporary Women Novelists*, edited by Flora Alexander, 34-41. London: Arnold, 1989.

Barber, Barrington and Charlotte Gerlings. *Through the Eyes of Vincent Van Gogh: Selected Drawings and Paintings by the Great Master*. London: Arcturus Publishing, 2005.

Bosveld, Jennifer. *Elastic Ekphrastic: Poetry on Art / Poets on Tour Through Galleries*. Ohio: Pudding House Publications, 2003.

Bourdarot, Emilie. "The Quest for the 'Thing Itself'" in A. S. Byatt's *Still Life*." In *Picturing the Language of Images*, edited by Nancy Pedri and Laurence Petit, 87-101. Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013.

Byatt, A. S. *Still Life*. London: Vintage, 1995.

Byatt, A. S. *Passions of the Mind: Selected Writings*. London: Chatto and Windus, 1991.

Coleridge, Samuel Taylor. *Specimens of the Table Talk of the Late Samuel Taylor Coleridge*. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1835.

Davey, Gail. "Still Life and the Rounding of Consciousness." *Literature and Medicine*. 1998. Vol 352: 1544-1547.

Derrida, Jacques. *The Truth in Painting*, translated by Geoffrey Bennington and Ian McLeod. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.

Hagstrum, Jean. *Sister Arts: The Tradition of Literary Pictorialism and English Poetry from Dryden to Gray*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974.

Heffernan, James A. W. "Ekphrasis and Representation." *New Literary History* 22, no. 2 (1991): 297-316. DOI:10.2307/469040.

Hicks, Elizabeth. *Still Life in the Fiction of A. S. Byatt*. Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010.

Jansen, Leo and Hans Lujiten, Nienke Bakker, eds. *Vincent van Gogh: Ever Yours The Essential Letters*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2014.

Kenyon, Olga. *Women Novelists Today. A Survey of English Writing in the Seventies and Eighties*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1998.

Lessing, Gotthold Ephraim. *Laocoön: An Essay on the Limits of Painting and Poetry*, translated by Edward Allen McCormick. Baltimore: John Hopkins UP, 1962.

Pedri, Nancy and Laurence Petit, eds. *Picturing the Language of Images*. New Castle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013.

Pereira, Margarida Esteves. "More than Words: The Elusive Language of A.S. Byatt's Visual Fiction." In

Writing and Seeing: Essays on Word and Image, edited by Rui Homem Carvalho and Maria de Fatima Lambert, 211-221. Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006.

Sorensen, Sue. "Something of the Eternal: A.S. Byatt and Vincent Van Gogh." *Mosaic: An Interdisciplinary Critical Journal* 37, no. 1 (2004): 63-81. http://www.jstor.org/stable/44030061.

Wagner, Peter. *Icons-Texts-Iconotexts: Essays on Ekphrasis and Intermediality*. Berlin: Gruyter, 1996.

Webb, Ruth. *Ekphrasis, Imagination and Persuasion in Ancient Rhetorical Theory and Practice.* Surrey: Ashgate Publishing, 2009.

Woolf, Virginia. *A Room of One's Own.* Toronto: Broadview Press, 2001.

"Van Gogh. The Man and the Earth" *Ergo*, 4th August 2017, http://ergosumus1.altervista.org/blog/van-gogh-man-earth/.

CHAPTER TWENTY

BETWEEN SOUND AND SENSE: LITERARY TRANSLATION AND *THE THOUSAND AND ONE NIGHTS*

JEFFREY HOWLETT

The concept of equivalency has undergone several transformations in the development of translation theory. Early linguistic theories put forth an ideal construction of word-for-word equivalency. Alternate theories sought to produce an equivalency for each idea expressed in a text, rather than in each word. Following the trend that has overtaken all fields in the Humanities in recent years, current translation theory increasingly favours the idea of cultural equivalency. A translation must consider all the cultural codes that are constituted in language and render as near an equivalent as exists in the target language and culture.

This foundation also raises new problems. How do we define a culture? If the boundaries between language groups are cloudy, the distinctions between cultures are still more so. Does the United States of America have a unique culture? To what degree do African American authors share this culture? Do Hispanic authors writing in English take part in this culture? Do men and women in the United States share a common culture? Post-Colonial and Feminist theories would answer that culture is a complex determinate factor. All of these groups are working within distinct cultural zones they argue.[1]

Clearly, intercultural translation requires fluency beyond grammar and vocabulary. Indeed, much of the contemporary theory insists on the inevitability of misreadings and mistranslations, yet the translator must discover ways to bring the two worlds together, finding correspondences between practices which may be quite different yet occupy a similar

---

[1] A useful summary of the development of translation theory is given in Douglas Robinson, *Becoming a Translator*: *An Introduction to the Theory and Practice of Translation*, (New York: Routledge, 2003), 3-14.

cultural zone. The difficulties in such a theory increase when the cultures have constructed disparate modes for the transmission of knowledge, especially in the case of literary translation; still more so in the case of historical texts. Opposing practices have arisen to deal with such cultural gaps. A translator can choose to provide the reader with the sound and feeling of the original text, as well as the modes of thought and rhythms of life in the culture that produced it. This method confronts the reader with difference. Ideas without cultural equivalents in the target language may be left in the original language. The literary world may become a travelogue in which the reader must assume the position of "other" in order to participate in the world of the text. On the other hand, a translator may choose to replicate the literary experience of the original audience in the target language by reducing as much as possible the dissonant cultural elements. The goal here is to render a transparent version of the text, allowing the reader's focus to remain on the poem or narrative. In this case, familiar expressions in the target language may replace more precisely equivalent terms that convey little to the intended audience. Ideally, the translation admits a new readership to share a literary experience that corresponds to that of the original audience.

To evaluate this range of practices, we will consider two translations of *The Thousand and One Nights*, a work available in several English translations over the years. Throughout much of its publication history, the most popular translation has been the 1885 edition of the British military officer Sir Richard Burton.[2] Burton is conveying a classic Arabic text from the far reaches of the British Empire to an English readership for whom the East constitutes an exotic other. Burton takes pains to preserve much of the oriental flavour of the original, even to the point of approximating the artificial rhymed and alliterative prose of the Arabic composition. This project at times amounts to the production of an original English form. Another translation currently very popular in the United States was made by Husayn Haddawy, an Iraqi scholar living and teaching in America.[3] Professor Haddawy's goal is clearly to produce a comfortable experience for readers in English and to showcase stories that are part of a beloved heritage. The comparison of these two versions of *The Thousand and One Nights* will, I hope, raise valuable questions about the qualities and qualifications of a good translation. It will also inevitably point to the political nature of this sort of intercultural exchange. We must ask how

---

[2] *The Arabian Nights: Tales from A Thousand and One Nights*, translated by Sir Richard F. Burton, (New York: Random House, 2001).

[3] *The Arabian Nights*, translated by Husain Haddawy. edited by Muhsin Mahdi, (New York: Norton, 1990).

many of the choices we make as translators depend upon who we are and which cultural perspectives we privilege.

We may suspect that such a comparison is a simple case of the colonialist appropriating an Eastern text and the native offering an insider's clear explanation. Certainly, Burton, a military officer in the service of the British East India Company, may be accused of clumsiness in rendering the world of classical Islam. His situation could not be more colonial and those of us espousing modern theories may rush to charge him with abduction from start to finish. There is doubtless some truth in these suspicions, yet Burton harmonizes remarkably well with contemporary critics in his justification of his work. He disdains the Orientalists of his day who see a detached competence in language as sufficient for translation. He believes that culture is lived in language and that true understanding is derived more from the bazaar than from the book. Burton's proposition receives some support from an unexpected quarter. Walter Benjamin comments on the "by no means insignificant share" the voices and practices of tradesmen "have had in the art of storytelling … They have left deep traces in the narrative cycle of *The Arabian Nights.*"[4]

Some of Burton's biographers have even portrayed him as a trailblazer in the field of ethnography. He peppers his translation of *The Thousand and One Nights* with a thousand and one footnotes, as many of them dealing with Muslim life and belief as with the Arabic of the text. Burton himself states in the introduction:

> I … address the reader in a few final words. He will not think lightly of my work when I repeat to him that with the aid of my annotations, … the student will readily and pleasantly learn more of the Moslem's manners and customs, laws and religion than is known to the average Orientalist, and, if my labors induce him to attack the text of The Nights he will become master of much more Arabic than the ordinary Arab owns.[5]

Burton seizes for himself the role of educator overseeing an audience unfamiliar with the manners and customs of the Middle East. This is an impressive claim and it gives further evidence that Burton distinguishes himself from the academic translators of Arabic by his superior life experience in the region. He is not modest about his linguistic skills, but he sees them as the lesser pillars in the foundation of his authority. Contemporary critics may challenge whether Burton, in fact, understood

---

[4] Walter Benjamin, "The Storyteller" in *Illuminations*, edited and translated by Hannah Arendt, (New York: Schocken, 1968), 101.
[5] Burton, *Arabian Nights*, xxxvi.

Arab culture as well as he thought, but clearly, his goal as a translator was to bring the world of classical Islam to his audience as completely as possible.

On the other hand, we may expect Husain Haddawy's translation to be much more culturally sensitive. A native Arab speaker, working from the authoritative Mahdi manuscript, the product of Arab scholarship, must be the more capable as a translator of a Middle Eastern text. His focus must surely rest on the meanings current in the original culture. But is it his culture? The 14th century Mahdi manuscript is more remote in time from Haddawy than Shakespeare's plays are from our university students. Indeed, most of the footnotes Haddawy adds are historical and he uses them very sparingly, especially in contrast to the verbose Burton. This lack of scholarly comment is consistent with the overall bareness of Haddawy's translation. The English prose is simple and unadorned. Exotic terminology is avoided in favor of language readily understood by Haddawy's English speaking audience. In some cases, Haddawy seems too accommodating to his target audience in English. Burton, who condemned the practice of his contemporaries in resorting to exotic Arabisms when perfectly good English equivalents existed, himself allowed exclamations like "Bismillah" and "Inshallah" to remain, confident that his English readers were familiar with these expressions. Haddawy, on the other hand, translates even these common formulae, creating such passages as "By the Almighty God" and "If God wills it," which are not perfectly natural in American English. Perhaps this is an attempt to appeal to a multicultural audience of many different religious groups. As such, Haddawy's translation would be comfortable in its cultural neutrality.

Less successful, I think, is Haddawy's rendering of Ifrit and Jinni as "demon." The demon occupies a specialized and more narrowly religious-cultural zone in the Christian world when compared to the supernatural beings of the Arab tales. The threat of the genie may be equivalent, but the sinister religious overtones of the demon far overshoot the mark, I believe. Moreover, the popularity of such folktale figures in American life makes this translation unnecessary. Genie has long been adopted as a loan word in the English language which can be found in every American English dictionary. The term has figured in products of popular culture and advertising and has been used to sell items from storage containers to vacuum cleaners. Shortly after the publication of Haddawy's *Arabian Nights*, Disney Studios began production on the animated film *Aladdin* in which the scene-stealing character of the Genie was voiced by Robin Williams. The film's success as the top-grossing movie of 1992, according to Wikipedia, makes clear that the American public was already familiar

with and ready to embrace such a figure without unnatural linguistic mediation. [6]

The choices made by the two translators appear very clearly when reading passages from the two versions aloud. If the middle eastern souq is the realm in which the Arabic language lives most fully in Burton's assessment, he makes sure that readers hear the noise, the rhythms and the sheer verbal excess in his *Arabian Nights*. Rather than seeking concise equivalents to elaborate metaphors and similes as Haddawy tends to do, Burton prefers to painstakingly unfold verbal formulae, offering word for word translations even when simpler English idioms would sound more natural. Again, Burton's purpose is to reveal his understanding of the Arab culture and sensibility through a stylistic representation of Arabic structures in English. Burton's confidence in his ability to accomplish this purpose is remarkable and results in the unique vigour, if not the verifiable accuracy, of his very popular translation.

Benjamin's tribute to the traders, cited above, credits not just the voices of the merchants, but their systems, the basic role played by their enterprise in shaping so many of the tales' narratives. The trading voyage is responsible for many of the outlandish encounters that furnish the magic and fantasy of the *Nights*. The movement to another place spurs a similar shift in imagination necessary to any literature that relies on the anti-realist impulse. Shahrazad's first cycle of stories branches off from the root narrative "The Merchant and the Demon" (as Haddawy renders it). That sequence also introduces the figures of three mercantile brothers, two of whom are addicted to risky trading journeys, in its initial story "The Second Old Man's Tale." This narrative is later mirrored in "The Tale of the First Lady, the Mistress of the House" in The Three Ladies of Baghdad cycle.

Thus, it can be seen that the pattern of trade, of risk, is already built into the structure of *The Nights*, and both translators are bound to acknowledge it, however widely their treatments of the theme may vary. Haddawy chooses an accountancy model, offering a detailed enumeration of the brothers' finances:

> I shall do my business accounts, calculate my net worth for the year, and after subtracting the capital, whatever the profit happens to be, I shall divide it equally between you and myself. When I examined the books and subtracted the capital, I found out that my profit was two thousand dinars

---

[6] "*Aladdin* (1992 Disney Film)." Wikipedia. Paragraph 26. Last edited September 11, 2019. en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Aladdin_(1992_Disney_film).

> … I divided the money, giving him a thousand dinars and keeping a thousand for myself. [7]

The selflessness of the brother is expressed through precise numeric value. His prudence, his kindness in bailing out the two heedless brothers, are not expressed directly in moral terms, but as concrete financial calculations. The First Lady occupies the same position. She is the sole mercantile figure, while her sisters insist on pursuing their fortunes through marriage, which parallels the risky trading voyages of the two brothers in "The Second Old Man's Tale" and leads to similar ruin. When restoring her sisters' losses, the First Lady in Burton's translation professes: "as for the inheritance which came to me as to you twain, Allah hath blessed it and prospered it to me with increase; and my circumstances are easy; for I have made much money by spinning and cleaning silk; and I and you will share my wealth alike." [8]Burton's emphasis is on the moral and religious qualities of the speaker, rather than with the quantification of wealth. The elevated register and archaic word selection may also suggest a scriptural basis for these pious views. Burton again seems to favor a translation that injects an ethnographic lesson along with the basic commercial structure of the story.

Another passage that illustrates the differing goals and effects of the two translations appears also in the cycle of tales entitled "The Porter and the Three Ladies of Baghdad." The episode begins as a shaggy dog story in which the porter is hired by a beautiful young woman whom he follows through the bazaar as she buys flowers and fruits from the fruit seller, meat from the butcher, vegetables and dairy products from the grocer, sweets from the confectioner and perfumes and sugar from the druggist. Both translators record these events faithfully, Haddawy in his plain prose and Burton in his more florid style. Burton, too, uses many archaisms to indicate that we are dealing with a historic text. However, his Shakespearian flourishes don't disturb the narration of events. Both translations vividly record the shopping trip and the porter's complaints about the growing weight of his basket.

The description of the second and third ladies introduces significant differences in the translations. Haddawy lists the attributes of the second lady, who answers the door, as follows:

> She was all charm, beauty, and perfect grace, with a forehead like the new moon, eyes like those of a deer or wild heifer … cheeks like red

---

[7] Haddawy, *Arabian Nights*, 26.
[8] Burton, *Arabian Nights*, 106.

anemones, mouth like the seal of Solomon, lips like red carnelian, teeth like a row of pearls set in coral, neck like a cake for a king … breasts like a pair of big pomegranates … and belly with a navel like a cup that holds a pound of benzoin ointment. [9]

Haddawy's description is a simple enumeration, one item after the other. Stated in this form, the description clearly recalls the trip through the market. Eyes like a deer or wild heifer: meat from the butcher. Cheeks like anemones, mouth like Seal of Solomon: flowers from the fruit seller. Neck like a cake for a king: sweets from the confectioner's. Breasts like pomegranates: again the fruit seller. Navel like a cup holding benzoin ointment: the druggist. Haddawy's prose makes clear that the description of the lady is a kind of shopping list. The appearance of the third lady, to a lesser extent, also recalls the market:

She had an elegant figure, the scent of ambergris, sugared lips, Babylonian eyes, with eyebrows as arched as a pair of bent bows, and a face whose radiance put the shining sun to shame, for she was like a great star soaring in the heavens, or a dome of gold, or an unveiled bride, or a splendid fish swimming in a fountain, or a morsel of luscious fat in a bowl of milk soup.[10]

While this description adds some abstract similes, it still savors slightly of the shopping trip. Ambergris and sugar are both purchased at the druggist, while the fish and the wonderfully precise soup image again return to the idea of consumption. Haddawy's translation lets us see the continuation of the theme even as it weakens in successive descriptions.

Burton's description of the third lady, however, seriously disrupts the pattern of shopping images built up in this part of the story. More important is the sound of the passage:

Thereupon sat a lady bright of blee, with brow beaming brilliancy, the dream of philosophy, whose eyes were fraught with Babel's gramarye and her eyebrows were arched as for archery; her breath breathed ambergris and perfumery and her lips were sugar to taste and carnelian to see. Her stature was straight as the letter I and her face shamed the noon-sun's radiancy; and she was even as a galaxy, or a dome with golden marquetry or a bride displayed in choicest finery or a noble maid of Araby. [11]

---

[9] Haddawy, *Arabian Nights*, 68.
[10] Haddawy, *Arabian Nights*, 69.
[11] Burton, *Arabian Nights*, 49.

Burton's first consideration is to reproduce the sound and style of the Arabic text, which consists of an artificially rhymed prose. He realizes that this may not be to his readers' taste, but he defends it thus in his introduction:

> Despite objections manifold and manifest, I have preserved the balance of sentences and the prose rhyme and rhythm which Easterns look upon as mere music. This "Saj'a," or cadence of the cooing dove, has in Arabic its special duties. It adds a sparkle to description and a point to proverb, epigram and dialogue; it corresponds with our "artful alliteration" (which in places I have substituted for it) and, generally, it defines the boundaries between the classical and the popular styles which jostle each other in *The Nights* … This rhymed prose may be "un-English" and unpleasant, even irritating to the British ear; still, I look upon it as a *sine quâ non* for a complete reproduction of the original. [12]

Here we have two different notions of literary translation. Both men isolate elements of the text they wish to emphasize in the target language. For Burton, literary style is primary, not only for effect—indeed, the effect may be an unfortunate one—but to illustrate the clash of high and low literary forms that constitute the original work. Reproducing sounds, rhythms and varieties of diction is absolutely essential in Burton's assessment. Other than setting the interpolated poems in a noticeably higher register, Haddawy makes no effort at all to represent the clashing literary styles in his English translation. More important is keeping the imagery as clear as possible so that a developing thematic pattern remains highly visible. Both of these are valid goals of literary translation. The emphasis depends on the individual translator.

Haddawy's translation differs further in that it includes the second stage of the Porter and the Three Ladies tale. Burton, acting as an editor as well as a translator, deleted the episode, believing that his readers would consider it obscene. The scene, probably the oldest part of the "Three Ladies" narrative, is, in fact, a dirty joke. In it, the porter describes the naked women using terms varying in register from the crude idiom of such sexual humor, to the language of reproduction, to a very clinical scientific terminology, are all rejected by the women as shameful. They protest his "ugly" and disrespectful choice of words by slapping and boxing him until he asks in frustration to be corrected. Finally, he catches on to their game and uses the same strategies to win their laughter and appreciation.

Haddawy likely includes this material, not because the American audience is less uncomfortable with the sexual content, but because it is

---

[12] Burton, *Arabian Nights*, xxix.

now essential to various feminist readings of the *1001 Nights*. The fact that the porter transfers his desire to the realm of discourse mirrors the work that Shahrazad is doing with the mad King Shahrayar. Though her cliff-hanger stories begin as a ploy to gain time, Shahrazad's manipulation of narrative desire begins to suggest a new and healthier pattern of sexuality. Fedwa Malti-Douglas explains the technique thus:

> Rather than taking on directly the king's fractured pattern of physical lovemaking, Shahrazad shifts the problem of desire from the area of sex, the realm of Shahrayar's trauma, to the superficially more distant and more malleable world of the text. Her storyteller teaches a new type of desire, a desire that continues from night to night. [13]

Thus, Haddawy's translation is prepared for use in the contemporary academy in which feminist and postcolonial theories have prominence. In his introduction, he points out the multicultural origin of the tales and the fact that they had been transmitted orally for years before they are finally recorded during the Islamic caliphate. He also positions himself within a living oral tradition—and a feminist one at that—by relating that he first heard these tales from a group of old women in Baghdad. In other words, no matter what theory of translation we may hold, the target audience would seem to be as influential as the original text and culture in determining the choices made in translation. Haddawy hails from Baghdad and is a native Arab speaker, yet his *1001 Nights* is arguably less self-consciously Arab than Burton's. Haddawy carefully translates out most of the identifying signatures of classical Islamic life while harmonizing his text with the theories currently prevalent in the Western academy.

Burton, on the other hand, prepares a compendium of information on the Arab language and culture, while championing the view that language cannot live apart from culture. He imitates the rhyme and rhythm of medieval Arabic and from the beginning must defend this aesthetic against the attacks of his British critics. While part of a colonial enterprise, Burton felt no great devotion to the seat of the empire. He grew up abroad[14] and

---

[13] Fedwa Malti-Douglas, *Woman's Body, Woman's Word: Gender and Discourse in Arabo-Islamic Writing*, (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991), 22.

[14] It is interesting to note that several of the stories Burton translated from the Egyptian versions of *The Thousand and One Nights* have proven to be forgeries, apparently written by missionaries in Arabic with French grammar. Having spent a large part of his youth in France, should Burton have noticed this? Is it the job of a translator to evaluate, to authenticate? For Burton's background in France, see Fawn Brodie, *The Devil Drives:A Life of Sir Richard Burton*, (London: Eland Publishing, 1967), 22-31.

had to create his own professional niche as a writer. His knowledge of the East was the possession with which he would challenge the scholars and Orientalists of whom he speaks so dismissively. His translation reflects his position as an outsider to the ideological state apparatus of nineteenth-century England and, in particular, to the academic world.

What cultural and political forces are acting upon a translator? Husain Haddawy published his translation of 1001 Nights in 1990. That same year the American army was sent to confront Iraq for the first time. No translation of the *Nights* is more English-friendly and comfortable for readers in the target language. The narrative is so domesticated, however, that it is difficult to know where the tales take place. The words "Arabian Nights" (Saudi Arabia was an ally of the United States and hosted American military bases during the Gulf War) cross the cover of the book below an abstract image that might represent anything. Is this translation softened and cleansed of its Islamic sensibilities to meet a political situation in which Iraq has been demonized? Is that why the Jinn have fled to be replaced by demons? Or is this simply a good translation, one which approximates the experience of the original audience without continually pointing out the cultural differences?

We may also ask what challenges are presented by this unique sort of text. The Baghdad represented in the tales is not the place Professor Haddawy was born, nor the place that was being bombed by American and allied air forces. The fantastic nature of the stories—their value, according to the Shahrazad herself consists not in their cultural specificity but in the fact that they are "amazing"—sets them in an ahistorical world in which magical and uncanny events can take place. Yet, in a post-Said academic world, we have been repeatedly warned against representing the east as occupying a completed historical time that is in conflict with the modern west. Haddawy's translation of *Arabian Nights* might be considered self-orientalizing. Does this make the text a hot potato for western scholars? Is it an advantage for scholars working in the source language or residing in lands referred to in anti-realist literature? Should fables and fairy tales be anchored to culturally specific meanings and cultural situations?

Both Burton and Haddawy have made valid literary choices in translating a classical text, but both have also been affected, consciously or unconsciously, by cultural power dynamics. I present this issue as one that is relevant to scholars now working in Turkey. The rich literature of Turkey boasts many Ottoman texts that are not presently available in English translation. The English-speaking world should know about this heritage. As scholars in our field are the most qualified to produce new English translations, we should identify the unique problems of translating

historical texts. Translators working to share Turkey's literary tradition will be faced with the same choices as were Haddawy and Burton. They must decide which elements constitute the essential nature of a classical work. Can an approximation of verbal music or meter be rendered in English? Should we seek the most accurate sense-for-sense equivalency even if it means that poetic qualities will be sacrificed? The nature of the text will set certain boundaries, but, for the most part, it is the translator's judgment that must determine which qualities should be emphasized in a good translation.

References

"*Aladdin* (1992 Disney Film)." Wikipedia. Last edited September 11, 2019.
    en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Aladdin_(1992_Disney_film).

Benjamin, Walter. "The Storyteller" in *Illuminations*. Edited and translated by Hannah Arendt, New York: Schocken, 1968.

Brodie, Fawn. *The Devil Drives: A Life of Sir Richard Burton*. London: Eland Publishing, 1967.

The Arabian Nights: Tales from A Thousand and One Nights. Translated by Sir Richard F. Burton. New York: Random House, 2001.

The Arabian Nights. Translated by Husain Haddawy. Edited by Muhsin Mahdi. New York: Norton, 1990.

Malti-Douglas, Fedwa. *Woman's Body, Woman's Word: Gender and Discourse in Arabo-Islamic Writing*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991.

Robinson, Douglas. *Becoming a Translator: An Introduction to the Theory and Practice of Translation*. New York: Routledge, 2003

CHAPTER TWENTY-ONE

ENGLISH LANGUAGE INSTRUCTORS' SELF-AWARENESS AND RESEARCH PERCEPTIONS: A TURKISH UNIVERSITY CONTEXT

VILDAN İNCI KAVAK

Introduction

The differentiation between researchers and university language instructors in the field of ELT has long been a matter of controversy in academia. The mediators (The Departments of Applied Linguistics, Language Teacher Education, Language Pedagogy, TESOL or the Council of Higher Education) usually design and implement academic curricula. These mostly feed off research studies and hypothetical sources and aim to adapt theoretical knowledge into more practical and easy-to-read textbooks for future practitioners. Despite all the efforts, the impact of research on classroom teaching is still rather limited. The majority of stakeholders in academia and policymakers in public institutions still advocate the necessity of the theory and practice distinction. To illustrate, Medgyes insists that teaching and researching are two separate fields that necessitate different forms of expertise.[1] For him, teachers are practitioners, namely, "people of action" as opposed to researchers who are "people of theory."[2] Borg also claims that teachers do not show interest in research due to a number of reasons such as time constraints, limited access to resources, the complexity of research and lack of expertise.[3] It is also a widely-

---

[1] Péter Medgyes, "The (ir) relevance of academic research for the language teacher." *Elt Journal* 71, no.4 (2017): 491-498.

[2] Ibid. 492.

[3] Simon Borg, "English Language Teachers Conceptions of Research." *Applied Linguistics* 30, no.3 (2009): 358-388.

accepted assertion that "research has been less consequential in affecting practice widely",[4] thus it is challenging to direct what appears in research to practice. As mentioned above, the language of research can be too intricate and theoretical to be grasped by practitioners and this may often be due to their lack of expertise and knowledge in the field, which is one of the chief reasons why there is a common confusion and division about how and when to read and carry out research.

Literature review

Instructor as language teacher versus instructor as researcher

The debate about who should do the research in the classroom is still valid. In popular belief, teachers are expected to teach while researchers are employed for research. Many teachers do not assume to have the role of "researching."[5] They only stand as the topic of research for a researcher but are not the actual researcher who carries it out. There are teachers who agree with the researchers, acting as the research subjects for reasons such as lack of time, energy, support by their institutions and colleagues as well as lacking in expertise in doing valid and reliable research. However, some of them still want to be more active in their classroom practices.[6]

Both sides, researchers and teachers, can be justified in their own rights. Many teachers do not feel like being a researcher and claim they are being treated as the objects of an inquiry. There is generally no requirement for research in their job descriptions. As quoted in Medgyes' article, "teachers are paid to get students to learn; their job is to teach effectively. They are not paid to understand, document, and generate public knowledge about how students learn and how best to teach them."[7] This is one aspect of the controversy and a sign of academic arrogance or prejudice by those who look down on practitioners and fear of the competition lurking ahead of them. In this sense, when intending to do research, teachers can be assumed not to receive the necessary encouragement in comparison to

---

[4] Diane Larsen-Freeman, "Research into practice: Grammar learning and teaching." *Language Teaching* 48, no. 2 (2015): 271.

[5] Anthony J. Polemeni, "Research and Teacher Power." *Educational Leadership* 33, no.7 (1976): 493-497.

[6] Jim McKernan, "The countenance of curriculum action research: Traditional, collaborative, and emancipatory-critical conceptions." *Journal of curriculum and supervision* 3, no. 3 (1988): 173-200.

[7] Medgyes, "The (ir) relevance of academic research for the language teacher.", 496.

their academic peers at universities. An academic researcher has the entitlement, privilege, and support from the university to do research while a teacher or a university language instructor would have to put in extra effort to carry out a similar task on top of the teaching workload required by the institution.

Language instructors at universities have a vital role in teaching English to students who are supposed to study academic subjects in L2. This role extends beyond the classroom. Besides delivering the curriculum, they are expected to recognize and solve potential problems upon delivering the curriculum.[8] As a qualified teacher should be aware of, and be able to respond to, the direction of new development in teaching, language instructors are expected to be more up-to-date and competent in teaching than any other language teachers. To realise these, they need to engage in research, so they can possibly improve the quality of their teaching.[9]

The relationship between researcher and language instructor/teacher should not be evaluated with questions asking about "power" or "superiority" such as who needs whom?[10] Just like Medgyes, Gomm and Hammersley and Maley claim, teachers and researchers come from two different worlds and their routes rarely meet because they are in charge of "two distinct forms of activity."[11] These fields traditionally have no links to connect each other, but they are organically interconnected, with being two sides of the same field. On the one hand, they are both involved in learning and teaching activities in the classroom. On the other hand, language teachers and researchers do have different roles in different contexts of language education. Moreover, many individuals combine both roles: some researchers in the Applied Linguistics often teach at schools or universities, and some teachers/instructors carry out research activities as well as publishing them in academic journals or books. As Eisner puts it,

---

[8] James R. Davis, *Interdisciplinary courses and team teaching: New arrangements for learning*. (Phoenix, Ariz.: American Council on Education, 1995).

[9] Peter Mortimore, "Does educational research matter?" *British Educational Research Journal* 26, no. 1 (2000): 5-24. Also in Tim Everton, Maurice Galton, and Tony Pell. "Teachers' perspectives on educational research: Knowledge and context." *Journal of Education for Teaching* 26, no. 2 (2000): 167-182.

[10] Medgyes, "The (ir) relevance of academic research for the language teacher.", 495.

[11] Martyn Hammersley and Roger Gomm, "Research and practice, two worlds for ever at odds" in *Educational research, policymaking and practice*, edited by Martyn Hammersley. (London: Paul Chapman Publishing, 2002)*:* 59-83. Alan Maley, "More research is needed–A mantra too far." *Humanising Language Teaching* 18, no. 3 (2016): 491.

"researchers are beginning to go back to schools, not to conduct commando raids, but to work with teachers."[12] These two separate but interconnected worlds can potentially be brought together, from which both sides can mutually and considerably benefit.

Instructor – researcher versus traditional researcher

Research is a tool to create knowledge, encourage people to draw conclusions on actions, sharpen skills in critical thinking and evaluating results. University instructors generally do research in order to improve their teaching practices or alternatively having the target of completing a higher degree or publishing their results. Another point is that language instructors' and researchers' research goals and strategies can be different, which affects the way they approach it. While traditional research is considered to be theory-based, the instructor/teacher research is mostly practice-based.[13]

Research done by teachers and university instructors for practical reasons has been severely criticized by traditional researchers for certain reasons. Some researchers claim that language teachers' work is not theoretical, and does not have the standards of research norms in general.[14] Reliability and validity are other issues that should be addressed. These led academicians to adopt a negative attitude towards teacher/instructor research, which can be tracked in their remarks such as "a mere language teacher/instructor" or "needs more theory" for teachers whose research attempts failed due to flawed methodology.[15] Therefore, teacher/instructor research is often described as action research, not in its real sense, but in a reproachful tone. It is only a method of doing classroom research and it would be pointless to label all the work produced by instructors or teachers as action research. Medgyes, for example, chooses to identify

---

[12] Elliot W. Eisner, "The primacy of experience and the politics of method." *Educational Researcher* 17, no. 5 (1988): 19.

[13] Richard Allwright, Dick Allwright, and Kathleen M. Bailey. *Focus on the language classroom: An introduction to classroom research for language teachers*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991). David Nunan, *Research methods in language learning*. (Cambridge University Press, 1992). Diane Larsen-Freeman, "Research into practice: Grammar learning and teaching." *Language Teaching* 48, no. 2 (2015): 263-280.

[14] David Nunan, "Standards for teacher-research: Developing standards for teacher-research in TESOL." *TESOL Quarterly* 31, no. 2 (1997): 365-367.

[15] Desmond Allison and Julia Carey. "What Do University Language Teachers Say About Language Teaching Research?" *TESL Canada Journal* 24, no. 2 (2007): 71.

teachers' work as not research but an "inquiry" in order to emphasise the "problem-solving" and "pragmatic" nature of the work.[16]

Language teachers/instructors also put blame on researchers and their studies by claiming that studies produced by researchers do not fit in the goals of teaching practices even if they are compatible with the research norms. McNamara reports that "teachers do not rely on statistical nature of research because the statistics are susceptible to manipulation."[17] Some teachers believe that academic works are too uninspiring and unrewarding to put into practice. Another finding shows that teachers do not see any advantage of putting research findings into good use.[18] Most research "[makes no] serious contribution to fundamental theory or knowledge …, is irrelevant to practice…, is unco-ordinated with any preceding or follow-up research… and clutters up academic journals that virtually nobody reads".[19] In other words, teachers and language instructors find research articles too impenetrable, academic and impractical to understand due to the theoretical knowledge they use. Therefore, there is a need for a mediator "chewing", "regurgitating" just like preparing food for a baby to spoon-feed, in order to help them swallow and digest the academic research.[20] Instead, it can be suggested that teachers should be encouraged to get closely and personally involved in research rather than demanding assistance for problems in their teaching practices.

Another point is that "there is not enough justification for [language] teachers to jump on the research bandwagon."[21] Instead, they could depend on their own and fellow experiences since there are many contrasting and erratic ideas about controversial issues. This resembles trying out a new dish from a recipe. There are countless recipes for the same dish. One recommends using a certain ingredient while the other replaces it with another or sets it aside completely. It can be difficult for a novice language instructor to decide upon which of these different recipes

---

[16] Medgyes, "The (ir) relevance of academic research for the language teacher," 497.

[17] Olwen McNamara, "Evidence-based practice through practice-based evidence." In *Becoming an evidence-based practitioner*, 29-40. (Routledge, 2003).

[18] Graham Crookes and Lowell Arakaki, "Teaching idea sources and work conditions in an ESL program." *Tesol Journal* 8 (1999): 15-19.

[19] Derek Hargreaves, "Teaching as a research-based profession: possibilities and prospects (The Teacher Training Agency Lecture 1996)." *Educational research and evidence-based practice* (2007): 3-17, 7.

[20] Medgyes, "The (ir)relevance of academic research for the language teacher," 493.

[21] Ibid., 493.

to choose, yet an experienced practitioner could pick the right one for the right people. Just like the dietary analogy, an experienced instructor would not run after what is trendy in the field or get affected easily by any recent research so quickly.[22] Considering him/herself a researcher or not, s/he can pick and mix what is right for her/his context and available off the shelf.

There are reasons for teachers to keep away from researching. Among the most repeated justifications are lack of time, lack of encouragement, lack of expertise and confusion about the concept of real research. This should not mean that the quality of research can be ignored. Key factors mentioned earlier are essential for quality research. Therefore, stress should not be on whether a researcher or teacher conducts research, but whether it is a useful research or not.[23] When teachers are given the opportunity to engage in research, they become more aware of their own practices and can make the necessary changes, can systematically analyse their own and their students' performances.[24] In this way, they can evaluate and better themselves professionally, which, in turn, enhances the quality of teaching and learning.

We can assert that there is a continuum from informal and anecdotal research conducted by teachers to formal, objective and empirical research done by researchers. Teachers do this type of research mainly for reflecting on their teaching, but academicians use the classroom as a source for data.[25] While teacher research supports teaching in teachers' daily teaching practices, studies published by researchers may not have comparable practical applications. Likewise, the fact that most universities have the faculties and/or departments of teaching does not bring about an immediate impact on the quality and success of their language departments or schools where language instructors are employed. In light of this discussion, it appears that researchers and teachers often tend to be on the different sides of a junction and move hastily in the opposite direction due to common misconceptions and inadequate incentives for a more collaborative teaching and research environment.

---

[22] Ibid., 491-498.
[23] David Nunan, "Standards for teacher-research: Developing standards for teacher-research in TESOL," 365-367.
[24] Susan Anne Capel, Marilyn Leask, and Tony Turner, *Starting to Teach in the SecondarySchool: A Companion for the Newly Qualified Teacher.* (London: Routledge, 1997).
[25] Desmond Allison and Julia Carey, "What Do University Language Teachers Say About Language Teaching Research?" 61-81.

Methodology

The aim of this study was to find out the perceptions of instructors on their research engagement. The data featuring their thoughts about research were collected through a detailed questionnaire. A subgroup of teachers who also volunteered to attend interviews was asked about the answers they provided in the survey.

Research questions

In this paper, the following questions were attempted to be answered:
1. What counts (or not) as research for ELT instructors?
2. What are the characteristics of "good research" for ELT instructors?
3. What are their perceptions of institutional research culture?

Participants

50 English language instructors teaching at the School of Foreign Languages of Gaziantep University in Turkey volunteered to take part in the study.

Data collection and analysis

Questionnaire

The questionnaire used in this study was developed by Borg and the data came from four sections.[26] These sections asked questions to find out the instructors'

- opinions about what counts as research,
- opinions about the characteristics of high-quality research,
- views about the institutional research culture,
- experience in teaching and research,

Triangulation was used to complement quantitative data collection tools with qualitative ones. As a quantitative tool, the questionnaire was administered as hard copy only for the convenience of the instructors in practice. Questionnaires can sometimes reveal superficial data which needs exploring more deeply to give accurate information. To be able to

---

[26] Borg, "English Language Teachers Conceptions of Research," 358-388.

overcome this weakness, direct questions such as "what do you think about good quality research?" were not preferred. Rather, the information from the surveys was supplemented with follow-up interviews, which will be explained further in the next section.

Follow-up interviews

After the instructors who had been teaching at the School of Foreign Languages filled out the questionnaire, they were asked whether they would volunteer for follow-up interviews to discuss their responses in more detail. 11 instructors (%22 of total) stated their intention to take part in the second phase of the study. Their profiles were provided in Table 1:

Table 1. Profile of interviewees

Instructors	Gender	Nationality	Qualification	Experience
1	Female	American	MA in Literature	3 yrs
2	Female	Turkish	MA in Social Sciences	8 yrs
3	Female	Turkish	MA in ELT	9 yrs
4	Male	Turkish	MA in ELT	10 yrs
5	Female	Turkish	MA in Business cont.	14 yrs
6	Female	Turkish	BA in ELT	13 yrs
7	Female	Turkish	MA in Literature	11 yrs
8	Female	Turkish	MA in Education	15 yrs
9	Female	Turkish	PhD in ELT	12 yrs
10	Female	Turkish	PhD in Education cont.	12 yrs
11	Female	Turkish	PhD in ELT cont.	24 yrs

All the volunteering instructors were interviewed. The face-to-face interviews were kept casual and lasted around half an hour. The interviews were also audio recorded so as not to miss important details. The mother tongue of the instructors was used to guarantee a sincere and relaxing environment for the interview. A semi-structured interview sheet was used to be as personal and honest as possible, so the follow-up questions were tailored and adapted to the answers given in the questionnaire and in the process of interview. This casual talk was flexible enough for interviewees to expand on any responses they had given to the survey or during the interview. The interview was mainly used to crosscheck, clarify and enrich the data collected by the survey on

  ▪ what should be researched and why (not),
  ▪ what good research means for instructors,

The interviews were also fully transcribed and analysed according to their broad subcategories to see whether they are in accordance with the survey results. These categories helped towards an understanding of the quantitative analysis of the survey. The whole data collected via each tool -survey and interview- was brought together to answer the research questions more accurately.

Results

Background information

A total of 50 instructors participated in this study. 48 questionnaires were completed in hard copy. 2 of them were not used due to the missing data in some sections. As shown in Table 2, the majority of the instructors have between 5-14 year experience of teaching English at university.

Table 2. ELT instructors by years of experience

Years	Number	%
0–4	1	2%
5–9	11	23%
10–14	18	38%
15–19	6	13%
20–24	4	8%
25+	8	17%
Total	48*	100%

Table 3. Respondents by highest ELT qualification

Qualification	Number	%
Certificate	0	0%
Diploma	1	2%
Bachelor's	20	42%
Master's	23	48%
Doctorate	4	8%
Other	0	0%
Total	48*	100%

*The total number does not count up to 50 due to the missing data.

Section 1 & 2 - instructors' research conceptions

Instructors were asked to evaluate 10 scenarios and then state their opinions about the characteristics of "good quality research". The data was gathered from two interrelated sections.

Evaluating scenarios:

The instructors were provided with 10 scenarios and 4 possible options ranging from "definitely not research" to "definitely research". There was no definite answer to these situations, but they were designed to understand the instructors' personal perceptions and conceptions of research. Table 4 summarizes the findings from the first section.

Table 4. Teachers' assessment of 10 scenarios

Scenarios	Numbers	Definitely not research (%)	Probably not research (%)	Probably research (%)	Definitely research (%)
1	50	16	14	48	22
2	49	2	4	24	69
3	48	8	19	23	50
4	50	0	4	10	86
5	49	2	6	43	49
6	49	0	4	22	74
7	49	12	18	33	37
8	49	27	20	27	27
9	50	10	16	32	42
10	49	10	20	25	45

As mentioned above, deciding what is worth researching and what does not is not an easy task. The attempts to define research by scholars in the literature help us understand what qualities research should possess in terms of subject matter, data, analysis, and interpretation.

In Table 3, three of the ten scenarios are highly rated in comparison to the rest. These are 2, 4 and 6. We know that the analysis of the scenarios can provide only a general picture of the instructor's conception of research. For a deeper analysis to understand their reasoning for research, we have to analyse the follow-up data gathered through a questionnaire and interviews. Scenario 4, for instance, was rated the highest (%86) as research by instructors. The ones who were interviewed stated that it should be definitely researched because it has a large sample (500 teachers), a reliable, quantitative research analysis method (statistics) and a data collection tool (questionnaire) were used. Finally, it turned into a

paper published by a journal. The instructors claimed that these are the main qualities that research should have.

The second highest-rated was Scenario 6 (%74). The instructors mentioned that testing the effectiveness of a method is also research. It does not have to be theory-driven only. They also highlighted that the research that is more practical is more useful for them and this type of research can be put in practice more easily. In this scenario, the teacher approaches teaching quite systematically by using different methods and then comparing the results, which explains why it is highly approved by the instructors.

The final highly rated scenario is Scenario 2 (%69). Interviewees stated that the teacher in this scenario has an academic approach to a new method and after s/he tried it out, s/he collected samples via various data collection tools and then analysed it. The instructors claimed that even if it is not published and made public, it is still counted as research because the researcher employs an academic and systematic approach in the study.

Scenarios 1, 7 and 8 were the least rated items. For all of these, the responses are spread equally. For Scenario 1, the instructors stated that adapting and tailoring the activities, making decisions during and after the class about what worked well and what did not is what they do all the time because "this is what teaching is about." Scenario 7 is about a talk between a headmaster and teachers. Interviewees claimed that taking notes is not research; it has a lot of missing components. Data collection should be carried out in a systematic fashion. Scenario 8 also had mixed results. The instructors who participated in the interview stated that the researcher needs a large sample to be able to make a proper decision. Having feedback from only 5 students out of 30 would not be adequate for such a study.

Characteristics of good quality research

The second section of the questionnaire invites instructors to rate what they think is good quality research out of a group of characteristics. The responses are summarized in Table 5. To be able to understand this table in a better way, we have to explain that "unimportant" and "moderately unimportant" and also "important" and "very important" responses are considered together to highlight which characteristics are important for instructors or not.

Table 5. Teachers' views on the research characteristics

Characteristics	Numbers	Unimportant (%)	Moderately Unimportant (%)	Unsure (%)	Important (%)	Very Important (%)
Large number	48	0	15	6	44	35
Large volume	49	0	8	10	53	29
Experiments	48	4	8	15	50	23
Hypothesis	49	0	2	8	43	47
Statistical info	48	2	6	11	33	48
Questionnaire	48	6	19	15	35	25
Objectivity	49	2	2	0	10	86
Applicability	48	6	8	25	44	17
Publicity	49	2	0	27	53	18
Usability	49	0	4	10	49	37
Controllability	49	0	6	10	39	45

Here is the summary list of research characteristics that are in descending order from "more important" to "less important" according to the responses in the questionnaire.

- Objectivity
- Hypothesis
- Usability
- Controllability
- Large volume
- Statistical info
- Large number
- Experiments
- Publicity
- Applicability
- Questionnaire

As it is clarified above, the most rated characteristics are "objectivity", "testing hypotheses", "controllability" "having large volume and number", "statistical information", and also "experiments" seem crucially important for the instructors. As most of the features specified are of quantitative research, we can conclude that the instructors' conception of research tends to be more aligned with natural sciences and its systematic notions. It should be highlighted that "usability" had third place out of 11 characteristics. As stated in the interviews by the instructors, it is very

important for studies to have practical results, and thus, they could be used in the classroom. This proves that instructors have pragmatic concerns and this was reflected frequently in their answers. "Publicity" (%71) is also almost equally marked with being applicable (%71) and making experiments (%73). Here there are no big differences between them in terms of percentages. However, 27 percent of the instructors, which is the highest in the "unsure" column hesitated about whether making research public for readers and being applicable to class practices are important features or not.

Another point worth mentioning here is what instructors consider as "less important." "Using questionnaires" is the one that is marked the least. As some interviewees stated that they fill in many of them and they sometimes do not reflect the reality so "questionnaires are not reliable enough." They also declared that what is revealed in other contexts might not be possible to apply to the field of ELT.

As a final item, we have to consider why "objectivity" is marked by nearly all of the instructors. In the interviews, the instructors stressed that the researcher should not be biased and it should be data that leads the flow of the study, not the researcher's personal preferences. Accordingly, the results of a study should never be decided in advance and the data should not be manipulated in any way.

Research culture

The third section of the questionnaire enquired instructors to state their opinions about the research culture in their institution. It has been stated before that there is a relation between research engagement and research culture in the school. In this section, there are statements to elicit responses as to what extent they are encouraged to read and do research. Table 6 provides a summary of the results of this section.

Table 6. Institutional research culture

Attitude	Numbers	Disagree strongly (%)	Disagree (%)	Don't know (%)	Agree (%)	Agree strongly (%)
Ts do research	49	8	12	16	53	10
Management encouragement	49	4	16	12	59	8
Doing research is important	49	10	14	25	35	16
Accessibility to research books	49	4	2	24	35	35
Current research	49	4	8	20	41	27
Talking about research	49	8	16	23	39	14
Support for ELT conferences	49	2	8	10	47	33
Given time for research	49	16	16	29	27	12
Ts read published research	49	4	12	37	43	4

Table 6 reveals that the majority of the instructors agreed with six of the items. The highest-rated item "instructors can get support for ELT conferences" was marked by %80 of the participants. The item which enquires about the "access to research books" got the approval of %70. Subsequently, reading "current research", having "encouragement from the school" and "teachers do research" are all highly rated. That is, the participants acknowledged the existence of a positive atmosphere for research engagement in the school. On the other hand, the item stating "teachers are given time to do research allocated to their workload" was rated evenly. As the instructors taught English at a state university, they believed that they were not expected to carry out research by the institution. The fact that they had a high teaching workload also proved that they could only have their own free time to do research even if they aspired to do so. They were not officially given any time or encouragement to engage in research. As to the final item in the questionnaire, the participants claimed that they did not know whether their colleagues read the published research or not, despite the positive research environment provided for all instructors at school.

Discussion and conclusion

Teaching and researching can be identified and respected as separate areas of expertise. They both have challenges peculiar to themselves. However, this does not mean that teachers and researchers cannot build a partnership to answer some key questions that are relevant to language learning and

teaching in the classroom.[27] Language teachers who are research-engaged also benefit from researching in terms of professional development.[28] In this sense, they need to be critical in their evaluations by moving from a submissive position to a more leading one steering the students into learning. As Gurney puts it, the teacher should have full control of their classrooms and they should be the ones who assume a more innovatory role, not an implementary one. The only way to do this is by adopting the researcher role.[29]

The data gathered from 50 English language instructors working at Gaziantep University has shown that they are familiar with the conventional properties and characteristics of research such as objectivity, hypotheses, controllability, volume, sample size, variables, statistical information and experimentation in research. In other words, natural science and its systematic research notions are considered to be "more relevant" to quality research. "Usability" and "practicality" are also the popular expectations of the language instructors from data collection tools as essential parts of good research practice.

A surprising finding is that using questionnaires for research is not considered by the instructors to be a reliable method. They stated that they fill in many paper-based and online surveys, but they generally do not receive any feedback afterwards. Therefore, they believe that questionnaires and surveys are not answered with complete honesty and integrity and researchers are not concerned with the practical impact of their studies.

---

[27] Rod Bolitho, "Teaching, teacher training and applied linguistics." in *Re-exploring CELT: Continuing Education for Language Teachers*, edited by Verner Courtenay Bickley, 26-32. (Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education, Education Dept., 1987).

[28] Joe L. Kincheloe, *Teachers as researchers (classic edition): Qualitative inquiry as a path to empowerment*. (London: Routledge, 2012). Also in Sue Lyle, "An investigation into the impact of a continuing professional development programme designed to support the development of teachers as researchers in South Wales." *Journal of In-Service Education* 29, no. 2 (2003): 295-314; Colin Lankshear, and Michele Knobel. *A Handbook for Teacher research: From design to implementation*. (London: Open University Press, 2004). Margaret Kirkwood and Donald Christie. "The role of teacher research in continuing professional development." *British Journal of Educational Studies* 54, no. 4 (2006): 429-448.

[29] Paul M. Gurney, "Implementer or innovator: A teacher's challenge to the restrictive paradigm of traditional research." *The management of change* (1989): 13-28, 15.

Another important point this study makes is that it features similar results with the previous research on the subject[30] although the number of studies on the same topic is scarce and some have been conducted internationally[31] or at Turkish primary or secondary school levels with more localized contexts.[32] This study can serve as a starting point to raise awareness in terms of the instructors' tendencies towards research. Over and above the percentages it examines, it is intended to comprehend what perceptions and conceptions instructors held about classroom and theoretical research in the field of ELT and to what extent they were engaged in research practices.

One striking conclusion is the instructors' perception of official support and encouragement from the institution by which they were employed. The majority of the participants admitted that the university offered them a positive atmosphere for research, but they also believed that they were not expected to carry out research due to their job descriptions. Understandably, foreign language instructors at Turkish universities are expected to teach language rather than carry out research on language teaching and learning. Yet, they are still more flexible and well-equipped in terms of academic opportunities and access to resources in comparison to their peers at primary, secondary schools or colleges in Turkey. As a final point, the study showed that there is no collective and cooperative research culture urging the instructors to take part in a larger scale research either within the school or the university. Accordingly, most of the participants were not aware of or concerned about their colleagues' research interests or engagement, which appears to be a serious drawback to the universal and, often official, objectives of universities to be research powerhouses and initiators.

---

[30] Simon Borg, "English Language Teachers Conceptions of Research," 358-388. Also in Kadir Beycioglu, Niyazi Ozer, and Celal Teyyar Ugurlu. "Teachers Views on Educational Research." Teaching and Teacher Education 26, no. 4 (2010): 1088-093. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2009.11.004. Nesrin Kutlay, "A survey of English language teachers' views of research." *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 70, (2013): 188-206.

[31] Simon Borg, "English Language Teachers Conceptions of Research," 358-388.

[32] Kadir Beycioglu, Niyazi Ozer, and Celal Teyyar Ugurlu, "Teachers Views on Educational Research," 1088-1093.

References

Allison, Desmond, and Julia Carey. "What Do University Language Teachers Say About Language Teaching Research?" *TESL Canada Journal* 24, no. 2 (2007): 61-81. doi:10.18806/tesl.v24i2.139.

Allwright, Richard, "Exploratory practice: Rethinking practitioner research in language teaching." *Language Teaching Research* 7, no. 2 (2003): 113-141.

Allwright, Richard, Dick Allwright, and Kathleen M. Bailey. *Focus on the language classroom: An introduction to classroom research for language teachers*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.

Bassey, Michael. *Case Study Research in Educational Settings*. Buckingham: Open University Press, 1999.

Beycioglu, Kadir, Niyazi Ozer, and Celal Teyyar Ugurlu. "Teachers Views on Educational Research." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 26, no. 4 (2010): 1088-1093. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2009.11.004.

Bolitho, Rod. "Teaching, teacher training and applied linguistics," in *Re-exploring CELT: Continuing Education for Language Teachers*, edited by Verner Courtenay Bickley, 26-32. Hong Kong: Institute of Language in Education, Education Dept., 1987.

Borg, S. "English Language Teachers Conceptions of Research." *Applied Linguistics* 30, no. 3 (2009): 358-88. doi:10.1093/applin/amp007.

Capel, Susan Anne, Marilyn Leask, and Tony Turner. *Starting to Teach in the Secondary School: A Companion for the Newly Qualified Teacher*. London: Routledge, 1997.

Crookes, Graham, and Lowell Arakaki. "Teaching idea sources and work conditions in an ESL program." *Tesol Journal* 8 (1999): 15-19.

Davis, James R. *Interdisciplinary courses and team teaching: New arrangements for learning*. Phoenix, Ariz.: American Council on Education, 1995.

Eisner, Elliot W. "The primacy of experience and the politics of method." *Educational Researcher* 17, no. 5 (1988): 15-20.

Everton, Tim, Maurice Galton, and Tony Pell. "Teachers' perspectives on educational research: Knowledge and context." *Journal of Education for Teaching* 26, no. 2 (2000): 167-182.

Freeman, Donald. "Redefining the relationship between research and what teachers know" in *Voices from the language classroom: Qualitative research in second language education*, edited by Bailey, Kathleen M., and David Nunan, 88-115. New York: Cambridge University Press, (1996).

Hammersley, Martyn., and Roger. Gomm. "Research and practice, two worlds for ever at odds" in *Educational research, policymaking and practice*, edited by Martyn Hammersley. London: Paul Chapman Publishing, (2002): 59-83.

Gurney, M. "Implementer or innovator: A teacher's challenge to the restrictive paradigm of traditional research." *The management of change* (1989): 13-28.

Hargreaves, Derek. "Teaching as a research-based profession: possibilities and prospects (The Teacher Training Agency Lecture 1996)." *Educational research and evidence-based practice* (2007): 3-17.

Kincheloe, Joe L. *Teachers as researchers (classic edition): Qualitative inquiry as a path to empowerment*. London: Routledge, 2012.

Kirkwood, Margaret, and Donald Christie. "The role of teacher research in continuing professional development." *British Journal of Educational Studies* 54, no. 4 (2006): 429-448.

Kutlay, Nesrin. "A survey of English language teachers' views of research." *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 70 (2013): 188-206.

Lankshear, Colin, and Michele Knobel. *A Handbook for Teacher research: From design to implementation*. London: Open University Press, 2004.

Larsen-Freeman, Diane. "Research into practice: Grammar learning and teaching." *Language Teaching* 48, no. 2 (2015): 263-280.

Lyle, Sue. "An investigation into the impact of a continuing professional development programme designed to support the development of teachers as researchers in South Wales." *Journal of In-Service Education* 29, no. 2 (2003): 295-314.

Maley, Alan. "More research is needed–A mantra too far." *Humanising Language Teaching* 18, no. 3 (2016). Available at http://www.hltmag.co.uk/jun16/index.htm (accessed on 3 April 2019).

McKernan, Jim. "The countenance of curriculum action research: Traditional, collaborative, and emancipatory-critical conceptions." *Journal of curriculum and supervision* 3, no. 3 (1988): 173-200.

McNamara, Olwen. "Evidence-based practice through practice-based evidence." *Becoming an evidence-based practitioner*, 29-40. Routledge, 2003.

Medgyes, Péter. "The (ir) relevance of academic research for the language teacher." *Elt Journal* 71, no. 4 (2017): 491-498.

Mortimore, Peter. "Does educational research matter?" *British Educational Research Journal* 26, no. 1 (2000): 5-24.

Nunan, David. *Research methods in language learning*. Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Nunan, David. Standards for teacher-research: Developing standards for teacher-research in TESOL." *TESOL Quarterly* 31, no. 2 (1997): 365-367.

Polemeni, Anthony J. "Research and Teacher Power." *Educational Leadership* 33, no. 7 (1976): 493-7.

Chapter Twenty-Two

The Story of an Hour with Drama:
Towards a Better Grasp of Literature

Perihan Korkut

Introduction

The benefits of using literature for language development purposes are well established.[1,2,3]Acting as valuable authentic material, literature provides not only rich linguistic input but also cultural enrichment opportunities for the learners. This study was carried out in Turkey, which is representative of many EFL contexts where students have limited opportunities to visit an English-speaking country. EFL students can "get a feel of what people do, how they behave in public, and behind closed doors"[4] thanks to reading stories without actually being abroad. Moreover, students of English can get drawn into the events in a story and experience more personal involvement thanks to the reading experience.

In order to attain the aforementioned benefits of literature, many schools in Turkey have literature components in their syllabi. However, the question of whether the students are making the most of this component is debatable. Akyel and Yalçın found incongruence between the goal and achievement in classes where literature is employed.[5] The teaching of

---

[1] J. Charles Alderson, *Assessing Reading.* (Cambridge: CUP, 2000).

[2] Piera Carroli, *Literature in Second Language Education.* (London: Continuum, 2008).

[3] Hyun-Soo Hur, *Literature-Based Activities and Language Socialization in an Elementary ESL Classroom*. (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University, 2005).

[4] Joanne Collie and Slater Stephen. *Literature in the Language Classroom: A Resource Book of Ideas and Activities.* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1987).

[5] Ayşe Akyel and Yalçın Eileen. "Literature in the EFL Class: A Study of Goal-Achievement Incongruence." *ELT Journal* 44, no.3 (1990): 174-180.

literature in most EFL Turkish contexts is highly teacher-centered.[6] The teacher takes the stage, produces questions and explains the necessary information to be memorized – and may appear in the exam- which are noted down by the students. This method of teaching clearly would not help students gain the skills for continuing to read on their own and develop their own tastes of literature without depending on literary criticism books. More student-centered approach is suggested in the studies of both Akyel & Yalçın[5] and Timuçin.[6] Akyel and Yalçın's survey revealed that the literature education was not based on learner needs and employed a teacher-centered approach. They recommended using a variety of in- and out-of-class texts as well as improving classroom techniques. Timuçin employed a learner-based classroom methodology in his experimental study and found that the experimental group had better student motivation and appreciation of literary text compared to the control group.

Moreover, a new perspective on reading literature has recently flourished in literary criticism circles. To summarize from Kukkonen and Caracciolo,[7] the first-generation cognitive theories which perceive the mind as a computer have evolved into second-generation theories that emphasize the e-qualities (enactive, embedded, embodied and extended qualities) of the mind. When we read about somebody's physical and emotional states, we do not merely see the words on the page; our mirror neurons get activated and we almost feel the same emotions. Moreover, physical actions can convey abstract meanings through metaphorical associations. For instance, moving from one place to another in a journey can represent a transformation. Besides, these physical movements are interpreted according to culture. While it is accepted that the use of bodily images in literature represents the culture of the story characters, in the second-generation analyses, the readers' culture is also taken into consideration. When we read, we refer to our own representations of body which is embedded in our own culture.

Kukkonen and Caracciolo demonstrate that the experience of reading is to be taught from the second-generation perspective and must go beyond surface readings and straightforward descriptions of the events and characters.[8] Therefore, finding a new approach providing students with a

---

[6] Metin Timucin. "Gaining Insight into Alternative Teaching Approaches Employed in an EFL Literature Class." *Revista de Filología y su Didáctica*, no. 24 (2001): 269-293.

[7] Karin Kukkonen and Marco Caracciolo. "Introduction: What is the "Second Generation"?" *Style* 48, no.3 (2014): 261-274.

[8] Ibid.

better grasp of the literature is crucial. This must be an embodied approach which allows students to interpret situations from their own cultural and emotional perspectives.

This study aims to serve as a showcase for how drama can be useful to fulfil the needs of educating students as critical readers and motivating them to continue reading extensively. The term "drama" is used as the name of a teaching method that encapsulates as "the enactment of an idea or a concept with a group using techniques such as improvisation and role playing, based on the group's life experiences,"[9] similar to process drama approach.[10] Process drama was used in literature classes and it was found out that process drama enabled even the reluctant students to participate in the class more willingly, and triggered higher-order thinking since getting in the role created a need to "read" the situation.[11] In the session described below, Chopin's (1973) short story "The Story of an Hour" is discussed by using drama conventions such as sculpture, narration, speaking objects, dreamscape and teacher in role[12] (Also see Winston & Tandy for a compact list of drama conventions). The session makes use of the viewpoint of the armchair as a focal point. This was a purposeful choice because it would enable flexibility and neutral territory for student ideas to flourish. Below, I provide some information about the story and the research setting.

Written in the late 1800s, "The Story of an Hour" begins with Louise Mallard receiving the bad news that her husband had lost his life in a train accident. Upon receiving the bad news, she immediately locks herself into her room upstairs where she initially cries but then realizes that Mr. Mallard's death has set her free. Meanwhile, her sister Josephine is waiting at the door, concerned that Louise's weak heart might not bear the bad news. When Josephine finally manages to get Louise downstairs, unexpectedly, Mr. Mallard comes through the door, safe and sound. Louise cannot take losing her one-hour-long independence and dies instantly. Ironically, the doctors say that she died of joy.

---

[9] Ömer Adıgüzel. *Eğitimde yaratıcı drama*. (Ankara: YKY, 2018)

[10] Dorothy Heathcote and Bolton Gavin. *Drama for Learning: Dorothy Heathcote's Mantle of the Expert Approach to Education. Dimensions of Drama Series*. (Portsmouth: Heinemann, 1994).

[11] Trish Wells and Susan Sandretto. '"I'm on a Journey I Never Thought I'd Be On": Using Process Drama Pedagogy for the Literacy Programme." *Pedagogies: An International Journal* 12 no. 2 (2017): 180-195.

[12] Kate Chopin. *The Awakening and Other Short Stories*. (New York: William Morrow, 1973).

The story is short enough to be read in one sitting. It contains examples of literary devices such as symbolism and irony. Its surprise ending makes it fertile for classroom discussions. Due to these characteristics, the story has been preferred in many other studies as well as this particular study.[13] [14] [15]

This study took place in an ELT department at a Turkish university. The aim of the study was to showcase the use of drama for literacy instruction. A lesson plan was designed using drama as a method and implemented as a session lasting about three lecture hours. The session took place in a large and mostly unfurnished room. It was repeated twice on the same day with two separate groups (about 23 each), forming the participants of the study (n=46). Students participated in the session as a part of their literature course in which they were enrolled; therefore, participation in the session was compulsory. However, their consent for carrying out the study was taken orally before the session and they were permitted to withdraw their data once the session ended. The students agreed to cooperate on the condition that no photographs or video recordings would be taken and their names would be anonymous.

In order to exhibit the session's effect on students' understanding and appreciation of the story, a single group pretest-posttest quasi-experimental research design was utilized. The students were given 20 minutes to read the story and answer pretest questions just before the drama session and another 20 minutes for the posttest questions just after the session. The pre- and post-test questions were originated by Fall, Webb and Chudowsky[13] to measure the effect of group discussion on comprehension of literature. Both the questions of pre- and posttest require students' knowledge of the facts and events in the story as well as their opinions about the story in general. There were also questions in the posttest specifically asking the students whether the session caused any change in their understanding of the story. The data were collected and analysed qualitatively.

---

[13] Ginger Malin, Is It Still Considered Reading? Using Digital Video Storytelling to Engage Adolescent Readers." *The Clearing House*, 83 (2010): 121-125.
[14] Ibid.
[15] David S. Miall. "Emotions and the Sructuring of Narrative Responses." *Poetics Today* 32, no. 2 (2011): 323-348.

The Drama Session

The drama sessions with both groups were carried out by the researcher herself. As a participant-observer, the below account includes the researchers' actions, observations, and subjective interpretations.

Step 1 was a *sculpture*. I gave one chair per three people. Working in pairs, one student – as the sculptor – gently guided the other –the sculpture - into a position on the chair without talking or making any explanations. Once the sculpture's pose was ready, another student (other than the sculptor) was invited to stand behind the sculpture and to talk as the chair. Then the sculptors looked at each other's work and asked questions to the chairs such as "Are you an old or a new chair? Is this person your owner? What is s/he thinking?" etc. The third student had to interpret the sculpture and make up answers to the questions. This was repeated several times, changing the roles each time. The purpose of this was to get used to the idea of using the furniture, particularly the armchair's point of view.

Step 2 was *narration*. I read aloud a section of the story while students shut their eyes and listened. This section was the part where Louise was in her room. This part began "There stood, facing the open window, a comfortable, roomy armchair." and ended "Free! Body and soul, free!" she kept whispering."[16] In the second reading, I told the students that they would find or make the chair in the classroom and one volunteer would sit in it as Mrs. Mallard to act as the reading went on. The first group discussed a little about which chair to choose but they carefully chose its place in the room. Some students argued that the chair had to be in front of the window as in the story. Others objected and said most of the people would not be able to see Mrs. Mallard's face when she sat in that position. The solution was found relatively quickly that the audience would sit between the chair and the window. In the second group, however, a long discussion took place. There were two candidates supported by different students. I warned them that they had to choose one as a whole class. One group wanted to use an old chair with a broken leg (Figure 1A). They argued that the unstable feeling while sitting in it would symbolize the tragic event that shook Mrs. Mallard's life at that moment. The other was the teacher's chair modified with cushions (Figure 1B). This group objected that the armchair symbolized the only place that Mrs. Mallard was allowed to be herself, a safe spot for her during her marriage. So, they argued it must be a strong, large, comfortable armchair. Much of the discussion was in relation to Mrs. Mallard's psychological state and how it

---

[16] Chopin, *The Awakening*.

should be expressed. Finally, one student who was tired of the discussion suggested that they chose an ordinary chair from the classroom. It would be like a blank page, not symbolizing anything at all (Figure 1C). This offer was taken up by the majority of the class, so the drama could continue. The section of the story was read whilst a volunteer sat in the chosen "armchair" and acted accordingly. Had the students decided too quickly, I would not delay, nor would I hurry them on to the next stage if they were discussing for too long. The drama belongs to the group, and the role of a teacher is to guide the group throughout the process. The discussions in this section helped the students visualize the setting of the story. While they meticulously created each detail about the armchair, they also had a chance to enter the world of the story. They heard each other's points of view and defended their own.

A – The unstable chair   B – The safe spot chair   C – The ordinary (blank) chair

Step 3 was *speaking objects*. I stood behind the volunteer student sitting in the "armchair" and announced that I am the armchair's voice and that they can ask whatever they want. In the beginning, a few trivial questions such as "How old are you? Where did they buy you from?" were asked. I answered them as curtly as I possibly could. I tried to give more elaborate answers to those about the story's plot. For example, "How is she feeling right now?" "Does she love her husband?". Soon, the students began to ask questions, the answers of which was not disclosed within the story. For instance, they asked if Mr. Mallard loved her. Without contradicting the given facts in the story I tried to design my answers so as to reflect the spirit of the 1800s which I had researched and learned about before the lesson. I had dealt with any misunderstandings about the main plot of the story before that session.

Step 4 was *dreamscape*. This is a popular drama convention that has many variations. The main aim is to improvise scenes without much preparation. For this step, I sat in Louise's armchair and reminded the students that Louise has heart problems, so she felt very tired and fell

asleep. Students began to rotate around the chair. I put my hands over my forehead in a gesture of sleeping. Once I removed my hands whoever was in front of me had to begin improvising a dream that Louise could be having at that moment. When I made the sleeping gesture once more, the students cut the scene and began rotating again. We had to try this a few times until students got used to the procedure. The end product was a dramatic display of Louise's dreams, patchy, inconsistent, depicting fear, happiness, sadness all at the same time with long humming intervals. Mostly, the dreams were about short episodes of talks between Mr and Mrs Mallard, Louise's dreams of being an independent woman and her fears that her freedom would be taken from her again. The students also showed dreams about Louise marrying Richard, Mr. Mallard and Josephine having an affair, even Louise getting a cell phone. I did not make any comments to direct their performances but just made facial expressions in a way showing how I thought Louise would react to such crazy dreams. In drama, it is important not to interrupt the natural unfolding of the process. Although the time spent may look extravagant at first sight, it is necessary for a group of people to reach enough a saturation point in the experience. I paid attention to the signs of involvement. At a point when I thought the group had reached a peak where everyone was absorbed in the process, I suddenly stood up and announced that Louise had woken up.

Step 5 was the *teacher in role*. Sinking back in the chair in a dramatic way, I told the students to sit in front of me. Once they settled I began to act saying: "Josephine, my sister is knocking at the door. In a minute I will go downstairs with her. A key will click in the front door. I will know instantly that my independence is over. Richard will try to prevent me from seeing him... but too late. My heart will break at the sight of my husband standing at the door." I stood up dramatically from the armchair. Looking at the empty armchair I said: "The doctors said that I died of the joy that kills."

Step 6 was *speaking objects*. A volunteer was invited to sit in the armchair. I announced that Mr. Mallard had just come from the funeral of his wife. Now the students became the voice of the armchair. I asked them questions about the funeral, about Mr. Mallard's future plans, etc. Once they were asked about his present feelings, one student stood up and said: "free, body and soul free". He explained that having an ill wife had been a burden for him and now he felt free in the sense that he did not have to worry about Louise any more. In the other group, it turned out that Mr. Mallard had hurried home thinking that Louise's heart would not bear the

bad news but he was confused when he noticed that his death was not strong enough to kill her but the surprise of his coming back was.

Step 7 was writing *the story of the armchair*. To finish the session, students were told to write the story from the armchair's point of view. This provided them with some private time to digest the experience and turn this into a concrete product. I try to finish the drama with a tangible product because it acts as a durable reminder of the experience, like a souvenir from a journey to another world. In addition, the products can be focused on in terms of language in subsequent classes. For example, one student wrote that

> It was the morning breeze that gave Louise the creeps. But I could feel that the faith of the day had been sealed. Louise took her scarf which lied on me. As soon as she sat in me, I felt the negative energy through her. The sudden knock on the door startled her and she went downstairs. I could hear the noise and the sobbing.
>
> I was scared for her when she came in, slammed the door shut and threw herself on me. She started murmuring "free…free.." She was as light as a feather: So happy that she had never been. With a sudden urge she stood up and took a deep breath. She unlocked the door and went downstairs with Josephine. She never came back. (sample student response to the writing activity)

Although the narration begins a little before the onset of the actual story, it shows great parallelism in terms of the events and emotions in the story. There were more varied products. Compare for example with the following extract from another student's writing:

> Today, Louise rushed into my room. She was looking so sad as usual. But there was something different this time. She looked at me. She walked towards me and sat on her knees. Then she suddenly stood up and played one of Brently's favourite songs. She sat again. She held her throat as if she wanted to take a deep breath. She said "How could this happen to my dear Brently". She started to sing the song with a trembling voice and tears fell down her cheeks. She felt relaxed. She stood up, looked in the mirror and said "Get a grip of yourself, Louise. You are a beautiful, independent woman from now on." (sample student response to the writing activity)

The same flow of emotions in the original story can be seen in this version but the events are altered a little and gestures from Turkish culture were added. There are prototypical stories to represent feelings in every

culture.[17] This particular student had made use of powerful imagery to express the feelings in the story.

Results

Considering the students' answers to the pre- and posttest questions, it was seen that nine students (19, 5 %) still had misunderstandings about the story even after the drama session. Another ten (21, 5%) had already understood the story very well when they read it for the pretest. The remaining 27 students (58, 6%) exhibited improvement in their posttest compared to their pretest answers. Below, a summary of the observed changes is presented along with examples from the data.

Improved factual understanding

The session allowed some students to understand the facts in the story in a better way. One of the most difficult concepts to comprehend things about the story was the reason for Mrs. Mallard's death. Most of the participants could not understand the conditions of her death in the first reading. For example in the below extract, one student's pre- and posttest answers are compared.

> Extract 1
> Before: Richard was late and she had died of heart disease but this was what she wanted so it was a joy that kills.
> After: Firstly she felt like she was in a cage she wasn't free after all but then she heard the news that her husband died and she felt free at last. She died when she found out that her husband was not actually dead.

As seen in Extract 1, the student initially thinks that Louise wanted to die. This misinterpretation of "dying out of joy" was corrected in the posttest answer.

Understanding character emotions better

Some students had been confused about Mrs. Mallard's feelings upon her husband's death. It was seen most clearly in the following student's case in extract 2.

---

[17] Miall, 2011.

Extract 2
Before: Normally, when somebody you close with dies you really don't feel free. I think there must be some reason why she felt free. After: She was sad at the beginning of the story but in the end, she was so happy. She was free. She was sad because she didn't do anything she wants. She was happy because there will be no one who can say her what to do.

A different version of this problem in the pretests was that there were many students who could not relate to Mrs. Mallard's emotions in the first place. However, according to the answers of the students to the question in the posttest, students could relate to the emotions of the character more easily thanks to drama.

Extract 3
I couldn't understand the story clearly at the beginning but my friends helped me to understand it. Also I was confused about the woman's feelings because at the beginning I thought her feelings weren't natural but then I realized that freedom is the most important thing in this life.

In this parallelism, the drama session reportedly enabled the students to see the character's situation from a different perspective and this provided them with a clearer understanding of the character. They began to take into consideration different variables such as the setting and time of the story.

Extract 4
In the beginning, I never thought about the time of the story. But now that I know the time, I can understand the situation of that woman.

Extract 5
At the beginning of the story, she was in trouble with her husband's existence. Also, she may not find protection against life's condition. I guess at that time, women think and are curious about the future because of being dependent on their husbands.

Thinking about other characters' point of view in the story

Comparing test answers evidently shows that students considered not only the main character's emotions and situation, but also the other characters' point of view in the story after the drama session.

Extract 6
He loved her when he rushed to his house to give her the news that he hadn't died, he got disappointed by her death. But the most disappointing thing for him was that she died of joy- not of the sadness.

In extract 6, the student highlights his contribution to the 6th step (see above) by writing about it in the posttest. There is promising evidence that this kind of emphatic thinking is independent of the session itself. See the below extract for an example.

> Extract 7
> I had a new view of her husband. When I think her husband he is so protective that he never allows her to do anything because she is ill. If we look at just this way, the man could be right.

In extract 7, the student's comment about Mr. Mallard shows a certain empathy by explaining why Mr. Mallard was so restrictive with regard to Mrs. Mallard. As this had not been mentioned explicitly in the sessions, it may be inferred that this particular student has gained the skills of analysing motives and underlying reasons for events based on evidence in the story.

Conclusion

In order to discuss the value of drama in the study of literature in language education, one sample implementation was showcased. The comparison of pre- and posttest answers indicated a greater understanding of the story especially in terms of the characters' emotions. The use of dramatic forms facilitated higher-order thinking and collaborative learning by stimulating discussion.

In the pretest, the students were given just enough time to read the story only once. But before the posttest, they had had plenty of time to engage with it during the drama. Admittedly, this could pose a threat to the validity of the results. If the students had been given more time to process the story, the differences in understanding the facts and emotions in the story in the posttest might have been less evident. Even then, the advantages that the group experience provided, such as sustained interest and an urge to read and re-read the story thinking from different perspectives, would not be available for most people in a merely personal reading. Considering that the participants were EFL learners, group support could mean more meaningful interaction and collaborative learning. In order to reach a conclusive judgement about the effects of such work on students' reading habits and tastes of literature in general, further studies are needed whereby students' subsequent reading experience is explored.

References

Adıgüzel, Ömer. *Eğitimde yaratıcı drama*. Ankara: YKY, 2018.

Akyel, Ayşe and Eileen Yalçın. "Literature in the EFL Class: A Study of Goal-Achievement Incongruence." *ELT Journal* 44, no. 3 (1990): 174-180.

Alderson, J. Charles. *Assessing Reading*. Cambridge: CUP, 2000.

Carroli, Piera. *Literature in Second Language Education*. London: Continuum, 2008.

Chopin, Kate. *The Awakening and Other Short Stories.* New York: William Morrow, 1973.

Collie, Joanne and Stephen Slater. *Literature in the Language Classroom: A Resource Book of Ideas and Activities*. Cambridge: CUP, 1987.

Fall, Randy, Noreen Webb and Naomi Chudowsky. "Group Discussion and Large Scale Language Arts Assessment: Effects on Students' Comprehension." *American Educational Research Journal* 37, no. 4 (2000): 911-941.

Heathcote, Dorothy and Gavin Bolton. *Drama for Learning: Dorothy Heathcote's Mantle of the Expert Approach to Education. Dimensions of Drama Series*. Portsmouth: Heinemann, 1994.

Hur, Hyun-Soo. *Literature-Based Activities and Language Socialization in an Elementary ESL Classroom*. University Park: The Pennsylvania State University, 2005.

Kukkonen, Karin and Marco Caracciolo. "Introduction: What is the "Second Generation"?" *Style* 48, no. 3 (2014): 261-274. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5325/style.48.3.261

Malin, Ginger. "Is It Still Considered Reading? Using Digital Video Storytelling to Engage Adolescent Readers." *The Clearing House* 83, (2010): 121-125. doi: 10.1080/00098651003774802

Miall, David, S. "Emotions and the Sructuring of Narrative Responses." *Poetics Today,* 32, no. 2 (2011): 323-348. doi: 10.1215/03335372-1162704

Timucin, Metin. "Gaining Insight into Alternative Teaching Approaches Employed in an EFL Literature Class." *Revista de Filología y su Didáctica* 24, (2001): 269-293.

Wells, Trish and Susan Sandretto. "'I'm on a Journey I Never Thought I'd Be On": Using Process Drama Pedagogy for the Literacy Programme." *Pedagogies: An International Journal,* 12, no. 2 (2017): 180-195. doi: 10.1080/1554480X.2016.1245147

Winston, Joe and Miles Tandy. *Beginning Drama 4-11 (Third edition)*. London: Routledge, 2009.

CHAPTER TWENTY-THREE

MOTIVATIONAL ORIENTATIONS AND PERCEPTIONS OF TURKISH ELT STUDENTS REGARDING THEIR SPEAKING MOTIVATION

SABRIYE ŞENER AND SUAT CAKOVA

Introduction

Motivation has been generally considered by both teachers and researchers to be one of the key factors that has an impact on the rate and success of second/foreign language (L2) learning. As it operates as a point of initiation for learning and supporting the process of foreign language acquisition, it has been seen as a major factor in language learning.[1] As indicated by Gardner, motivation is perceived as a goal-directed factor since it includes four perspectives: a goal, effortful behaviour, a desire to reach the goal, and favourable attitudes towards an activity.[2] Motivation gives the essential catalyst to start learning the L2 and later the main thrust to continue the long and arduous learning process.[3]

Motivation is acknowledged as a kind of activity that urges somebody to get things done to achieve an objective. Besides, this is essential in order to prevail in many fields of learning; without such motivation, we will most likely not try to learn.[4] Then again, high motivation will be

---

[1] Cheng, Hsing-Fu and Zoltan Dörnyei, "The Use of Motivational Strategies in Language Instruction: The Case of EFL Teaching in Taiwan." *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching* 1 (2007): 153-174.

[2] Robert C. Gardner, *Social Psychology and Second Language Learning: The Role of Attitudes and Motivation.* London: Edward Arnold Publishers, 1985.

[3] Zoltan Dörnyei. "Motivation in Second and Foreign Language Learning." *Language Teaching* 31 (1998): 117-135.

[4] Jeremy Harmer, *The Practice of English Language Teaching: Describing Learners.* Harlow: Pearson Education, 2002.

helpful for students to accomplish legitimate proficiency in the second language (L2), regardless of whether their inclination or learning conditions are suitable or not.[5] Hence, it is important to comprehend the function it has when learning a language.

Deci and Ryan recognize extrinsic and intrinsic motivation, which originate from outside and inside the individual separately.[6] As indicated by Brown, intrinsic motivation is one of the key points that enables students to prevail in language learning.[7] Obviously, there are different variables engaged in language learning achievement; however, on condition that students are given opportunities in the classroom to practice the language without depending on a great deal of outside rewards for their motivation, they will have a better opportunity to succeed. At the point when students practice language because of their motivation to end up proficient, they will almost certainly build up their own competence and autonomy, gaining proficiency in the language. In this regard, Harmer argues that, in broad terms, intrinsic motivation originates from inside the individual. In this way, students may be motivated by the reality of having a pleasant learning process or by a desire to help themselves feel better.[8]

According to researchers, there are numerous different factors that affect the individual's cognitive processes. Viewing it from an educational angle, the most significant aspects are processing past experiences (attribution theory), judging one's own abilities (self-efficacy theory), and attempting to maintain one's self-esteem (self-worth theory). Attributional processes are among the most crucial influences on the formation of students' expectancies. The main principle in the attribution theory is to assume that humans' future achievement behaviour is significantly influenced by the way they interpret their own past successes and failures.[9] The self-efficacy theory is about individuals' judgment of their capabilities of performing certain specific tasks, whereby their sense of efficacy will have an impact on their choice of activities tackled, on the level of their aspirations, the amount of effort applied, and the persistence maintained. Hence Bandura asserts that individuals with a low sense of self-efficacy in

[5] Cheng and Dörnyei. "The Use of Motivational", 153-174.
[6] Edward Deci and Richard M. Ryan, *Intrinsic Motivation and Self-Determination in Human Behavior.* New York: Plenum Press, 1985.
[7] Douglas Brown, H., *Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy.* White Plains, New York: Longman, 2001. 2nd ed.
[8] Harmer, *The Practice of English Language Teaching*, 117-135.
[9] Bernard Weiner, "A Theory of Motivation for Some Classroom Experiences." *Journal of Educational Psychology* 71 (1979): 3-25.

a certain field see difficult tasks as personal threats.[10] In general terms, self-esteem could be identified as an individual's overall positive evaluation of the self.[11] [12] Competence and worth are two distinctive features that make up this concept.[13] [14]As the concept of motivation has no physical reality, it cannot be seen; what can be perceived is effort, interest, attitude and desire. In speaking, competence comes first and is followed by performance.

In the field, there are some studies examining motivation orientations and problems. Al-Haj embarked on a study to examine and solve motivational problems in EFL Sudanese secondary students.[15] The study revealed that the lack of motivation in EFL classrooms stemmed from factors such as teachers and their training, schools, families, and the non-existence of programs that could foster students' interest. In 2012 Tuan focused on key motivational factors that have an impact on students' English learning performance and on how these factors could effectively be maintained. The study showed that 94% of the participants believed that motivational activities are required. Among the activities preferred by students most are playing games, reading, translation, group or pair work, role-plays, watching films in English and listening to audio recordings. Chou looked at how far activities such as games, songs, and stories were involved in motivating primary school pupils to acquire English vocabulary.[16] According to this research, games, songs, and stories positively affected learners' motivation towards learning English vocabulary. In another study by Masmaliyeva, the advantages and disadvantages of oral presentation in ELT classrooms was analysed. The results indicated

---

[10] Albert Bandura, "Perceived Self-Efficacy in Cognitive Development and Functioning," *Educational Psychologist* 28/2 (1993): 117-148.

[11] Viktor Gecas. "The Self-Concept." *Annual Review of Sociology* 8 (1982): 1–33.

[12] Morris Rosenberg, Carmi Schooler, Carrie Schoenbach and Florence Rosenberg, "Global Self-Esteem and Specific Self-Esteem." *American Sociological Review* 60/1 (1995): 141–156.

[13] Viktor, "The Self-Concept", 1–33.

[14] Viktor Gecas and Michael L. Schwalbe, "Beyond the Looking-glass Self: Social Structure and Efficacy-Based Self-Esteem." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 46 (1983): 77–88.

[15] Abd ul-Gayoum M. A. Al Haj, "Enhancing Motivation in the EFL Classrooms is the Solution: A Case Study of Secondary Schools of the Gezira State, Sudan." *Journal of Language Teaching and Research* 2/3 (2011): 524-529.

[16] Mu-hsuan Chou, "Assessing English Vocabulary and Enhancing Young English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Learners' Motivation through Games, Songs, and Stories." *Education 3-13* 42/3 (2014): 284-297.

that oral presentation fostered the students' motivation, confidence, sense of community, ownership over learning, speech fluency, and accuracy.[17]

In the Turkish context, there are also some research studies carried out to investigate the motivational orientations of the learners. Şener carried out a study to determine the Willingness to Communicate in English and the relationship between motivation and WTC and found that the highest correlation occurred between motivational intensity and WTC.[18] In other words, students with a high level of motivation were more eager to participate in conversations in the target language. Cihan Soyoğul carried out a research study with high school students to investigate the motivational beliefs and learning strategies, paying attention to gender and grade level.[19] She discovered that all participants mostly used task value, control beliefs for learning and help-seeking from among the beliefs and strategies. As the students proceeded through the program, crucial differences in students' test anxiety, extrinsic goal orientation and effort management were detected.

Besimoğlu, Serdar, and Yavuz embarked on a study which aimed at discovering Turkish EFL learners' profile of their perceived successes and failures in English language learning where they noticed that 59.33% were interested in using strategies of the kind students resort to improve their learning.[20] They believe that these strategies are the cause of their success. In their study in 2017, Dinçer and Yeşilyurt detected that even though students are overwhelmingly intrinsically orientated, other motivational factors additionally have an influence on their willingness to speak, where the teacher seems to be the main factor of motivation enhancer in the class.[21] They assert that the results could guide language teachers and educators in creating a classroom environment without anxiety which will foster motivation in learners to speak English. In yet another study, Genç İlter argues that technology is a dynamic and challenging factor of

---

[17] Leyla Masmaliyeva, "Using Affective Effectively: Oral Presentations in EFL Classroom." *Dil ve Edebiyat Egitimi Dergisi* 2/10 (2014): 145-154.
[18] Sabriye Şener, "Willingness to Communicate in English as a Foreign Language among ELT Students in Turkey." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, 2014.
[19] Emine Cihan Soyuğul, "Students' Motivational Beliefs and Learning Strategies: An Investigation of the Scholar Development Program." Unpublished MA Thesis, Bilkent İhsan Doğramacı University, 2015.
[20] Sevdeğer Besimoğlu, Hande Serdar ve Yavuz Şenay, "Exploring Students' Attributions for Their Successes and Failures in English Language Teaching." *Hasan Ali Yücel Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi* 14 (2010): 75-89.
[21] Ali Dinçer and Savaş Yeşilyurt, "Motivation to Speak English: A Self-Determination Theory Perspective." PASAA 53 (2017): 1-25.

motivation in EFL classrooms and attempts to suggest some practical ideas that could help to make language learning more effective.[22]

And finally, Dinçer and Yeşilyurt report in another study that ELT students had negative perceptions about speaking lessons in Turkey, while admitting that it was the most necessary language skill.[23] Their findings also indicated that the students perceived themselves as incompetent in oral communication though they differed in their motivational approaches to speaking English.

Educational research has always paid attention to the question of why some learners are not as successful as others. It is commonly acknowledged that a variety of factors have a crucial impact on improving learners' foreign language learning competencies. In the present study, our starting point was this. The researchers aimed at determining the factors that play roles in students' speaking motivation. As motivation and speaking skill in foreign language learning - the latter being a neglected and challenging language skill in EFL contexts - are considered to be of great importance, this study has tried to examine the motivational orientations of ELT learners in speaking classes. It also seeks to describe the factors influencing their speaking motivation. It further aims to find out the thoughts of the learners about the role technology plays increasing motivation and consequently in improving speaking. For these reasons, the aim of this study is to explore Turkish ELT students' motivational orientations and investigate their perceptions regarding their speaking motivation and to determine the factors influencing their motivation. To reach this goal, this study aims at obtaining answers to the following questions:

1. What are the motivation orientations of ELT students?
2. What are the factors influencing their speaking performance and motivation?
3. What is the role of technology in improving students' speaking skills?

---

[22] Binnur Genç İlter, "Effect of Technology on Motivation in EFL Classrooms." *The Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education* 10 (2009): 9-17.
[23] Ali Dincer and Savaş Yeşilyurt, "Pre-Service English Teachers' Beliefs on Speaking Skill Based on Motivational Orientations" *English Language Teaching* 6/3 (2013):88-95.

Methodology

In this study, a mixed design was utilized. Among the main types of mixed-method, the sequential-explanatory mixed design was used.[24] Firstly, the quantitative data were collected and analysed and then the qualitative data were collected and analysed. The study was conducted at a state university in the west of Turkey, during the winter and spring terms of the 2018-2019 academic year. The participants included 61 Turkish EFL university students, 40 females and 21 males. By employing a purposive sampling method, only the first-year students were included in the study.

The quantitative data were gathered by means of Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire (MSLQ) to determine the motivational orientations of the participants. It contained 31 items on a 7 point-Likert scale measuring 6 categories of motivational orientations:

- Intrinsic goal orientation (Alpha .74) (Items: 1,16,22,24)
- Extrinsic goal orientations (Alpha .62) (Items 7,11,13,30)
- Task value (Alpha .90) (Items: 4,10,17,23,26,27)
- Control of learning beliefs (Alpha .68) (Items: 2,9,18,25)
- Self-efficacy for learning and performance (Alpha .93) (Items: 5,6,12,15,20,21,29,31)
- Test anxiety (Alpha .80) (Items: 3,8,14,19,28)

Qualitative data were elicited by means of 11 open-ended interview questions developed by examining the sub-categories of the MSLQ, and other data collection devices used in previous studies and by getting some expert views. [25] [26] [27] [28]

---

[24] John W. Creswell and Vicki L. Plano Clark, *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research,* Los Angeles: SAGE Publications, 2011.

[25] Paul R. Pintrich, David A. F. Smith, Teresa Garcia, and Wilbert J. McKeachie, "A manual for the Use of the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire (MSLQ)." Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan, National Center for Research to Improve Postsecondary Teaching and Learning. (1991).

[26] Cheng and Dörnyei, "The Use of Motivational Strategies"

[27] César Ochoa, Paola Cabrera, Ana Quiñónez, Luz Castillo and Paúl González, "The Effect of Communicative Activities on EFL Learners' Motivation: A Case of Students in the Amazon Region of Ecuador." *Colombian Applied Linguistics Journal* 18/2 (2016): 39-48.

[28] Luu Trong Tuan, "An Empirical Research into EFL Learners' Motivation." *Theory and Practice in Language Studies* 2/3 (2012): 430-439.

Only volunteers were accepted as the participants of the study. The language of the questionnaire was English. The quantitative data were collected during the class hour by one of the researchers. It took the students approximately 25 minutes to complete the questionnaire. In order to collect the qualitative data 11 open-ended questions were asked. The qualitative data were collected at a different time. All of the participants were informed about the ethical issues and that their personal information would not be used by anyone. The language of the questions was English. Firstly, the quantitative data were analysed by using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS 20). Among the techniques used there are descriptive statistics such as mean, standard deviation and percentage. To analyse the qualitative data, the Content Analysis method was utilized. The data analysis involved processes such as categorizing and making sense of the phenomenon of the essential meaning.

Findings and discussions

In the present study, the reliability of the quantitative data was calculated by means of SPSS 20. Firstly, the quantitative data findings were presented and then the qualitative results were given under the same research question.

RQ1. What are the motivation orientations of ELT students in speaking classes?

The participants were specifically asked to respond to the statements and express their perceptions related to their motivation in speaking classes. Among the sub-categories, task value (M=5.93) received the highest mean score. Among the statements "It is important for me to learn the course material in this class (M=6.66).", "I like the subject matter of this course", "Understanding the subject matter of this course is very important to me" were mostly chosen. It is apparent that students give importance to the speaking course and the course contents.

Table 1. The motivation orientations of ELT students in speaking classes

Sub-categories	n	$\overline{X}$	sd	se_x
Intrinsic Goal Orientation	60	5.42	.82	.10
Extrinsic Goal Orientation	60	5.19	1.14	.14
Task Value	60	5.93	.78	.10
Control of Learning Beliefs	60	5.51	.91	.11
Self-Efficacy	60	5.19	.88	.11
Test Anxiety	60	4.28	1.27	.16

In the qualitative data of the task value sub-category, it was observed that all the participants regard the contents of the speaking course as important or very important. It can be said that the contents of the course have an impact on the motivation of the learners. In this study, students in the speaking course seemed to be highly motivated because they state that knowing a language means using that language. In other words, they give value to their speaking course, find it important, and for this reason, express a high level of speaking motivation. The findings of the quantitative and qualitative analyses support each other.

Table 2. Perceptions about task value

Theme	Category
Task value	helping communication (13) intercultural competence (5) need for the job (4) English as a lingua Franca (4) importance of speaking skill (4)

Here are some of the excerpts of the participants regarding Task Value:

P8 "Without communication humanity will disappear. We all try to speak in other languages, and we should keep going. English is an international language. We can speak everyone in the world with this amazing language"

P28 "Speaking is really important especially if you are going to be a teacher or something like that, you need to speak English. Apart from that, English is the world's language anymore and almost every people's job has English in it. And of course, without speaking you can't progress in your job"

Task values are related to the values involved in the task, such as the benefits, importance, and fun connected to the task.[29] Expectancies and task values work together in such a way that they define and foretell the level of commitment, engagement, interest, and academic achievement.

In the present study, it became clear that the students' perceptions of course materials in terms of importance scored high. Parallel findings were also found in some other research studies.[30] [31]

Among the sub-categories, Control of learning beliefs (M=5.51) received the second highest mean score. Among the statements "If I try hard enough, then I will understand the course material" and "If I study in appropriate ways, then I will be able to learn the material in this course" were the most favoured ones. Most of the students believe that their efforts and not external factors have an effective role in learning.

Table 3. Perceptions about the control of learning beliefs

Theme	Category
Control of learning beliefs	my effort (6) teacher (3) both my effort and teacher (11) external factors (class, materials, atmosphere, classmate) (8)

When the qualitative data of perceptions about control of learning beliefs were analysed, four categories were found. After the qualitative analysis it was seen that the ELT students regard their teacher as well as themselves as a contributing factor to their learning. The actual words of the students are presented below:

---

[29] James A. Shepperd, "Social Loafing and Expectancy-Value Theory." In Multiple Perspectives on the Effects of Evaluation on Performance, edited by Harkins, Stephen, G. Springer, Boston, MA, 2001.

[30] Rosa Stoffa, Joseph C. Kush and Misook Heo, "Using the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire and the Strategy Inventory for Language Learning in Assessing Motivation and Learning Strategies of Generation 1.5 Korean Immigrant Students." *Education Research International* 2011, Article ID 491276, 8 pages, 2011.

[31] Silindele Mbatha, "The Relationship between Self-Efficacy, Motivation and Academic Performance among Students from Various Gender and Generations." Unpublished MA Thesis, University of the Free State, 2015.

P17 "The importance role of success plays my teachers. My teacher is patient. If you don't speak clearly, he doesn't give up listening to the person. He always have a big smile on his face. (Teacher)

P25 "My success is about myself. I mean my confidence. Definitely, it is related to my abilities but my mood influences my success and my failure. When I trust myself I get better grades" (Myself)

P9 "My success depends on both my skills and my teacher in the other hand my failure depends on my interest points. I mean if the course subject is something that I don't have any interest, I would probably do worse than other subjects" (Both)

In the Korean context, Stoffa et al. Control of learning beliefs were preferred as the second most important by 104 Korean immigrant college students.[32] The findings are similar to the findings of the present study, as in the qualitative analysis it was seen that the ELT students regard their teacher as well as themselves as a contributing factor to their learning. In the Turkish context, the role of the teacher as a motivator, moderator, and evaluator is very important. If the teacher lowers the anxiety of the learners, provides materials according to their levels and interests and is patient and objective, he/she can create a positive atmosphere and increase learning. Cihan Soyoğul in her investigation on students' motivational beliefs and learning strategies described learners' control of beliefs as the highest subcategory.[33] The participants of the present study come from the ELT department of a university. The difference between the two studies should be seen as normal because university students are older and more experienced when compared to high school students. It is normal that they are more autonomous and less dependent on the teacher.

When the quantitative data were analysed, the intrinsic goal orientation sub-category received the third highest score. In this group "The most satisfying thing for me in this course is trying to understand the content as thoroughly as possible" received the highest score. This was followed by "In a class like this, I prefer course material that arouses my curiosity, even if it is difficult to learn" and "In a class like this, I prefer course material that really challenges me so I can learn new things" It is pleasing to see that students have goals and that understanding the content is more important than getting good grades. In other words, students have a high level of intrinsic motivation since they value learning more than getting

---

[32] Stoffa, et al., "Using the Motivated Strategies"
[33] Cihan Soyuğul. "Students' motivational beliefs and learning strategies"

good grades. This is a sign that students can think critically and attach importance to learning.

As for the qualitative data analysis, except for a few participants, most of the participants had a high level of intrinsic goal orientations (See Table 4). They were intrinsically motivated to improve their speaking skills. Some express that the activities in the course created an enjoyable atmosphere and consequently increased their motivation. They were inspired to learn more English.

Table 4. Perceptions about intrinsic goal orientation

Theme	Category
Intrinsic Goal Orientation	Enjoying the course (getting fun) (6) Learning from peers (4) Improving speaking skills (13) Providing practising (4) Teachers' assistance (4) Increasing confidence (5) Interesting tasks and activities (3) Being free (1) Broadening horizon (2)

P22 "Of course, I do. Attending this course makes me feel better. I feel as I improve myself. It is enjoyable also. Speaking interesting topics, using new words is a good way to improve your speaking"

P24 "Yes, I like. But I like most is playing with words, combine them and have fun with them. Especially when I use it with person who use it as a mother language it makes me happy and gives me inspiration for learning English more."

Although most students like English, a few don't like speaking in the class in front of their peers because of their anxiety and lack of confidence.

P14 "I don't like speaking English because I can't speak English fluently. If I can speak fluently and accurately, I will love speaking English.

P19 "I like speaking English but not in the course because I am very shy person, so I get excited in the class. But I can be more relax in the speaking exams more than in the class because we will be less people in the speaking exam.

RQ 2. What are the factors influencing their speaking motivation?

In addition to the motivational orientations in the speaking classes, the researchers also investigated the factors influencing their speaking motivation. In order to answer the second research question, the qualitative data were analysed.

In this study, anxiety was the most important factor influencing their motivation and performance. This was followed by fear of making mistakes, lack of knowledge and lack of experience. However, the teacher was seen as a positive factor in increasing learners' motivation and performance.

Table 5. Factors influencing speaking motivation

Theme	Category
Factors influencing performance and motivation	**Negative Influence**
	Lack of knowledge (grammar, vocabulary, content, etc) (9)
	Making mistakes (10)
	Speaking in front of the class (4)
	Anxiety (29)
	Experience (8)
	Being misunderstood (5)
	Lack of communicative competence (Fluency) (4)
	Forgetting during speaking (5)
	Feeling under pressure (1)
	Low self-confidence (4)
	Not studying properly (1)
	Positive Influence
	Teacher (26)

Almost all of them agreed that the teacher's positive attitude and their providing feedback and information, lowering their anxiety, using relevant materials and activities all had positive effects on learners.

P5 "I felt nervous when I spoke English for the first time but that was 6 or 7 years ago. Thanks to my very kind teacher, I could control myself. "

P7 "Actually this year I took my first speaking exam. I feel anxious so much. But normally I am anxious at speaking. I think it depends on the teacher"

P8 "…. Very beginning of this year I was afraid of English more than this term. Now I get used with my classmates and lecturer. I am still afraid of making mistakes but nowadays I feel better while speaking"

P20 "I think I have the best teacher in the world"

According to Krashen, the affective filter hypothesis explains the impact of affective factors on second language acquisition.[34] Affect pertains to non-linguistic variables such as motivation, self-confidence, and anxiety. Affective variables such as fear, nervousness, boredom, and resistance to change may influence the acquisition of a second language by obstructing information related to the second language from getting access to the language areas of the mind.

In this study, as can be understood from the actual words of the participants, the teacher's positive attitude increased learners' motivation and decreased anxiety. In some other studies, communicative competence, and language anxiety are indicators of communication in the target language.[35 36 37 38 39 40]

RQ3. What is the role of technology in improving students' speaking motivation?

In the speaking classes, it was observed that some of the learners were better at pronouncing the words correctly and thus were highly motivated to speak. In order to investigate the reasons for their high motivation,

---

[34] Stephen D. Krashen, *Principles and Practice in Second Language Acquisition,* Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1982.

[35] Rieko Matsuoka, "Japanese College Students' Willingness to Communicate in English." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Temple University, 2016.

[36] Yun-Fang Sun, "Motivation to Speak: Perception and Attitude of Non-English Major Students in Taiwan." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Indiana University, 2008.

[37] Şener, "Willingness to Communicate in English".

[38] Tomoko Yashima, "Willingness to Communicate in a Second Language: The Japanese EFL Context." *The Modern Language Journal* 86/1/ (2002): 54-66.

[39] Miao Yu, "Willingness to Communicate of Foreign Language Learners in a Chinese Setting." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Florida State University, 2009.

[40] Wen and Richard, "Chinese Conceptualization of Willingness to Communicate"

some personal conversations revealed that they benefitted from technology and consequently became more motivated in speaking classes. The qualitative data were analysed in order to receive more information about the role of technology in their speaking motivation.

All of the students agreed on the contribution of technology (video games, movies, series, etc.) to their speaking motivation and vocabulary learning. They see technology as crucial and beneficial in developing their speaking and listening skills, pronunciation, vocabulary level and in giving them a chance to use the target language and be exposed to the language. They also mentioned that it increased their motivation to learn English and help them develop their skills and have fun at the same time.

Some expressed that technology was useful for practicing their English with native speakers as it provided a positive social atmosphere. Genç İlter also found in her research study that technology was a dynamic and challenging motivating factor in EFL classrooms.[41] Furthermore, the findings of this study showed almost all of the ELT students were autonomous learners and they discovered how to increase their speaking ability by having fun at the same time. Research in the learner autonomy has shown that learning behaviour may be influenced by how one conceptualizes language learning in general.[42] In the present study, it was observed that the participants had developed some concepts on their own learning and they managed to increase their motivation by using technology. Here are some actual words of the students regarding the benefits of technology use:

P32 "If the things that are listed above didn't exist, I wouldn't know a single word in English".

P31 "Yes, they are really helpful, and we learn this language in funny way which motivates me to speak. I prefer to learn new words from songs, lyrics, movies and games."

P28 "I have been watching TV series, YouTube, movies for years and they helped me a lot improve my language. I feel good. But just doing these things doesn't help your speaking skills. Speaking skills mostly depend on talking. The examples that I gave mainly help your listening skills"

P27 "Especially I benefit from YouTube. I watch English films or videos and I develop my listening skill and I imitate accents. It is very useful for me."

---

[41] Genç İlter, "Effect of Technology"

[42] Matthew Pennington, "Asia Takes a Crash Course in Educational Reform." Retrieved from http://www.unesco.org, 1999. Accessed February 25, 2019.

Table 6. Benefit from technology

Theme	Category
Benefit from technology	Improving vocabulary knowledge (8)
	Developing listening skills (15)
	A chance to use the target language (4)
	Improving pronunciation (6)
	Having fun (4)
	Increasing motivation and confidence (10)
	Exposure to the target language (6)
	The reason for learning English (10)

Conclusion

Research has paid attention to why some learners are more motivated than others. It is known that there are various factors which influence learners' language learning motivation. The present study firstly aimed at exploring motivational orientations of learners in a speaking class and then it aimed at discovering their perceptions on their motivation and factors influencing their speaking motivation. The findings of this study establish that mutual understanding between teachers and students, relevant content, relevant technology use, lowering the anxiety of the learners can all be factors increasing motivation in speaking classes. Students feel confident when their teacher supports them and provides a positive atmosphere. It is also clear that students give importance to the course and the course contents. Besides, most of the students believe that their efforts rather than external factors have an effective role in learning.

Furthermore, the findings of this study indicate that almost all of the ELT students were autonomous learners and discovered how to increase their speaking ability by having fun at the same time. Teachers ought to always sustain an enjoyable classroom environment so that students are motivated to learn the target language, permit students to grasp the aims of communicative activities, expand the prevalence of activities such as games and role-plays and technology, as these encourage language practice opportunities, learners' independence and establish a positive, friendly and affective atmosphere in the classroom. In addition, teachers should keep supplying appropriate feedback and error correction, as these are important motivating factors for learners.

In this study, there are some limitations. The data were collected from a small group of students studying at a state university in a speaking course. For this reason, the findings cannot be generalized. By using a

different motivation scale, different findings can be elicited. Therefore, teachers should carry out some research studies in different contexts with different levels.

References

Al Haj, Abd ul-Gayoum M. A. "Enhancing Motivation in the EFL Classrooms is the Solution: A Case Study of Secondary Schools of the Gezira State, Sudan." *Journal of Language Teaching and Research,* 2/3 (2011): 524-529.

Bandura, Albert. "Perceived Self-Efficacy in Cognitive Development and Functioning," *Educational Psychologist* 28/2 (1993): 117-148.

Besimoğlu, Sevdeğer, Hande Serdar ve Yavuz Şenay. "Exploring Students' Attributions for Their Successes and Failures in English Language Teaching." *Hasan Ali Yücel Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi* 14 (2010): 75-89.

Brown, H., Douglas. *Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy,* 2nd ed. White Plains, New York: Longman, 2001.

Cheng, Hsing-Fu and Zoltan Dörnyei. "The Use of Motivational Strategies in Language Instruction: The Case of EFL Teaching in Taiwan." *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching* 1 (2007): 153-174.

Chou, Mu-hsuan. "Assessing English Vocabulary and Enhancing Young English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Learners' Motivation through Games, Songs, and Stories." *Education 3-13* 42/3 (2014): 284-297.

Cihan Soyuğul, Emine. "Students' motivational beliefs and learning strategies: An investigation of the scholar development program." Unpublished MA Thesis, Bilkent İhsan Doğramacı University, 2015.

Creswell, John, W. and Vicki L. Plano Clark. *Designing and conducting mixed methods research.* Los Angeles: SAGE Publications, 2011.

Deci, Edward and Richard M. Ryan. *Intrinsic Motivation and Self-Determination in Human Behavior.* New York: Plenum Press, 1985.

Dincer Ali and Savaş Yeşilyurt. "Pre-Service English Teachers' Beliefs on Speaking Skill Based on Motivational Orientations" *English Language Teaching* 6/3 (2013): 88-95.

Dinçer, Ali and Savaş Yeşilyurt. "Motivation to Speak English: A Self-Determination Theory Perspective." *PASAA* 53 (2017): 1-25.

Dörnyei, Zoltan. "Motivation in Second and Foreign Language Learning." *Language Teaching* 31 (1998): 117-135.

Gardner, Robert C. *Social Psychology and Second Language Learning: The Role of Attitudes and Motivation.* London: Edward Arnold Publishers, 1985.

Gecas, Viktor. "The Self-Concept." *Annual Review of Sociology* 8 (1982): 1–33.

Gecas, Viktor and Michael L. Schwalbe. "Beyond the Looking-glass Self: Social Structure and Efficacy-Based Self-Esteem." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 46 (1983): 77–88.

Genç İlter, Binnur. "Effect of Technology on Motivation in EFL Classrooms." *The Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education* 10 (2009): 9-17.

Harmer, Jeremy. *The Practice of English Language Teaching: Describing learners.* Harlow: Pearson Education, 2002.

Krashen, Stephen, D. *Principles and Practice in Second Language Acquisition.* Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1982.

Masmaliyeva, Leyla. "Using Affective Effectively: Oral Presentations in EFL Classroom." *Dil Ve Edebiyat Eğitimi Dergisi* 2/10 (2014): 145-154.

Matsuoka, Rieko. "Japanese College Students' Willingness to Communicate in English." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Temple University, 2016.

Mbatha, Silindele. "The Relationship between Self-Efficacy, Motivation and Academic Performance among Students from Various Gender and Generations." Unpublished MA Thesis, University of the Free State, 2015.

Ochoa, César, Paola Cabrera, Ana Quiñónez, Luz Castillo and Paúl González. "The Effect of Communicative Activities on EFL Learners' Motivation: A Case of Students in the Amazon Region of Ecuador." *Colombian Applied Linguistics Journal* 18/2 (2016): 39-48.

Pennington, Matthew. "Asia Takes a Crash Course in Educational Reform." Retrieved from http://www.unesco.org, 1999. Accessed February 25, 2019.

Pintrich, Paul, R. David A. F. Smith, Teresa Garcia, and Wilbert J. McKeachie. "A manual for the Use of the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire (MSLQ)." Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan, National Center for Research to Improve Postsecondary Teaching and Learning, 1991.

Rosenberg, Morris, Carmi Schooler, Carrie Schoenbach and Florence Rosenberg. "Global Self-Esteem and Specific Self-Esteem." *American Sociological Review* 60/1 (1995): 141–156.

Rosenberg, Morris. "Beyond Self-Esteem: The Neglected Issues in Self-concept Research." Paper presented at the annual meetings of the ASA, 1976.

Schofield, Linda. "Why Didn't I Think of That? Teachers' Influence on Students' Metacognitive Knowledge of How to Help Students Acquire Metacognitive Abilities." *Kairaranga* 13/1 (2012): 56–62.

Shepperd, James, A. "Social Loafing and Expectancy-Value Theory." In Multiple Perspectives on the Effects of Evaluation on Performance, edited by Harkins, Stephen, G. Springer, Boston, MA, 2001.

Stoffa, Rosa, Joseph C. Kush and Misook Heo. "Using the Motivated Strategies for Learning Questionnaire and the Strategy Inventory for Language Learning in Assessing Motivation and Learning Strategies of Generation 1.5 Korean Immigrant Students." *Education Research International* 2011, Article ID 491276, 8 pages, 2011.

Sun, Yun-Fang. "Motivation to Speak: Perception and Attitude of Non-English Major Students in Taiwan." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Indiana University, 2008.

Şener, Sabriye. "Willingness to Communicate in English as a Foreign Language among ELT Students in Turkey." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, 2014.

Tuan, Luu, Trong. "An Empirical Research into EFL Learners' Motivation." *Theory and Practice in Language Studies* 2/3 (2012): 430-439.

Weiner, Bernard. "A Theory of Motivation for Some Classroom Experiences." *Journal of Educational Psychology* 71 (1979): 3-25.

Wen, W. P. and Richard Clement. "Chinese Conceptualization of Willingness to Communicate in ESL." *Language Culture and Curriculum* 16 (2003): 18-38.

Yashima, Tomoko. "Willingness to Communicate in a Second Language: The Japanese EFL Context." *The Modern Language Journal* 86/1/ (2002): 54-66.

Yu, Miao. "Willingness to Communicate of Foreign Language Learners in a Chinese Setting." Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Florida State University, 2009.

CONTRIBUTORS

Anna Asiatidou, PhD is a Lecturer at the School of Foreign Languages in Hasan Kalyoncu University, Gaziantep/Turkey. She is the writer of "The New Historicism's Future under Tristram Shandy's Magnifying Glass" in *History in Western Literature: A Selection of Papers from the 3rd International BAKEA Symposium*.

Kyriaki Asiatidou, PhD is a Lecturer at the department of English Language and Literature in Gaziantep University, Gaziantep/Turkey. She is the writer of "Meeting the Yahoos and the Houyhnhnms: Swift's Sermon and the Function of Satiric Allegory" in *English Studies: New Perspectives* (Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015) and "The Turn of the Screw and 'Daisy Miller': Henry James's Puritan View on the Ideal Victorian Middle-class" (DOI: 10.21547/jss.424206).

Nilay Erdem Ayyıldız, PhD is a Lecturer at the School of Foreign Languages in Fırat University, Elazığ/Turkey. Her dissertation has been published as a book entitled *British Children's Adventure Novels in the Web of Colonialism* (Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2018). She is also the writer of "A Representation of British Gendered Imperial Politics in Fiction for Children: Rudyard Kipling's *The Jungle Book*" in *Language, Power, and Ideology in Political Writing: Emerging Research and Opportunities* (IGI Global Publishing, 2019).

Gönül Bakay, PhD is a Professor of English in Bahçeşehir University, Istanbul/Turkey. Her most recent publications are *Women Made Mad* (in Turkish) and "My Cleaner: Help or Foe" (*Philologia* 64.1, 2019).

Şenol Bezci, PhD is a Lecturer at the department of American Culture and Literature in Ankara University, Ankara/Turkey. His most recent publications are "Muhteşem Gatsby Gerçekten Muhteşem mi?" in *Batı Kültür ve Edebiyatlarında 20. Yüzyıl* (Ankara Üniversitesi Basımevi, 2018), and "The Narrative Situation in *The Ballad of the Sad Café*" (*Journal of American Studies of Turkey* 48, Spring 2018).

Suat Cakova, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the English Language Teaching Department of Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University. His recent

presentations are "Techniques for Teaching Translation to Students of English at University Level" (Contemporary Education Research Journal Conference, Muğla, 02.10.2016), "The Dilemma of Teaching the American or the RP Accent of English Teachers in Turkey" (Contemporary Education Research Journal Conference, Muğla, 01.10.2017), and "The Effectiveness of Creative Drama for Stress and Intonation Instruction in EFL" (4th International Contemporary Education Research Conference, Bodrum, 19.10.2018).

M. Mirac Ceylan is a Research Assistant at the department of English Language and Literature in Gaziantep University, Gaziantep/Turkey. He is currently writing his M.A. Thesis on Contemporary English Fiction.

Onur Ekler, PhD is a Lecturer at the English department in Mustafa Kemal University, Hatay, Turkey. He is the author of "Rite of Transition in Guy of Warwick and Bevis of Hampton: The Liminal Persona in Betwixt and Between" (*IJELS*, Yayın No: 4440538) and "The Folly Grail Of Science: Medea's Robe in Rachel Carson's *Silent Spring*" (Yayın No: 4440790).

Hakan Gültekin, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Artvin Çoruh University, Turkey. He is the writer of "Pause as a Discursive Element in Hemingway's Selected Short Stories" (DOI: 10.17951/lsmll.2017.41.1.20) and "Pause as a Linguistic Element in Ernest Hemingway's 'Old Man at the Bridge,' 'The Three Day Blow' and 'The Revolutionist'" (*Journal of Narrative and Language Studies* 4.7, 2016).

Ömer Kemal Gültekin, PhD is an Assistant Professor of English in Burdur Mehmet Akif Ersoy University, Turkey. His last publications include "'Cultural Bereavement' and An Irishman Stuck in the Past" (DOI: 10.1501/Dtcfder_0000001533) and "Migration and European Identity in David Edgar's *Pentecost*" (*The Journal of International Social Research* 10.54, 2017)

Ela İpek Gündüz, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Gaziantep University, Gaziantep/Turkey. Her recent works include "*Never Let Me Go*: a Traumatic Dystopian World" in *Literature, Narrative and Trauma* (Ege University Publishing, 2019), "The New World as the American Sublime" in *Perspectives on the Sublime in American Cultural Studies* (Dokuz Eylül University Publishing, 2018), and "*Fingersmith* or *Handmaiden*: Adaptations from the Neo-

Victorian Era to Contemporary Asia" in *Adapted from the Original* (London: McFarland, 2018).

Mesut Günenç, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Aydın Adnan Menderes University. He has recently published articles entitled "The Crisis of Masculinity: Jez Butterworth's *Mojo*" (DOI: 10.1515/rjes-2017-0004), "Witnessing Trauma in Simon Stephens' *Motortown*" (e-ISSN: 2458-908X) and "A Paradigm of Dramatic and Postdramatic Tragedy: Simon Stephens's *Motortown*" (DOI: 10.22559/folklor.955).

Jeffrey Howlett, PhD is an Assistant Professor at Başkent University in Ankara, Turkey. His publications include "Nawal Saadawi and the Birth of a Native Egyptian Feminism" in *Globalization and Transcultural Issues in the New World Order* (Ege University, 2003) and "The End of the American Frontier? Male Escapism in 20th Century American Literature" in *Literary Studies: Beginnings and Ends* (University Press of America, 2001).

Enes Kavak, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Gaziantep University, Gaziantep/Turkey. Some of his most recent publications are "Fin De Siècle Female Writers: Representing the New Femininity in the New Woman's Short Stories" (DOI: 10.21547/jss.265446), "Exceptional Femininities as Historical Role Models in Cicely Hamilton's *A Pageant of Great Women*" (DOI: 10.5505/pausbed.2017.19327) and "Threatened Masculinity in Arthur Conan Doyle's Imperialist Detective Fiction: *The Sign of Four*" (DOI: 10.20875/makusobed.324045).

Vildan İnci Kavak is an Instructor at the School of Foreign Languages in Gaziantep University, Gaziantep/Turkey. She continues her PhD in ELT at Çukurova University in Adana/Turkey. She has recently published "The Acquisition and Use of Negation in the Early Child Language" (DOI: 10.17263/jlls.586745) and "Teaching English to Young Learners in a British Multilingual Classroom" (DOI: 10.30703/cije.518963).

Perihan Korkut, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the ELT department of Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University. Her latest publications are "The Construction and Pilot Application of a Scoring Rubric for Creative Drama Lesson Planning" (Doi: 10.1080/13569783.2017.1396211), "Developing Pronunciation through Creative Drama" (DOI: 10.1080/09571736.2018.

1491058), and "Teacher trainees' use of mother tongue in EFL classes: A case study" (*Eğitim Kuram ve Uygulama Araştırmaları Dergisi* 4.1, 2018)

Zennure Köseman, PhD is an Associate Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Inonu University, Malatya/Turkey. Some of her most recent publications are "Comparative Outlook for George Eliot's *Silas Marner* and William Dean Howells' *The Rise of Silas Lapham* in respect to Retrospective Moral Achievement" in *Karşılaştırmalı Edebiyat Yazıları* (Kriter, 2019), "Henry David Thoreau: Free Mind in the Garden" in *Enchanted, Stereotyped, Civilized: Garden Narratives in Literature, Art, and Film* (Konigshausen Neumann, 2018), and "The Reflection of the Imagery of Coldness in Ann Beattie's 'Snow'" (*Fırat Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 29.1, 2019).

Meltem Muşlu, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Gaziantep University, Gaziantep/Turkey. Her most recent publications are "Use of Stance Lexical Bundles by Turkish and Japanese EFL Learners and Native English Speakers in Academic Writing" (DOI: 10.21547/jss.4443869), "Acquisition of Turkish Demonstrative Pronouns in Children" (DOI: 10.14687/ijhs.v12i1.3104), and "A Corpus-Based Analysis of Adjectives and Adverbs in Charlotte Bronte's *Jane Eyre*" in *Progress in Education: Volume 45* (NOVA Publishing: USA).

Cansu Çakmak Özgürel is a PhD student who is also working as an English Language lecturer at TED University in Ankara, Turkey.

Seda Pekşen, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Ankara University, Turkey. Her latest publications are "The Trauma of the Witness in Joyce Carol Oates' Rape: A Love Story" in *Literature, Narrative and Trauma* (Ege University Press, 2019) and "The Absent Presence of the Middle Class in Ali Smith's *There But For The*" (DOI: 10.21547/jss.522477).

Yiğit Sümbül, PhD is based originally at Ankara Haci Bayram Veli University but is currently a post-doctoral research fellow at the University of Southampton. His recent publications include the monograph *Sanatçının Genç Bir Devrimci Olarak Portresi: William Wordsworth ve Fransız İhtilali* (Ankara: Ürün Yayınları. 2019), "Memory as an Unreliable Source of History and/or as the Simulacrum of the Past in Julian Barnes' *England, England*," (*Turkish Journal of Social Research* 23.1, 2019), and "Caryl Phillips' Questioning of the Post-Colonial Space in *The Final Passage*" in

Representations of Space in Literature (Bilgin Kültür Sanat Yayınları, 2018).

Sabriye Şener, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the ELT department in Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University (Muğla, Turkey). Her latest publications are "Reflections of Incoming Erasmus+ Exchange Students at a Turkish University Context" (DOI: 10.32601/ejal.599613), "Learner Autonomy in Foreign Language Teaching for Democracy and Human Rights" in *Education and Human Rights* (LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing, 2018), and "The Effect of Songs on Primary School Students' Motivation" (*International Online Journal of Education and Teaching* 5.4, 2018).

Hilal Şengenç, PhD is a Lecturer of English at the School of Foreign Languages in Ege University, Izmir/Turkey. Her most recent work is "Trauma of Slavery and Witnessing in Fred D'Aguiar's *Feeding the Ghosts*" in *Literature, Narrative and Trauma* (Ege Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2019).

Ayşegül Turan, PhD is an Assistant Professor of English at Istanbul Kültür University. Her recent publications include "Recovering (from) the Past in V.S. Naipaul's The Mimic Men" (*METAFOR: The Boğaziçi University Journal of Literary Studies*, Winter 2017) and "Spaces of Memory and Memories of Space in Alaa al-Aswany's The Yacoubian Building and Elif Shafak's The Flea Palace" (*Neohelicon*, December 2019).

Asya Sakine Uçar, PhD is an Assistant Professor at the department of English Language and Literature in Iğdır University, Turkey. Her most recent publications include "A Silent Resistance: Objectification and a Clash of Empowerment in Doris Lessing's 'A Woman on a Roof'" (DOI: 10.1501/Dtcfder_0000001629) and the Turkish translation of Ricki Schultz's *Mr. Right-Swipe* (*Bay Doğru*) (Martı Publications, 2019).